Published by

Earth Beings: Ecologies of Practice across Andean Worlds.
Project MUSE. muse.jhu.edu/book/68721.

For additional information about this book
https://muse.jhu.edu/book/68721
NOTES

Preface

1. A literal linguistic translation of tirakuna would be tierras or seres tierra, earths or earth-beings in English. The Andean ethnographic record has extensively documented earth-beings, also referred to as Apu or Apukuna (with the pluralizing Quechua suffix). See Abercrombie 1998; Allen 2000; Dean 2010; Ricard 2007.

2. Runakuna (pl.) is what Quechua persons like my friends call themselves; the singular is runa. Runakuna are pejoratively called Indian by non-runakuna.

Story 1. Agreeing to Remember, Translating, and Carefully Co-laboring

1. There is much to say about the museum’s representation of the curators, and the “behind the scenes” events and rationales that contributed to that representation. I write about these events and rationales in story 6. Flores Ochoa’s words are meaningful in many ways, which I will engage with later in this story.

2. Carmona is a relative of Flores Ochoa, one of the most reputed local contributors to what is known as Andean anthropology. Thus, behind the pictures there is a long story of friendship, knowledge exchange, and complex hierarchies among Nazario, Carmona, and Flores Ochoa.

3. Other important collaborators in translation were Margarita Huayhua, Gina Maldonado, and Eloy Neira.

4. Worlding is a notion that I borrow from both Haraway (2008) and Tsing (2010), and that I think they composed in conversation. I use the concept to refer to practices that create (forms of) being with (and without) entities, as well as the entities themselves. Worlding is the practice of creating relations of life in a place and the place itself.
5. This does not make for a socially homogeneous region; on the contrary, practices that re-mark difference and emphatically deny similarity (even through the act of sharing) also enact the partial connection and give that relationship a hierarchical texture that is specific to the region.

6. The landlord’s eviction was in part a result of Mariano’s activism, although the state-owned cooperative was not his goal.

7. Mistikuna is the plural of misti, a word that in Cuzco works both when speaking Spanish or Quechua to indicate someone who can read and write and therefore, given the social hierarchies in the region, may act superior to a runa, even if the misti has runa origins.

8. Rosalind Gow (1981) lists Mariano Turpo as one of four prominent politicians in the southern Andes, along with Pablo Zárate Willka, Rumi Maqui, and Emiliano Huamantica. In the 1970s, Rosalind and David Gow (then husband and wife) conducted dissertation fieldwork in the neighboring community of Pinchimuro and talked to Mariano Turpo on several occasions. Enrique Mayer generously gave me his copy of Rosalind Gow’s dissertation, and David Gow sent me a hard copy of his (1976). I learned quite a bit reading both works, for which I am very grateful.


10. For example, there is no written evidence that Ausangate had helped people win a local battle for Peru in a war against neighboring Chile. Instead, evidence of Ausangate’s decisive participation in the battle is inscribed in the landscape—in a lagoon and on rocks surrounding the area—and this does not count as historical proof. Given Ausangate’s antecedents in the war with Chile, his participation was summoned to influence decisions during the political confrontation against the hacendado (see story 3).

11. Historical Ontology is the title of a book by Ian Hacking (2002) and its first chapter. Both illustrate what I am calling the being historical of modern academic knowledge. Hacking’s focus is the analysis of the historical emergence of objects, concepts, and theories of Western knowledge.

12. It is unusual for women to be considered yachaq.

13. According to Viveiros de Castro the groups he calls Amerindian enact Amazonian worlds that are similar to ours in that they are inhabited by humans and animals (2004b). Unlike in our world, however, in all these worlds their inhabitants all share culture and inhabit different natures, and what is depends on their different bodies—their different natures. Viveiros de Castro uses blood and beer as an example: they are exchangeable notions that emerge in relation to a human or a jaguar, and being one or the other depends on whose world (human or jaguar) the thing is in. Thus, rather than belonging to the human or the jaguar, the point of view that
makes the thing belongs to each of their worlds. Adapting the notion of equivocation to my purposes, I use it in story 6.

14. I thank Cesar Itier and Hugo Blanco who helped me think this distinction.


Interlude 1. Mariano Turpo

1. The term bare-kneed refers to the black woolen knee-length pants that identified runakuna and stigmatized them as Indian. Except for festivities, runakuna do not wear those pants anymore.

2. The preposition is italicized to mark the important conceptual work it performs inflecting the relation with ayllu specificity.

3. In Andean ethnographies, the usual glossaries describe ayllu as a “local community or kin group” (Sallnow 1987, 308); “a group of families” (Ricard 2007, 449); a “polity self-formulated through ritual” (Abercrombie 1998, 516); an “indigenous community or other social group whose members share a common focus” (Allen 2002, 272); “distinguishable groups whose solidarity is formed by religious and territorial ties” (Bastien 1978, 212); and a “kin group, lineage, or indigenous community with a territorial land base and members who share a common focus” (Bolin 1998, 252). The list could go on.


5. Consulting coca and earth-beings was not uncommon when choosing leaders to confront the hacendado. Rosalind Gow narrates a similar episode that occurred at the beginning of the twentieth century, during a confrontation with the hacendado about moving the market to the town of Ocongate. A woman told Gow that a group of townsmen (not Indians) came to her father and said, “Listen Don Bonifacio, It is your destiny to fight for justice. We have asked the altomisa to tell your fortune . . . you [will] go to Cuzco for us” (Gow 1981, 91). Don Bonifacio succeeded, and the market was moved to Ocongate, where it remains today.

6. The personero was never a woman. The agrarian reform replaced the personero with the Junta Comunal—the Community Group—which continues to operate like the personero under the orders of the communal assembly. Women are rarely members of the Junta Comunal.

7. The Andean ethnographic record, to which I do not necessarily subscribe, labels the first one a masculine element, the other a feminine element.

8. The words runa and runakuna that people use to identify themselves avoid this stigma.

9. From the response to this question I also gathered that many times chikchi
(hail) and qhaqya (lightning) are indistinguishable because they may bring one another about; once again, a condition of more than one but less than many. Hail and lightning are not necessarily units. Xavier Ricard (2007) considers chikchi and qhaqya (which he translates as lightning and thunder) to be synonyms.

Story 2. Mariano Engages “the Land Struggle”

1. Todas las sangres is the title of a novel by José María Arguedas, a famous writer. The novel proposed the possibility of indigenous political leadership, which became the focus of the debate.

2. The “one indigenous leader” Quijano refers to may have been Saturnino Huillca, also from Cuzco. A book about his life was published in 1975. Mariano knew him, and they collaborated on several occasions.

3. The concept of “coloniality of power” denotes the global model of power that came into place with the conquest of America. Although the concept emphasizes the hierarchical classification of the world’s populations around the idea of race, its core element is the identification of Eurocentrism as the model’s specific rationality. According to Quijano, the modern world system is characterized by a “colonial matrix of power,” namely, a heterogeneous and discontinuous socio-epistemic structure that articulates together race as a modern category; capitalism as the structure of control of labor and resources; specific geo-cultural identities and subjectivities, including race and sex; and the production of knowledge, especially the suppression of the knowledge and meanings of the colonized peoples. Thus, coloniality of power, capitalism, and Eurocentrism are equally essential elements in Quijano’s conceptualization. Conversely, liberation and decolonization imply a radical redistribution of power requiring the transformation of all of these three elements (Quijano 2000).

4. The five names of parcialidades that my friends recalled were Tinki (which included the ayllus Pampacancha, Marampaqui, Mawayani, and Mallma), Andamayo (including Pacchanta, Upis, Chilcacocha, Andamayo, and Rodeana), Tayancani (including Tayancani and Checaspampa), Taira, and Collca. Reátegui gives the same names but calls them sectores and considers them divisions within the hacienda Lauramarca, which they also were (1977, 3).

5. Among them were the U.S. anthropologist Richard Patch and the U.S. scholar Norman Gall. They both worked as part of the American Universities field staff and visited Lauramarca in the late 1950s and early 1960s, respectively. See Gall n.d.; Patch 1958.

6. I am grateful to Bruce Mannheim for conversations about and insights on this phrase.

7. Pacchanta was part of a larger parcialidad called Andamayo until the 1960s, both Andamayo and Pacchanta were also ayllus.

8. Moraya and chuño are dehydrated tubers.
1. I tweak several of Rancière’s concepts to build my argument. Thus I am not claiming that “the partition of the sensible” as I use it here is faithful to Rancière’s concept.

2. Stefanoni 2010a. The complete sentence is: “Al final de cuentas, como queda cada vez más en evidencia, estamos en presencia de un discurso indígena (new age) global con escasa capacidad para reflejar las etnicidades realmente existentes.”

3. While most postcolonial commentary was a critique of the power to represent, the implicit proposal it included was for alternative representations: for example, the right of the subaltern to self-representation, both analytically and politically. This extremely valuable contribution, however, is part of the nature-humanity divide, since representation requires the reality (out there) that nature signifies, to signify it (in here) as its scientific or cultural definition. I am not advocating for a retreat from the critique of representation; instead, I suggest that it can be strengthened by taking into consideration the requirements and limits of the practice of representation, including critical representation. This may renew analytical commentary on a variety of subjects, among them modern politics.

4. And, of course, they are in partial connection with what is not in-ayllu. Even if that is another story, I do not want the reader to forget it.

5. Cesar Itier translates ruwal as “Espíritu del Cerro” (forthcoming). Xavier Ricard proposes that it is synonymous with Apu, which he also translates as “espíritu del cerro” or “mountain spirit” (2007, 463, 448).

6. Regional usage frequently translates earth-beings as espiritú—or spirit. I do not do so mainly because the Turpos rejected it—“they are who they are, there is no ispiritú.” My avoidance is also intended to slow down translations that would make practices with earth-beings and Catholicism equivalent. Mariano and Nazario frequently made a distinction between the two while, nevertheless, constantly summoning earth-beings and Christian entities (for example, Ausangate and Taytacha, or Jesus Christ) in the same invocation and for the same purpose.

7. For example, while in exile after his insurgent activities, the legendary leftist leader Hugo Blanco (who has appeared several times above in Mariano’s stories) wrote a book in which he described the ayllu as a communal land-holding system that had deteriorated with the “advance of capitalism” but was potentially revolutionary, given its “collective spirit” (1972, 28).


9. Itier confirmed in a personal communication that in Quechua “the place one is native from and the place itself assume the same verbal expression.” He also explained that the term ayllu can be used for the whole and for its parts—it expresses a relation among the beings that compose the ayllu, in which the part conjures up the whole.
10. Guacas may have been the earlier word for what I heard named as tirakuna.

11. According to Viveiros de Castro, equivocations cannot be “corrected,” let alone avoided; they can, however, be controlled. This requires paying attention to the process of translation itself—the terms and the respective differences—“so that the referential alterity between the [different] positions is acknowledged and inserted into the conversation in such a way that, rather than different views of a single world (which would be the equivalent to cultural relativism), a view of different worlds becomes apparent” (2004b, 5; emphases added).

12. Starn’s comments provoked a strong reaction from the Andeanists he criticized. Their responses commented on his narrow understanding of the political relevance of their work (see, for example, Mayer 1991). The discussion transpired within a basic agreement: both the works Starn criticized and his critique worked within the division between nature and humanity. Accordingly, earth-beings are cultural interpretations of nature. Ausangate can only be a mountain—really. In 1991 both sides would have agreed on that point; they may do so today as well.

13. Mariano also mentioned consulting with yachaqkuna that did not live in Lauramarca and were famous in the region—he did not remember his names (or might not have wanted to mention them).

Story 4. Mariano’s Archive

1. This struggle between peasants and landowners has been historically documented. See, for example, Reátegui 1977.

2. The first constitution of Peru that fully recognized the right of illiterates to participate in the election processes was in 1979.

3. I thank Bruce Mannheim for this translation. For a wonderfully smart explanation of the possible meanings of puriy and its relatedness with tiyay (to exist in a location) and kay (to be), see Mannheim 1998.

4. When I received Mariano’s archive the documents had been numbered in the order in which they were found in the box. I kept the original numbers and also recorded the documents in compact discs chronologically. I then labeled the CDs with the year of the documents they contain. Following this self-catalogue, when I cite a document in Mariano’s archive, I record the number the document had when I received the archive and the year that identifies the CD where I recorded it.

5. For example, Reátegui writes: “Francisco Chillihuani is a relevant figure beginning in 1922; he was the delegate of the villages of Lauramarca and traveled frequently to Lima. He played an important role in the movements between 1922 and 1927. In 1927 he fell prey to the overseers of the hacienda and was confined to the lowlands of Cosñipata, from where he did not return” (1977, 103).

6. I thank Cesar Itier for this idea.

7. For those who read Quechua, his answer is worth transcribing: “Imaynataq
qunqayman ñawpaqniypi kaqta. Ñawpaqniypi kajqa, chayllapiyá qhepan. Manan qunqawaqchu, saqenasuyki kama. Chayña mana yuyankichu.”

8. In Sonqo, where she worked, Allen describes the nested quality of ayllus: “Lower-order ayllus [are] nested within ayllus of a higher order. Luis [a man from Sonqo] explained that together the neighborhood ayllus make up Sonqo ayllu. Similarly, Sonqo is grouped with other community-level ayllus to make up Colquepata ayllu, the district; which in turn is part of Paucartambo, the province which in turn is part of Cuzco ayllu, the department, and so forth” (2002, 85).

9. John Law and Ruth Benschop explain: “To represent is to perform division. . . . [1]t is to perform, or to refuse to perform, a world of spatial assumptions populated by subjects and objects. To represent thus renders other possibilities impossible, unimaginable. It is in other words to perform a politics, a politics of ontology” (1997, 158).

10. I can speculate about who the scribes of the documents were and assign the differences to their degree of literacy: the first document seems to be written by a less literate individual than the second and third. This, I could say, explains the differences in the presence of ayllu in the documents, which I can also say, decreases as the language of property becomes prevalent in the country through processes of modernization. To complete my interpretation, I could say that runakuna persisted in claiming ayllu ancestral possession and arguing against property. However, this linearity does not work in either direction for the notion of ayllu appears when the scribe would be literate, and while it is used against the landowner, ayllu does not appear against indigenous property.

11. Frank Salomon and Mercedes Niño Murcia (2011) have written a beautifully documented book about peasants’ efforts to appropriate literacy in the highlands of Lima.

12. In 1983, Bolivia indigenous intellectuals funded the Taller de Historia Oral Andina—a nongovernmental institution dedicated to the writing of indigenous oral histories.

Interlude 2. Nazario Turpo

1. The word ayllu was deployed in a way that was similar to the way “ayllu” appeared in the legal documents in Mariano’s archive.

2. The expansion of the tourist industry concerns anthropologists; many of us have discussed how it makes commodities out of almost everything. Memories of the revolution are hot tourist buys in Mexico, Nicaragua, and Peru (Babb 2011); in South Africa wealthy chiefs promote the preservation of tradition as a future worth investing in (Comaroff and Comaroff 2009); in Mexico and Peru, anthropologists, New Agers, and local indigenous individuals together have invented a religion for both the third millennium and its tourist market (see Galinier and Molinié 2006).
3. An adamant disseminator of these ideas is Hernando de Soto (n.d.), a Peruvian economist internationally renowned for his work with governments in developing countries.


6. Intriguingly, iñi is composed of two words: i, which was the way to say “yes” in Quechua, and ñi, which meant “to say.” Iñi is thus “to say yes” to God. My source for this information was Cesar Itier’s erudition in colonial Quechua. I thank him.


8. This term belongs to the epistemology of the state and its logic of recognition; outside of this logic, authenticity is not necessarily an issue.

9. This process is similar to Annemarie Mol’s (2002) analysis of atherosclerosis: a disease rendered multiple by the different biomedical practices through which it is enacted coordinated into singularity also by biomedicine and its institutions. And there are also differences, of course: the requirements of the practices that co-ordinate earth-beings into the singularity of nature transpire through the nature-humanity divide; they thus diverge from the requirements of the practices that make earth-beings that ignore such a divide.


Story 5. Chamanismo Andino in the Third Millennium

1. The Quechua word is altumisayuq. Nazario and Mariano explained that the altumisayuq, which they both considered did not exist anymore, were individuals that could communicate directly with earth-beings. Lower in hierarchy were the pampa-misayuq, which both my friends considered themselves to be.


3. The phrase circulated orally among politicians and intellectuals and was later published in Karp 2002.

4. Risking theoretical heresy (which, however, I think Antonio Gramsci would have understood), at times I even imagine the region as articulated by two hegemonies: an obvious one, the hegemony of the nonindigenous—modern, Spanish-speaking, urban, and literate; and a less visible, more intimate one, the hegemony of the indigenous—affirming regional pride vis-à-vis Lima, fluent in Quechua, claiming Inka ancestry (and even origins), nimble in rural ways, and knowledgeable about
earth-beings and their practices. And just to be clear: I am not saying that the second one is counterhegemonic to the first one. On the contrary, striking in the region is the absence of “either nonindigenous or indigenous” political projects.

5. According to Núñez del Prado, Andean priesthood is comparable to the “great mystic traditions,” among which he counts “shinto, yoga, meditations with madala, and the practice of Tai Chi chuan” (Núñez del Prado 1991, 136).

6. Núñez del Prado takes his knowledge and business around the world. His activities are dynamically connected to what can be loosely identified as New Age, a movement whose members around the world read his works and some of whom visit him in Peru. A search for his name on the Internet yields innumerable links. See, for example, Blackburn 2010; Deems 2010; Victor 2010.

7. Américo Yábar, personal communication.

8. In Pacchanta the extension of a “masa” varies depending on the quality and incline of the plot.

9. Archaic is so central a word in Eliade’s work that it even appears in the title of his book *Shamanism: Archaic Techniques of Ecstasy*.


Story 6. A Comedy of Equivocations


5. In addition to the Quechua exhibit, *Our Universes* contains Pueblo of Santa Clara (New Mexico), Anishinaabe (Canada), Lakota (South Dakota), Hupa (California), Q’eq’chi’ [sic] (Maya), Mapuche (Chile), and Yup’ik (Alaska).

6. The website has made slight changes to the text. Under the heading “Our Universes: Traditional Knowledge Shapes Our World,” it reads: “*Our Universes* focuses on indigenous cosmologies—worldviews and philosophies related to the creation and order of the universe—and the spiritual relationship between humankind and the natural world. Organized around the solar year, the exhibition introduces visitors to indigenous peoples from across the Western Hemisphere who continue to express the wisdom of their ancestors in celebration, language, art, spirituality, and daily life.” National Museum of the American Indian, “Current Exhibitions,” http://
7. In related fashion, albeit not necessarily an insult, in Peru, *indigenous* is an identity reserved for monolingual and illiterate individuals. Although this meaning is currently disputed, the challenge is still marginal. In fact, the prevalence of the definition (along with Mariano’s reputation and the fact of the anthropologists’ long-term acquaintance with him) might have prompted Carmona and Flores Ochoa to suggest Mariano’s name when the NMAI approached them to request an “indigenous consultant” for the exhibit.

8. Which, in my view, may be indigenous religion *but “not only”* as I explained in the previous story.

9. For more about Quyllur Rit’i, see D. Gow 1976; Poole 1987; and Sallnow 1987.

10. Intriguingly, Her Many Horses thought he had followed Nazario’s suggestions. In a conversation about Nazario, Her Many Horses told me, “He thought the spinning wheel had to have wool to be what it was, and we did so.”

11. As a technology of translation the obligatory passage point works like what Latour calls a *stronghold*. He writes, “whatever people do and wherever they go, they have to pass through the contender’s position and to help him/her further his/her own interests— it also has a linguistic sense, so that one version of the language game translates all the others, replacing them with ‘whatever you wish. This is really what you mean” (1993a, 253).

12. There is a similarity between this despacho and the ones Nazario makes for tourists in Machu Picchu. As I explained above, burning is prohibited in the sanctuary, so he makes “raw despachos” that are not despachos until he burns them where he is allowed to.

13. The solution that the British Museum has adopted—which is the theme that provoked Hetherington’s discussion—is to allow access through Braille methods of seeing. This replaces a form of seeing (with the eyes) with another form of seeing (with the hand), but it does not allow for a haptic access to the scopic. Through these methods a person is “given access to a text, not the objects represented by that text” (Hetherington 2002, 202).

**Story 7. Munayniyuq**

1. Wamani is the most popular word for the commanding earth-beings in Ayacucho, the region where Earls worked. It is equivalent to Apu in Cuzco, the region I am familiar with.

2. As place, tirakuna are also referred to as ruwalkuna. This word is the plural of ruwal, a phonetic transformation of *lugar* (or place), and it is used interchangeably with tirakuna (which I translate as earth-beings). Cesar Itier (n.d.) lists it as “lugar, luwar, ruwal” and translates it as “espíritu del cerro.”
3. *Ley de Rondas Campesinas, Ley 27908*, June 1, 2003. Possibly contributing to the legalization of the rondas was their efficacy in the organization of the resistance against the Shining Path in 1992, as well as the numerous petitions that *ronderos*—as ronda authorities are known—had made to state authorities.

4. For stories of ronda punishments that verge on meeting official definitions of torture, see Starn 1999.

5. *Ley de Rondas Campesinas*, June 1, 2003, art. 6, 7, and 8.

6. I am aware of the gendered pronoun I am using. It is not an accident: ronda authorities are men, with women in subordinate positions, if at all. This, of course, does not preclude decisive female participation in rondas. Yet such is not the topic I have chosen to discuss here.

7. In her subtle ethnographic work on power, war, and secrecy in Sarhua, an Andean village in Ayacucho—a department neighboring Cuzco—the anthropologist Olga González (2011, 111 and 198) discusses the case of a wealthy and powerful communal authority, locally identified as a munayniyuq, who was killed by a crowd as a result of his abuses. The fact that specific assassins were never identified may speak also about the impossibility of individuating that emerges from in-ayllu relationality.

8. As a relatively recent offshoot of this measure, *municipalidades menores* (minor municipalities) mushroomed in villages that were not the capital of their district (or major municipalities) but that fulfilled the demographic requirement to exist as an independently peri-urban administration. See Ricard et al. 2007.

9. Wilber Rozas, personal communication. For more on Zenón Mescco, see Ricard et al. 2007.

10. Gavina Córdoba, personal communication.


Epilogue


2. The strike turned into a violent confrontation as the government ordered troops that were repelled by the local population. Los Sucesos de Bagua, http://www.servindi.org/producciones/videos/13083, accessed June 20, 2009.

3. This would amount to what Michel Foucault would call eventalization—in this case, the eventalization of modern politics. Inquiring into the “self-evidences on which our knowledges, acquiescences, and practices rest” (Foucault 1991, 76) to show that the way things happen was not a matter of course.

4. In introducing the notion of ontological disagreement, I am tweaking Ran-
cière’s notion of disagreement. As he conceptualizes it, the disagreement that is politics emerges from a “wrong count of the parts of the whole” (1999, 10; emphasis added). Instead, I propose that politics emerges when that which considers itself the whole denies existence to that which exceeds—or does not abide by—the principle that allows “the whole” self-consideration as such. This denial is an ontological practice and so is the politics that disagrees with it. After this proviso, Rancière’s terms resonate with those in this epilogue.

5. I borrow the term alter-politics from Ghassan Hage (2015), although my conceptualization may differ from his.

6. The practices that make worlds in divergence exceed the analytic capacity of race, ethnicity, or gender. These categories identify differences that usually find their home in the sameness that the notion of humanity provides, and in its contrast with nature—each as fundamental and hegemonic as their contrast with the other.

7. I am not talking about the modern constitution only figuratively. The recently issued Bolivian and Ecuadoran constitutions resulted from overt disagreement with the terms of the modern politics; I discuss this point below.

8. Buen vivir has also been included in state development programs in both Ecuador and Bolivia; it is also used by NGOs to mean sustainable development (Schavellzon 2014).