Modern Subjects/Colonial Texts

Holden, Philip

Published by ELT Press

Holden, Philip.
Project MUSE. muse.jhu.edu/book/25264.

For additional information about this book
https://muse.jhu.edu/book/25264
Chapter 1 Notes

2. Ibid., 24.
3. The concept of strategic essentialism, much reiterated, has its origins in Gayatri Spivak’s praise of the work of the Subaltern Studies group of Indian historians as “a strategic use of essentialism in a scrupulously visible political interest.” See Spivak, *In Other Worlds: Essays in Cultural Politics* (London: Methuen, 1987), 205. Bart Moore-Gilbert reasonably points out that many other post-colonial and anti-colonial intellectuals have advocated similar tactics on the road to certain goals, giving the instance of Frantz Fanon’s qualified endorsement of negritude in *The Wretched of the Earth*. See Moore-Gilbert, *Postcolonial Theory: Contexts, Practices, Politics* (London: Verso, 1997), 179.
6. On being posted to Trinidad, for instance, Clifford wrote “I, who once was outcast in Asia, to-day am outcast from the East, and, behold, the East is claiming me as she never claimed me before! Twenty years—the years which bridge the gulf between boyhood and middle age—have wedded me to Malaya, and now, of a sudden, there has been pronounced against me the decree of a great divorce” See Hugh Clifford, foreword to *Sally: A Study and Other Tales of the Outskirts* (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1904), [ix]-x.
8. Ibid., 93.
15. Ibid., 40.
16. Ibid., 11.
19. Ibid., 206.
20. Ibid.
21. Ibid., 23.
22. Ibid., 110.


24. Bhabha seems to oscillate between seeing the parallel he makes as merely an analogy and presenting it as an objective description of actual psychic structures. For a more extended discussion of this ambiguity, see Robert Young, *White Mythologies: Writing History and the West* (London: Routledge, 1990), 153–54.

28. Ibid., 132.

29. One exception to this is the essay "By Bread Alone," which deals with, or at least takes as its starting point, the rumoured circulation of chapatis during the 1857 Indian Rebellion. See Homi Bhabha, "By Bread Alone: Signs of Violence in the Mid-nineteenth Century." In *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994), 198–211.

31. Ibid., 55.
36. Ibid., 149.
38. Ibid., 198.
39. Ibid., 199.
40. Bhabha, "Signs Taken for Wonders," 175.

41. Gyan Prakash gives a cogent summary of this process: "Enjoying access to the culture of Europe but deeply aware of its limits in the colonies, the nationalist intelligentsia was able to re-situate it, crosshatching it with notions of tradition, history, culture, and justice. It incorporated modern science and polity in the anticolonial agenda but represented them as the return of the indigenous and the archaic; it endorsed women's education and the reform of patriarchy but located them in the project to recover the nation; it declared solidarity with subaltern struggles against agrarian and industrial transformations but turned them into mobilizations for the achievement of a nation-state" See Gyan Prakash, "Who's Afraid of Postcoloniality?", *Social Text*, 49 (Winter 1996), 195.

42. Ella Shohat, "Notes on the 'Post-Colonial,'" *Social Text*, 31/32 (1992), 106.


47. Ibid., 146–47.


49. Bhabha uses the concept of performativity in his essay "DissemiNation" in a manner which is close to Butler's usage. See "DissemiNation: Time, Narrative, and the Margins of the Modern Nation," in Nation and Narration, ed. Homi K. Bhabha (London: Routledge, 1991): 291–322. The nation, Bhabha maintains, exists as a "contested cultural territory . . . in a double-time." The nation's people are both the "historical 'objects' of a nationalist pedagogy" and engaged in a "narrative performance" of nationality which "interpellates a growing circle of national subjects." "The tension between the pedagogic and performative," Bhabha argues, "haunts the symbolic formation of social authority" (297). Curiously, Bhabha's use of the concept in this essay has not been explicitly tied to Butler's in the analysis of gender in colonial discourse.


51. Ibid., 9–10.


53. Ibid., 307.

54. Ibid., 305.


56. Ibid., 333.


59. Ibid., 2.

60. Ibid., 4.


62. Lane, 22.

63. Ibid., 59–60.


65. Lane, 15.

66. Ibid., 17.

67. Ibid., 71.

68. Ibid., 161.
70. Ibid., 25.
71. Ibid., 16.
74. Boone, 104.
75. McClintock, 17.
76. Ibid., 65.
77. The phrase is Kaja Silverman’s. Her reading of T. E. Lawrence’s “double mimesis” of Arab identity in *Seven Pillars of Wisdom* is very much representative of this type of analysis. See Kaja Silverman, *Male Subjectivity at the Margins* (New York: Routledge, 1992).
79. Ann Laura Stoler’s *Race and the Education of Desire: Foucault’s History of Sexuality and the Colonial Order of Things* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1995) is another recent return to Foucault. Stoler is concerned with the function of sexuality as a regulatory mechanism within nineteenth-century European colonial communities, and the imbrication of the discourses of sexuality and race. She revises Foucault’s account of the rise of the bourgeois individual to account for a topic which Foucault hints at, but does not explicitly address, race: “In locating the power of the discourse of sexuality in the affirmation of the bourgeois self, Foucault short-circuited the discursive and practical field of empire in which Western notions of self and other were worked out for centuries and continue to be drawn” (194). Stoler, in contrast to Scott and my analysis here, sees Foucault’s concern with governmentality as a movement away from the issue of race and colonialism to a renewed emphasis on the role of sexuality (25).
80. The phrase “form of power” is somewhat of a simplification of what Foucault has in mind. He gives, in fact, three definitions of governmentality: the techniques used to maintain the new, modern form of power, the tendency of these forms to attain pre-eminence in the process of government, and the resultant process of transformation of older features of the state. See Michel Foucault, “Governmentality.” In *The Foucault Effect: Studies in Governmentality*, ed. Graham Burchell, Colin Gordon and Peter Miller (London: Harvester, 1991), 102–103.
86. Ibid., 199.
87. Ibid., 200.
88. Ibid., 201.
89. Ibid., 214.
90. Hugh Clifford, preface to *The Further Side of Silence* (Garden City: Doubleday, 1923), xi.
91. Ibid., xi.
92. Ibid., x.
94. Ibid., 10.
95. Ibid., 11.
97. Sussman, 3.
100. The individualisation of the homosexual as a specific human type was a direct result of the medicalisation of sexuality in the nineteenth century. Michel Foucault’s comment that the “sodomite had been a temporary aberration; the homosexual was now a species” (*History of Sexuality*, 43) has provided the foundation for a series of studies of late Victorian masculinity: Ed Cohen’s *Talk on the Wilde Side* and Richard Dellamora’s *Masculine Desire* are two works which accord homosexuality a central place in their analyses. See Ed Cohen, *Talk on the Wilde Side: Toward a Genealogy of a Discourse on Male Sexualities* (New York: Routledge, 1993), and Richard Dellamora, *Masculine Desire: The Sexual Politics of Victorian Aestheticism* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1990).
101. Mrinalini Sinha offers a concise summary of the fluctuations of the debate. See Mrinalini Sinha, *Colonial Masculinity: the “Manly Englishman” and the “Effeminate Bengali” in the Late Nineteenth Century* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1995), 3-5. The debate’s basic terms, whether to foster the education of a modern native elite with allegiance to British culture, or whether to museumize native culture and rule through “traditional” centres of authority, were present in policy discussions throughout the British empire.
103. While Medieval Europe is the most common reference point for comparisons with Malay society, it is not the only one. Several commentators, including Clifford, draw parallels between Malay martiality and emotionalism and the same qualities in Celtic people, especially the Irish and the Scots. At one point, Clifford compares Malay polity to the city states of Classical Greece: predictably, perhaps, Sparta, rather than Athens, is the usual state with which comparison is made.
105. Ibid., 15
106. Clifford’s Diary of his Expedition to Pahang, Entry dated 11 February, 1887, PRO, CO 273: 144: 28 April, 1887
109. Ibid., 148
115. Clifford’s picture of Malay despotism is likely to have been influenced by the unusual centralisation of power in Pahang in the 1880s, which resulted from the fact that Sultan Ahmad had previously fought and won a civil war concerning the succession.
117. Ibid., 106.
118. Ibid., 110.
119. Ibid., 28.
120. Ibid., 27.
126. Ibid., 93–94.
127. Ibid., 56.
128. Ibid., 227.
129. Ibid., 246.
130. Ibid., 227.
132. Syed Hussein Alatas, *The Myth of the Lazy Native* (London: Frank Cass, 1977), 138. Alatas himself notes that Abdullah’s critique of Malay indolence is different from that of the majority of the British. In attributing its cause to the social system of the *kerajaan*, and the fact that the raja could dispossess anyone who showed industry, Abdullah produces a social, not a racially essentialist, explanation.
133. Abdullah, 192–93.
134. Ibid., 196–99.
135. Ibid., 301–304.
136. Ibid., 277–79.
137. It is tempting to use a gender-blind pronoun here, but to do so would be misleading: the subject of modernity is normatively male.
138. Abdullah, 118.
NOTES: HUGH CLIFFORD

140. Ibid., 20.
142. The very word *bangsa* carries traces of this contestation. It is normally translated as “race,” as in the phrase *bangsa Melayu*, the Malay race. However, the word also carries strong connotations of nationalism. *Bahasa kebangsaan*, which uses the adjective derived from the noun *bangsa*, is translated as “national language.” The question of the relationship between race and nation was a fraught one for the British colonial administration on the eve of decolonisation, and is still an important question in contemporary Malaysia.
144. Ibid., 280.
145. Ibid., 324–25.
149. Roff, 77. See also Milner’s account of the Malay newspaper *Al Imam*, published in Singapore, and providing an Islamic critique of the traditional rulers’ powers. The newspaper focused upon the idea of a *ummat*, or community of believers, had a progressivist view of history, and perceived its readers as a “rational community.” Anthony C. Milner, *The Invention of Politics in Colonial Malaya. Contesting Nationalism and the Expansion of the Public Sphere* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 190.
157. Ibid., 175.
158. Ibid., 188.
Chapter 2 Notes


2. See Hayden White, *Metahistory: The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Europe* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1973), 1–42. White’s essential point is that no history, or by extension, biography, can merely remain a chronicle: significant events must be selected, causes and effects ascribed, and a narrative structure, driven by both ideological and literary assumptions, followed.


4. Ibid., 5.

5. The frankest account of Clifford’s early life is contained in his typescript letters to Eve Hall, Rhodes House, Oxford, especially that written on 12 May 1925.


8. Ibid.


10. Many colonial officials felt that a Roman Catholic clique was running the colony and sanctioning appointments in the Malay States. See, for example, Emily Innes’s remark that after her husband was passed over for the Residency of Sugei Unjong in favour of a Mr. Paul: “there were not wanting scandalous people who said it was due to the fact of Mr. Paul's being of the same religion with the chief officials in Singapore, who happened at this time to be mostly Roman Catholics. Indeed, I have several times heard it remarked in the States that ‘Protestants have no chance’” Emily Innes, *The Chersonese with the Gilding Off*, 2 vols. (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University Press, 1993), vol 2: 212–13.


15. Ibid., 366.


17. Ibid., vol. 2, 134.

18. Clifford, preface to *The Life of Sir Frederick Weld*, xiii.

19. Clifford annotated a copy of *Sally: A Study and Other Tales of the Outskirts* with the comment that Pope Hennessy was “the most wicked man that ever held gubernatorial rank... an... Irish M.P. whom Gladstone made Governor of Labuan in order to get him out of the House of
Commons.” See the copy of Sally: A Study and Other Tales of the Outskirts (Edinburgh: Blackwood: 1904), 275, with Clifford’s annotations in the Rare Books Room, National University of Singapore Library.

20. Ahmad had by this time already declared himself Sultan, rather than his previous title Bendahara, which was a relic of the former paramountcy of the Johore-Lingga Sultanate. The British, keen to extend their influence in Pahang, did not accept the change in title. See Aruna Gopinath, Pahang 1880-1933: A Political History. MBRAS Monographs no. 18 (Kuala Lumpur: MBRAS, 1991).

21. All quotations here are taken from Clifford’s own diary of his mission to Pahang, which appears as an enclosure to correspondence dated April 28, 1887, PRO, CO 273/144.


26. See Chapter 4 for a fuller discussion.

27. Frank Athelstane Swettenham, whom Clifford spent time with on one of his visits to Singapore, and his collaborator on the Malay-English dictionary.

28. Clifford, Personal Diary for 1893, 129.

29. Clifford’s manuscript annotations to In a Corner of Asia (London: Unwin, 1899), Rare Book Room, National University of Singapore Library, 3.

30. See, for example, the essays “Some Notes on the Sakai Dialects of the Malay Peninsula,” JSBRAS, 24 (December 1891), 13–29, and “A New Collection of Malay Proverbs,” JSBRAS, 24 (December 1891), 87–120.

31. See, for example, the series of letters in response to Clifford’s letter “Some Aspects of Mahomedanism,” Spectator, 90 (1903), 48–49, to which he in turn replied.

32. Gailey, 41.


34. Clifford, “Minute by his Excellency Sir Hugh Clifford, G. M. C. G., Dated 18th March, 1922.” In Indirect Administration (Secretariat: Kaduna, Nigeria 1936), 6.

35. Ibid., 9.


37. Clifford to Edward Clodd, 29 August 1927, Brotherton Library, University of Leeds.


41. Clifford, “Mr Joseph Conrad at Home and Abroad,” Singapore Free Press, 1 September 1898, 142.


44. Clifford, "Three Books of Short Stories and a Novel," review of A Romance of Canvas Town and Other Stories by Rolf Boldrewood, That Little Cutty, and Other Stories, by Mrs. Oliphant, and Her Memory by Maarten Maartens, Singapore Free Press, 6 April 1899, 214.


46. Clifford, "Volumes of Recent Verse," review of verse collections by Stephen Newbolt, Mr. Newbolt, and Alma Tadema (titles not given), Singapore Free Press, 23 June 1898, 400.

47. Clifford, "Mr. Joseph Conrad at Home and Abroad," 142.

48. See, for example, the partly autobiographical "From Beyond the Bourne" In Days that are Dead (Garden City: Doubleday, 1926), 297.


50. Clifford, Sally, x.

51. Clifford, Studies in Brown Humanity, x.


55. Ibid., 103.

56. The phrase is Michel Foucault's. Foucault notes the post-enlightenment stress upon authorial genius, in which the "author's name manifests the appearance of a certain discursive set and indicates the status of this discourse within a society and a culture." See Michel Foucault, "What is an Author?" In Modern Criticism and Theory: A Reader, ed. David Lodge (London: Longman, 1988), 202. The text, and ideological forces outside the text, construct the author for the reader through a "complex operation," while attributing this construction to the author as sovereign individual.


59. See Clifford's manuscript annotations to the story "In Chains" in a copy of Bush-Whacking and Other Sketches (London: Blackwood, 1901), made while Clifford was Governor of Nigeria, 24–26 December, 1924, National University of Singapore Library, Rare Books Room.


62. Ibid.

63. Ibid., 171.

64. Ibid., 173.
NOTES : HUGH CLIFFORD

65. Ibid.
68. Clifford, Bushwhacking and Other Asiatic Tales and Memories, 45.
69. Clifford, In Days that are Dead (Garden City: Doubleday, 1926), 31.
70. In annotations made to a copy of Bush-Whacking and Other Sketches (London: Blackwood, 1901), annotations made while Clifford was Governor of Nigeria, 24–26 December 1924, National University of Singapore Library, Rare Books Room. Clifford identifies himself as the narrator of the story on page 149.
71. See Chapter 2 for a full account of this relationship.
72. Clifford, In Days that are Dead, 57.
73. Ibid., 57–58.
74. See Chapter 3 for a close reading of the story.
75. Clifford, In Days that are Dead, 37–38.
76. Ibid., 27–28.
79. Clifford, In Days that are Dead, 58.
80. Ibid., 59.
81. Ibid. 58.
83. Clifford, In Days that are Dead, 32.
84. Ibid., 65–66.
85. Ibid., 60.
86. Ibid., 72.
87. Ibid., 74.
88. Ibid.
89. Ibid., 48.
90. Ibid.
91. Ibid., 73.
92. Ibid., 31.
93. Ibid., 36.
94. Ibid., 31.
95. Ibid., 24.
96. Ibid., 24.
97. Ibid., 73.

Chapter 3 Notes

2. Ibid., 5.
3. Ibid., 8.
7. Ibid., 67.
10. Ibid., 82.
13. Ibid., 173.
16. Hendrik M. J. Maier, *In the Centre of Authority: The Malay Hikayat Merong Mahawangsa* (Studies on Southeast Asia, Southeast Asia Program, Cornell University [Ithaca], 1988), 34.
17. Ibid., 35.
19. Maier, 51.
22. Ibid.
27. See Clifford's annotations to the story in a copy of In a Corner of Asia, National University of Singapore Library, 196. Clifford also re-tells the story in the Annual Report of the State of Pahang for the Year 1898, PRO, CO 437.
29. Ibid., 200.
30. Ibid.
32. There are a few other clues. The Hikayat Pahang, for example, insists that Goh Hui was not a British subject.
34. Thio, 91-92.
37. Clifford, In a Corner of Asia, 227.
43. Contemporary discussions of manliness, and indeed of community, in Malaysia are often filtered through a discourse of self-discipline that is inherited from the "shared culture" of colonialism. Mahathir bin Mohamad's discussion of Malay ethical codes in The Malay Dilemma, for instance, criticises the inability "to control desires and to direct will-power" as a deficiency in Malays. See Mahathir, The Malay Dilemma (Singapore: Times, 1970), 161.
44. J. M. Gullick, Malay Society in the Late Nineteenth Century (Singapore: Oxford University Press, 1987), 192.
45. In this aspect, the dandy represents as metaphorisation of subject individual as subject landscape. Mary Louise Pratt's three elements of the "master of all I survey" gaze of the imperial travel writer—aestheticization, density of meaning, and mastery can be easily applied to Innes's surveillance of the dandy. See Pratt, Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation (London: Routledge, 1992): 204-205.
47. See Hugh Clifford, At the Court of Pelesu and Other Stories, ed. William R. Roff (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University Press, 1993), 12. Medievalism as a discourse is common to most British writers describing traditional Malay society. The spectacle of Malay society was also a backward glance down the arduously travelled road to modernity: "The chroniclers of Medieval Europe tell only of Princes and Nobles, and Knights and Dames—and merry tales they are—but we are left to guess what was the condition of the bulk of the lower classes in Thirteenth-Century England. If we knew all, however, it is probable that their lot would prove to have been but little more fortunate than is that of the Malay raayat of to-day, whose hard-
ships and grievances, under native rule, move our modern souls to indignation and compassion." See Clifford, *At the Court of Pelesu and Other Stories*, 13. The spectacle of the pre-modern here enables the English reader to confirm his or her modernity through the showing of compassion, thus reinforcing the synonymity of modernity and Britishness. It is interesting that the French writer, Henri Fauconnier, uses Loti’s primitivism and analogies with Homer to describe Malaya in his novel *The Soul of Malaya*: clearly the use of medieval tropes by British writers is connected to the revival of chivalry in nineteenth century Britain. See Philip Holden, "Love, Death and Nation: Representing Amok in British Malaya," *Literature and History*, 6.1 (Spring 1997), 43-62.


52. See the discussion of "Greater Love" later in this chapter.
54. Adams, 54.
56. Adams, 54.
58. Ibid., 9.
60. Ibid., 165.
61. Ibid., 162.
62. Ibid., 160.
63. Ibid., 168.

64. In a journal article Clifford considers "whether Christianity is well adapted to the temperament of the brown Oriental races in their present state of moral and intellectual development" and concludes "that it is undoubtedly less markedly suited to them than is Mahommedanism." See Clifford, "America's Problem in the Philippines." *Macmillan's Magazine*, Series 2. Vol. 2 (1906), 75. Islam is a lighter technology of the self here, which prepares the way for modernity. Clifford’s views upon Islam’s regenerative potential, indeed, remained constant throughout his administrative career, although he did express doubts about how readily it might be discarded when an appropriate stage of modernity was reached. In a letter to the *Spectator*, he argued that while Islam had the ability to bind a society together, it was ultimately resistant to "reform." See Clifford, "Some aspects of Mahommedanism," *Spectator*, 90 (1903), 49. As Governor of Nigeria in the 1920s, he again constructed the largely Islamic emirates of the North of the colony as feudal kingdoms, further up on the scale of social evolution than the decentralised political systems of the Igbo Southeast.

65. Clifford, "A Halt on the King’s Highway," *Blackwood’s Magazine*, 170 (1901), 120.
69. Ibid.
NOTES : HUGH CLIFFORD


71. Clifford, Since the Beginning: A Tale of an Eastern Land (London: Grant Richards, 1898), 33.


73. Clifford, Malayan Monochromes, 1.

74. The affair followed revelations in the press that messenger boys at the Central Telegraph Office had been procured for sexual services by members of the aristocracy. It was the first widely publicised case of prosecution under section 11 of the Criminal Law Amendment Act. See Ed Cohen, Talk on the Wilde Side: Toward a Genealogy of a Discourse on Male Sexualities (New York: Routledge, 1993), 121–25.

75. This is, of course, a very truncated account. Jeffrey Weeks gives a fuller account of nineteenth-century sexological constructions of the homosexual as subject to uncontrollable passion, and essentially unable to govern the self. See Jeffrey Weeks, “Inverts, Perverts and Mary-Annes: Male Prostitution and the Regulation of Homosexuality in England in the Late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries,” Journal of Homosexuality, 6.1/2 (1980), 113–34.


79. Annotations made to a copy of Bush-Whacking and Other Sketches (London: Blackwood, 1901) while Clifford was Governor of Nigeria, 24–26 December 1924, 61. National University of Singapore Library, Rare Books Room.


81. George Maxwell recalled, for instance, that “Clifford was a magnificent walker. He told me that he could cover the forty miles of bridle path between Kuala Lipis and Raub, between the sunrise & sunset. He also said that “Teddy” Wise, his greatest friend, could cover the distance in ten hours.” See A. J. Stockwell, “Sir Hugh Clifford in Malaya, 1927–29; ‘pinang pulang ka-tampok,’” JMBRAS, 53.2 (December 1980), 44.


83. In the 1894 Pahang Annual Report, Clifford was relatively circumspect, noting that Walker made a “somewhat impetuous attack” and that “for some reason, which I am unable to explain or understand, two dressers who were then at Kuala Tembeling were left behind at that station.” See Clifford, Annual Report on the State of Pahang for the Year 1894, PRO, CO 437/1,15.

84. Reports of the incident from Walker, Talbot, and Lyons were enclosed with Straits Settlements Correspondence of 9 July 1894, PRO, CO 273/196. On his return to Selangor, Lyons made a further report on the complete expedition to Pahang, which includes a detailed description of the events at Jeram Ampai, and which is preserved as “Report on Expedition to Pahang,” Selangor Secretariat File Police 4496/1894, Arkib Negara, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

85. The unit also contained a number of Pathan soldiers, and is sometimes referred to as the “Selangor Pathans” in Colonial Office correspondence on the issue.

87. Ibid., 12.

88. Helen Kanitkar notes that British juvenile fiction of empire frequently celebrates "martial races." "Among them are Sikhs, the tribesmen of the North-West Frontier and Gurkhas, who are seen as exemplifying familiar martial qualities of courage and respect for orderly discipline, both of which are admired by the imperial English": in the Indian context, martial races are often contrasted with the Anglicised, educated, and therefore effeminate Bengali. Helen Kanitkar, "'Real True Boys': Moulding the Cadets of Imperialism." In Dislocating Masculinity: Comparative Ethnographies, ed. Andrea Cornwall and Nancy Lindisfarne (London: Routledge, 1994), 191-92.

89. Clifford refers to an ambush in "Bushwhacking" and gives additional information in his annotations. See annotations in NUS library made to a copy of "Bush-Whacking," in Bush-Whacking and Other Asiatic Tales and Memories (New York: Harper, 1929), 46. A more detailed account of the specific incident, which Clifford notes was narrated to him by Wise, is given in his annotations to the story "Greater Love," in a copy of Sally: A Study, and Other Tales of the Outskirts (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1904), 242-43. It is here that Clifford identifies Burton as Wise.

90. It would probably be wrong to attribute a nationalist consciousness to Bahaman, Mat Kilau, and the other "rebels," but it is clear that they saw their struggle as more than a personal one, embracing a racial and religious community's resistance to the British.

91. Clifford, Sally: A Study and Other Tales of the Outskirts (Edinburgh: Blackwood, 1904), 247.

92. Clifford, Sally: A Study and Other Tales of the Outskirts, 257.

93. Ibid., 257.

94. Ibid., 258.

95. Frank Athelstane Swettenham, Unaddressed Letters (London: John Lane, 1911), 221-22.

96. Clifford, Sally: A Study and Other Tales of the Outskirts, 259.

97. Ibid., 249.

98. Ibid., 260-61.

99. Ibid., 262.

100. Ibid.

101. Ibid., 265

102. Ibid., 265.


104. Clifford, Sally: A Study and Other Tales of the Outskirts, 268.

Chapter 4 Notes


NOTES

7. Ruskin, 259.
8. Poovey, 50.
9. Leonard Woolf served under Clifford in Ceylon, and recalled that “Clifford was a tremendous ‘lady’s man,’ and while he was Acting Governor, a glamorous lady, the wife of an officer in the Indian Army, visited Kandy for a few weeks. One evening, riding with Rachel in Lady Horton’s Walk, a carriage passed us in which sat Clifford and the lady, and a brief glimpse showed that the lady had made a conquest of the Acting Governor of Ceylon.” See Leonard Woolf, Growing: An Autobiography of the Years 1904–1911 (London: Hogarth, 1961), 170. Clifford asked Woolf to arrange a show of “Kandyan dancing” and “the glamorous lady, for whom all this was done, was properly appreciative, and Clifford was immensely pleased.” See Woolf, 171. Pat Barr also recounts anecdotes regarding Clifford’s eye for women told to her by the wife of a British planter in Malaya. See Pat Barr, Taming the Jungle: The Men Who Made British Malaya (London: Secker and Warburg, 1977), 149.
11. Ibid., 48.
14. Ibid.
17. Ibid., 291.
24. Ibid., 11.

28. Mills, "Knowledge, Gender, and Empire," 47.


30. Ibid., 323.


32. Ibid., vol. 1, 13.

33. Ibid., 47.

34. Ibid., 37–38.

35. Ibid., vol. 2, 17.


37. Innes, vol. 1, 139.

38. Susan Morgan feels that sometimes Innes moves towards a "disinterested sympathy" with Malays. See Susan Morgan, Place Matters: Gendered Geography in Victorian Women's Travel Books about Southeast Asia (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1996), 174. Yet Innes's account of the Sultan of Selangor's daughter, Tunku Chik, which Morgan holds up as potentially subversive of a patriarchal colonial order, does not seem so upon close examination; rather, it is based upon orientalist premises. Innes' comment that Malays were often not improved by their contact with the English is, similarly, not automatically subversive. It is a common theme in colonial writings, especially Clifford's, and used to promote an ideology of separate development in which Malay culture is museumised.


46. Callaway, Gender, Culture and Empire, 167.


48. Ibid., 207.
50. Ibid., 235.
51. Ibid., 218.
52. Ibid., 219.
53. Ibid., 225.
54. Ibid., 227.
55. Ibid., 229.
56. Ibid., 222.
57. Ibid., 249.
58. Ibid., 239.
60. See Clifford’s annotations to a copy of *Sally: A Study and Other Tales of the Outskirts*, Rare Book Room, National University of Singapore Library, 274-75.
62. Ibid., 279.
63. Ibid., 288.
64. Ibid., 289.
65. Ibid., 290.
66. Ibid., 292.
67. Ibid., 280.
68. Ibid., 277.
69. Ibid., 289.
71. Ibid., 230.
73. Ibid., 284.
74. Ibid., 285.
75. Ibid., 284.
76. Ibid., 295.
77. Ibid.
78. Ibid., 290.
79. Ibid., 291.
80. Ibid., 296.
81. See Fred Botting’s discussion of the contradictory roots of the Gothic in *Gothic*, New Critical Idiom Series (New York: Routledge, 1996), 21–43. While the Gothic referred in the eighteenth century to a pre-Enlightenment, and therefore barbarous and superstitious past, it might also be deployed as a celebration of ancient liberties. Bram Stoker’s *Dracula*, written during the same period as Clifford’s stories, clearly shows how by the late nineteenth century such affiliations had been embroidered into racial histories.
82. In his annotations to a copy of *Studies in Brown Humanity* (London: Grant Richards, 1898) Clifford indicates that the story is based upon an incident which he either witnessed or was informed of (the latter seems more likely) in 1887. The “Chief” of the story here is To’ Ga-


84. Ibid., 139.


89. Ibid., 264.


91. Ibid., 80.


93. The hierarchy is often elaborated in considerable detail. In “The Flight of Chep, the Bird,” a Malay man is attractive to an orang asli woman because he is “a man of superior race,” and one of the “dominant foreign race.” See Clifford, In Court and Kampung, 76, 79. Clifford also suggests, however, that the Malays who live in close proximity to aboriginal peoples are not so very different from them in terms of social evolution. Such precise gradations also apply to the question of whiteness. In “The King of the Sedangs” Malay men on Tioman complain to their District Officer of a Frenchman’s presence on their island, commenting that he “is the wrong sort of white man, having much that is black about him.” See Clifford, Heroes in Exile, 77.


95. Ibid., 8.

96. Ibid., 7.

97. Ibid., 31.

98. Ibid., 14.

99. Ibid., 8.

100. Ibid., 12.


102. This is Saw’s opinion. Certainly Since the Beginning was written not long after Clifford’s marriage, and there is evidence that he may earlier have had a relationship with a Malay woman called Munah or Minah. Given the extant evidence, however, biographical speculation is, after a certain point, fruitless. More interesting is the manner in which Clifford publicly constructs an “author function” through his fictional works.


109. Ibid., 49.
NOTES : HUGH CLIFFORD

110. Ibid., 50.
111. Clifford, *Since the Beginning*, 42.
112. Ibid., 179.
114. Ibid.
116. Ibid., 42–43.
117. Ibid., 44.
118. Clifford, *Since the Beginning*, 90.
119. Ibid., 91.
120. Ibid., 114.
121. Ibid., 179.
122. Ibid., 214.
124. Ibid., 7.
125. Clifford, *Annual Report on the State of Pahang for the Year 1890*, PRO, CO 437/1, 12. This report was completed by Clifford in his capacity as Acting Resident.

**Chapter 5 Notes**

3. Ibid., 13.
5. Clifford’s two major periods of convalescence were from October 1888 to January 1890, and from October 1901 to September 1903. His service record also lists 29 days sick leave taken in 1892 See PRO, CO 273/295/4628.
11. I have adopted this terminology from Robert Winzeler, since there is considerable medical and sociological debate about the nature of *amuk* and *latah*. See Winzeler, *Latah in Southeast Asia: The History and Ethnography of a Culture-Bound Syndrome* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995). For *latah*, R. C. Simons notes that there are “three logically distinct positions . . . now current: that latah is a culture-typical elaboration of the manifestations of hyperstartling, that it is some sort of hysterical syndrome, and that it is some sort of custom, explicable functionally.” See Simons, “Commentary: the Interminable Debate on the Nature of Latah,” *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease*, 182 (6 June 1994), 340.
13. Ibid., 8.
15. Ibid., 105.
16. Ibid., 231.
17. Ibid.
20. Ibid., 80.
21. Lee Yong Kiat, 265.
22. Ibid., 268.
27. Ibid., 17.
29. Ibid., 189.
30. Ibid., 195-96.
31. Ibid., 212.
32. Ibid., 213.
33. Clifford, *Studies in Brown Humanity* (London: Richards, 1927), 191. Robert Winzeler notes that while doing fieldwork in Pasir Mas, Kelantan, in 1966 one of his friends, Pak Tengah, told him of an incident that very much resembled the one Clifford discusses in his story. "Pak Tengah described the incident as a "story" (cerita) which he knew rather than an occurrence which he himself had witnessed. I have sometimes wondered if this story had its origins in Clifford's written account or, alternatively, if the incident Clifford described derived in whole or part from Malay oral tradition." See Winzeler, *Latah in Southeast Asia*, 2. This anecdote illustrates the complex genealogy of narratives of latah in both colonial British and modern Malaysian accounts.
34. Winzeler notes that it has been suggested that latah actually began as a response to colonialism, since there is "little evidence of latah in the Malayan world before the latter part of the nineteenth century." See Winzeler, *Latah in Southeast Asia*, 25. Thus its imitative nature may have been a reflection that "Europeans came to be increasingly seen as powerful figures worthy of copying. But since Europeans were also very different, efforts to do so were inherently problematic and frustrating, which led to extremes, that is to latah." Winzeler, *Latah in Southeast Asia*, 26. Having begun in urban centres, latah became indigenized and moved back to the countryside, so that it came to be seen as a rural phenomenon. The explanation is extremely inventive, and would constitute a curious example of Bhabha's notion of mimicry as a form of
NOTES : HUGH CLIFFORD

resistance—especially given the obscenities uttered by the orang latah. Winzeler, however, is inclined to reject it in terms of simpler—and to me more plausible—explanations.

35. Winzeler, Latah in Southeast Asia, 27.

36. Curiously, the majority of nineteenth-century colonial accounts of latah, while stressing the act that latah is a syndrome to which women are particularly vulnerable, nonetheless have male protagonists. Winzeler suggests that this is probably because most early European observers, lacking the access to asylums and prisons which later observers had, would have had little contact with Malay women (Latah in Southeast Asia, 30). European men such as Swettenham and Clifford would have been best acquainted with two areas of Malay society firstly, the rajas and district chiefs, and secondly, their own followers (13); both of these were preponderantly male. Contact with women would have been considered improper, and British men were unlikely to wish to publicly acknowledge relationships with concubines. Winzeler’s argument is persuasive, but it still seems to me important to see the stress upon the femininity of latah, in frequent contradiction to textual examples, as influenced by ideological presuppositions regarding race and gender.


40. Ibid.


42. Ibid., 116.


44. Ibid., 149.

45. Ibid., 119.


48. Ibid., 187.

49. Ibid., 186.

50. Ibid., 195.

51. Ibid., 201.

52. Ibid., 196.

53. Ibid.

54. Ibid., 199–200.

55. Ibid., 194.


57. Ibid.

58. Ibid., 105.

59. Ibid.

60. Ibid., 106.

61. Ibid., 136.
62. Ibid.
63. Ibid., 115.
65. Ibid., 204.
66. Ibid., 204-5.
67. Ibid., 240.
68. Amok, in its Portuguese form *amouco* or *amuco* seems to have entered English in the early sixteenth century. By the eighteenth century, it was a sufficiently familiar word to be used metaphorically in a non-Malayan context: "Satire's my weapon, but I'm too discreet/To run a muck, and tilt at all I meet." See Alexander Pope, "The First Satire of the Second Book of Horace Imitated." In *Poetical Works*, ed. Herbert Davis. (London: Oxford University Press, 1966), 343. It is not until the nineteenth century, however, that amok comes to stand metonymically for "Malayness."
69. For instance, Mahathir bin Mohamad's comments in *The Malay Dilemma*: "Amok is a Malay word. It is a word now universally understood. There is no single word that can quite describe amok. And the reason is obvious—for amok describes yet another facet of the Malay character. Amok represents the external physical expression of the conflict within the Malay which his perpetual observance of the rules and regulations of life causes in him. It is a spilling over, an overflowing of his inner bitterness. It is a rupture of the bonds which bind him. It is a final and complete escape from reason and training. The strain and the restraint on him is lifted. He is free.... The link with the past is severed, the future holds nothing more. Only the present matters. To use a hackneyed expression, he sees red. In a trance he lashes out indiscriminately. His timid, self-effacing self is displaced. He is now a Mr Hyde—cruel, callous and bent on destruction. But the transition from the self-effacing courteous Malay to the amok is always a slow process. It is so slow that it may never come about at all. He may go to his grave before the turmoil in him explodes." See Mahathir bin Mohamad, *The Malay Dilemma* (Singapore: Times, 1970), 117-18. It is not insignificant that Mahathir illustrates his character analysis through reference to a late nineteenth century British novel.
70. I follow contemporary theoretical models in the social sciences by viewing race as primarily a constructed category. Charles Hirschmann's two articles provide a genealogy of the deployment of racial categorization by British census officials in the Straits Settlements and Malaya in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. In the author's view, ethnic categories in pre-colonial Southeast Asia were not marked by "impenetrable group boundaries.... Direct colonial rule brought European racial theory and constructed a social and economic order structured by 'race.'" See Hirschmann, "The Making of Race in Colonial Malaya: Political Economy and Racial Ideology," *Sociological Forum*, 1 (1986), 330. In post-independence Malaysia, the word "race" on census questionnaires has been replaced with the word "community," requiring the invention of a new word, *kommuniti*, in Bahasa Malaysia. See "The Meaning and Measurement of Ethnicity in Malaysia: An Analysis of Census Classifications," *Journal of Asian Studies* 46 (1987): 562.
NOTES: HUGH CLIFFORD

85. Ibid., 340.
86. Ibid., 319.
88. Kinloch, 135. Robert Winzeler’s comment upon European representation of amok provides a useful heuristic: “In evaluating the reliability of European writings on amok, especially regarding matters of frequency, it needs to be kept in mind that amok was a political issue and not merely a matter of medical and legal interest or of ethnographic curiosity.” See Winzeler, “Amok: Historical, Psychological, and Cultural Perspectives,” in *Emotions of Culture: A Malay Perspective*, ed. Wazir Jahan Karim (Singapore: Oxford University Press, 1990), 119. The disparity between the voluminous number of depictions of amok in colonial ethnography, travel writing and fiction and the paucity of first-hand accounts is suggestive.
90. In this respect amok is similar to two other tropes of European colonial literature: cannibalism and leprosy. Stephen Slemmon notes that cannibalism “is a figure in which colonialism’s own internal economy is marked out by representation, disavowed, and then projected onto colonialism’s Other” See Slemmon, Stephen. “Bones of Contention: Post-Colonial Writing and the ‘Cannibal’ Question,” in *Literature and the Body*, ed. Anthony Purdy (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1992), 167. Helen Tiffin remarked to me, in a conversation in December 1994, that colonial representations of leprosy focus obsessively upon the disease even after its threat to European populations has largely disappeared. Construction of leprosy as a disease which turns dark skins white illustrates its position in reinscription of the boundaries of European communities in the colonies. However, there is little suggestion of this in the colonial accounts of leprosy written in Malaya and discussed above.
92. Ibid., 99.
94. Ibid.
95. Ibid., 115.
96. Ibid., 95.
97. Donald E. Hall, Introduction to *Muscular Christianity: Embodying the Victorian Age* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1994), 11. The arbitrary nature of this past/present opposition is illustrated by Henri Fauconnier in an article written in the 1940s, looking back upon his life in Malaya in the 1920s: "The old-time planter, and the planter of today come from the same stock, but circumstances have created different types. If comparing them one could say that the first had been a young man willing to take all risks, the other is a mature man concerned with avoiding risks; the primitive man of action, compared with the civilized reflective thinker." See Henri Fauconnier, *The Soul of Malaya*, trans. Eric Sutton (Kuala Lumpur: Oxford University Press, 1980), ix. Yet in the 1920s Maugham's protagonists lament the passing of the freedom of action of the last century. Novels of late nineteenth century, such as Conrad's *An Outcast of the Islands*, romanticize a past which has moved even further back: Willems' shrunken quotidian reality forms a sharp contrast with the romantic escapades of Lingard's youth.
98. Donald Hall, 10.
102. Ibid., 69.
103. Ibid.
106. Ibid., 44.
107. Ibid., 43.
110. Ibid., 99.
114. Ibid., 72.
115. Ibid., 185.
116. Ibid.
118. The novel was originally published in two parts, as *Sally: a Study* (1904) and *Saleh: a Sequel* (1908), and did not appear as a complete work until its publication as *A Prince of Malaya* in 1926. In discussing Clifford's text, I follow the OUP edition of 1989, which is a reprint of the

120. Ibid.
121. Ibid., 85.
122. Ibid., 187.
123. Ibid., 28-29.
124. Ibid., 28.
125. Ibid., 46.
126. Ibid., 83.
127. Ibid., 9.
128. Ibid., 10.
129. Ibid., 3.
130. Ibid., 196.
131. Ibid., 42.
132. Ibid., 65-66.
133. Ibid., 113.
134. Ibid., 34-35.
135. Ibid., 92.
136. Ibid.
137. Ibid., 42.
138. Ibid., 117.
141. Ibid., 251.
142. Ibid., 252.
143. Ibid., 117.
144. Ibid., 42.
145. Ibid., 251.
146. Ibid., 252.
148. In his review essay "The Art of Mr. Joseph Conrad" Clifford approves of *Heart of Darkness*, which he views as a powerful study of "denationalization", in which "the power of the wilderness, of contact with barbarism and elemental men and facts, to effect the demoralization of the white man is shown." See Clifford, "The Art of Mr. Joseph Conrad," *Living Age*, 236 (10 January 1903), 122. Nor does Clifford find Conrad's writing technique at all destabilising: rather than seeing the novella's proto-modernist style as in any way disruptive, Clifford praises it as more realistic than realism," superior to the trammels of ordinary realism." See "The Art of Mr. Joseph Conrad," 121.
Chapter 6 Notes

1. The anecdote and quotations are taken from Clifford’s annotations to a copy of Bush­Whacking and Other Sketches (London: Blackwood, 1901), 141, made while Clifford was Governor of Nigeria, 24–26 December 1924 in the National University of Singapore Library, Rare Books Room. The book was presented by Clifford to Eve Hall.

2. Clifford mentions this fact in his foreword to the later collection In Days that are Dead (Garden City: Doubleday, 1926).

3. The collection is “abridged and adapted to meet the requirements of pupils of the lower secondary school.” See Stories of Malayan Adventure, adapted for schools by D. H. Howe (London: Harrap, 1962), [ii].


14. Ibid.

15. Ibid., 175.

16. Ibid., 167.


25. The Queen’s Scholarships were set up in 1885 in order to enable the best products of the education system in the Straits Settlements to further their education in Britain. Up to 1903, of the 33 scholars, 20 were Europeans or Eurasians, 11 Chinese, and 2 Indians.
26. The May Fourth Movement takes its name from the date of a demonstration by Chinese students on May 4, 1919, in Beijing, to protest against the cession of Shandong to Japan in the Treaty of Versailles. The movement involved, among other elements, efforts to write in the common language or baihua, rather than Classical Chinese, and a revolutionary rejection of much "tradition," including Confucianism.


30. The series of comments are reproduced in Straits Chinese Magazine, 1 (1897), [34].


34. Clifford, In a Corner of Asia (London: Unwin, 1899), 197-198.

35. Ibid., 199–200.

36. Untitled review of Clifford's In a Corner of Asia, Straits Chinese Magazine, 6 (1903), 116.

37. Lim Boon Keng is the Hokkien transliteration of Lim's Chinese name. At times Lim would use Mandarin-based transcriptions—Lin Wen Ching, W.C. Lin, and Wen Ching.


39. Ibid., 121.

40. Ibid.


44. Lew See Fah, "The Correspondence of Lew See Fah. Straits Chinese Maidens," Straits Chinese Magazine, 6 (1902), 84.

45. Ibid., 50.


48. Ibid.


55. Ibid., 143.

56. Ibid.


59. The Raffles Library was founded as the Singapore Library in 1844. At first it was a proprietary library, but, in 1874 the Colonial Government, while establishing a Public Library and Museum, took over the library. At that time it had about 3,000 volumes, and by 1905 the collection had grown to 30,000 volumes. While it is difficult to estimate circulation and relative popularity of various books, the 1900 catalogue does illustrate that the library had extensive holdings in both literary and popular fiction. In 1900 it held three copies of East Coast Etchings, and copies of In a Corner of Asia, In Court and Kampong, Since the Beginning, and Studies in Brown Humanity, as well as of Clifford’s Malay Dictionary. Other popular authors included Emile Zola, Israel Zangwill, Charlotte Yonge, Edmund Yates, Mrs Henry Wood, John Strange Winter, William Westall, H. G. Wells, Florence Warden, Jules Verne (mostly in translation), Sarah Tytler, Mark Twain, Anthony Trollope, Anne Thomas, W. M. Thackeray, Alfred Tennyson, Swinburne, Frank Stockton, R. L. Stevenson, Herbert Spencer, Hawley Smart, Samuel Smiles, Walter Scott, George Augustus Sala, W. Clark Russell, Ruskin, "Rita", Mrs. J. H. Riddell, Mayne Reid, Charles Reid, James Payn, "Ouida", Mrs. Oliphant, W. E. Norris, Christie Murray, George Meredith, Florence Marryat, Captain Fred Marryat, Rev. George MacDonald, Lord Bulwer Lytton, Andrew Lang, Charles Kingsley, Kipling, Henry James, Washington Irving, G. A. Henty, Bret Harte, Rider Haggard, the Hakluyt Society’s publications of accounts of voyages, James Grant, J. A. Froude, G. M. Fenn, Alexander Dumas, Arthur Conan Doyle, Dickens, de Quincey, Defoe, Darwin, Wilkie Collins, Carlyle, Fenimore Cooper, and Walter Besant. See the Catalogue of the Raffles Library, Singapore, 1900 (Singapore: American Mission Press, 1905).

60. Goh Keng Hood, editorial in the Straits Chinese Literary Association Recorder, 1.1 (15 March 1918), 8. The Recorder was a substantially less ambitious effort than the Straits Chinese Magazine, and each issue had separate pagination. A volume system was retrospectively introduced, and I follow this in giving page references.


64. Ibid., 17.


66. Ibid., 63.

67. “Press Opinions,” Straits Chinese Magazine, 1 (1897), [34].


72. Ibid., 132–33.


74. Ibid., 108. Singapore Chinese Girls School was founded in 1899.


NOTES : HUGH CLIFFORD

78. Ibid., 93.
79. Ibid.
80. Ibid., 92.
81. Ibid., 93.
82. T.B.G., Ibid., 92.
83. Ibid.
84. Ibid., 96.
85. Ibid., 161.
86. Ibid., 162.
87. Ibid., 95.
90. “Rodney’s Salvation” is one of the very few anonymous stories published by the magazine. There are some similarities in the phrases used in the story and those in subsequent editorials written by Song and Lim, although these are not close enough to establish authorship.
94. Ibid., 7.
95. Ibid., 8.
96. Ibid.
97. Ibid.
98. Ibid.
99. Ibid.
100. Ibid., 9.
101. Ibid.
102. Ibid., 11.
103. Ibid.

Chapter 7 Notes

2. This is the Singapore Government’s own phrase. See the discussion in Michael Hill and Lian Kwen Fee, The Politics of Nation Building and Citizenship in Singapore (London: Routledge, 1995).


7. McCleod’s Syllabus of Instruction is preserved in Raffles Institution Archive, Raffles Institution, Singapore.


12. Ibid., 7.

13. Nick Cumming-Bruce’s “British Q.C. Lashes Singapore P.M.,” Guardian, August 20 1997, 12, is typical in this regard. While maintaining his point that Goh conspicuously failed in his attempt to defend Singapore as a liberal democracy, Cumming-Bruce takes as a given that Goh is “invoking the Confucian values prevalent in Singapore.” What the writer does not realise is that Goh is not attempting to defend Singapore as a liberal democracy, but rather to claim that it is a different society based Confucianism, using an understanding of Confucianism which is, in itself, a complex reinscription which incorporates, among its many components, a nativisation of Victorian values.

14. “Jeya’s action was ‘like throwing a Molotov Cocktail,’” Straits Times, 20 August 1997, 25.