Technicians of Human Dignity

Gaymon Bennett

Published by Fordham University Press

Bennett, Gaymon. 
Technicians of Human Dignity: Bodies, Souls, and the Making of Intrinsic Worth. 

For additional information about this book
https://muse.jhu.edu/book/42424

For content related to this chapter
https://muse.jhu.edu/related_content?type=book&id=1655758
Notes

PREFACE: THE MOTION OF INQUIRY

4. See, for example, the range of cases detailed in Ilana Feldman and Miriam Ticktin, eds., In the Name of Humanity: The Government of Threat and Care (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2010).
11. Ted Peters, Karen Lebacqz, and Gaymon Bennett, Sacred Cell? Why Chris-


15. See especially Foucault, Security, Territory, Population.


19. Ibid., 2–17.

20. Ibid., 15.


INTRODUCTION: FIGURING HUMAN DIGNITY


2. See, for example, the body of works represented by contributing authors in Feldman and Ticktin’s *In the Name of Humanity* or in Erica Bornstein and Peter Redfield, eds., *Forces of Compassion: Humanitarianism Between Ethics and Politics* (New York: SAR, 2011); see also Peter Redfield, *Life in Crisis: The Ethical Journey of Doctors Without Borders* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013).


4. Normand and Zaidi, *Human Rights at the U.N.*


13. Ibid., 2.


18. Ibid.
31. On parallel dynamics in the conception and development of the modern state, see Foucault, *Security, Territory, Population*.

32. Foucault, “*Omnes et singulatim*.”

33. See Didier Fassin on the operational asymmetry between the worth of European and local employees of Doctors Without Borders.


39. On the homeostatic dimensions of moral thought and practice, see Faubion, *Toward an Anthropology of Ethics*, esp. chap. 3. See also his “The Themitical in the Ethical,” paper presented on March 27, 2009, as part of the seminar series “What Is Ethics? And Who Cares?” hosted by the Kenan Institute for Ethics at Duke University.

40. On the notion of an apparatus, see Dreyfus and Rabinow, *Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, 120–121.

41. Ibid.

I. THE CHURCH, THE SECULAR, AND PASTORAL POWER


3. Ibid.


5. Ibid.


10. Ibid., 319–321.


13. It is important to note that the opening address and this passage in particular was cited and rehearsed throughout the council and became a kind of point of orientation, focus, and, eventually, contestation. All of my quotes from John’s address come from the online archives of the Catholic Forum: Pope John XXIII, “Gaudet Mater Ecclesia” (October 11, 1962), Catholic Forum archives, http://www.catholic-forum.com/saints/pope0261i.htm.


16. Norman Tanner, “V. The Church in the World (Ecclesia Ad Extra),” in History of Vatican II, vol. 2: Church as Communion, Third Period and Intersession,


22. Ibid., 270–328.

23. Ibid., 402.


31. Ibid., 281–284.


33. Ibid.

35. See “The Church,” in Henri de Lubac’s Brief Catechesis on Nature and Grace (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1984); see also de Lubac, Catholicism.


37. Ibid., 143–153.


40. Ibid., 136–137.


42. Routhier, “Finishing the Work Begun,” 142.


2. THE ONTOLOGY OF VOCATION: GAUDIUM ET SPES

1. All of the quotes from the Pastoral Constitution in this chapter are taken from the edition found in the Vatican’s online archive. I have worked with both the Latin and English translations. The English translation can be found at http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_cons_19651207_gaudium-et-spes_en.html.


3. Gaudium et spes, para. 2.


7. *Gaudium et spes*, para. 91.


9. Ibid.


12. Ibid., 23–27.


14. Ibid.

15. Ibid.


17. Ibid.


20. Many council fathers called for a full Christological treatise in traditional liturgical form as the basic response to the question of the human. Ibid.


23. Ibid., para. 15.

24. Ibid.

25. Ibid., para. 19.

26. Ibid., para. 17.

27. Ibid.

28. Ibid., para. 22.

29. Ibid., para. 9.

30. Ibid., para. 12.

31. Ibid., para. 32.

32. Ibid., para. 42.
33. Ibid., para. 23.
34. Ibid.
35. Ibid., para. 42.
36. Ibid., para. 24.
37. Ibid.
38. Ibid.
39. Ibid., para. 31.
40. Ibid., para. 23.
41. Ibid.
42. Ibid., para. 32.
43. Ibid., para. 40.
44. Ibid., para. 1.
45. Ibid., para. 40.
46. Ibid.
47. Ibid.
48. Ibid., para. 3.
49. Ibid., para. 3.
50. Ibid., paras. 4–10.
51. Ibid., para. 9.
52. Ibid., para. 5.
53. Ibid., paras. 9–10.
54. Ibid., para. 9.
55. Ibid., para. 11.
56. Ibid., para. 4.
57. Ibid., para. 10.
58. Ibid., para. 40.
59. Ibid., para. 41.
60. Ibid., para. 22.
61. Ibid., para. 22.
64. Ibid., 186.
65. Ibid., 189.
69. Ibid., 1–48.
70. Milbank, *Theology and Social Theory*, 220.
73. Ibid., 10.
75. Milbank, *The Suspended Middle*, 5.
76. Ibid., 6.
80. Ibid., 225–256.
81. Ibid., 250–253.
82. It bears noting that my reading of the integralist/integrist controversy relies in good part on Milbank’s account of things. Although this account holds up under scrutiny, there are those who think the political advantages of an integrist anthropology and ecclesiology outweigh the purported costs. See Rosemary Radford Ruether and Marion Grau, *Interpreting the Postmodern: Responses to “Radical Orthodoxy”* (London: T&T Clark, 2006).
83. *Gaudium et spes*, para. 36.
84. Ibid., para. 33.

3. INCAPACITY BY DESIGN: POLITICS, SOVEREIGNTY, AND HUMAN RIGHTS

4. Ibid., 6–10.
5. Ibid., 186–187.


9. Cf. Ibid.


13. Samuel Moyn’s *The Last Utopia* goes some way toward putting these matters in clearer historical perspective.


17. Ibid., 160.

18. Arieli, “The Emergence of the Doctrine of the Dignity of Man,” 4. “Standing on the threshold of the twenty-first century, one is permitted to say that the conception of humanity as expressed by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights has become the only valid framework of values, norms and principles
capable of structuring a meaningful and yet feasible scheme of national and international civilized life. Such a development demands explanation." See also William Korey, *NGOs and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1998).


21. Ibid., 143ff.

22. Ibid., 157–159.

23. Ibid., 194–196.

24. Ibid., 154–155.

25. Ibid., 168.

26. Ibid., 166–173.

27. Ibid., 169–171.


29. Ibid., 172.

30. Ibid., 165.


34. Ibid., 177.


40. Ibid., 311.


42. Ibid., 2.

43. Ibid., 4.

44. Ibid., 6–12.

45. Ibid., 6.

46. Ibid., 8–11.

47. Ibid., 7–9.

48. Ibid., 14–19.
49. Ibid., 11.
55. Ibid., 136–137.
57. Ibid.
63. Ibid., 176.

4. DIGNITY AND GOVERNANCE: THE UNIVERSAL DECLARATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS

7. Ibid., 178.
8. Ibid., 179–180.
10. Ibid., 179–182.
11. Ibid., 190.
12. Ibid., 180–181.
13. Ibid., 182.
15. Ibid., 186. See also Dicke, “The Founding Function of Human Dignity.”
17. The quotes taken from the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in this section are from the online version at the UN website: http://www.un.org/Overview/rights.html.
22. Normand and Zaidi, Human Rights at the U.N., 198, my emphasis.
23. Ibid., 179.
25. Ibid., 7–8.
27. Ibid., 187.
28. Ibid., 182.
29. Ibid., 183–184.
30. Ibid., 184.
31. Ibid., 185.
32. Ibid.
33. Ibid., 183.
34. Ibid., 186.
35. Ibid., 187.


40. See the Preamble, in particular.

41. Cf. Rabinow and Bennett, *Contemporary Equipment*.


45. See, e.g., Ticktin and Feldman, *In the Name of Humanity*.


DIAGNOSTIC EXCURSUS: ECONOMIES OF LIFE AND POWER


11. Ibid.
12. Ibid., 6.
17. Ibid., 2.
18. Ibid., 2–3.
29. Namely, Agamben’s *Homo Sacer* and Hardt and Negri’s *Empire*.
30. Rabinow and Rose, “Biopower Today.”
31. Ibid.
33. Rabinow and Rose, “Biopower Today.”
35. Rabinow and Rose, “Biopower Today.”
37. See Rabinow and Bennett, *Designing Human Practices*.
39. Ibid.
40. Ibid., 161.
41. Ibid., 161–162.
42. See ibid., 161–323.
43. Some careful attention has been paid by scholars of philosophy and religion and, in a different mode, by the anthropologist James D. Faubion; the sociologist Nikolas Rose gives brief attention to the question of pastoral power as a general designation for “individualizing power” in his *The Politics of Life Itself*.
45. Ibid., 166.
46. Ibid., 170.
47. Ibid., 167.
48. Ibid., 168.
49. Ibid., 169.
50. Ibid., 196.
51. John Chrysostom’s *De sacerdotio*, the *Epistles* of Saint Cyprian, Saint Ambrose’s *De officiis ministrorum* and the *Liber pastoralis*, John Cassian’s *Conferences* and the *Cenobite Institutes*, the *Letters* of Saint Jerome, and the *Rule* or *Rules* of Saint Benedict.
53. Ibid., 223.
54. Ibid., 228.
55. Ibid., 230.
56. Ibid., 229–231.
57. Ibid., 231–233.
58. Ibid.
59. Ibid. 231–232.
60. Ibid., 232.
61. Ibid., 233.
65. Ibid., 264–270.

67. Ibid., 20.

68. Rabinow, Marking Time.

69. On the double valence of “remediation,” see Rabinow, Marking Time.

5. BIONETHICS AND THE RECONFIGURATION OF BIOPOLITICS


2. All of the texts from the President’s Council, as well as transcripts of their meetings, can be found at http://www.bioethics.gov.


16. Ibid., 65–89.
17. Ibid., 65–66.
18. Ibid., 146–148.
19. Ibid., 96.
21. Ibid., 94–98.
22. Ibid., 98.
24. Ibid., 101.
32. Ibid., 152–153.
33. Belmont Report, part A.
35. Ibid., 230.
40. Ibid., 35.
44. Ibid., 1–28.
45. From the National Human Genome Research Institute website, http://www.genome.gov/12011238.
47. For the HGP’s description of ELSI, see http://www.ornl.gov/sci/techresources/Human_Genome/research/elsi.shtml; see also Peters *Playing God?*, 73.
50. Ibid., 21.
52. Okarma was, at the time of the quote, and still remains, the president and


56. Ibid., 55–81.

57. The council was created by Executive Order 13237, http://www.bioethics.gov/about/executive.html.

58. All the quotes from Kass in this section are taken from his opening address from the January 17, 2002, inaugural meeting of the President’s Council unless otherwise specified.


6. THE BIOPOLITICAL PASTORAL: BEYOND THERAPY

1. Meeting agendas and transcripts can be found at http://www.bioethics.gov/meetings/index.html.


5. President’s Council on Bioethics, Beyond Therapy, 23–24.
6. Ibid., 7.
7. Ibid., 7–8.
8. Ibid., 17–19.
9. Ibid., 17.
10. Ibid.
11. Ibid., 287.
12. Ibid., 289.
13. Ibid., 308.
15. Ibid., 287–290.
16. Ibid., 288.
17. Ibid., 289.
18. Ibid.
19. Ibid., xvi.
20. Ibid., 13.
21. Ibid.
22. Ibid., 291.
23. Ibid., 18.
24. Ibid., 286–287.
26. President’s Council on Bioethics, Beyond Therapy, 292.
27. Ibid., 308.
30. Ibid., 4–7.
31. Ibid., 5.
32. Ibid.
33. Ibid., 6.
34. Ibid., 305.
35. Ibid., 4.
36. Ibid., 305–308.
37. Ibid., 5.
38. Ibid., 7.
40. President’s Council on Bioethics, *Beyond Therapy*, 301.
41. Ibid., 301–310.
44. President’s Council on Bioethics, *Beyond Therapy*, 301.
45. Ibid., 305.
46. Ibid., 301.
47. Ibid., 302.
48. Ibid., 305–308.
49. Ibid., 305.
52. Ibid., 288.
53. Ibid., 23.
54. Ibid.
55. Ibid.
56. Ibid., 11.
63. Leon Kass makes the same point in his essay in the volume.
66. Ibid.
68. President’s Council on Bioethics, *Human Dignity*.
69. Ibid.

**METHODOLOGICAL EPILOGUE: TOWARD AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF FIGURATION**

3. Ibid.
4. Ibid., 2.


11. On connections and distinctions between *bios* and *anthropos* as objects of anthropological investigation, see Paul Rabinow and Anthony Stavrianakis, “Bios: Configurations of Technè and Logos,” http://anthropos-lab.net/studio/episode/17–0.


14. Ibid.
