This chapter will address a number of issues pertaining to multilingualism for teaching and learning in South African higher education during the SANTED II Programme. It will provide the national and institutional language policy context for the SANTED multilingualism projects, the challenges of implementation, the strategies used for implementation and monitoring, and the institutional uptake of the programmes at the end of the SANTED II Programme in 2010. The discussion will illustrate how the pilot projects introduced through SANTED provided a springboard for implementation of multilingual learning and teaching. The chapter will further demonstrate that while some universities had policies that supported multilingualism, in most cases these policies were largely dormant. The pilot projects provided the means for activating them and institutionalising practices conceptualised therein. The process itself provided impetus for robust debates on the value of bilingual and multilingual education for effective learning in higher education, as well as the importance of linguistic and cultural diversity in building national unity.

Multilingualism in South African higher education

Multilingualism is a norm in South African institutions of higher learning because of the linguistic composition of the students and staff in these institutions. Despite the fact that lecture halls are multilingual and multicultural, the language of learning and teaching is English.
The choice of English, especially for speakers of languages other than English, can be linked to issues of practicality. English, on the one hand, is historically the language of academic discourse in South Africa and a global language seen as presenting opportunities for economic and social empowerment. African languages, on the other hand, are not seen as sufficiently developed as languages of academic discourse. Research on bilingual and multilingual teaching and learning models in higher education is not advanced enough to support the implementation of multilingualism. However, there is research that supports bilingual education and multilingualism for its value in facilitating cognition in the learning process (Bamgbose 1991:62-3; Heugh 2003:452-453; Obanya 2004:8-10). This research shows the important relationship between language and cognition in the learning process and illustrates that the mother tongue of a learner is critical, amongst other things, in ensuring quality education. It further supports the view that multilingualism can develop human potential, promote social cohesion and a sense of inclusive citizenship. In the South African context, African languages are indispensable in the accomplishment of these aims.

As stated above, English is the common medium of instruction in South African higher education. This benefits those students who have had the privilege of developing linguistic competence in English suitable for the higher-level thinking demands of university teaching and learning, while disadvantaging those who have English as an additional language and making it difficult for them to access the curriculum presented to them in that language (Kapp 2000). The throughput rate in degree programmes between English first language and English additional language students shows that the first language students have better success in higher education than the additional language students (Department of Higher Education and Training 2013). While the Department of Higher Education and Training’s (DHET) report does not identify language as a factor in student throughput rates, learning problems resulting from the use of English in teaching and learning are often cited, amongst others, as a contributing factor (Setati et al. 2002; Heugh 2003). In the South African context, the majority of English additional language students are black. It could therefore be argued that
poor schooling and socio-economic factors, a result of our political past, are also impacting on their academic performance.

While English is the language of teaching and learning in higher education, it is also the language of wider communication outside the lecture halls – in administration, in residences and other campus spaces, even though linguistic and cultural diversity is characteristic of these spaces.

Given the value of mother tongue in facilitating epistemic access and success, multilingual teaching and learning models need to consider the role of African languages, while at the same time recognising the role of English as the language of academia. In the democratic South African context, multilingualism is supported by legislative policy that aims to enhance linguistic and cultural sensitivity, and promote equity of access and success for all students.

The legislative policy context for promotion of multilingualism in higher education

The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996) confers on all the right to quality education. Quality education is generally understood as effective teaching and learning which empowers individuals to be producers and consumers of knowledge, and which nurtures diversity and the need to understand the world views of others, while encouraging rootedness in one’s own culture. Central to the provisions of the Constitution is the issue of access and success. The Constitution states that language, race and other markers that have been used in the past to discriminate against certain groups should not hinder the access and success of these groups. Policy pertaining to higher education advances the sentiments of the Constitution.

The Language Policy on Higher Education (LPHE) (2002) provides for the promotion of multilingualism, equitable access, and the participation and success of all in higher education. Other language policy guidelines, such as the Development of Indigenous African Languages as Mediums of Instruction in Higher Education (2003), also emphasise the social, pedagogic, economic and political value of languages. While recognising
the position of English as the dominant language of academia in South Africa, maintenance of the status quo is seen as a threat to equity and the success of students speaking languages other than English who have gained physical but not epistemic access to higher education. In education, epistemic access is generally understood as access to the conceptual platform from which the learner is able to construct new knowledge from pre-existing knowledge and knowledge presented in the learning process.

An important objective of the South African legislative framework on language in higher education is to develop a multilingual environment in which all languages are promoted and developed, and past political injustices redressed. Furthermore, the medium of instruction should not present a barrier to the access and success of any student. This objective is in line with the pedagogical value of language, and with the vision of the state for a nation where equity, equality and multilingualism are cherished.

The SANTED II Programme on Multilingualism

When the SANTED II Programme on Multilingualism was introduced in 2006, it presented South African universities with an opportunity to pilot research on implementation of multilingual teaching models. The aim of these models was to initiate the implementation of multilingual teaching and learning in higher education, as stipulated by language policy at both national and institutional level. A more detailed discussion of the four South African universities that hosted the SANTED multilingualism projects is presented below.

The two main thrusts of the SANTED multilingualism projects were the development and promotion of the use of indigenous African languages, alongside English, to support learning; and the development of language learning curricula that promote proficiency in indigenous African languages, especially for students in professional disciplines. The key purpose of the projects was to promote multilingualism in higher education in the following areas:
• enabling multi-language acquisition for students in professional programmes (e.g. in the Health Sciences, Law and Education);
• piloting projects in the use of African languages as the medium of instruction (e.g. in student support programmes and tutorials); and
• offering short courses to promote multilingualism among both academic and non-academic university staff.

As can be seen above, the thrusts and the purpose of the SANTED II Programme on Multilingualism are aligned with the objectives of the legislative framework: multilingual awareness and proficiency, the development of African languages to achieve this, as well as the use of African languages to support academic literacy.

The programme’s theoretical foundations

The theoretical foundations that underpinned the work of the SANTED multilingualism projects advance the notion of language being central to cognition and the facilitation and maintenance of social cohesion. South African policy on language in higher education recognises this link and the SANTED projects provided a platform for initiatives using multilingualism for teaching and learning in universities. As illustrated by local, continental and international research (Cummins 2000; Obanya 2004; Alexander 2007; Heugh 2003), learning mediated through the mother tongue facilitates cognition and should be maintained for as long as possible in education, including higher education. This is not the case for most students for whom English, the common medium of instruction, is an additional language. Madiba (2010:230-5) argues that English additional language students in South African universities experience conceptual difficulties in four ways. First, their underpreparedness, mainly because of their schooling background, means that they are unable to deal with the cognitive demands of university education. Second, the discipline-specific nature of knowledge at university is highly abstract and far removed from their
own knowledge and experiences. The third aspect considers the fact that each discipline uses key concepts that the students must understand and master in order to be competent in it. Fourth, students learn scientific concepts through a language which is not their first language and this presents difficulty in the learning process. Therefore, low proficiency in the language of instruction leads to inadequate levels of academic proficiency.

Mother tongue-based bilingualism and multilingualism enable epistemic access by using the home language to access knowledge presented in a second language. This provides a foundation for contextualising newly acquired knowledge within pre-existing knowledge and should enable students to produce new knowledge in both content subjects and languages. The general view in mother tongue-based bilingual education is that the languages that a learner brings into the learning space should be perceived as a resource, rather than a problem. In South Africa, this raises two long-term challenges: research into the development of indigenous languages as languages of science and teaching in higher education has to be intensified, and African languages need to be further developed for use in higher education. Corpus planning in African languages, i.e. the development of African languages in scientific domains, and acquisition planning, i.e. the development and design of curricula to teach the African languages to their speakers and non-speakers, were therefore pivotal in the work of the SANTED multilingualism projects.

Besides the centrality of language in cognition, the work of the multilingualism projects was motivated by the role of language as a source of identity. In South Africa’s multilingual context, and as citizens of a global environment, it is easy to minimise linguistic and cultural differences for the sake of what is perceived as ‘unity’ and easy communication. Where our university campuses are linguistically and culturally diverse, when one language (in this case English) is favoured over many others, it results in the other languages and cultures being sidelined and their speakers having limited means to express their own views in formal learning and social contexts. Communication classes that focus on language learning and cultural awareness are pivotal in providing an intervention in such cases.
SANTED project plans took cognisance of theories of learning, language teaching and learning, and language planning in multilingual contexts. The process of implementing these plans provided the framework for the implementation of multilingual education in the South African context. This provided rich material for the other focus of the projects, which was postgraduate research. Each of the universities that hosted the projects approached them in a manner consistent with their institutional and language contexts, but each reflected the key objectives of the SANTED multilingualism theme.

Introducing the four universities

The four beneficiary universities of these projects were the University of KwaZulu-Natal in collaboration with the Durban University of Technology (2007–2009), Rhodes University (2007–2010), and the University of Cape Town (2007–2010).

The Durban University of Technology-University of KwaZulu-Natal Project

The Durban University of Technology (DUT) and the University of KwaZulu-Natal (UKZN) are located in the province of KwaZulu-Natal, on the east coast of South Africa. The dominant language in the province is isiZulu (spoken by over 80 per cent of the total population in the region), followed by English, isiXhosa and Afrikaans.

During the period of SANTED activity, the institutions had over 65 000 students in total. At UKZN the institutional language policy, approved by the University Senate in 2006, named English and isiZulu as the official languages of the institution. The policy makes explicit the benefits of being bilingual, and commits the university to ensuring students’ academic proficiency in English, the international and national language of wider communication. Acknowledging the underdevelopment of isiZulu in high function domains such as higher education, the university undertakes to initiate collaborations with regional universities to develop isiZulu usage at university to promote communicative proficiency in it as an additional language, as well as to
use it as a language of learning, instruction and administration (UKZN Language Policy 2006). While the UKZN Language Policy mentions Afrikaans as a third language, there is no explicit designated role for it in the university’s teaching and other practices. The policy is in line with the requirements of the LPHE, but there is no indication that there was an implementation plan aligned to it. Except for some programmes on the teaching of isiZulu as an additional language to students, language teaching practices at the institutions, prior to the Multilingualism Project, were limited.

At the inception of the project, DUT had no official language policy. Its language policy was only approved in 2010. The formulation and publishing of a policy and its implementation plan is a requirement of the LPHE (2002), as indicated in the policy framework section.

The DUT and UKZN submitted a joint proposal and sought to consolidate their multilingual practices in the following areas to:

- enable non-isiZulu-speaking staff and students to learn isiZulu and begin to use it, selectively and when appropriate and feasible, for teaching and learning;
- develop additional staff capacity in teaching in isiZulu;
- develop the requisite disciplinary terminology and some teaching materials in isiZulu;
- develop a model for working towards multi-language teaching and learning; and
- produce graduates who have the capacity to interact professionally in both English and isiZulu with their clients, as appropriate.

These proposals for multilingual practices were incorporated into the projects which was renegotiated with the SANTED staff.

The DUT-UKZN Multilingualism Project was housed in the School of isiZulu Studies at UKZN. The two institutions implemented the project in the School of Education and the Departments of Nursing and Psychology at UKZN, and Dental Assisting at DUT.

The project consisted largely of second language learning programmes for staff and students in professional disciplines, development of
terminology lists and glossaries, translation of tutorial materials, and provision of interpreting services in isiZulu in DUT.

IsiZulu second language learning programmes in professional disciplines were offered in the Education Department to trainee-teachers in Early Childhood Development, in the Department of Community Health to students training in Nursing, as well as to students in the Psychology Department. Their main purpose was to provide English students with conversational proficiency, cultural awareness and sensitivity in contexts where isiZulu would be spoken during the students' professional experiential training at the university and as practitioners beyond university. In other words, the students were prepared and sensitised to the multilingual and multicultural South African society.

Professional language training is important in the South African context given the country's linguistic profile: English is the language of wider communication in professional contexts, it is the main medium of instruction in institutions of higher learning, but it is spoken by less than 9.6 per cent of the population and, when combined with Afrikaans (the medium of instruction at some historically Afrikaans-medium universities), is spoken by less than 25 per cent of the population. Therefore, over 75 per cent of the South African population speaks indigenous African languages. When this is applied in the context of universities as centres of vocational training, it means that most professionals trained in South Africa do not speak the language of the majority of the South African population they will serve when they leave university. General language learning programmes offered to students in professional disciplines at universities do not produce the kind of knowledge required from their candidates – the kind of vocation-specific language competence that students need to deal with their clients in a specific context. These students have different communicative needs and, as such, the communicative competence they need to develop is often different from that offered to students in general second language learning contexts. It is for this reason that vocational-specific language learning and teaching is now a preferred method of teaching second languages in vocation-specific contexts. Professional language learning and teaching was therefore
Driving Change

an intervention strategy to prepare professionals for a society where linguistic and cultural diversity is the norm. Its purpose was to prepare students to function in the multilingual and multicultural contexts in South Africa where isiZulu was spoken.

Generic isiZulu second language learning programmes were offered to academic and non-academic staff and students in other disciplines with the aim of reinforcing and sensitising them to institutional language policy provisions on multilingualism.

Another aspect of the DUT-UKZN Multilingualism Project involved the development of English-isiZulu terminology lists and glossaries to support learning in the professional disciplines listed above, as well as in Dental Assisting in DUT. Terminology lists and glossaries enabled the universities to provide academic support and to promote concept learning for English second language students.

There is a clear indication that the project spurred the implementation of UKZN’s Language Policy. The focus of implementation was primarily on acquisition of isiZulu as an additional language for students speaking other languages, and corpus development where concepts in professional disciplines were developed or translated from English into isiZulu. The other outcome of the implementation of UKZN’s Language Policy is that staff, from executives to support staff, became more aware of language issues in the context of higher education, particularly the role of isiZulu within the university and in the South African multilingual context. In the case of DUT, the institution developed and adopted its Language Policy in 2010. While there is no clear indication of the correlation between the SANTED activities and the adoption of the Language Policy, inference can be made that the policy formulation and its adoption must have been encouraged by the language-related activities driven by the SANTED Multilingualism Project.

The SANTED multilingualism projects were implemented at a time when the study of African languages and their role in higher education was marginalised. It therefore made sense that institutions that hosted the projects used the opportunity to revive scholarship in African languages, especially in relation to their significance in transforming higher education in terms of access and success. For this reason, all
the institutions had the projects hosted by, or had some relations with, the departments of African languages as academic homes for African languages. UKZN’s SANTED Multilingualism Project was hosted by the Department of isiZulu. It is clear, and indicated above, that there was increased awareness from the university community of issues related to language and learning, and particularly the role of African languages in access, success and retention in higher education. However, there is no scientific baseline data to gauge the impact of the project on the ‘growth’ of the department, but there is evidence that the scientific output of the department, in the form of academic publications, increased during the SANTED period. The publications, that constituted reports on the process and implementation of the SANTED activities, were produced by staff and postgraduate students.

The DUT–UKZN Multilingualism Project certainly achieved its objectives, as conceptualised in their business plan, and as conceived in the multilingualism theme of the SANTED II Programme. The project piloted the introduction of multilingualism in teaching and learning at the two institutions, and provided an opportunity for reflection in the form of publications. The impact of the project on practices of multilingualism and their institutionalisation within the DUT and UKZN and the extent of their impact on promotion of linguistic and cultural diversity, access, success and retention of students, particularly those to whom English is a second language, must still be evaluated. The 2007–2009 period focused on the practical implementation of programmes, and reporting on the process of their implementation. The institutional adoption of these programmes will provide a basis for the evaluation of their impact on students and staff.

The University of Cape Town Project

The University of Cape Town (UCT) is situated in the Western Cape Province of South Africa. The Province has Afrikaans, isiXhosa and English as its official languages. Afrikaans has the highest number of speakers while English has the fewest speakers. However, as with all South African universities, UCT is linguistically and culturally diverse
and its language of teaching and learning is English. Its Language Policy and Plan were approved and adopted by the University Senate in 1999, and revised in 2003. In UCT’s policy, English is recognised as the medium of instruction, and academic language departments are tasked with the responsibility of ensuring students’ academic proficiency in the language. The policy acknowledges the need to produce students who are proficient in other South African languages and who are aware of the multilingual nature of the South African society.

Unlike the UKZN and DUT, the University of Cape Town has a history of multilingualism in its teaching and learning practices, but until the SANTED phase only focussed on teaching the acquisition of isiXhosa to speakers of other languages. Institutional recognition of multilingualism was strengthened with the establishment of the Multilingualism Education Project (MEP) in 2005. The project’s main responsibility is to drive the implementation of the institutional Language Policy with the objective of promoting a multilingual environment on campus by fostering multilingual proficiency and awareness amongst staff and students. It made sense for the UCT-SANTED Multilingualism Project to be hosted and coordinated by MEP. In implementing its activities, the project collaborated with the Department of African Languages and Literatures and the Department of Afrikaans, which had been offering academic programmes in the learning of isiXhosa and Afrikaans as additional languages to medical students and general isiXhosa courses to students in the Humanities and Social Sciences Faculty.

The activities of the project were based on objectives outlined in the business plan which were to:

- provide an isiXhosa communication skills course to staff and students;

- facilitate the compilation of multilingual corpora and glossaries, including the development of a machine translator for African languages.

On the one hand, the project enabled the expansion and the consolidation of the academic isiXhosa second language courses that were already in
place, while introducing isiXhosa non-academic conversation courses to staff and students. The isiXhosa course in the Health Sciences Faculty was initially offered as a one-year course. With the introduction of the project, the course offering was changed to a six-year course that was presented alongside the medical training programme. The course was structured to provide physical contact with the teacher in the first two years and this was then gradually replaced by partial teacher support, and eventual independent learning. Materials developed during the SANTED phase, in the form of language learning CD-ROMs and phrasebooks, facilitated the independent learning. The programme was further customised and introduced in other professional disciplines, including Occupational Therapy, Speech Therapy and Physiotherapy in the Health Sciences Faculty. Funding from SANTED enabled the development of course materials and various computer-assisted language learning materials, and the hiring of teachers to provide teaching support to the course. The teachers were capacitated on various aspects of language teaching for professional purposes.

The strength of the language courses was rooted in their integration into the curriculum of the health sciences courses, as well as the robust collaboration between MEP, academic language departments, and the targeted disciplines in the Faculty of Health Sciences.

For its non-academic language learning programmes MEP introduced certified short isiXhosa communication skills courses to staff and students. These courses further entrenched multilingualism on campus. Offering the course as a non-academic subject, but providing a certificate approved by the South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA) at successful completion of the course, motivated students to see the value of participating in the course, but with less of the anxiety often associated with academic courses. The evaluation of both the academic and non-academic courses at the end of each cycle illustrates student and staff awareness of and sensitivity to issues of multilingualism on campus and beyond. The courses have also been fundamental in the introduction of ‘homestays’ for medical students when they stay with a family speaking isiXhosa or Afrikaans while they undertake their training at hospitals. Students reported that the ability to speak basic isiXhosa and Afrikaans enabled them to embrace other
cultures and to become sensitive to problems that could arise as a result of communication difficulties with their patients.

On the other hand, the work of the project enabled the extraction of English corpora and glossaries in the disciplines of Statistics and Mathematics, Law, Economics, Physics and Health Sciences. The Statistics and Mathematics, and Economics glossaries from the corpora have been translated from English into the other ten national official languages and uploaded to UCT’s e-learning platform. The objective of this project was to pilot the use of African languages in facilitating concept learning, alongside English, the medium of instruction. This project for piloting the use of isiXhosa and other languages was not focused on the actual implementation of multilingual teaching, but rather on the development of materials for that purpose. While the glossaries were uploaded to the e-learning platform, there has been no study to report on their impact on students’ learning or whether the glossaries facilitated quality learning. As with the UKZN-DUT project, the four-year period provided for the systematic development of concepts in African languages in specialised disciplines. The period after the SANTED intervention will facilitate the next stage of developing classroom methodologies to implement bilingual or multilingual teaching where African languages are used alongside English to support learning. The impact of such interventions can only be evaluated then.

Of the three SANTED multilingualism projects, the UCT project was the only one that developed three languages in its academic communication skills courses. In the Health Sciences Faculty, the project offered courses in both isiXhosa and Afrikaans to students who were proficient in English, with students graduating with proficiency in three languages. However, the specialised language glossary was translated into all the other official languages. The UCT Multilingualism Project provided a systematic and research-based approach to the design, development and implementation of their activities and its work on terminology planning, particularly the extraction of corpora, and development of multilingual glossaries, provided a breakthrough in the development of indigenous languages for use in higher education.
**The Rhodes University Project**

Rhodes University (RU) is situated in the Eastern Cape Province of South Africa. With about 7,000 students, it is one of the smallest universities in the country. The project was guided in its activities by the university’s Language Policy and the vision and mission of the African Language Studies (ALS) Section of the School of Languages where the project was housed. The ALS’s objective is to promote academic literacy in English (the language of learning and teaching of RU) as well as to encourage teaching and learning of isiXhosa as an additional and academic language.

Prior to the launch of the SANTED Multilingualism Project in 2007, the ALS had just over 80 students studying isiXhosa as an additional language at undergraduate level. With the exception of the staff communication skills course at beginner level, which was introduced in 2006, the isiXhosa additional language course was the only such course offered at the university. In 2007, the ALS had three staff members and the project employed the coordinator as well as five other staff members. From its inception in 2007, the project institutionalised the programmes it had conceptualised within the Humanities, Pharmacy, Education and Law faculties, and in the Human Resources Division (HRD). It is within these entities that the activities of the project were planned, designed and implemented to realise the broad aims of the project.

The programmes that the RU SANTED Multilingualism Project conceptualised focused on three areas: the development of the isiXhosa second language learning programmes, the development of teaching support materials in specialised academic disciplines aimed at students speaking English as an additional language, and the advancement of scholarship in isiXhosa.

More specifically, the project operated in the following broad areas:

- enabling the acquisition of isiXhosa, as an additional language, for both academic and support staff at the university;
- enabling the acquisition of isiXhosa as an additional language in
professional programmes (Pharmacy, Law, Education, Journalism and Media Studies);

• developing bilingual glossaries and piloting the use of isiXhosa as an additional teaching resource in specialised academic disciplines (Computer Science, Political Studies, Geography);
• promoting African languages in ICT and other domains (offering human language technology courses in mother tongue and localising computer software terminology); and
• promoting scholarship in and intellectualisation of African languages, particularly by advancing isiXhosa as a subject of study for mother tongue students at both undergraduate and postgraduate levels.

The Pharmacy and Law faculties offered language acquisition and cultural awareness courses in isiXhosa. The Pharmacy Faculty course was designed together with the community engagement arm of the faculty while the Law Faculty course was designed in collaboration with the Legal Aid Clinic. In both these faculties the students were required, as part of service learning and community involvement, to engage with local community members who speak isiXhosa. The courses were designed and piloted in 2007 and offered as credit-bearing electives from 2007. The Pharmacy Faculty course was offered to final year and doctoral students who were already in the field and the Law Faculty course was offered to students in their penultimate year of study.

The Education Faculty course also focused on language acquisition and cultural awareness. The curriculum for the course was designed in 2007 and 2008. It was introduced into the curriculum of the Postgraduate Certificate in Education (PGCE) in 2009 as a credit-bearing module and was offered to all PGCE students.

The materials designed and made available to teach these courses consisted of printed manuals, phrase books and, except for the Education Faculty course, audio and a digital version of the course manual on a flash drive.

The curriculum for the Journalism course was developed and designed in collaboration with the School of Journalism and Media Studies in
2009, and the course was piloted in 2010 and 2011. It was included in the Bachelor of Journalism programme as a compulsory course in 2012. The course has two streams, one for mother tongue speakers with a focus on writing and translation skills in isiXhosa, and another for speakers of other languages where the focus is on developing proficiency in isiXhosa and cultural awareness in the context of journalism.

IsiXhosa, as a subject of study for mother tongue students, had not been offered at RU for 15 years and one of the main activities in the RU project involved the reintroduction of the subject. The academic programme established as a result of the project is an indication of how it reinvigorated the scientific study of isiXhosa and resuscitated the ALS at the university. By the end of the project, the programme had over 60 undergraduate students and an equal number of postgraduate students, including students at doctoral level. One of the reasons often cited for poor education in African languages, both at school and university, is the lack of exposure of teachers to mother tongue education. It makes sense, therefore, that the development of conceptual understanding of school children in their mother tongue and the success of mother tongue education are dependent on teachers who have also received training in their mother tongue.

As a service to academic and non-academic staff, the project also continued with the isiXhosa communication skills course at beginner level that had been in place prior to the inception of the project, and then went on to design and develop an intermediate course. The project applied for SAQA approval of the course and, on successful completion, the participants were awarded a certificate with a recognised unit standard. At the inception of the project, this programme was managed and financed by the Human Resources Division of the university. During the SANTED period, this relationship was maintained with SANTED providing the staff that professionally designed, developed and offered these courses. This arrangement made it easy for the programme to become sustainable when SANTED funding came to an end.

The development of bilingual teaching support material was also one of the leading activities of the project. Bilingual (English–isiXhosa) glossaries were developed in Computer Science, Political Studies and
Geography. This was in response to a need identified by academic staff in these departments, concerned with the many entry-level students enrolled in these courses who failed to progress further, because English was not their mother tongue. They sought language assistance from the project to facilitate cognition.

The project also developed a bilingual computer literacy booklet which was used, in collaboration with the Computer Science Department, in local high schools. The booklet was also utilised by the teachers enrolled in the Advanced Certificate in Education (ACE) programme in the Education Faculty. The materials were developed by masters and doctoral students in isiXhosa.

In its first year the project also developed a multimedia facility which was localised into the other ten official languages in collaboration with Translate.org, a non-governmental open-source software localising organisation. The facility, named the SANTED Peter Mtuze Multimedia Facility, was launched in 2008. The development of glossaries, CD-ROMs, and the teaching of most of the courses in the project, were supported by this facility. The facility continues to support the teaching and learning of all other languages offered by the School of Languages such as French, German, Chinese, Afrikaans, Dutch, Latin and Greek.

The main goals of the project were to implement the RU Language Policy to promote multilingualism on campus, enhance student academic success, develop African language scholarship, and advance isiXhosa as an intellectual and academic language. Generally speaking, the activities of the project and the teaching of proficiency in isiXhosa strengthened and promoted the use of isiXhosa alongside English at the university, thereby creating an environment where previously marginalised languages became valuable and visible in both formal and informal learning contexts.

**Challenges, unexpected results and lessons learnt**

From the discussion above, it is evident that the SANTED multilingualism projects were successful on many fronts, but there were also many challenges in the implementation of project activities. On reflection,
the impact of the challenges was mitigated by the supportive and non-prescriptive nature of the management and monitoring offered by the SANTED Programme management and staff. Their regular visits and reporting helped projects to identify challenges before they became problems and allowed them to change their course, but within the focus areas identified in their business plans. Having said that, there were critical challenges that could not be resolved, and which affected the outcomes of the projects.

The use of African languages and the implementation of multilingualism in higher education requires expertise that has not yet been sufficiently developed at universities and other post-school training entities. This presented the challenges of developing the appropriate pedagogy and practices related to implementing multi-language usage in higher education, and finding staff with the capacity and expertise to undertake the activities of the projects, including language learning curriculum design in professional disciplines and terminology planning. The SANTED office therefore arranged workshops with leading local and international scholars who could provide expertise and share knowledge for all project staff. Unfortunately these workshops were one-off events and the implementation of their recommendations was not always carried out in a systematic way by the various projects. For example, a computer-based tool that was introduced at a workshop on extraction of corpora in specialised disciplines for terminology planning was used by only one of the projects afterwards, even though its benefits in corpus extraction were immense. Furthermore, because of the interdisciplinary nature of the programmes, it was often a challenge to find a person with expertise in both the language and the discipline within which the projects worked. All the projects were able to identify a willing expert in each discipline, but these experts were often not language specialists, and language specialists did not necessarily possess the disciplinary knowledge for identifying and glossing concepts in another language. This often raised questions about the appropriateness of the resulting terminology within the discipline and for the level of study at which it would be used.

Another challenge related to the staffing of the projects. Except in the case of Rhodes University, all project coordinators were, first and
foremost, employees of the host universities and project coordination was a secondary responsibility for these people. Given the fixed period within which the multilingualism projects received funding, and the inevitably output-focused form of reporting, important features of activities were sometimes overlooked. It is in the post-SANTED phase that the academic departments that adopted the project activities, through their postgraduate programmes, are systematically documenting the conceptualisation, design, development, implementation and impact of the courses. This research should inform the future implementation of multilingual teaching and learning practices in the South African higher education environment.

The linguistic profile of staff at the universities also proved a challenge. Whilst the non-academic communication skills courses might have provided participants with basic conversation skills in African languages, as well as an awareness of issues of language and learning, their language abilities would not enable them to implement with confidence the use of other languages as mediums of instruction alongside English. The linguistic profile of staff is changing slowly and therefore the strategies of implementing multilingual teaching and learning, especially with the objective of facilitating epistemic access, need to take this into consideration. During the SANTED phase RU and UCT piloted mother tongue-based bilingual teaching using multilingual senior students and tutors.

The challenges experienced, although worth noting, were negligible compared to the unexpected and positive results of the projects. Firstly, the projects fostered collaboration, not only between the recipient institutions, but also with other institutions that invited participants to share their experiences of implementing multilingualism. The models adopted by the SANTED multilingualism projects have left a lasting legacy, because their achievements and the models they developed have been shared with, and adopted by, many institutions in the country.

The activities of SANTED also attracted other sources of funding from within the country. The UCT SANTED Multilingualism Project, for example, secured funding from the National Research Foundation (NRF) to recruit students from the Department of Electrical Engineering
to undertake research on human language technology. The RU SANTED Multilingualism Project received funding for a scholarship for Applied Language Studies over a three-year period. The success of these financial grant applications relied on the research environment created by the SANTED work.

Another valuable consequence of the projects is the manner in which the campus community at large, from the managing executives to support staff, embraced issues of multilingualism in higher education. Senior managers, across the three universities, participated in the communication skills and cultural awareness courses. Academic staff members, also in all three projects, started recognising language as a factor in students’ underperformance and considered intervention strategies based on language issues. The successful introduction of models of bilingual practices in teaching, for example in the PGCE Programme at UKZN, and in the ACE Programme at RU, are also examples of positive outcomes of the projects. These modules provided a classroom environment to debate issues around multilingualism in higher education, particularly the role of African languages in facilitating meaningful learning and social cohesion, among other things.

Because of the interdisciplinary nature of the SANTED interventions, relationships were created that resulted in cutting-edge interdisciplinary research which has been published in scientific journals. The UKZN Press also dedicated a volume of its journal *Alternation* to the work of the SANTED multilingualism projects.

The revitalisation of the ALS at RU and the reinvigoration of the study of isiXhosa as a scientific language remains one of the most positive outcomes of the RU SANTED Multilingualism Project. The ALS, in 2006, prior to the inception of SANTED, had two staff members and approximately 80 students studying isiXhosa as an additional language at undergraduate level. By 2010, there were eight staff members, four of whom were previously employed through SANTED, and student numbers had increased to over 500. Approximately 20 per cent of these are postgraduate students.

One of the issues hampering the implementation of multilingualism in higher education in South Africa is insufficient funding. The funding
formula used by the state for research at universities awards the lowest level of funding to research in languages. Therefore, even if a university commits to multilingualism, state funding remains a challenge. The nature of these multilingualism projects, although output-orientated, allowed for the piloting of programmes which, in retrospect, would not have been possible in this funding context. Because of the successes of the projects, many of them were institutionalised and integrated into the curriculum.

**Sustainability of the multilingualism projects beyond SANTED**

One of the key objectives of the SANTED multilingualism projects has been the institutional uptake of the courses conceptualised during the SANTED period. The academic courses were generally integrated in the curricula in which they were taught. Other non-academic courses, for example the staff communication skills courses, are funded through the universities’ operating budgets.

Institutional language committees at UCT, RU and UKZN are instrumental in keeping debates on multilingualism in higher education alive. RU, whose Language Committee was formally constituted in 2010, hosts an annual event to celebrate multilingualism in higher education, and UKZN has an annual interdisciplinary conference on issues of multilingualism in higher education.

There is no doubt that the SANTED activities provided an impetus in research on multilingualism in higher education, both within and outside the institutions that hosted the projects. RU African Language Studies was awarded a Research Chair on Intellectualisation of African Languages, Multilingualism and Education by the National Research Fund. The research derives its focus areas from those conceptualised during the SANTED period. UKZN also funded a Research Chair in African Languages. In both instances, the research and other activities initiated by the SANTED multilingualism projects continue to form part of the institutions’ enterprises.
Conclusion

The activities of the SANTED multilingualism projects attempted to implement key objectives expressed in national and institutional language policy. These objectives include using language to facilitate equity of access, both physical and epistemic, to all students entering higher education; facilitating academic success; and creating sensitivity and awareness of issues related to linguistic and cultural diversity within the university environment and beyond. These principles are fundamental in preparing students to be responsible members of a multilingual nation and global village who will contribute to the socio-economic development of South African society.

The promotion of multilingualism and development of African languages in higher education is an inherently difficult task, especially given the history of the practice of these languages in South African higher education and in society at large. However, the SANTED multilingualism projects presented a timely opportunity to pilot multilingual teaching and learning models using African languages. The institutional uptake of these programmes, as well as the research opportunities in African languages that they presented, benefitted all the participating institutions, albeit to varying degrees. Dialogues on the role of African languages in teaching and learning are robust at institutions that hosted the SANTED multilingualism projects, and within the Department of Higher Education and Training.

Endnotes

1. UKZN is the product of a merger in 2004 of the University of Durban-Westville (UDW); which was established during apartheid to cater for Indians; the University of Natal, which originally enrolled white South Africans; and an incorporated teacher training college. The merger was part of the post-apartheid policy of desegregating higher education, amongst other things. UKZN has five campuses made up of three former separate institutions.