Monumental Matters

Kavuri-Bauer, Santhi

Published by Duke University Press

Kavuri-Bauer, Santhi.

For additional information about this book
https://muse.jhu.edu/book/64098

For content related to this chapter
https://muse.jhu.edu/related_content?type=book&id=2279127
NOTES

Introduction


2. Communalism in India refers to social divisions based on the belief of religious difference and is often used to describe the religious tension between the Hindu and Muslim communities.

3. I am using the term *spatial practice* to designate the multiplicity of processes that occur at the monument to produce its meaning. I am therefore diverging from Henri Lefebvre’s more limited use of the term, which describes the material production of space. Michel de Certeau’s notion of spatial practice, as the everyday practices of lived space, defined by multiform-resistant procedures, is closer to my use of the term. See Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, 33; and Certeau, *The Practice of Everyday Life*, 96.

4. After the destruction of the Babri Masjid in December of 1992, religious riots claimed two thousand lives, and in related communal riots in Gujarat in 2002 between one thousand and two thousand people, mostly Muslims, were killed.


7. Foucault, “Nietzsche, Genealogy, History.”

8. This strategy of chronological ordering and synchronic framing is not necessarily contradictory and can offer a robust understanding of how the meaning and function of monuments have changed with time and are adapted to the present concerns of Indian society. Exemplifying this kind of strategy are Davis, *Lives of Indian Images*; Deshpande, *Creative Pasts*; and Thapar, *Somanatha*.


11. Ibid., 94.


15. Among these scholars is Stephen Legg, with his compelling examination of the colonial construction of New Delhi in relation to its double, Old Delhi. See Legg,
Spaces of Colonialism. Similarly, Swati Chattopadhyay’s examination of the urban planning of Calcutta is based not on the usual epistemological separation of the “Black Town” from the “White Town” but on their mutually constituting realities. Chattopadhyay, “Blurring Boundaries.”


17. The fundamental process of identification in the imaginary is theorized by Jacques Lacan as the “mirror stage” and marks the subject’s first alienation from the natural order: “The *mirror stage* is a drama whose internal thrust is precipitated from insufficiency to anticipation—and which manufactures for the subject, caught up in the lure of spatial identification, the succession of phantasies that extends from a fragmented body-image to a form of its totality that I shall call orthopaedic—and, lastly, to the assumption of the amour of an alienating identity, which will mark with its rigid structure the subject’s entire mental development.” Lacan, *Écrits*, 4.


19. Louis Althusser, a student of Lacan, identified this process of subjection to ideology as “*interpellation*”: “I shall then suggest that ideology ‘acts’ or ‘functions’ in such a way that it ‘recruits’ subjects among the individuals (it recruits them all), or ‘transforms’ the individuals into subjects (it transforms them all) by the very precise operation which I have called *interpellation* or hailing, and which can be imagined along the lines of the most commonplace everyday police (or other) hailing: ‘Hey, you there!’” Althusser, *Lenin and Philosophy, and Other Essays*, 118.


21. The song, called Babri Masjid (Masjid-e-Babri Hum khatakar hain), was uploaded to YouTube by a Pakistani student who collects *taranay* or Urdu songs that are militant and jihadist in nature. I do not know who wrote the song or if the student was Pakistani or Indian. The student calls himself Ugerwadi.


23. Ibid., 222.

24. Ibid., 391.

25. Ibid.


Chapter 1: Breathing New Life into Old Stones

1. By accepting the diwan, the British became the financial and judicial administrators of the Bengal territories for the Mughal Emperor.


5. Ibid., 39.
7. Schimmel, Pain and Grace, 14.
9. Ibid.
11. Sauda writes: “Whatever holymen’s mosques there are are less valuable than mule posts / For seated there like asses are men, old and young / The mullah gives the call to prayer with his mouth shut.” Petievich, “Poetry of theDeclining Mughals,” 107.
12. Ibid.
13. As Lacan explains the point de capiton: “This point around which all concrete analysis of discourse must operate . . . the point at which the signified and the signifier are knotted together, between the still floating mass of meanings that are actually circulating. . . . Everything radiates out from and is organized around this signifier, similar to these little lines of force that an upholstery button forms on the surface of a material. It’s the point of convergence that enables everything that happens in this discourse to be situated retroactively and prospectively.” Lacan, The Seminars of Jacques Lacan, 267–68.
14. Ahmad, Shahr-Ashob. The translation here is that of Frances W. Pritchett, available online at the website for her workshop, “What is a shahr-ashob?” It can be accessed in “Resources: Urdu/Hindi language and literature” found on her main webpage: http://www.columbia.edu/itc/mealac/pritchett/oofwp/#fwp (last accessed 29 October 2010).
15. Umar, Muslim Society in Northern India during the Eighteenth Century, 438–39.
17. For a discussion of the parallaxic, as I am using it here, see Žižek, The Parallax View, 17–20.
19. For the ideological study of Hodges’s work, see Quilley and Bonehill, William Hodges, 1744–1797. For studies on Hodges’s forms and style, see Bann “Antiquarianism, Visuality, and the Exotic Monument”; and Tillotson, The Artificial Empire.
21. Hodges, Travels in India during the Years 1780–1783, 47.
22. Ibid.
23. Ibid., 52.
25. Hodges’s view was thus in accord with Hastings’s representation of the Indian landscape as a negative sign of Mughal governmentality. As the latter claimed: “Sovereignty in India implies nothing else; for I know not how we can form an estimate of its power but from its visible effects—and those are everywhere the same, from Kabul to Assam. The whole history of Asia is nothing more than precedents to prove the invariable exercise of arbitrary power. It will, no doubt, be most happy for the inhabitants of Asia when the despotic institutes of Jengheez Khan or Tamerlane shall give place to the liberal spirit of a British legislature. I shall be amply satisfied in my present prosecution, if I shall tend to hasten the approach of an event so beneficial to the great interests of mankind.” Warren Hastings, quoted in Davies, Strange Destiny, 242–43.

26. Hodges, Travels in India during the Years 1780–1783, 59.
28. Tillotson makes a similar point in Artificial Empire, 3.
29. Hodges, Travels in India during the Years 1780–1783, 61.
30. Ibid., 62.
31. Žižek, The Sublime Object of Ideology, 104.
32. Haque, Glimpses of Mughal Society and Culture, 117.
33. Ibid., 118.

34. Lefebvre, The Production of Space, 389.
37. Hodges, Travels in India during the Years 1780–1783, 122.
38. Ibid., 123.
39. Ibid.
40. Ibid., 128.
41. Ibid., 127.
42. Ibid.
44. Ibid.
46. Tillotson, Artificial Empire, 82.
47. Mills, “Knowledge, Gender, and Empire,” 42–46.
49. Ibid., 83.
50. Ibid., 93.
52. Ibid.
53. An example of this sort of representation of Mughal Delhi is Thomas Metcalfe’s, “Delhi Book,” which describes the monuments of the city. Illustrated by Indian artists, the book was produced for his daughters in 1844. The folios, now in the British Library, were published in facsimile in the book *The Golden Calm*. Metcalfe spent considerable time with the emperor, Bahadur Shah, as the agent of the governor general in Delhi from 1835 to 1853. Despite this proximity his descriptions never give the details of court life and culture. Instead, he limits himself to describing individual structures of the palace, their form, decay, and if and when a historical event that led to the decline of the Mughals took place there. See Bayley and Metcalfe, *The Golden Calm*.
55. Ibid., 182.
56. Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, 222.
58. Ibid., 184.
59. Ibid., 184–85.
60. Das, *A History of Indian Literature*, 64.
64. Ibid., 151.

Chapter 2: From Cunningham to Curzon
2. Ibid., 4.
3. Ibid., 5.
5. Ibid.
6. Also known as the first war of Indian independence and the Sepoy Mutiny, the event will be referred to as “the Uprising” in this book.
8. One son fled to Hyderabad, but he never assumed the title of a Mughal prince.
12. Slavoj Žižek provides a useful description of the master-signifier: “Let us imagine a confused situation of social disintegration, in which the cohesive power of ideology loses its efficiency: in such a situation, the Master is the one who invents a new signifier, the famous ‘quilting point,’ which stabilizes the situation again and makes it readable. . . . The Master adds no new positive content—he merely adds a signifier which, all of a sudden, turns disorder into order, into ‘new harmony,’ as Rimbaud would have put it.” Žižek, *The Parallax View*, 37.
16. Ibid., iv.
21. Ibid.
23. Ibid., 14.
25. Ibid.
26. Ibid., 135.
30. Ibid., 66.
32. Ibid.
34. British Library/Asia, Pacific and Africa Collections/India Office Records/P/3218 Proceedings of the Revenue and Agricultural Department, Government of
India, Archaeology, 1888 (Letter from Dr. J. Burgess, Dir. Gen. Arch. Survey of India to the Secretary to the Government of India, 16 March 1887).

35. Ibid.

36. Ibid.


42. British Library/Asia, Pacific and Africa Collections/India Office Records/P/1681/Proceedings of the Revenue and Agricultural Department, Government of India, 1882 (Letter from H. H. Cole to Officiating Secretary to the Government of India, Home Department, 27 March 1882).


45. British Library/Asia, Pacific and Africa Collections/India Office Records/P/1681/Proceedings of the Revenue and Agricultural Department, Government of India, 1882 (Letter from H. H. Cole to Officiating Secretary to the Government of India, Home Department, March 27, 1882).


47. Ibid., 165.

48. Ibid.

49. Ibid., 183.


52. Ibid., 76.

53. Curzon quoted ibid., 81.


55. Ibid., 253.

56. Ibid., 261.

57. Ibid., 399.

58. Ibid., xii.
59. Ibid.
60. Cohn, *Colonialism and Its Forms of Knowledge*, 78.
63. Ibid.
64. Ibid., 58.
65. Ibid., 59–60.
68. Ibid.
70. Ibid.
74. Ibid., 14.
81. Ibid.
84. Ibid., 169.

Chapter 3: Between Fantasy and Phantasmagoria
4. Ibid., 3.
5. Ibid., 2.
6. Ibid., 52.
10. Ibid.
12. Ibid., 17.
13. Ibid., 22.
15. Ibid.
17. Ibid., 25.
18. Ibid.
20. Ibid., 27.
33. Ibid., 186.
34. Ibid.
35. Ibid.
36. Ibid., 191.
39. Ibid.

Chapter 4: Rebuilding Indian Muslim Space

1. *Al-madinat al fazilah* (the moral city, also translated as the virtuous city) is the name of the book by Arabic philosopher al-Farabi (c. 870–950). In it he describes the conditions for a well-governed city. Among these is a king or governor who provides care and protection for each part of the city, knowing that each part is integral to the
health of the whole. Al-Farabi also posits that when a city and its parts are governed well and function together, the citizens are more inclined to act morally. See Adamson and Taylor, *The Cambridge Companion to Arabic Philosophy*, 276–80.


5. Ibid., folio 16a. Shivaratri is a Hindu festival that honors and celebrates the god Shiva.

6. Ibid.

7. Ibid., folio 18a, 19b.


11. Ibid.


13. Ibid.


15. Ibid., 18a.


18. Metcalf also commissioned a book of monuments with written descriptions and illustrations called *The Delhi Book* preserved in the British Library.

19. Among the very few exceptions is the linguist and scholar Rajendralal Mitra (1824–1891) of the Asiatic Society, Calcutta.


22. Ibid., 134.


24. Ibid., 25.


27. Ibid., 67.

28. Delhi Archives/Chief Commissioner’s Office, File no. 238/Box 9/70, Corre-
spondence to the Secretary to Government from A. A. Roberts, offg Financial Commissioner for the Punjab, 22 November 1869.
29. Ibid.
30. Raikes, *Notes on the Revolt in the North-Western Provinces of India*, 78.
31. Delhi Archives/Chief Commissioner’s Office, File no. 238/Box 9/70, Major R. C. Lawrence, Military Secretary to Chief Commr., Punjab to Lieutt Coll E. C. Ommanney, Officiating Chief Engineer, Punjab, 14 December 1858.
32. Delhi Archives/Chief Commissioner’s Office, File no. 238/Box 9/70, Letter Secretary of the Government of India to the Secretary to the Government of Punjab, 20 April 1860.
33. Delhi Archives/Chief Commissioner’s Office, File no. 238/Box 9/70, Letter to Secretary of Government, Punjab to the Commissioner and Superintendent Delhi Division, 3 February 1862.
34. Delhi Archives/Chief Commissioner’s Office, File no. 238/Box 9/70, “Abstract of Correspondence Referring to the Jama Musjid.”
35. Ibid.
36. Delhi Archives/Chief Commissioner’s Office, File no. 238/Box 9/70, Memo from Secretary of the Government Punjab, A. H. Diack to Commissioner and Superintendent, Delhi, 11 November 1862.
37. Delhi Archives/Chief Commissioner’s Office/File no. 196/Box 21/70.
38. Cohn, “Representing Authority in Victorian India,” 648–49.
44. Delhi Archives/Deputy Commissioner’s Files/5/1909, “The Plaint.”
45. Ibid.
47. *Curzon Gazette* (Delhi), September 1902, 2, quoted in Rashid, *Wakf Administration in India*, 20.
51. *Madina* (Bijnor), 15 September 1913.
52. *Madina* (Bijnor), 8 December 1913.
54. *Madina* (Bijnor), 8 July 1913.
55. Ibid.
57. Minault, *The Khalifat Movement*, 47.
58. Delhi Commissioner’s Office, Files/DC/44/1912, to Mr. A. Meredith, Commissioner and Supervisor, Delhi Division from Major H. C. Beadon, Deputy Commissioner, 27 May 1912.
59. “Old Graves and Mosques of Delhi (i),” *Hamdard* (Delhi) 29 June 1913.
60. “Old Graves and Mosques of Delhi (2),” *Hamdard* (Delhi), 1 July 1913.
61. “An Issue of a Mosque,” *Muslim* (Delhi), 1 July 1922, 3.
63. Ibid.
66. Quoted in ibid., 125n47.
69. Robinson, “The British Empire and Muslim Identity in South Asia.”
70. Pandey, *The Colonial Construction of Communalism in Colonial North India*.
74. Ibid.
75. This is the Urdu scholar Abdul Haq’s view, quoted in Shackel and Majeed, *Hali’s Musaddas*, 51.
76. Ibid., 53.
77. Ahmed, *Jinnah, Pakistan, and Islamic Identity*, 75–76.
80. Ibid., 1073.
81. Ibid., 1076.
82. Ibid.
83. Ibid., 1080.
84. Ibid., 1082.
85. Ibid., 1084.
86. Ibid., 1083.
87. Ibid., 1084.
88. Ibid.
90. Gilmartin, “Partition, Pakistan, and South Asian History,” 1087. Gilmartin is looking at the events of Partition in Punjab when he makes this observation.
91. Nile Green correctly argues that those Muslims living near Sufi shrines did not face the same loss of space and continue to the present day to identify with the territorial presence of these sites and their saints. Green, “Stories of Saints and Sultans,” 419–46.

Chapter 5: Tryst with Destiny
4. Ibid., 106. It is interesting to note that Ali has the same distrust for the managing committee of the Jami Masjid as Haji Fazil-al-Rahman and Muhammad-ud-din, whose petition against the committee was examined in chapter 4.
5. Ibid., 107.
6. Ibid., 143–44.
7. Ibid., 144.
12. It is important to note that not all Indians felt the optimism of the Congress Party and its supporters, nor did they read the choice of the Red Fort as the site for the proclamation of the new social order as appropriate. Some Muslims wrote to the Meerut daily *Dawn* expressing their disquiet over the choice of the Red Fort for the flag-raising ceremony. They saw the site as a historical monument to the greatness of Muslim rule, rather than as a symbol of the protosecular policy of the Mughals or as an important site of the independence struggles. For these Muslims, the Red Fort marked the terminus of Muslim culture and power in India, and when Nehru replaced the Union Jack with the Indian tricolor he was in their eyes merely signifying the replacement of one mode of domination with another. The resistance to the dominant power of the secularist party could be seen evolving from the same historic moment and space that inaugurated a new nation. See Tan and Kudaisya, *The Aftermath of Partition in South Asia*, 59–60.
14. Ibid., 126.
22. Ibid., 102.
25. Ibid., 138.
26. Ibid.
27. Ibid., 238–39.
28. Ibid., 241; 257–60.
29. Ibid., 268.
30. Ibid., 238.
32. Ibid.
36. Ibid., 11.
37. Ibid., 10.
40. Ibid., 96:387
41. Ibid., 97:155.
42. Ibid., 98:98.
44. *CWMG*, 98:309.
45. Pandey, *Remembering Partition*, 144.
46. Ibid., 145.
47. Ibid.

Chapter 6: The Ethics of Monumentality
2. Ibid., 5.
6. Ibid.
8. Ibid.
12. India National Congress, *Communications*, 50.
13. Ibid., 69–70.
17. Ibid., 40.
20. Ibid.
22. Ibid.
23. Ibid., 68.
26. Ibid.
27. Mayawati was re-elected chief minister in 2007.
29. Ibid.
30. Ibid.
31. An example of this is the public interest litigation in 2003 of Rajeev Sethi et al., which sought to protect Delhi’s Red Fort from outmoded conservation techniques. The particulars of the case can be found in *Seminar* under the heading “Document.”
32. Harvey, “From Space to Place and Back Again,” 8.
34. Ibid.
36. Ibid.


42. At the time of this writing Usman’s term as chairman has ended and the Sunni Waqf Board has ended without a decision by the Supreme Court over the case of ownership.

43. On 30 September 2010 the high court in Allahabad handed down a verdict on the demolition of the Babri Masjid and ordered a three-way division of the disputed land. Two parts would go to Hindus and one part to Muslims. The ruling sanctions the Hindu fundamentalists’ claims of the existence of a Ram temple and the violent act of destroying a Muslim place of worship.


45. Ibid., 10.

46. Ibid., 12.

47. The repeated occurrence of such attacks could be read as a symptom of the larger trauma that the state refuses to acknowledge. Instead, the antagonism underlying modern Indian reality lives on within the national unconscious, where it gives rise to social anxiety, hatred, and prejudice toward the nation’s Muslim other. More important, it reveals how the nation’s largest majority has been allowed to exist in substandard living conditions, made evident by statistical data on the income, education, and social status of Indian Muslims made available in the widely disseminated Sarchar Committee Report of 2006. A PDF version of this report can be obtained at minorityaffairs.gov.in/newsite (last accessed 13 March 2009).

48. Chairman Usman, interview by the author, video recording, Lucknow, 12 January 2007. The Shiv Mandir, or temple to the Hindu God Shiva, that the chairman refers to is an idea derived from a revisionist history written by P. N. Oak, which is now widely accepted as doctrine regarding Mughal architecture among Hindu nationalists. Oak himself is a Hindutva-inspired journalist and the president of the Institute for Rewriting Indian History. His texts share one basic thesis: Mughal and other Muslim monuments are wrongfully attributed, and their builders were actually Hindu royalty. His titles include the *Taj Mahal Was a Rajput Palace* (1965), reprinted as *The Taj Mahal Is Tejo-Mahalaya: A Shiva Temple* (1981) and reprinted a second time as *The Taj Mahal Is a Temple Palace* (1991), *Who Says Akbar Was Great!* (1968) and *Delhi’s Red Fort Is Hindu Lalkot* (1976) are among Oak’s other books claiming Hindu patronage of famous Mughal structures. A fellow member of the Institute for Rewriting Indian History, Hansraj Bhatia, completed the Hindutva canon on Mughal monuments with *Fatehpur Sikri Is a Hindu City* (1969) and *Agra Fort Is a Hindu Building* (1971).
52. Žižek, The Sublime Object of Ideology, 4.
54. Sikand, Muslims in India since 1947, 3.
55. Gyanendra Pandey makes a similar argument when he states that the fragment (the Muslim Indian community) perspective has the ability to reveal the contradictions of social reality and should therefore be taken seriously: “Part of the importance of the fragmentary point of view lies in this: that it resists the drive for a shallow homogenization and struggles for other, potentially richer definitions of the nation and the future political community.” Pandey, Routine Violence, 15.
56. Žižek, The Sublime Object of Ideology, 5.

Epilogue
1. Deputy Nazir Ahmad’s Bride’s Mirror of 1869 is revered as the first best-selling Urdu novel.
3. Muslim Ahmad, interview with Santhi Kavuri-Bauer and Malik Faisal, Delhi, 20 January 2007. All of Mr. Ahmad’s answers and statements are taken from this interview.
4. The imam did know that the Fatehpuri Masjid was the site of an important meeting of the ulema to discuss the part they would play the All-India Muslim League in 1918.
5. See the video on YouTube, “Amitabh Bachchan Recites ‘India Poised’ Anthem” (last accessed 16 September 2010).
6. hooks, Yearning, 42.