NOTES

CHAPTER ONE

1 Schechter, ARN. Schechter's edition contains the two versions in parallel columns with notes on the manuscripts and further notes on parallels and points of interpretation.

2 For many details of interpretation, see Saldarini, ARNB and Finkelstein, Mabo.

3 Many parallels are conveniently listed in Schechter, ARN and Saldarini, ARNB.

4 Goldin, "Two Versions."


6 For a thorough discussion of Torah in Isaiah, see Jensen, The Use of tôrâ by Isaiah.

7 Dodd, The Bible and the Greeks, p. 34.

8 J.A. Sanders, "Torah," p. 910.

9 G.P. Moore, Judaism, I, p. 263.

10 Josephus, Antiquities, 13, 10, 6 (#297).

11 Schäfer, "Das 'Dogma' von mundlichen Torah im rabbinischen Judentum," in Studien, pp. 153-197 shows that the explicit term "oral Torah" arose in the third century among the Amoraim. PA 1:1 does not specify what it includes in the term Torah.

CHAPTER TWO

1 For a discussion of the enumeration form, see W.S. Towner, The Rabbinic "Enumeration."

2 Actually, PA 1:17 and 18 cite "Simeon his son" and "Rabban Simeon ben Gamaliel." This problem and others associated with the continuation of the chain will be discussed in ch. 5.

3 William McKane, Proverbs, 1-22 and passim, distinguishes wisdom instructions and wisdom sentences. Biblical proverbs, of course, have parallel members and are not tripartite.

4 For the original meaning of Simeon's saying, see Goldin, "The Three Pillars."

4a Küchler, Frühjüdische Weisheitstraditionen, p. 185 notes that PA 1:12-14 has the three basic forms of wisdom sayings, imperative, indicative and interrogative.

5 Towner, The Rabbinic "Enumeration", pp. 79-84; 249.

6 See ch. 5 below. Also, Saldarini, "The End of the Rabbinic Chain of Tradition."
In the Biblical tradition, note the use of the first person singular in Qohelet.


Goldin, "A Philosophical Session."

Two of the sayings have additions. 2:10 has some clauses added to the initial three imperatives. 2:14 was probably a three part saying originally, according to Goldin, "A Philosophical Session," pp. 4-5; Heb. version, pp. 71-74.

In ARNA Akabya asks four questions. See ch. 7 for a discussion.


PA 3:15-16 are not attributed to Akiba in ARNB and are recorded in a different place in the text (ch. 44).

Elisha ben Abuyah may have been put last because he was an apostate. Akiba, the best known of the four may have been put first and then moved ahead to join the early sages in ch. 3. See L. Finkelstein, *Mabo*, pp. 75-77 and "Introductory Study," pp. 22-24.


Neusner, *Method and Meaning*.

Goldin, "Abot," 983 suggests that the tripartite saying is not just a *bon mot* or moral maxim, but the formulation of a fundamental principle or policy characteristic of the tradent. This suggestion has yet to be tested. Küchler, *Frühjüdische Weisheitstraditionen*, pp. 176-198, surveys PA and ARN within the larger wisdom tradition.

Hengel, *Judaism and Hellenism*; Bickerman, *From Ezra*.

This subject will be treated more extensively in ch. 6. For a convenient collection of some Greek materials, see Tod, *Sidelights*, ch. 3.


Bikerman (sic), "La Chaîne." Bikerman also cites Sotion (known only through fragments) and jurists.

Bickerman, "The Maxim of Antigonus of Soko."


The mass of material collected by Fischel contains many motifs, but not structural parallels or carefully nuanced
discussions of related genres. For an extensive critique, see the unpublished paper of Shaye Cohen prepared for the 1977 meeting of the Society of Biblical Literature.

28 The number seven may derive from Gilgamesh (tablet 11), according to Lesky, History of Greek Literature, p. 156.


31 J.M. Robinson, "Logoi Sophoi"; see also Wilkin, "Wisdom and Philosophy"; Schoedel, "Jewish Wisdom."

32 Wilken, "Wisdom and Philosophy."

33 The external arguments for dating PA at 300 C.E. or later have been assembled by A. Guttmann, "Tractate Abot."

34 Epstein, Mabo.

35 Culpepper, The Johannine School.


37 Neusner, Eliezer, II. Avi-Yonah, The Jews in Palestine, p. 128 says that the third century is the century of haggadists.

CHAPTER THREE

1 Saldarini, "The End of the Rabbinic Chain" and chapters 5 and 6 below.

2 According to L. Finkelstein, Mabo, pp. 67-70, Nehunya ben Ha-Kana was originally a fifth member of this group, but was eliminated because his saying was strongly pro-government.

3 b. Hagiga 14b.

4 According to L. Finkelstein, Mabo, pp. 75-77 and "Introductory Study," pp. 22-24, Elisha ben Abuyah originally headed the list, followed by Ben Zoma, Ben Azzai and Akiba. Because Elisha apostatized Ben Zoma was put ahead of him so that an apostate would not introduce the group.

5 Interestingly, ch. 27 has the last sayings of both PA, ch. 2 and PA, ch. 3.

6 In "Introductory Study," note 5, Finkelstein mentions seven further groups of sayings used as sources.

7 See J.N. Epstein's account of the growth of the Mishna in Mabo Ḥa-Meṣaḥah.

8 See J. Heinenmann's critique of Finkelstein's liturgical source studies and his convincing hypothesis concerning the multiformal "original" of the prayers in Prayer in the Talmud.

CHAPTER FOUR

1 Goldin, "Not By an Angel."
See L. Finkelstein, "The Maxim of the Anshe Kneset Ha-Ge-dolah."


4 In chronological sequence, Job belongs after Adam since he is thought of as a contemporary of Abraham. Torah should be joined with the Prophets and Writings. See the order in ARNB below.

5 M. Shabbat 9:3; m. Mikwaot 8:3. See other interpretations in b. Shabbat 86a-b and b. Yebamot 62a.

6 P. Schäfer, Studien, pp. 153-197, shows that explicit mention of oral Torah alongside written Torah at Sinai arises in the third century, C.E.

7 Or perhaps translate יִדְיָד as "and not even like all the mighty men in the world," according to Goldin, ARNA p. 180, n. 53.

8 Goldin, "Third Chapter."

9 Goldin, ARNA, p. 182, n. 14 says that this discussion belongs under the phrase "acts of loving kindness" where it is found in ARNB, ch. 8. But from the viewpoint of ARNA the key item for discussion is study of Torah and this case is used appropriately here to develop that theme.

10 ֹ Eylül is understood as "world" rather than as "forever".

11 See Saldarini, "Johanan ben Zakkai's Escape" and Schäfer, "Die Flucht Johanan."

12 Bickerman, "The Maxim of Antigonus of Soko." Urbach, The Sages, p. 403 and n. 22 disagrees with Bickerman without sufficient evidence. Urbach quickly becomes embroiled in later disputes about the relative merits of fear and love as motives.

13 Fischel, "The Uses of Sorites." p. 128.


15 Towner, The Rabbinic "Enumeration", pp. 75-84.

16 See ch. 5 for further discussion. Finkelstein, Mabo, p. 6, n. 10, proposes the opposite theory, that Eli and Samuel were original to the chain and were dropped after 70 C.E. when the Rabbis replaced the priests as the dominant authority in Judaism.

17 Saldarini, ARNB, p. 34, n. 42.

18 Finkelstein, Mabo, 32-35, says that fear as a better motive is an old Shammaite teaching. Vermes, Post Biblical Jewish Studies, p. 114. finds justice rather than love stressed in Targums to Gen. 4:8. This was probably a continuing Rabbinic dispute. See note 12 above.

19 Saldarini, ARNB, p. 131 has a chart.

20 ARNB also has the order Shammai—Hillel in ch. 46. See Finkelstein, "Introductory Study," pp. 17-18.

21 Goldin, "Two Versions."
CHAPTER FIVE

1 See Saldarini, "The End of the Rabbinic Chain."
3 Finkelstein, Mabo, p. 233, n. 16 and "Introductory Study," pp. 48-49.
4 Fischel, "The Uses of Sorites," pp. 125-126 and n. 18. Fischel notes that some Greco-Roman chains use a verb without a direct object to indicate what is being passed on.
6 Neusner, Pharisees, 1:184-185. Finkelstein classifies Menahem as a "conservative," even though he is said to agree with Hillel (Akiba, p. 298).
7 Josephus, Antiquities, pp. 15, 10, 5; Derenbourg, Essai, pp. 464-465.
8 Josephus, War, pp. 2, 17, 8. Lieberman, Greek, 179-181 on the basis of Shir Ha-Shirim Zuta, end. See also J. Rosenthal, "The Identity of Menahem" (In Hebrew).
9 Hoenig, "Menahem" (in Hebrew).
11 Finkelstein, Mabo, p. 56; "Introductory Study," p. 28.
13 ARNA, end of ch. 22; ARNB, end of ch. 32.
14 Bikerman, "La Chaîne" and Fischel, "The Use of Sorites."
17 Celsus, Medical Art, Proem 8 under Tiberius.
18 Eusebius, Evangeliae Praeparationis, 9.30 (447a)
20 Johnson, The Purposes of the Biblical Genealogies and Wilson, Genealogy and History.
21 Finkelstein, Mabo, pp. 5-18 and "Introductory Study."
22 Wilson, Genealogy, p. 154.
23 Finkelstein, Mabo, pp. 9-10; Johnson, Genealogies pp. 190-191.
24 Wilson, Genealogy, pp. 27-36 and passim.
CHAPTER SIX

1. Goldin, "A Philosophical Session"; Fischel, "Story" and "Studies," passim. A chria is an antedote, usually about a sage or a philosopher, which culminates in a meaningful action or proverb.


3. Lieberman, Greek and Hellenism.

4. Tod, Sidelights, Lecture 3; Ferguson, "The Attic Orgeones."


6. Sevenster, Do You Know Greek; Fitzmyer, "The Languages"; Fischel, "Greek and Latin Languages."


11. Tod, Sidelights, p. 77; MacMullen, Roman Social Relations, pp. 18-20 and 73-80.

12. Tod, Sidelights, pp. 76-77.


15. MacMullen, Roman Social Relations, pp. 73-80.


20. Goldin, "Several Sidelights," p. 184 says that aphorisms and exempla were used to educate the young. See also "The End of Ecclesiastes," pp. 136-138.


23. Urbach, The Sages, p. 610 says that extravagant praise of Torah is addressed to students.


25. Bowersock, Greek Sophists.
26 Urbach, *The Sages*, pp. 599-620 traces the tension between the imperative to study and the demands of holding office in the lives of the sages.

27 Fischel, "Story," pp. 82-84 and passim in his works.

28 We should note that the Rabbis in Babylon, where the civil authority resided in the exilarch, participated in government and assumed multiple roles. See for example J. Neusner, *Talmudic Judaism*, chs. 4-8.

29 Urbach, *The Sages*, pp. 603-620. PA 1:13, by Hillel, is the most famous stricture against using Torah: "He that puts the crown to his own use shall perish." Note that Paul is proud that he works at a craft and supports himself (1 Cor. 9:8-12).

30 ARNA, chs. 1 and 28; ARNB, ch. 8.


32 MacMullen, *Roman Social Relations*, passim.

33 Bowersock, *Greek Sophists*, ch. 4.

34 SifreDt #343, end (ed. Finkelstein, 400)

35 Fischel, "Studies," passim.


37 ARNA, ch. 14. גַּדְלָה and צַאתָם are ambiguous and carry both meanings. In a culture where wisdom is often associated with age and experience, the two meanings overlap.

38 Fischel notes that the encyclopedic curriculum is common in Greco-Roman literature ("Studies," p. 82). ARNB, chs. 12 and 28 has a stereotyped description of the curriculum, varying a little from what is found here in ARNA. ARNA, ch. 28 has part of the curriculum also. See b. Sukkah 28a and b. Baba Bathra 134a for further items. Mention of gemara shows that the form before us is third century or later. PA 3:18 indicates that the calendar and mathematics are also presumed.


42 Goldin, "A Philosophical Session," pp. 16-18; Fischel, "Story," p. 75 and n. 83. Goldin sees the exchange as the summary of an actual discussion; Fischel (p. 71, n. 61) more persuasively evaluates it as a rhetorical figure rather than an historical account.

Finkelstein, Mabo, p. 44 surmises that "good impulse" was original. Goldin, "A Philosophical Session, p. 13 says good neighbor was original.


These stories are found in ARNB in a different order and in b. Shabbat 31a with a fourth added. The stories in b. Shabbat are abbreviated and even obscure in places. ARNA shows affinities with both ARNB and b. Shabbat.

Fischel, "Story," pp. 70-71 and 76-77.


Goldin, "A Philosophical Session," pp. 5-6; Hebrew version, pp. 74-75. Goldin also suggests that the other mishnaic mention of an Epicurean in m. Sanhedrin 10:1 is meant literally.

Saldarini, "Last Words."


Lieberman, Hellenism, p. 103. In b. Berakot 28b the saying is attributed to Eliezer.

Alon suggests that gúwn refers to wealth which in turn leads to social status. Mekqarim, 2:49; ET 344-53.

Note that the parallelism is characteristic of Biblical proverbs.

CHAPTER SEVEN

Finkelstein, Mabo, chs. 7-9. Note that the five sages match the five disciples of Johanan ben Zakkai. See ch. 3 above for a presentation of Finkelstein's source theory.

b. Hagiga 14b.

Saldarini, "Last Words."

hûwnûn and nhûwny.
Finkelstein, Mabo, pp. 122-124.

See ch. 5 above for the place of these two princes in the chain of tradition. Here they are part of the theme of the chapter, though both Johanan and Eleazar ben Azariah who are present led the school for short periods.

Fischel, Rabbinic Literature, Part 1, argues that the story of the four is originally based on a Greco-Roman anti-Epicurean tradition. But the traditional interpretation associating it with mysticism remains the strongest interpretation. See most recently, Gruenwald, Apocalyptic and Merkavah Mysticism.

Finkelstein, Mabo, p. 77.

Fischel, Rabbinic Literature, p. 150, n. 121.

Fischel, Rabbinic Literature, Parts 3 and 4. See the exposition of ARNB below for more detail.

See Saldarini, "Last Words," for a review of the texts.

מַעַמ תַּהוּס is translated as "a place of compression" by S. Lieberman in "How Much Greek" p. 137 and interpreted to refer to the womb and grave.


Fischel, Rabbinic Literature, pp. 70-72; "Studies," p. 73.

Scholem, Jewish Gnosticism, p. 77, n. 6 quotes a text which uses similar language. But this imagery is very common; in Seder Eliahu Rabba, ch. 8 Israel is God's orchard.

Fischel, "The Uses of Sorites," p. 141; Rabbinic Literature, pp. 74-78.

Fischel, Rabbinic Literature, pp. 90-91.

Fischel, Rabbinic Literature, p. 152, n. 130.

Fischel, Rabbinic Literature, p. 94.

The other two Amoraim are Abba in ch. 25 and Rabbi Jeremiah in ch. 36.

CHAPTER EIGHT

See Towner, The Rabbinic "Enumeration of Scriptural Examples," for a careful form critical study of this form with special reference to the Mekilta of Rabbi Ishmael.

Roth, Numerical Sayings, pp. 95-96.

Roth, Numerical Sayings, pp. 99-100.
Chapter 8, cont.

4. J. Goody, *The Domestication*. See especially ch. 5 on lists. Goody began his study in "The Consequences of Literacy." The transition from oral to literate culture is traced by E. Havelock, most recently in *The Greek Concept of Justice* and "The Alphabetization of Homer" (with citations of previous literature.)

5. Towner, *The Rabbinic "Enumeration"*, pp. 75-76.


7. Towner, *The Rabbinic "Enumeration"*, pp. 213; 244-250; see also pp. 75-76 on variations in the contents of the lists.

8. See Goldin, *ARNA*, ch. 40, nn. 33-35 for the editor, Julian Oberman's highly speculative attempt to reconstruct three groups of three.

9. Actually five requirements are listed. See m. Demai 2:2-3.

10. See the end of the Babylonian Talmudic Tractates Berakot, Yebamot, Nazir, Tamid and Keritot for this saying.

CHAPTER NINE

1. Goldin, "Two Versions."

2. See the comparative chart in Saldarini, *ARNB*, pp. 303-305.


4. Daube, "Rabbinic Methods," p. 244, n. 17 says that the four stories in b. Shabbat illustrate four of Hillel's hermeneutical principles. In another place (New Testament and Rabbinic Judaism, pp. 336-337) he argues that b. Shabbat is earlier than ARN because Hillel is portrayed as accepting the Gentile as a Jew before instructing him.


8. Goody, "The Consequences of Literacy"; Havelock *The Greek Concept of Justice and Origins of Western Literacy."


10. m. Peah 2:6; m. Eduyyot 8:7; m. Yadim 4:3.


13. See Towner, *The Rabbinic "Enumeration."*
HISTORICAL CONCLUSIONS


16. The exact text of the Mishna varies in the two Talmuds and in discussions within the Talmuds. The text of PA differs even more in Tractate Abot and the two versions of ARN.

CHAPTER TEN

4. See the previous chapter and Goldin, "Two Versions."
5. See the indices in Goldin, *ARNA* and Saldarini, *ARNB*.
7. Saldarini, *ARNB*, pp. 16-17. The passages are in chapters 27, 29, 43, 48.
10. Guttmann, "Tractate Abot."
11. See ch. 2 above and Saldarini, "The End of the Rabbinic Chain."
12. Neusner, *Pharisees*, I, 19 suggests that Johanan was added by his own disciples.