Cycles of Conquest
Spicer, Edward H.

Published by University of Arizona Press

Spicer, Edward H.

For additional information about this book
https://muse.jhu.edu/book/58697
CHAPTER SEVENTEEN

Religious Diversification

In 1600 the dream of a vast harvest of souls, to be ripened by Christian teaching, imbued the missionaries who contemplated the Indians of the New World. Here, they believed, simple savages, uncontaminated by the appeals of competing faiths like Islam and Buddhism, awaited enlightenment. The Franciscans and the Jesuits plunged boldly and with unbounded hopes into the desert reaches of northwestern New Spain carrying the cross and seeking the thousands to be saved. Nearly fifty Franciscans and half as many Jesuits met death at the hands of the Indians during the first hundred years, but scores more pressed on and carried the work of conversion, as far as Spanish soldiers would give them protection, into the wilderness. Perhaps two hundred thousand Indians north of Durango received baptism during the first great burst of effort—before the missionaries became entangled in the Spanish government's and their own worldly interests, and the will to convert died down along with the will to conquer.

Then for nearly one hundred years the Christian dream faded, and the Indians of the north were left largely alone to make what they could of the revelations which had been vouchsafed to them. But again after 1850, renewed in vigor under the aegis of a new military power, the Christian dream reasserted itself—this time in the minds of Baptists, Presbyterians, and Lutherans. Less well supported and far fewer in numbers, a handful of missionaries moved out among the Indians of what had been northern New Spain and began again, in somewhat different ways and language, to preach and to convert. Then, as the churches of the United States became aware of the large numbers of Indians classed as heathens, more missionaries became possessed by the four hundred year-old dream. Dutch Reformed, Episcopalians, the Franciscans again, the Mennonites, the Mormons, the Methodists, the Plymouth Brethren, the American Baptists, the Southern Baptists, the Seventh Day Adventists, the Church of the Nazarene, the Assembly of God, and the Free Methodists all took up the dream, while down in Mexico among the Tarahumaras the Jesuits, after 1900, went back to work. A considerable sample of all the variations on Christianity which now existed in America was brought to the Indians. After four hundred years the full impact of Christianity was being felt; nearly all the Indians were becoming aware of the new religions.
By 1960 they were aware of the new religions, but of different ones depending on which missionaries had happened to reach them. A considerable majority of all the Indians in the region spoke of themselves as Catholics — employing the Spanish word *católico* — the Eastern Pueblos, perhaps a majority of Tarahumaras, Yaquis, Mayos, Opatas, Lower Pimas, and many Papagos and Gila Pimas. In addition, most Yumas, some Navajos, some Apaches, and some Zunis spoke of themselves as Catholics. The next largest group calling themselves by the name of one of the Christian faiths were the Presbyterians — more than half the Gila Pimas, a fourth or more of the Papagos, many Navajos, some Apaches, Mohaves, Maricopas, and Hopis; the other sects had members in small numbers among most of the Southwestern reservation groups. Indeed the situation among the Indians paralleled that among the Mexicans and the Anglos. The Indians of the southwestern United States had church membership in about the same proportions and in nearly as many sect groups as did the population of the United States as a whole. In Mexico the Indians were nearly all, like the general Mexican population, professing Catholics. Over the four hundred years, the dream of Christian unity held by the pioneer Jesuits and Franciscans had not come true, but nevertheless extensive religious assimilation had taken place.

However, such a general statement of the results of contact ignores two facts which were important for understanding the religious life which had developed among the Indians. One was that the majority of those Indians calling themselves Catholic were not actually accepted as such by the Catholic Church. The Yaquis, the Mayos, the Tarahumaras, and the Eastern Pueblos were regarded by the Church as something less than Catholic. The fact was that they had developed variations of belief and practice which were not acceptable to the organized church. Both in regard to beliefs and practices which they preserved from their old religions and in regard to their failure to accept certain doctrine and practice which the Church regarded as essential, they deviated from Roman Catholic orthodoxy. Yet they persisted in regarding themselves as Catholic, even (in the case of the Yaquis) as better Catholics than neighboring Mexicans accepted in the Church; thus they must be considered as adherents of a variety of Christian sect which the early missionaries had unwittingly created.

Another significant fact about religious life in the Southwest was that some hundreds of Indians in every generation reacted negatively to the offerings of the missionaries and, although aware of the new sects, did not join them. Some of the Indians who thus rejected Christian ways merely maintained their old religions, in some ways slightly modified in adjustment to the life around them, but essentially preserving their own views of men and the universe. A majority of Hopis, possibly a majority of Navajos, Eastern Pueblos generally, some Papagos, and the Seris until the late 1950's did this. Other Indians who reacted negatively to the denominational offerings as presented invented new cults. Of these, the ones which did not die out showed Christian influence, usually, in belief and ritual, yet they duplicated none of the sects which missionaries advocated. These were new religions growing out of the complex influences which had impinged on the Indians, especially during the hundred years after the eclipse of Spain.
The dream of civilizing the Indians by bringing them to a unity of belief according to Roman Catholic tenets had not materialized. Instead they had been brought to a state of very considerable diversity, with a range of belief probably just a little wider than that which existed among their conquerors. A new common element had been introduced and there was a strong tendency for this common element to dominate the religious life of all, but nevertheless in the 1950's the range in religious belief was far greater than it had ever been in the region, before or after the entry of the white men. The way in which this heterogeneity grew may be traced readily through the four hundred years of contact.

THE DIFFUSION OF CATHOLICISM

The Catholic variety of Christianity was introduced to the Indians of the region through two distinct missionary campaigns separated by more than one hundred years. The first campaign accompanied the first military conquest and lasted, with waning intensity, from about 1600 to after 1750. The second followed some fifty years on the heels of the military conquest of the northern Indians and continued, with increasing intensity, from about 1900 on into the 1950's.

The first campaign took place under conditions very favorable for the spread of new ideas. The Spanish missionaries carried with them not only the new religious concepts, but also many other new ideas and materials the practical value of which was immediately obvious to the Indians. The new food plants and fruits, the domestic animals, the metal tools, the cloth which Spaniards introduced at the same time that they preached and taught were inseparably connected at first with the new ideas concerning supernatural power and the new rituals of baptism and worship. The prestige of each missionary could be high, as a kind of culture hero bringing all sorts of wonderful goods and promising innovations. It is true that at the same time missionaries brought to at least some Indians military and other forms of oppression which roused resistance, but nevertheless the Spanish power could also force acceptance of new ways which became habitual, especially for children growing up in the soldier-protected mission communities. Moreover, the Jesuit and Franciscan missionaries had a monopoly of the new religious ideas. For more than 150 years their work was not hampered by any of the Protestant forms of Christianity to distract and confuse the Indians. If there were some differences between the specific rituals and the doctrinal emphasis of the two Orders, nevertheless each Order had exclusive control of the different tribes and worked without competition in the areas to which the king assigned them. The effectiveness of individual missionaries varied according to the adaptability of each to the local conditions and according to the nature of the particular Indian leadership with which each worked, but the general conditions were far more favorable to the diffusion of Christian belief and behavior than those which prevailed during the second campaign of conversion.

Under these circumstances the Jesuits, and to a lesser extent the Franciscans, overexpanded in their zeal to make Catholics of the Indians. They overexpanded in the sense that they brought the tidings of Christianity to many Indians to whom
they were unable to bring also the mission communities. It was in the organized mission communities that the indoctrination became the basis of new behavior under the direct tutelage of the missionary. The Jesuits were unable to follow through in their campaign by bringing missions to all the Tarahumaras, all the Upper Pimas, the Seris, or any of the Yumans. They acquainted these people superficially with Catholicism, but the rigorous indoctrination and daily practice of Christian ritual, characteristic of the mission communities, was not brought, and consequently those Indians remained outside the sphere of intensive diffusion.

Similarly, the Franciscans remained unable to maintain missions, after initial efforts, among the Seris, Zunis, Hopis, Navajos, and Yumans, even though they continued during the last half of the 1700's to make brief contacts and to go on short proselytizing expeditions. The Orders had both expanded beyond the power of their organizations to supply the necessary missionaries and beyond the power of the Spanish government to protect the missionaries if they had been available. The Hopis, Navajos, and Yumans, along with the Apaches whom neither Order even attempted to convert, thus lacked any but the briefest experience of the mission system and quickly forgot what little they had heard from the missionaries. However, the Zunis and some Upper Pimas, having had somewhat more intensive mission experience, did retain elements of Catholicism from these early contacts.

It was the Eastern Pueblos, the Opatas, the Lower Pimas, the Mayos and Yaquis, and some of the Tarahumaras, all of whom experienced intensive mission contacts, to whom many elements of Catholicism diffused. All of them, however, were left for 150 years, more or less, with no missionaries or priests actively among them. In the south the Jesuit expulsion in 1767 left the Sonora and Chihuahua Indians without missions and only a scattering of not very vigorous secular priests. In the north the decline in Franciscan activity had set in even before 1767 and for the next 150 years steadily faded out.

The result was that all the most strongly Catholicized tribes went their own ways. The Mayos, Yaquis, Opatas, and Tarahumaras took over the management of their own church organizations, which the Jesuits had instituted. They became independent of priests and even antagonistic in some instances, although some priests who shared the Indians' antagonism to Spaniards and Mexicans were able now and then to work among them. The functions of the priests in saying the Mass, officiating at marriages, and even in baptism ceased to be regarded as essential. Forms of ceremony changed and developed over the 150 years without the guiding standard of the priests constantly in touch with Roman orthodoxy. The Indians continued to use the prayers and other rituals which had been written down in the native languages, but interpretation was in the hands of the Indian specialists who developed as the ceremonial leaders. The seeds of Catholic behavior which the missionaries had planted continued to grow, but in nearly complete isolation from the nurture of the official Roman Church. Similarly in the north, the Eastern Pueblos continued through the late 1700's and almost throughout the 1800's with only the most passing contacts with the secular Spanish and Mexican priests. At first after the 1680 revolt priests in New Mexico tended the churches, but they did not work very hard at the difficult task of influencing the Indians. They did not work at
all in the Indian languages and as their numbers decreased under the Mexican regime they paid less and less attention to the Indians. The Pueblo villagers, like the Indians of the south, proceeded to carry out without benefit of priests those Catholic rituals which they had thus far accepted, maintained the churches through their own village organizations, and bothered little about the unavailability of priests for those rituals which the missionaries had told them were essential in Catholic life.

The ultimate result of this experience of initial intensive indoctrination followed by loss of contact with Catholic Church officials for an equal length of time was the growth of religious behavior which Church officials did not recognize as Catholic. Three quite different types of religious life developed, which incorporated Catholic forms of beliefs and ritual with Indian forms. These distinctive modifications of Catholic elements in many ways paralleled the adjustment of native and Spanish forms in the political organization which grew up among the Indians following Spanish contacts. The Eastern Pueblos added some selected Catholic elements to their existing ceremonial system, while retaining the latter otherwise little changed. The Yaquis reworked the whole ceremonial system, integrating so many Catholic elements into it that a wholly new religion appeared to result. The Papagos accepted certain Catholic elements as alternative ways to their aboriginal religion, with a minimum of integration between the two. These three types of Catholic influence may be considered in some detail as representative, since the other tribes merely varied somewhat these basic types of adjustment.

The Keres, such as the Pueblos of Santa Ana, exemplify the process of additions from Catholicism in part integrated and in part kept separate from the Indian religion. They permitted the missionaries to build churches in their villages, appointed fiscales and sacristans to maintain the churches, and continued through three hundred years to hold various ceremonies in and around the churches. They accepted and continued to use images and pictures with which the missionaries furnished the churches. They permitted missionaries and then secular priests to hold Masses in the churches and accepted the rite of baptism. They included in their annual ceremonial calendar a Christmas ceremony depicting the birth of Jesus, observances at Holy Week consisting of prayers recited by the Indian sacristan and the shooting of guns, the offering of food to the ancestral dead on All Souls' Day, and the annual celebration of the Christian patron saint's day assigned to the village by the missionaries. All these elements of Catholicism were apparently incorporated into Keresan ceremonial life early in the period of Franciscan work in the villages and they have continued to the present. In addition, certain Catholic observances were adopted by many individuals, including saying standard Catholic prayers in Spanish, keeping sacred pictures or images in the house, and calling themselves "Catholics." To this extent they adopted the Catholic religious way, but did not consider themselves members of any religious organization outside the village (and hence not of the Roman Catholic Church), nor did the acceptance of these elements lead to any reorientation of their own religious life.

Rather, the elements adopted were modified in small ways to fit their existing ceremonial system, much as the governor system was taken over to serve the additional functions of relations with the Spaniards but modified to fit into the existing
RELIGIOUS DIVERSIFICATION

governmental system. Thus Holy Week and Christmas were observed regularly, but chiefly as occasions for prayers and not for the purpose of dramatizing the life of Jesus. Jesus was not in fact accepted as a central, or even important, figure in religious life, appearing merely as a companion of Santiago (St. James) in saint's day celebrations riding a wooden horse. All Souls' Day was accepted as an occasion for honoring ancestors with gifts, but not as a day to repair to the graveyard and offer prayers for or to the ancestors by way of securing happiness in heaven. The patron saint's day became an important fiesta day with a procession with the image of the saint in the Catholic manner and with dances by men representing Santiago and the Indian variant of Jesus; the saint's day, which in Catholic concept was of course a minor part of Catholic practice, became in fact the one of the accepted ceremonial occasions which most resembled Christian observance. Yet it too invariably consisted not only of a procession and the Santiago dance, but also dances in the Indian style by the ceremonial organizations of the Indians. In this way the borrowings were modified and accepted, but kept peripheral to the central core of Indian ceremonial life.

In the process the Indian religion acquired more occasions for ceremony and more supernaturals in its pantheon, but lost nothing for nothing was replaced, and its central values and orientations remained the same as before. Thus, in line with their conception of a number of deities, none of whom was supreme, the Pueblos despite specific missionary pressure never accepted the conception of the Christian God. To be sure, they began, under missionary influence, to speak of Dios, but Dios was merely another deity of minor importance whom the Pueblos most often called "the Mexican God" and who became the object of no ceremonial cult. The Pueblos maintained even less interest in the Virgin and in Jesus, some of the villages admitting them to their pantheons, but merely as minor figures like Santiago's companion and with no important functions. The whole story of Jesus remained a matter of indifference, winning no interest or sympathy from the Pueblos, perhaps because the idea of individual salvation in a tightly organized, priestly-managed collectivity like a Pueblo village could have no meaning. At any rate the missionaries seemed to find no way to make it meaningful, for down to the 1950's there developed no dramatization or symbolization of the life of Jesus or of the Passion, and Pueblos, as priests complained continually, did not take communion. Nor did the basic ideas of Heaven and Hell have any appeal; the Pueblos continued to believe in an afterlife as a sort of continuation of this life. Eternal punishment and purgatory remained unintelligible, and their governors consistently forbade all villagers, once Spanish power disintegrated, to carry out confession. The prohibition may have had something to do with the effort to maintain secrecy concerning the ceremonial which the missionaries had attacked, but whatever its cause it would seem to be rooted also in an inability to understand sin and its official absolution. It is apparent from this list of rejections that the fundamental ideas of Catholicism were resisted by the Pueblos, despite the existence of a church and a saint's day celebration in every village and the belief on the peoples' part that they were "Catholics." The details of ritual which they had accepted and incorporated into their own system embellished the latter, but did not at all bespeak
a transition from a religion focused on natural growth and fertility to one preoccupied with sin and individual salvation.

The Eastern Pueblos can hardly be said to have been much influenced by Catholicism. And yet for over three hundred years they maintained churches in their villages and listened to and were baptized by official representatives of the Catholic Church. In assimilating the offerings of the latter to their own religion and continuing to accept, and pay for, their services, the Pueblos maintained a sort of compartmentalization of religions. Keeping their own organization and viewpoint quite separate from that of the Catholic Church, they nevertheless accepted and sharply defined functions of the latter in their lives. They integrated fragments of Catholicism, but not the system, and hence it is no cause for wonder that the Catholic Church regarded no Pueblo village as a Catholic community.

The Yaquis, on the other hand, were profoundly influenced in their religious life by Catholicism. Unlike the Pueblos, they did integrate the Catholic system with the religion which the missionaries found them practicing, and in the course of doing so achieved a new product, far more like that of the missionaries than was the Pueblos', but still different enough to be unacceptable to the Catholic Church. As in the case of the governmental system, there is very little reliable information about the religion of the Yaquis at the time they accepted Fathers Andrés Pérez de Ribas and Tomás Basilio. It is therefore not possible to say precisely and in detail what happened in the way of transformation during the time that the Jesuits worked peacefully in the newly established eight towns. It is nevertheless possible to gain some understanding of the transformation that took place by considering the nature of Yaqui religion as it was practiced as late as the 1950's.

In those that remained of the eight towns along the Yaqui River and in some eight smaller settlements of emigrants from the Yaqui country on the outskirts of cities in Sonora and Arizona, churches were maintained around which centered an organized religious congregation. However, the churches were by no means standard-pattern Catholic churches, nor did priests of the Catholic Church regularly attend any of the congregations. The churches in the Yaqui River towns were either rough cane shelters or ruined brick buildings, largely unrepaired for thirty years; those in the settlements elsewhere were improvised shelters often much like the houses lived in by the emigrant Yaqui population. The religious life which centered at these nondescript buildings was, however, highly organized; ceremonies were frequent; and the interest of the people was vigorous, even intense. The whole of ceremony was conducted by Yaquis, never by priests of the Catholic Church. It was in the hands of men called maestros who possessed little notebooks in which were written out, sometimes in Spanish and sometimes in Yaqui, large amounts of Catholic ritual material. Thus many hymns, or alabanzas, standard prayers such as the Our Father, Hail Mary, and the Credo, the Mass for the Dead, and the ritual of the Stations of the Cross appeared in the notebooks; the prayers were usually in Yaqui, the hymns in both Yaqui and Spanish, the ritual of the Stations in Spanish, and the Mass for the dead in a combination of Yaqui and Latin. With these notebooks, often aided by one of the Mexican books of common prayer and a Missal, maestros and their assistants conducted a regular round of ceremony according
to the Roman Catholic ceremonial calendar—Lent and Holy Week, the Day of the Finding of the Holy Cross, All Saints’ and All Souls’, the Day of the Virgin of Guadalupe, Christmas, and the Day of the Kings. In between there were regular Sunday services and observances of some saints’ days, Corpus Christi, and the Holy Trinity. The maestros, none of whom had any training other than the apprenticeship of learning from another maestro, often read Mass. In this way a kind of framework of Catholic ceremonial was maintained in the Yaqui settlements.

It was carried out by a rather elaborate organization. The maestros had assistants, men who acted as sacristans and were called by the name which the Jesuits had used for the catechists whom they trained—temastim; women who accompanied the maestros as singers and were called by a term—koparia—which the Yaquis had adapted from the Spanish cofradía; and girls called alpesim (Spanish, alferez, flagbearer) who worked with other women in tending the church images. Each of these was an organized group, or society, dedicated to church service through a lifelong vow. Similarly organized were men’s societies: an organization of dancers called matachinis dedicated to the Virgin, and two organizations collectively called the Customs Chieftainship devoted to the enactment of the Passion of Christ during Lent and Holy Week. These societies worked as cooperating units to carry out the annual round of ceremonies, each village being organized separately from every other and each entirely independent of the Catholic Church priesthood. Yet in each community, whether in Arizona or on the Yaqui River in Sonora, the religious life differed only in details and rested on the same foundation of beliefs.

Superficially, Yaqui belief appeared to be Catholic. At least nearly the whole range of terms employed in orthodox Catholicism, as well as the occasions for ceremony, were used by Yaquis. Baptism was regarded as essential for every individual; God, Jesus, and the Virgin were not only recognized and called by the Spanish terms but also were important and the objects of special devotion; Heaven was spoken of, as were grace and penance; a large number of saints were known and honored; a sharp distinction was maintained between baptized and unbaptized persons; the cross was an all-important symbol. Yet the system of beliefs, as the Catholic Church recognized, was something distinctly Yaqui. The Catholic ideas and symbols had been modified and knitted into a view of life and its meaning which was peculiar to the Yaquis.

There were essentially three cults, although all three were closely integrated through the ritual singing and praying of the maestros who took part in all three. Probably of primary importance was a cult of Jesus, who was identified in Yaqui thought as God. Maestros were regarded as representing Jesus and were sometimes spoken of as Savior Maestros. The Customs Chieftainships, two men’s organizations, were dedicated to Jesus and took over all civil and ceremonial functions in a community during the weeks of Lent and Easter each year. They undertook annually to make real to the people the last days of Jesus by the dramatization of his persecution and crucifixion. Members of one of the organizations donned masks representing Judas and Jews and enacted a search for Jesus, the capture of him and Mary, his crucifixion, and finally after losing Jesus as a result of his Resurrection, a military attack on the church. Defeated in the attack on Holy Saturday by the
power of little children dressed as angels, the evil Judases were ritually destroyed, through the burning of their masks, and the community delivered from their evil power. This period of enactment of the Passion with the personification of evil by the men’s organizations and the addition of a ritual battle between good and evil forces was the climax of ceremonial life each year in a Yaqui community. During the ascendancy of the Customs Chieftainship taboos on work and sexual intercourse were strictly maintained and the men’s organizations acting as police forced all people to attend all the observances.

Opposed ritually to the cult of Jesus but linked through many religious meanings was one of the Virgin. A men’s society also supported this cult with members dedicated to serving the Virgin Mary. These men were dancers called Matachinis. They owned an image of their own of the Virgin, and the mythology described how these dancers were created as soldiers by the Virgin in order to spread good influences through dancing in her honor. Headresses of the dancers were called “flowers” and as such were symbols of all good power. The dancing of the Matachinis with their flower headdresses supported the child angels who opposed the evil Judases on Holy Saturday and ultimately, together, the angels and the Matachinis destroyed the Judases. After Holy Week the Judases disappeared from community life entirely until the following Lent, and ceremonial life was dominated by the good Matachinis and the cult of the Virgin. The dance of the Matachinis was introduced by the Jesuit missionaries originally as a dramatization of the triumph of the Christians over the Aztec ruler Montezuma through Malinche, the first Christian convert in Mexico. The whole of that meaning, however, had disappeared from Yaqui belief. Although the name Malinche was still used for certain of the dancers, Montezuma had been entirely lost, and the Matachinis and Malinches were known only as the good soldiers of the Virgin.

The third cult was a cult of the dead. This received its major expression through ceremonies carried out on the days of All Saints and All Souls. At this time, the spirits of all the dead ancestors, who were believed to be present in the community during the month of October, took their leave of their families and as they left, maestros prayed with them and families put out food and drink on tables in their yards. Every family kept a small book in which the names of dead family members were written. These were placed on family altars during All Saints’ and All Souls’ days and the prayers were regarded as making the dead happy. The books of the dead were also brought to most ceremonies during the year, because it was believed that the spirits would appreciate the prayers and singing of the maestros and the women singers. In addition, once a month families made an effort to go to the graveyard surrounding the church to burn candles and make offerings of flowers, food, or drink to the dead buried there. The Mass for the Dead, from Catholic ritual, was a frequent part of the ritual of most important ceremonies and was recited from notebooks by the maestros.

As has been indicated, these three cults were woven together into a single ceremonial system. As the foci of Yaqui religious life, they rested on very definite beliefs. Jesus, sometimes identified with God, was the creator of all things including himself. He had lived in the Yaqui country and had been known there as a great
curer. He had been pursued throughout the Yaqui country by the Jews and Judas and, after performing many great deeds of curing during his persecution, was ultimately captured and crucified. But he rose again and instructed people how to honor him. His mother, who was not only the mother of Jesus but of all Yaquis, had the power of transforming herself. She thus made herself into the cross, so that Jesus was crucified in her arms, after she had failed in trying to protect him by the creation of the Matachini good soldiers. Actually, as mother of all, the Virgin was the earth itself as well as the church and the ground around the church where all Yaquis were buried. As the earth she produced the flowers which were the source of good and through whose power the persecutors of Jesus were annually destroyed. The dead continued to live in the Yaqui country and to return to the community annually. They lived neither in a heaven nor a hell, but in a place of flowers, that is, divine grace. They continued to be very much aware of what was going on and were aided in this by having their books, in which their names were inscribed, brought by the living to all ceremonial altars. They were helpful, not dangerous, and living people were obligated to please them, chiefly by maintaining the ceremonies in honor of Jesus and the Virgin.

There was a somewhat lesser cult of the Virgin of Guadalupe, who was patroness of the military society, and whose images were carried in a weekly Sunday ceremony which symbolized the marking of the sacred boundary line of the Yaqui territory. A whole set of myths, with many Biblical references, had grown up around the idea of the sacredness of the Yaqui land and the sacred locations of the eight towns. No cult of the saints had grown up among the Yaquis, although simple observances were carried out for many saints' days and every Yaqui community had a patron saint with a very elaborate secular celebration annually, an important feature of which was an enactment of the war between the Moors and the Christians of which the Jesuits had taught the Yaquis a dramatization. Closely linked also with the three major cults were non-calendrical ceremonies, or fiestas, as they were called, which took place at private houses rather than the church.

These fiestas were occasioned by deaths, by weddings, and by promises by families to honor Jesus or the Virgin for help they had given in curing or in some enterprise. At such fiestas the church organization, maestros and, depending on the ceremonial season, different men's organizations took part at a specially constructed altar. Alongside the altar was set up a temporary shelter at which dancers, who were not part of the church organization, acted as ceremonial hosts. These were the pascola dancers, "old men of the fiesta," as Yaquis called them. They wore bearded wooden masks in part of their dancing, told funny stories, gave out cigarettes and food and drink. They represented a survival of aboriginal ritual performers who had derived supernatural power from animals, but they remained a very vigorous part of Yaqui ceremonial life, and kept alive a great deal of the old mythology and point of view toward the universe. Yet they were tied in closely and in a variety of ways with the Christianized belief and ceremony. Mythologically they were held to have been derived from the Devil, but they were required to carve crosses on their masks, and to preface their sometimes sexually very expressive dances and ribald jokes by crossing themselves before the church.
altar. They also were required to ask God's pardon for their disrespectfulness and to offer up a Christian prayer before and after the ceremony. Under their auspices a dancer representing a deer, probably aboriginally connected with hunting magic, performed an active dance and enacted with the pascolas' help hunting scenes and funny skits. The songs to which the deer dancer danced dealt with flowers and a supernatural world of power connected with the flowers. Christian symbolism, except for the requirement of crossing himself before dancing, did not figure in the deer dancer's behavior.

It was thus apparent that Yaqui religious life constituted an intricate integration of the aboriginal beliefs and rituals with what had been learned from the Jesuits. This would be even more apparent in any detailed account of any one ceremonial occasion. The sketch presented here merely suggests the way in which the two traditions had been fused. It should be clear that many essential features of orthodox Catholicism were not present. God, a Supreme power, was not clearly recognized, although certainly such a concept was approached in the Yaqui view of Jesus. Rather there were two major deities—the male Jesus who was creator and the female Mary, Our Mother in Yaqui, who was also a creator in a more passive way. Hell was hardly recognized at all, except as a name; Heaven was identified with an afterlife to which all persons went where flowers and Our Mother's presence made things pleasant. Punishment in the afterlife was not conceived as a reality and prayer for the dead was not to improve their position in a hierarchy of levels but to add to their happiness in the place where they were. In such a view of the afterlife individual salvation could not have the orthodox Christian meaning; rather application to the prescribed forms of worship—prayer, dancing, dramatic representation, participation in the varied work of the ceremonial societies—was regarded as a return to the ruling supernaturals for their help in keeping one well through the years and keeping away evils. Religious life was essentially vigorous participation in a network of exacting relationships with Jesus and the Virgin and perhaps a few other supernaturals. "Fulfillment," which Yaquis habitually used in their religion, meant carrying out obligations to the deities with the result that both individual and deity felt well-being and remained well disposed toward one another.

This type of religious feeling led to no emphasis on sin as something which could be atoned for by any individual activities such as confession or even individual saying of prayers. Yaqui religion was primarily a group expression with emphasis on performance of roles in the established expressive ceremony. Confession was ignored. Yet penance was performed by assuming duties in the annual ceremonies, in the men's or women's societies. The ceremonies were the focus of interest and these were regarded as being quite independent of any priestly knowledge or authority. Hence the Catholic priesthood had no place in Yaqui religion, except as specialists who knew how to perform baptism. Since baptism was regarded as essential, priests were sought for this rite, but for many generations in Sonora priests were not available and hence came to be regarded as not necessarily essential even for baptism.

The Papago acceptance of Catholicism had something in common with that of the Yaquis, but differed in a few essentials. In the first place, it consisted of an
adaptation made during a period when no representatives of the Catholic Church were present among Papagos and hence showed features of independence similar to those of the Yaquis. But there was far less in the way of involved integration of old and new. The Papago adaptation of Catholicism consisted almost entirely of the adoption of the cult of one saint — Saint Francis Xavier, the Jesuit founder. This cult possibly grew up quite late, even as late as the last quarter of the 1800's. Nevertheless it undoubtedly had its roots in the earlier activities of Father Kino in the Upper Pima area. By 1900 many Papago villages, which at that time had no resident missionaries or priests, had small wattle-and-daub chapels surmounted by crosses in which a weekly worship of Saint Francis was carried on. The chapels usually contained several pictures, rather than images, of St. Francis and perhaps other Christian pictures. The worship was managed usually by a particular family who owned the major picture of the saint. The women of this family with the help of others conducted services consisting of the recitation of standard Catholic prayers, in Spanish, and the singing of hymns also in Spanish in praise of the saint. Villages having such small chapels were scattered throughout the Papago country, although not all villages had them. The chapels were not visited or recognized by priests, and hence the cult was wholly in the hands of the Papagos.

Another feature of the cult was an annual pilgrimage to Magdalena, a town in Sonora, where Father Kino had died and where his remains were buried. The Saint Francis of the cult was identified by some Papagos as Father Kino. The day on which Papagos made their pilgrimage to Magdalena was October 4, the day of Saint Francis of Assisi, founder of the Franciscan Order, not December 7, the day of Saint Francis Xavier. However, the Papagos seemed unaware of Saint Francis of Assisi and considered themselves to be honoring St. Francis Xavier or Father Kino. Hundreds of Papagos made the annual pilgrimage, as did also some Yaquis and other Indians of the region. Whether it began in Kino's day is not known. The fame of the reclining image of Saint Francis in Kino's Magdalena church was very great. Every year pilgrims in large numbers passed by the image seeking to gain some of its magical power. It was from Magdalena that many of the furnishings in the Papago chapels came.

In villages where the chapels existed, not necessarily all the inhabitants participated in the weekly or other gatherings. Some remained aloof and a name grew up for those who frequented the chapels, namely "santos." Some Whites spoke of the cult as the "Sonoran Catholic" since its source seemed to be in Sonora and since it resembled other Catholic-inspired independent developments like the Yaqui religion. Most of the people in the southernmost Papago villages practiced the cult with greater or less intensity and in conjunction with it made a great deal of use of rosary services for sick persons, as a means of curing and also as a means of preparing them for the afterlife. However, the participation of an individual or family in the cult did not carry with it lack of interest in the activities of the native religion, nor were devotees of Saint Francis excluded from the latter. On the contrary, in every village where a chapel to Saint Francis existed, there existed also ordinarily a village council house where saguaro wine for the annual rain-making ceremony was prepared. Often the family which led the Saint Francis ceremonies also played a
prominent role in aboriginal ceremonies. Thus, the saint’s cult was a simple addition to the ceremonial life of the village which replaced nothing else in the way of ceremony. Added to the means of curing — a focus of Papago ritual interest which had always existed was another — Saint Francis and objects connected with him.

There was here no compartmentalization of two religious systems as among the Eastern Pueblos, for the Papagos did not receive regular visits of priests and they built their own chapels on their own initiative. Moreover, baptism was not a necessary part of the cult and so it required no attention from the Catholic priesthood. The cult of the saint had diffused to the Papagos without the intermediary of a planned program of introduction. On the other hand, the Papago situation did not resemble very closely that of the Yaqui. Where the Yaqui acceptance of Catholicism involved many elements and a complex combination of these with aboriginal features, the Papagos selected one element — a powerful saint — and took him pretty much as he was without elaboration: representation, attributed power, and hymns. Once taken, his cult remained formally separate from other aspects of religious life. He was indeed interpreted as a source of supernatural power similar to existing Papago mythological figures and so was conceptually integrated with the persisting aboriginal religion. But the ritual associated with him remained distinct from other ritual, employing candles, rosaries, and hymns in Spanish, where the other made use of painted sticks, feathers, and Papago songs.

In Pueblo, Yaqui, and Papago religion we thus see three different results in the diffusion of Catholicism following the first Jesuit-Franciscan campaign of introduction — compartmentalization, fusion, and simple addition.

The other tribes of Sonora, with the exception of the Seris whose contact with Catholicism was most tenuous, accepted Catholicism pretty much as had the Yaquis. The Mayo and Opata reaction was almost identical, but the Opatas’ aboriginal beliefs and practices were much more deeply submerged than were the Yaquis’. The Lower Pimas and the Upper Pimas of Sonora may have experienced a fairly complete replacement of aboriginal religion, but we know too little to say. The religious life of the Tarahumaras was chiefly, even among those who before 1900 spoke of themselves as Catholics, still in the aboriginal pattern with little admixture of Christianity. Nevertheless elements of Catholicism had been adopted and were in process of being integrated with the aboriginal religion in much the manner of the Yaquis and Mayos. Those Tarahumaras who called themselves Christian, or Catholic, maintained churches as ceremonial and civic centers and most of these were visited about once a year by priests. At these churches part of the Catholic ceremonial calendar was observed — Sunday services, Holy Week, the Day of Guadalupe, Christmas, and Day of the Kings, with occasionally other saints’ days. The observances, like those of the Yaquis, were carried out entirely without the assistance of a priest. Maestros who knew Catholic prayers in Spanish and some hymns directed the ceremonies. The ceremonies consisted of feasts and simple rituals similar to those of the native curing ceremonies, but they had additional features which were Catholic-derived. Thus the maestros sang and offered prayers and at each ceremony instructed the people in crossing themselves and saying the Our Father. In addition, on the Day of Guadalupe, Christmas and Day of the
Kings, an organization of men called matachines danced under the direction of another men's organization called the chapeones; and during Holy Week other groups of men called Judases and Pharisees danced. Their performances were pure dances, rather than dramatizations, and thus differed from the Judases of the Yaquis but resembled the Yaqui Matachinis. These dance groups, under the general direction of the maestros, performed dances in a sacred context of worship of church images, but apparently had no Christian meanings that were generally understood by the Tarahumaras practicing them. The Judases burned effigies of Judas on Holy Saturday, but enacted no part of the Passion. Like the Yaquis the Tarahumaras spoke of God, identified with Jesus, and the Virgin as important male and female deities but possessed no clear beliefs concerning them in the Christian pattern. They had adopted the sign of the cross and employed three crosses in numerous otherwise aboriginal ceremonies. Thus among them, the aboriginal religious system was dominant and fusion with Catholic elements was still limited.

The second Catholic campaign of conversion brought missionaries again into close and continuous relationships with some of the Indians of the region. Jesuit missions, schools, and hospitals were established among the Tarahumaras in 1903. Steadily the program expanded and orthodox Catholic behavior slowly diffused in the vicinity of the new Jesuit centers. By 1960 however the great majority of Tarahumaras were still outside this influence, being visited only annually by the priests. This process of fusion of the church-centered ceremonies proceeded.

Franciscan missionaries went to work about 1910 among the Papagos and Gila Pimas, for the first time giving the latter Catholic missions and expanding throughout the desert area of the Papagos where the Kino mission chain had never reached. Here, too, orthodox Catholic behavior slowly diffused, in some cases absorbing the Saint Francis cult of the Papagos, and in some cases creating sharp divisions in Papago or Pima villages, where Presbyterian influence had preceded the Franciscans. Similarly, Franciscans added to the sectarian heterogeneity already existing among the Apaches, Navajos, Zunis, and a few Eastern Pueblos such as the Lagunas.

The hope of the early missionaries had not been realized three centuries after the beginning. Even among those Indians where missionaries had had the best conditions for work and had been able to carry out their program intensively, there was not a quick response resulting in complete acceptance and understanding of the Catholic ideas. The Pueblos remained devoted to their native religion and found ways to limit the influence of Catholic teaching. The Yaquis, Mayos, and Opatas were certainly profoundly influenced, but the new system of beliefs was clearly not that which the missionaries themselves had held, and the Tarahumaras were even further away from the doctrines and practices which had been offered. It could definitely be said that the missionaries had been forced to stop their work at the very height of its intensity in the case of the Jesuits and that the Franciscans had had to work in New Mexico against heavy odds during the 1700's. In this sense there were obvious reasons for the failure of the dream. The conflicts in Spanish culture had interfered and had left the Indians without effective guides and teachers of the Culture of the Conquest.
It seems nevertheless relevant to ask: How long under the very favorable conditions of the early Jesuit missions would it have taken to transfer a new religion? If 150 years, five generations was not sufficient, what time period would be? And further, what evidence is there from the record in Chihuahua, Sonora, and New Mexico that a religion could be transferred and replace another at all? What were the conditions which gave rise to a solid resistance like that of the Eastern Pueblos and to the creation of a new integrated system like that of the Yaquis? Were these results caused by the working methods of the missionaries? Were they a product of the incompatibility of the religion offered with the economic and social life which the Indians continued to lead?

These questions might have been answered after the new campaign of Catholic conversion had proceeded for another hundred years, but already the conditions had completely changed. The Catholic missionaries were now working as one among many sects competing for influence among the Indians with spiritual offerings and material gifts. Equivalents of the early gifts of tools, clothing, and seeds were being offered by the Indian Bureau in the United States and by the National Indian Institute in Chihuahua, as well as by various churches. The isolated communities of the old missions with contacts with the outside world so often controlled by a single, devoted missionary could not be reproduced. If the new missionaries among the Catholics were dreaming the same dream which their predecessors had, the reading of history might be frustrating. Their predecessors created several new religious ways rather than a single one, and the new missionaries were themselves working in the midst of what the early missionaries would surely have regarded as a more difficult situation than simply savagery.

THE MANY VOICES OF PROTESTANTISM

The taking over of political control of New Mexico Territory by the Anglo-Americans brought no immediate intensification of pressures on the Indians to change their religious life. The United States Indian Bureau did not develop, until President Grant's administration in the early 1870's, any systematic program of this sort. Consequently, during the 1850's, when Anglo-American contacts with the Indians first began to occur with some intensity, it was trappers, soldiers, mining men, a few civil administrators, and settlers who gave Indians their first acquaintance with Anglo-American ways. This was, of course, a great contrast with the earliest Spanish contacts, in connection with all of which the Indians were confronted with men who immediately advanced new religious beliefs and tried immediately to persuade the Indians of their importance.

In the 1860's one tribe of Indians, the Hopis, became aware of the religious interests of some Anglo-Americans. The Mormons, through Jacob Hamblin, made a great effort to convert the Hopis to Mormonism. It was part of Mormon belief that all American Indians were descendants of the Lamanites, one of the lost tribes of Israel. In accordance with this belief they held that Indians had once practiced the Hebrew religion, but had degenerated since arrival on the American continents,
producing nevertheless the prophetic book of Mormon which had been found by Joseph Smith, the founder of the Mormon religion.

It was therefore a duty of Mormons to convert Indians and bring them back to the right path. Moreover, the early Mormon settlers in Utah conceived of a new Mormon state in the west and, in the face of tendencies toward persecution by other Anglo-Americans, they wished to bring Indian tribes to their point of view and ally themselves with the Indians. It was with such aims that Jacob Hamblin tried to convert the Hopis and to persuade their leading men to go to Utah and learn the new revelations. Although Hamblin worked periodically for six years among the Hopis and gained their friendship, he made no converts and finally gave up the task. The Mormon efforts made no more lasting impression on the Hopis than had the efforts of the Franciscans.

In 1869, with President Grant's appointment of a Board of Commissioners to advise the Indian Bureau, it became the policy of the Bureau to give funds to various religious denominations for the establishment of schools on Indian reservations. The plan included giving sole jurisdiction to one denomination on each reservation, or at each agency. Prominent in the New Mexico-Arizona region were the Presbyterian and the Christian Reformed (a Lutheran denomination) churches. The Christian Reformed Church took over education and mission work among such groups as the Apaches, Navajos, Gila Pimas, and later the Zunis. This church, however, relinquished jurisdiction over the Gila Pimas by 1880 and the Presbyterians took over. Thus the first Protestant denominations in the field were the Christian Reformed and the Presbyterian churches, with the Presbyterians early becoming the sole missionary group among the Gila Pimas, sharing the Papago field with the Catholics who were established at San Xavier, and beginning work among the Mohaves and at Laguna among the Pueblos. In the 1890's, however, the Indian Bureau changed its policy. Instead of giving funds to the churches to manage schools on the reservations, the Bureau itself assumed responsibility for schools. In doing so, it did not eliminate schools already established by various church groups which were able to continue their own support of the schools. Such schools as the Presbyterian ones among the Gila Pimas and at Tucson for Papagos and the Evangelical Lutheran schools among the various Western Apache groups and continued in operation, competing for students with the Indian Bureau schools which slowly increased in numbers. The policy of giving favored position on a reservation to any one denomination was, however, abandoned. Any church which wished to set up a mission or a school on a reservation was permitted to do so by the Indian Bureau.

The result was that during the 1890's more churches entered the mission field and shortly after 1900 there began a steady increase in the number of denominations maintaining missionaries, schools, or other services on the reservations. In the 1890's the Mennonites began intensive work among the Hopis, the Episcopalians among the Havasupais and somewhat later among the Navajos. The American Baptists began to work among the Hopis, the Methodists among the Yumas and Navajos, the Plymouth Brethren among the Walapais, Eastern Pueblos, and Navajos. At the same time the Franciscans again entered the field among the Navajos, Apaches, Gila Pimas, and Papagos. There were by 1915 eight different Christian
denominations conducting schools and missionary work on the reservations of New Mexico and Arizona. None any longer had a monopoly on the religious conversion of any tribe, except for the Episcopalians who were the only church working among the small, concentrated community of the Havasupais. The Mormon missionary work among the Indians was discontinued as a result of the concentration of the Mormons on a colonization program rather than any direct missionary activity.

In general, the Protestant denominations followed a similar plan in their efforts to convert the Indians. They usually established schools as a beginning and, like the Jesuits and Franciscans before them, offered whatever services they found were needed — medical and nursing help, acting as go-betweens with other Anglo-Americans, and charity for the poorest Indians. Some maintained boarding and some day schools, in all of which the effort was made not only to give elementary secular instruction but also instruction in the doctrines of the sect. Converts were recruited primarily from among their students and members of their families. The use of the native language varied greatly, but only the Evangelical Lutherans (other than the Franciscans) made much effort to translate prayers and hymns into Indian languages and to train their ministers to preach in the Indian languages. In general, although no missionary was in a position, as had been the Jesuits and early Franciscans, to suppress effectively Indian ceremonials and religious practices, vigorous condemnation of the surviving native religion was the rule. Missionaries generally refused on principle to attend any Indian ceremonials, consistently taught in the schools that they were evil, and preached regularly against those practices of which they were aware. All the missionaries also introduced taboos on certain behavior such as smoking, drinking liquor, playing cards, and dancing in couples, thereby acquainting the Indians with a different standard of behavior from that which they were aware of among soldiers, miners, ranchers, and most of the settlers with whom they were coming into contact. The sects differed somewhat among themselves on doctrine and ritual, but a common complex of behavior and belief ran through them all. Such elements as the requirement of baptism, Sunday services, exclusive sect membership, absence of concrete representation of God, Jesus, or other figures in the churches, group hymn singing, sacredness of the Bible, and annual revival meetings made it clear that these were all the same general kind of religious way and that they as a group differed from the Catholic way.

The impact of the Protestant missionary program, as it developed during the years from about 1870 to about 1920, was pronounced on a majority of the tribes; it was a major influence on all the reservations and must be considered as one of the most important factors in shaping Indian life. It did not have the same sort nor the same degree of impact on all the reservations, but everywhere it was significant. Three types of influence were important; in confining ourselves to a consideration of those we may see in what ways Protestantism constituted an aspect of the "program of civilization" which the Indian Bureau administrators conceived themselves as bringing to the Indians. These three types of impact were the following: (1) the regeneration of community life disorganized by the reservation system, (2) the stimulation of political factionalism and community disorganization, and (3) the growth of new Christian sectarianism.
There is a certain rough similarity between what happened to the Yaquis as a result of Jesuit contacts and what happened to the Gila Pimas as a result of Presbyterian contacts. The Gila Pimas constituted the clearest example of a tribe regenerated up to a point through Protestant influence. By the 1880's they had lost much of their irrigation water to white settlers on the Gila River upstream from their reservation. From farmers with an abundant surplus selling wheat and other agricultural products to starving Anglo emigrant trains in the 1850's and 1860's, the Gila Pimas on the reservation had become twenty-five years later barely subsisting, poverty-stricken people. In the 1850's they had been spoken of as the "most civilized Indians" in the United States, not only because they were well off for food and land but also because they lived in peaceful, well-organized villages with strong and wise leadership, tribally expressed in the person of Antonio Azul. But by the 1880's the villages had become largely demoralized. The reservation system had been put into operation among them, a superintendent and his aides had unwittingly undermined many of the functions of the village headmen, drunkenness had vastly increased, and an attitude of dependency on the "government" had begun to take root. Into this situation of general community disorganization had come in 1870 a man named C. H. Cook. At the request of the tribal headman, Antonio Azul, he had started a school which had by 1878 become very well known to Pimas and Papagos alike, with a fairly regular enrollment of forty students. Cook's ambition was to convert all Pimas to Presbyterianism. This he was able to begin in 1880 when the Christian Reformed Church gave up its right to missionize them.

Cook, with his already long experience among the Pimas, went to work as a full-time missionary. He worked slowly and probably therefore all the more solidly. His period of most intensive building of congregations took place nearly twenty years after his first arrival among the Pimas. This was in the ten years from 1889 to 1899 when he baptized eighteen hundred Pimas. By 1911 when he relinquished his missionary post to another he had organized two-thirds of all the Pimas into active church congregations. He not only taught doctrine, conferred English names at baptism, persuaded people to cut their hair short and give up other minor customs which were different from Anglo-Americans, he also successfully altered the whole social organization. He gave the village headmen, who had been declining into listlessness as the Indian Bureau personnel took over many of their functions, a new lease on life. He instituted a system of church organization in the villages, appointing such leaders as elders of the churches. Each church had its board of elders who not only managed specific church affairs but also constituted a village council. The head elder was encouraged to preach good moral behavior to the congregation and thus the old moral exhortation function of the village headman was revitalized. The head elder and his assistants acting as a board or council sat on cases of misbehavior, meted out advice, and when they thought necessary, punishment, such as suspension from church activities. Although the Pimas did not accept the Presbyterian doctrine in regard to the nature of Hell and Heaven, they did rapidly reorganize their villages around the institution of the church. The social control applied through the old daily evening meetings now was exercised through the weekly Sunday meetings and the actions of the boards of elders. The elders through
their training in English and Anglo ways in the Presbyterian school became increas­ingly able to deal with Indian Bureau personnel and other Anglos as representatives of their villages. Missionary Cook took an interest in practical problems such as the loss of water for irrigation and encouraged his church leaders to think about and seek action for betterment. The total effect of Cook's activities, which emphasized so strongly the development of leadership through their own organizations, was a strong movement toward cultural assimilation of the Pimas and the regeneration of a dying community organization. In 1906 he introduced annual revival meetings which brought the people of all the villages together once a year and gave impetus on the tribal level to religious feeling and to the whole church organization.

Considered from the tribal point of view, there is no other example of constructive transformation through Protestant mission work remotely comparable to that of the Pimas. Some Papago villages, through Presbyterian influence, developed vigorous leadership. In the southeastern part of the Navajo Reservation, where Presbyterians founded a mission in 1903, there was a similar stimulation of leadership sometimes able to deal with the outside world. And on many reservations the Christian Reformed, Episcopal, and other churches strongly influenced individuals who became constructive leaders in community or even tribal affairs. But in other situations the unity of church influence, as it had developed among the Pimas, was interfered with by the existence of competing sects, the organized vigor of native religion, or other factors.

Elsewhere almost uniformly, the Havasupais being the only clear exception, Protestant missions stimulated factionalism which split families and communities. Such factionalism was not necessarily permanently destructive of community life; on the contrary it appears in several instances to have been a stage in the growth of communities which, through resolution of the conflict, reached a more stable equilibrium in the heterogeneous society of which they had become a part.

One of the earliest of these factional splits came about through the settlement of an Anglo man named Marmon at Laguna village in 1871. He married a Laguna woman and set about with her converting other Lagunas to Presbyterianism. He was successful with a majority of the families in the space of ten years and, when he was elected governor of Laguna, proceeded to tear down, with the approval of the converted Lagunans, two kivas. This precipitated a conflict over the ownership of ceremonial objects and ultimately resulted in one-fourth of the population leaving the village permanently. Those who left were not the Presbyterian converts, but those who were opposed to the new sect and devoted to the old religion. Making up a group of about one hundred they left Laguna and were given land for permanent settlement at Isleta on the Rio Grande. They took with them the disputed sacred objects and resumed their ceremonies at the settlement at Oraibi on the outskirts of Isleta. The remaining Lagunans continued in a state of schism, between the Presbyterians and the Catholic-native religionists, but were able to reconcile differences sufficiently, with the removal of the most conservative, to maintain a village organization. The ultimate result of the split was the breakdown of the control of the village organization by the cacique, or village ceremonial leader, and the growth of a more purely secular village government.
A factional split with equally serious consequences developed in the Hopi village of Oraibi as a result of missionary work of the Mennonites which began in 1893. The Mennonites were a European sect which opposed war and participation in civil government, maintained no priesthood, and regarded baptism and the celebration of the Lord's Supper as fundamental rites. A missionary established himself near Oraibi in 1893 and began to preach and offer instruction to children. He gained influence with a number of families and was not opposed until after 1906 by the village chief, Tewakwaptewa. The latter, then, after having turned anti-Christian as a result of his forced stay in an Indian Bureau boarding school, discouraged further activity by the Mennonite missionary. Those families who had been influenced moved out of Old Oraibi below the mesa where the mission was established and set up a new settlement where they then centered their lives around the Mennonite church. They still held their land, however, by virtue of assignment from the Old Oraibi village chief and this led to conflict. Some families attempted to extricate themselves from the conflict by adopting individual landholding as urged by the Indian Bureau officials, but such arrangement was not recognized by the village chief. The dispute over land continued through the years and further disputes developed over the Mennonite Hopis' efforts to carry out some ceremonies of the Hopi religion apart from official Old Oraibi sponsorship. The Mennonite Hopis, following the tenets of their new religion, also rejected participation in the Hopi Tribal Council when it was formed later as well as service in the United States armed forces.

A somewhat different sort of factionalism resulted among the Papagos when Presbyterians began to work intensively among them in 1910. The Presbyterian missionary work was carried out only in the southeastern part of what later became the Sells reservation, affecting directly only a quarter of the population. Here the Presbyterians built four churches between 1910 and 1920 and carried on an active proselytizing campaign. They made use of ministers who spoke the Papago language, having been trained by C. H. Cook, the Presbyterian missionary on the Pima Reservation. They rapidly gained several hundred converts and instituted an organization of elders similar to that among the Pimas. The converted Papagos not only accepted basic Presbyterian ritual and doctrine, but also gave up smoking, drinking, and card playing and became actively hostile to the native religious practices, such as the annual saguaro wine rain ceremony and others. This vigorous rejection of the native religion was required by the Presbyterian missionaries. The implacably hostile attitude toward native religion as well as toward the cult of Saint Francis and other Catholic practices resulted in friction with other Papagos of the area. The Presbyterian congregations consisted of only parts of the population of a half dozen villages, never of whole villages. The other residents of the villages were ones who called themselves Catholics for the most part, and practiced the Saint Francis cult along with some features of the Papago religion. The friction grew into serious schism as the Presbyterians expressed their hostility to other religious practices and as some Presbyterians emerged as vigorous leaders in tribal affairs in connection with the Indian Bureau program. All the villages in which a Presbyterian church existed were torn with conflict, and there was no cooperation
522 CYCLES OF CONQUEST

for any purpose between the Protestant and the Catholic factions. The Presbyterian missionary campaign was not, however, extended beyond this area and hence the factionalism did not spread among all the Papagos. After 1930 the friction lessened, although the Presbyterian congregations continued vigorous.

Internal factionalism not resulting in migration and in less intense form than that which characterized the Papago villages appeared on many other reservations. At the time when the Presbyterian churches had reached their peak of development on the Pima Reservation, the Franciscan Order built missions there and rather quickly gained many converts, as many as a third of the tribe. This division into two sects did not result, however, in the intensity of factional conflict which had characterized the Presbyterian conversion of the Papagos. Christian Reformed and Catholic factions sometimes opposed each other on Apache and Zuni reservations, as did Baptist and Mennonite on the Hopi Reservation. Generally speaking, where Protestant conversion was well established before the growth of Catholic missions, as among the Gila Pimas and the San Carlos and White Mountain Apaches, factional bitterness did not develop with much intensity. But where Catholicism in some form had been the rule and Protestantism was introduced, as among Papagos, Eastern Pueblos, and Zunis, some serious conflict developed. The process of Protestant replacement carried with it greater stimulus to factional discord.

A third feature of the Protestant impact on Indian life was the separation of new sects out of those introduced on the reservations. The new sects formed in this way consisted of groups of Indians already converted as Presbyterians, Baptists, or Lutherans who rebelled against being a part of a national organization and wanted more local control of their church. Sometimes they had their origin in the leadership of a particular personality serving as minister. Most of them centered around Indians who had received training as ministers, but occasionally an Anglo minister was employed. Independent churches grew up from Baptist congregations on the Hopi and Pima reservations, from Lutheran congregations on the San Carlos Apache Reservation, and from Presbyterian congregations on the Mohave Reservation. In all of these, church affairs and the treasury were administered by the various local congregations on the reservations, all of the ties with the denomination out of which they had grown being severed. They abandoned the denominational names and adopted new ones containing the tribal name, such as Hopi Mission Church, Mohave Mission Church, San Carlos Apache Independent Church, and Pima Independent Church. In all cases they constituted small minorities of the reservation population. Each church usually had a minister who was widely known as an effective preacher and who visited frequently the other independent churches to preach and to hold revival meetings. An important feature of these churches’ activities was annual camp meetings in which the congregations of all or several got together for a week or more at a time and conducted revivals in the manner of one or another of the churches from which they had been derived. Necessarily the preaching at such meetings was in English, since those in attendance spoke different Indian languages. However, the local congregations employed the native Indian language as frequently as English in their own services.

The independent churches represented a tendency toward local autonomy in
religious life, yet they were not composed of those Indians who had been least influenced by Protestantism. On the contrary, the congregations consisted of persons who had been most affected by the Protestant principle of exclusive sectarianism. They were usually persons who were most deeply opposed to the practice of the native religions and most uncompromising in their denunciation of native curing and other practices. They were usually noted on their reservations for the strictest religious discipline—as the most regular church-goers—and as the strictest observers of the taboos on smoking, drinking, card-playing, gambling, and couple dancing. They, in fact, represented the extreme in the development of Protestant behavior on the reservations and the rejection of all those behaviors about which Anglos were most articulate in their disapproval.

The diffusion of Protestantism was characterized by different results from that of Catholicism in respect to the modification and reintegration of basic doctrines and rituals. Although the social effects were somewhat similar in that Catholic conversion resulted in the unification of some tribes, the sometimes paralyzing splitting of others and the growth of new forms of Catholicism, the new varieties of Protestantism differed fundamentally from those of Catholicism. The Eastern Pueblo, Yaqui, and Papago types of modification of Catholic ritual and doctrine did not occur in the case of Protestantism. It is clear enough that there had been in the seventy-five years of Protestant contact no repetition of those conditions which were major determinants of the Yaqui and Papago varieties of Catholicism, namely, the departure of priests after an initial intensive indoctrination. We should not therefore expect similar results, unless perhaps they might be looked for as future developments in the independent churches which have split off from the nationally organized denominations.

However, there were basic characteristics of Protestant belief and missionary procedure which inhibited such results. The sects mentioned which were active in the field for the first fifty years of Protestant contact instructed their missionaries in a wholly uncompromising attitude toward native religions. They refused to attend native ceremonies and probably learned less about them than did even the early Franciscan missionaries. They insisted that their converts reject entirely all participation in the native religion and confine their religious life exclusively to the simpler and less colorful ritual of the introduced Protestant church. They tended to regard the greater Catholic tolerance for persisting Indian belief and ceremony as a compromise with evil. Later, after the 1920's, some missionaries began to show more tolerance and some recognition of the need for a slower transition from the old to the new, but even in the later period the Protestant missionary attitude was predominantly one of no compromise. Thus a Christian Reformed missionary working at Zuni in the 1940's expressed the prevailing viewpoint: Differences of opinion naturally arise whether in the realm of religion one should try to use existing concepts. Paul did make reference at Athens to an Unknown God, of whom he said, "Whom, therefore, ye ignorantly worship, Him declare I unto you." But it is questionable whether Paul gained much by this introduction. The most common reaction of well-meaning Zunis to the gospel message is that the Jesus-way and the Zuni-way are "hi-ni-na," the same. To identify our God, "eternal, incomprehensible,
in invisible, immutable, infinite, almighty, perfectly wise, just, good, and the overflowing fountain of all good” [Article I of The Confession of Faith] with an indefinite Holder of the Path proves rather a stumbling block than an aid to the full conception of the Christian message.

This missionary further expressed the ideal result in the conversion of Zunis. Louis Chavez and family ... no longer attend native ceremonies. Their beloved dead lie in a graveyard remote from those who have been given pagan burial. By the grace of God they have learned that one cannot walk upon two roads. He contrasted this family with another Zuni whom he described as “a faithful friend to the missionaries.” Oldest among the Indians was Telesee ... Decade after decade, Telesee has faithfully come to church ... It was he who would blow into the ears of the new-comers and say, “Now you will understand our language.” ... Telesee heard the message directly in his own language from Rex Natewa ... He has been especially valuable in translation work the last few years ... Telesee may not have liked the message of that Sunday. Rex made it very clear that the Holy Spirit tolerates no other spirit within. Telesee in all these years that he has attended church has never come to the point where he was ready to give up his own religion. When he visited the missionary at Thanksgiving time, with one breath he would ask for a Jesus story, with the next he would ask for some feathers, that is if the missionary had been fortunate enough to have had turkey. They were for his plumes. But Telesee also said he wanted to pray to Jesus. Of late, as he was hearing Sunday after Sunday that he must give up his own gods, he seemed less interested.

Such attitudes on the part of the missionaries generally resulted in little or no blending of Indian religious concepts with the Protestant. The Indian convert had to make a complete break. There was no combination of Protestant ritual with Indian ritual, no assumption of new ceremonial functions by existing Indian organizations, and consequently no fusion of the old and the new such as took place among the Yaquis. What the missionaries sought was sudden and complete replacement of the Indian religious behavior.

This result was obtained for the congregations who accepted missionary leadership and remained under direct missionary tutelage. Some modifications of a minor sort did take place. The kinds that resulted were exemplified by some of the Papago congregations. For the Papagos song had always been an important accompaniment of religious activity as well as a constant feature of daily life. Supernatural power was acquired in the form of songs. Songs brought rain and transformed wine. The first Presbyterian missionaries among the Papagos taught choral singing, which was the form — combined male and female voices — of song characteristic of the major Papago ceremonies. The Papagos took up the choral singing of hymns with great enthusiasm; the congregations vied with one another in singing. Choral groups went from their own church to sing at others. Protestant hymns were translated into Papago, although the music remained as the missionaries taught it. Churches had choral meets in which the different congregations sang competitively. The Papagos had chosen to emphasize an aspect of church behavior which appealed especially to them and fit in well with their own religious heritage. Emphasis on choral singing made their church life a little different from that of Anglo
Presbyterian churches, but in other respects the ritual was the same. There was further a different emphasis in the big revival meetings which the Presbyterians stimulated among the Papagos. The sins publicly confessed were most frequently failures to live up to the traditional kinship obligations in Papago culture. Tearful church members rose and spoke not of sins against the Holy Spirit, but of neglect of aunts and uncles on the father's side. The framework of morality was the old kinship system, but the sanctions for it were expressed through the new medium of the revival meeting.

It was also difficult for Papagos, and Pimas as well, to think in terms of eternal punishment in the afterlife, since that concept had not been part of their native religious system. Rewards and punishments in an afterlife were conspicuously absent in the sense of sin which developed among them. There were also attempts, certainly not sanctioned by the missionaries but nevertheless indulged in by individual Papagos, to make parallels between their old culture hero — I-itoj, creator of men — and Jesus. Such reinterpretations were not conspicuous in the thinking of the most devoted church-goers, but as the numbers of the latter increased and Jesus became better known to other Papagos who maintained some belief in the old myths, adjustments in their thinking were made to the Christian concepts. In these ways the same process developed by which the introductions of the Jesuits had been adjusted to Papago world views.

There were similar differences in emphasis in what was being taught among other tribes who formed Protestant congregations, but like those among the Papagos and Pimas they constituted only small departures. In general, Protestantism was not fundamentally altered in its process of transference and by virtue of that very fact a sharper distinction was created between those who embraced it and those who tended to cling to the Indian religions than had been the case in the diffusion of Catholicism.

Following World War I came some new developments in the diffusion of Protestantism. In the United States generally there were new trends in religious life. One of these was the proliferation of new Protestant sects such as the Holiness Church and the Assemblies of God, sects which emphasized the individual conversion experience, "speaking in tongues," and the supreme importance of religion over other aspects of life. During the 1920's and 1930's new missionaries representing such sects appeared on the reservations in New Mexico and Arizona — the Church of the Nazarene, the Free Methodists, the Assembly of God, the Southern Baptists, and a number of independent groups such as the Good News Mission, the Navajo Gospel Mission, the Navajo Bible School, and the Brethren in Christ. These raised the total number of Christian sects at work converting Indians on the reservations of the two states to twenty-six. While to some extent the older established denominations had altered their uncompromising attitude toward Indian religion and had settled down to a more patient and tolerant approach, at the same time increasingly emphasizing social and medical services, the new sects reintroduced the approach of no compromise with strict religious behavior. Their representatives were obviously often at odds with the longer established groups and hence sectarian exclusiveness was given a new impetus among the Indians. The
new missionaries were working in a general situation of increasing poverty among
the Indians, increasing clash between Indian ways and Anglo ways, and increasing
attitudes of dependency on government or resources outside of Indian society. In
this atmosphere all of the new sects gained adherents. They made extensive use
of charity, collecting and giving out to poorer Indians clothing and various other
goods. They worked among all the tribes of the Southwest except the Havasupai
and one independent revivalist carried his operations among the Seris in Sonora.
The impact was primarily the increase of sectarian feeling among the tribes where
they worked. Usually the sects gained influence quickly at first, as among the San
Carlos Apaches and in some Navajo areas, then tended to lose adherents as the
strictness of their behavior code became apparent and Indians became aware of
their implacable opposition to most Indian customs of family life. Small numbers
wherever they worked, however, remained devoted converts. Their greatest in-
fluence was attained among segments of Apaches, Navajos, and some Pimas, the
poorest and most disorganized and conflict-torn groups. The Eastern Pueblos,
Zunis, Hopis, and those Yaquis who had settled in Arizona among whom they
worked appeared to remain almost impervious.

A second influence following World War II was also an integral part of United
States religious trends generally. Quakers and Unitarians had developed during
the 1920's and 1930's a conception of secular social service as a part of what they
called their Service Committees. These groups set up "Indian Centers" in cities
where many Indians came as transients, in an effort to provide a place to stay other
than the streets or the cheap boarding houses. During the 1940's and 1950's these
centers in Gallup, Phoenix, and Los Angeles became important influences of the
nature of the "settlement house" where young Indians of all the Southwestern
tribes became acquainted with one another. In addition, the Quakers instituted
what they called self-help programs among the Papagos, Maricopas, and Apaches.
These consisted of encouraging local committees to discuss and take action on
practical problems. Participation did not entail the adoption of any religious be-
liefs or practices, but the Quaker representatives introduced a new type of religious
believer to Indians — Protestant-like in many ways, but less exclusive and non-
proselytizing.

THE RISE OF NEW RELIGIONS

New religions have often arisen among defeated and oppressed people, people
looking for a new hope in the midst of ruin. Christianity arose in this way and
became, through a remarkable series of circumstances, one of what we call the
world religions. No one knows how many religions have arisen under similar con-
ditions — and died out. The Cargo Cults of the natives of New Guinea, the Mesianic
movements of oppressed Jews of the ghettos of eastern Europe, and the Ghost
Dance of the North American Indians we know something about, but there must
have been many more about whose hopes and whose struggles nothing is known,
for conquest and oppression have not been rare in human history.
The entrance of the Spaniards into northwestern New Spain was heralded by a new religious movement on the borders of the Tarahumara country. The Tepehuanes, rapidly missionized by the Jesuits, fell enthusiastically under the leadership of a prophet after some twenty years of apparent acceptance of the Christian missions. A stone image was believed to speak and to foretell the destruction of the Spaniards. The Indians fought to fulfill the prophecies and only gave up their hopes after a bloody war that lasted through the year of 1618. The Tarahumaras from time to time for the next hundred years listened to similar prophecies and sometimes killed missionaries and soldiers in the belief that they had supernatural power which made them invulnerable to Spanish bullets. These beliefs, promulgated by an occasional prophet, never became organized into a religious movement even as unified as that of the Tepehuanes. It was possible for the missionaries to regard the outbursts as inspired merely by isolated “witches” rather than as a concerted movement based on a new set of beliefs, which they had recognized in the Tepehuan rebellion. The wisps of information available concerning the Tarahumara uprisings suggest nevertheless that the conditions set up in the form of forced labor in the mines of Chihuahua, the determined missionary effort to force people to live under strict discipline in concentrated towns, the suppression of ceremonies, and the repeated devastation of rancherías by the soldiers encouraged religious leaders of the prophet type. No “new religion” arose, probably because of the un-integrated nature of Tarahumara religious life as well as of their social organization, but the need for it was evidently sufficiently there to inspire an occasional prophet.

Other major uprisings of Indians in northwestern New Spain during the 1600’s and 1700’s cannot be attributed to new religious movements. The Pueblo Revolt of 1680 was a political-military effort to preserve an old religion. It was a revolt against political and religious oppression, but its leaders were offering nothing new in the way of religious belief. The old religion had not been destroyed, and it was in its name that the revolt was carried through. Nor can the destructive Mayo-Yaqui revolt in 1740 be attributed to newly-inspired religious beliefs; insofar as we know what happened it appears to have been set off by a conflict of authority in town government, and there was definitely no tendency before or after toward any deviation from the century-long growth of Catholicism which had become rooted among the Yaquis and Mayos. The Seri revolt a little later was over the appropriation of land and deportation of women, with no religious aspects, except marked continuing respect for Jesuits, and the Upper Pima rebellions can be classed as political rather than religious movements.

The Spanish conquest period, north of the Tepehuanes, was indeed singularly free of any instances of the rise of new religions. It was only during the last phases of the conquest, carried out by Mexicans and Anglo-Americans, that such movements began to appear. The earliest of which there is clear record was the appearance of the Ghost Dance among the Walapais in 1889. The Ghost Dance originated among the Paiute Indians whose territory bordered on the Walapais to the north. It was a Messianic cult preached by a Paiute named Wovoka, or Jack Wilson, who claimed to have received a revelation of supernatural power. The hopes involved
in the cult obviously had their origin in the changes wrought by the Anglo-American advance into the western United States. The cult focused on the elimination of white men and the return of the Indian country to the Indians, with the return of the wild game and the restoration of old ways. The means for removal of the white men consisted in the performance of a dance, based on an old type of social dance. Men and women dancing in a circle with hands clasped moved round and round to the music of voice and drum. The prophet, Wovoka, held that the constant performance of the dance would restore all the dead Indians as well as bring back the old conditions of freedom and good hunting. No military or other forcible action was urged. The mere regular carrying out of the dance would bring the results that the Indians hoped for. The movement was called the Ghost Dance because of its hopes for the return of the dead ancestors. During the 1880s the new cult spread rapidly and widely. Most of the Indians of the western United States, who had experienced the steady encroachment of white men and often battles with the Whites, took it up. It was danced for six or seven years even more vigorously by many newly conquered tribes of the Plains region than by the mountain Indians of the far west.

In 1889 the Walapais took it up. This was at a time when they were in the midst of conflict with white cattlemen. As a scattered, unorganized tribe, they had been largely ignored by white settlers. But it was possible to raise cattle to advantage in their territory, and Whites moved in. They appropriated waterholes, pushed Indians out of their way, shot them when necessary, and thus seriously threatened the very existence of the Indians. The government had tried to move the Indians to the Colorado River Reservation, but the Walapais had refused to stay. At the time the Ghost Dance appeared among them most had become hangers-on around the mining town of Kingman, poverty-stricken and despised by the white settlers. At some distance from Kingman, in 1889, they began a long series of Ghost Dance ceremonies. The participants included more than half the tribe. The ceremonial was to last until the desired results came. The Whites, as they did elsewhere in the western United States, became frightened that the dancing was preliminary to armed rebellion. It became apparent, however, that only magical means were to be used for the destruction of the Whites and the Indians were permitted to carry on their ceremonials unmolested. After several weeks, food supplies had all been used up by the dancing Indians and gradually group by group they gave up their efforts, slowly returning to their state of dependency on the mining-town Whites. Bringing no clear, positive results the cult was short-lived and within three years completely died out.

From the Walapais the Ghost Dance spread to the Havasupais, where, however, it lasted only a year. Here its leader lost prestige when he made an effort to restore to life a particular dead man, without result. At the same time many Navajos were aware of the Ghost Dance. They, too, like the Walapais at this time, were experiencing White encroachment and sporadic violence. Yet no Navajos embraced the cult. The hope of bringing back the dead, an essential element in the Ghost Dance, was one which Navajos would not entertain. In Navajo belief the dead as ghosts were to be feared. Navajos feared a dead body from the moment
of death, were reluctant to handle one for burial, and tore down the hogan in which anyone died. Most evil witch power was believed to come from corpses. Thus the Navajos would have regarded the return of the dead as a great calamity. The Ghost Dance influenced some Apaches on the Fort Apache Reservation, but elsewhere in Arizona and New Mexico Indians had no interest whatever in the new religion.

About the same time — from 1890 to 1892 — another prophet cult arose among the Mayos in southern Sonora. It had no ritual features whatever in common with the Ghost Dance, but it shared a similar hope. In 1890 on the Cocoraqui Wash at Cabora, which was the traditional boundary line between the Mayo and Yaqui territory, a girl named Teresa Urrea began to experience visions which she explained to her father in the Mayo language. Her father, Tomás, encouraged her once he learned the nature of the visions. One of the important myths in the Mayo-Yaqui mythology which had developed since the entrance of the Jesuits was a flood myth which described how the whole Yaqui-Mayo country had been flooded at the beginning of things. A few beings were saved by taking refuge on mountain tops, and these became the ancestors of the Indians. Teresa had begun to dream that a flood was coming to the Mayo country and that all who did not take refuge on certain spots, which were revealed to her in her visions, would be destroyed. The Mayos at this time had just been reconquered by the Mexicans after participation with the Yaquis in the series of battles that had begun about 1875, under the leadership of the Yaqui Cajeme. Mayo towns had been occupied by Mexican troops and most able-bodied Mayos had been forced to go to work on the haciendas of Mexicans in and beyond the Mayo country. The people were short of food and times were extremely hard.

The news of Teresa's visions spread everywhere in the Mayo country. Minor prophets began to have visions of the same sort and, taking up positions on high ground designated by Teresa, began to preach the new revelation. During 1890 seven or eight additional prophets or preachers appeared. So many Mayo laborers gathered to hear them, staying night and day, that the Mexican army officials began to fear that an uprising was brewing. They found instead that the people were gathering in expectation of the flood on the points of refuge and that they were listening peacefully to the preachers and expecting that the flood would destroy the hacendados and all other Mexicans. The Mexicans broke up the meetings and jailed the preachers, but the movement was not stopped. Teresa was not jailed and went on dreaming. Her influence continued strong among the Mayos. The rough treatment of the preachers inspired violence. In 1892 a nondescript party of armed Mayos attacked Navojoa, the largest Mexican settlement in the Mayo country, shouting, “Long Live the Saint of Cabora.” The Mayos were promptly repulsed and punished by the Mexicans, and Santa Teresa and her father were taken into custody along with other sympathizers. There were repercussions of the movement in the Tarahumara country at Tomochic. Ultimately Teresa was deported out of the Mayo country and went to Arizona, where she took up residence near Tumacacori. For a time she lived there and gained fame as a curer, but her prophetic visions ceased, and the religious movement she had inspired on the
Mayo River died out altogether. Although thousands of Mayos had listened and believed what Teresa said, her visions made no impression whatever on Yaquis. This was true despite the fact that conditions of poverty and oppression were even worse in the Yaqui towns than among the Mayos. The Yaquis apparently were not relying on magical means for removing Mexicans from their territory.

Another short-lived prophetic cult took hold of a small group of Papagos in 1906. It differed from the Ghost Dance and Saint of Cabora cults in that it envisioned the destruction of the whole world, not merely the white men. It probably had its origin in the preaching of an itinerant Protestant revivalist in Phoenix who may have preached the end of the world. At any rate a group of fairly well-to-do families living in the southeastern part of the Papago country, where Presbyterianism later made its entry, began to believe that the world was coming to an end and that therefore it was useless to work anymore. They assembled their cattle and all food resources they could muster and retired to the Comobabi Mountains. They expected the end to come before their food ran out but this was not the case. With all their stores gone and the fulfillment of the prophecy not indicated, they left the mountain and returned to their homes. The beliefs did not spread beyond this small group of families from a single village, nor had they appeared again up to 1960.

Another movement which affected some Papagos, but was chiefly influential among Gila Pimas, went by the name of the Montezumas. Strictly speaking, it was not a religious movement in the sense of resting on supernatural belief. Yet it had religious repercussions and in some ways affected Pimas and Papagos as a religious movement. About 1918 a man of Yavapai ancestry who had in childhood been captured by Pimas and sold as a slave came to Sacaton on the Pima Reservation and began to hold meetings. He was Dr. Carlos Montezuma. Since his early childhood, after being brought up by a frontier photographer of Italian descent, he had lived as an Anglo-American. He had gone to Chicago, where he worked his way through medical school and later became a successful practicing physician. He had become increasingly interested in the condition of Indians on United States reservations and especially in the serious economic plight of the Pimas, whose loss of irrigation water and consequent poverty had been given publicity widely over the United States by various Indian defense organizations. Montezuma began to publish a small magazine in which he advocated the abolition of the Indian Bureau and the elimination of government authority from Indian affairs. About 1918 he came to Arizona to preach his viewpoint among the Pimas, Papagos, Yavapais, and Western Apaches. His meetings at Sacaton on the Pima Reservation gained him many adherents, who were deeply dissatisfied with reservation conditions; at the same time he incurred the disapproval of the Indian Bureau. After several years of preaching he died of tuberculosis on the Salt River Reservation.

His influence survived him for some twenty-five years, but was most marked during the 1920's. His appeal had been based chiefly on the dignity and worth of the Indian racial and cultural heritage. He preached that Indian ways were fundamentally sounder than white man's ways and that Indians should cleave to their traditions in religion and moral behavior and not look to the Whites for guidance.
The oppressive and demoralizing program of the Indian Bureau was a prime example of White immorality. Indians should reassume the independence they had practiced before the Indian Bureau had taken them over, take up their land again in their own name, and demonstrate the fundamental greatness of the Indian way of life. The preaching was not wholly anti-White, it was rather completely anti-Indian Bureau; and its positive feature consisted in the assertion of the great value of Indianhood. The ideas of Dr. Montezuma were not unique in the United States; they were to a considerable extent parallel with ideas which had been discussed and advocated for thirty or forty years by the various Indian defense organizations. Dr. Montezuma's influence differed from that of any of the organizations in that he made a personal and direct appearance among some Indians and spoke with the authority of an Indian who had accepted wholly and with success the white man's way, but who had returned to the clear view of the worth of the Indian way.

With Dr. Montezuma's death in 1922, no organized movement came into existence. It was apparent that his influence had been very diffuse, but it had been powerful here and there. Some older Pima leaders had listened to him with eagerness and had accepted thoroughly his view of the destructive and evil role of the Indian Bureau; the idea fell into fertile ground among such elders who had lived through the period of the steady destruction of Pima agriculture by White farmers and the inability of the Indian Bureau to prevent it. On into the 1930's there were older men on the Pima Reservation who refused to deal with the Indian Bureau superintendent, who were called "Montezumas" by others, and who preached the necessity for the old Indian morality. Even stronger through the northern part of what had become the Papago Reservation, Montezuma's ideas became the basis of a conservative faction which remained unorganized, but probably had at least initial influence on the formation of the League of Papago Chiefs. The "Montezumas" of the northern Papago Reservation were older village headmen, men who were still maintaining the office of the Keeper of the Smoke, who still tried to keep up the practice of frequent moral exhortation. They wished for and advocated less contact with white men; many advised their children not to go to schools and attempted to scare them into not going by asserting that the children would be boiled to turn them White. There were among such men and their followers some attempts to adjust the tribal mythology; they believed that Jesus was really I-Itoy and some held that both Jesus and I-Itoy were Montezuma and that Montezuma would one day return and restore better times and good moral behavior. The Montezumas were not inclined to have any dealings with the Indian Bureau agency and tried to ignore it. Similarly, Dr. Montezuma's ideas gave support and sanction to older leaders among Yavapais on the Fort McDowell and San Carlos reservations and to Apaches at San Carlos. No organization of any sort developed however, and by 1950 Dr. Montezuma the man was but a vague memory to the Indians with whom he had come in contact. His ideas persisted under the general label of "Montezumas" among a few "conservative" old men on the Papago Reservation.

Only the Apaches, among all the Indians of the region, conceived a new religion which persisted for more than a few years. In contrast with the ephemeral and unorganized cults which have thus far been described, a religion now generally
called by Apaches The Holy Ground religion grew up after 1920 among both Fort Apache and San Carlos Indians. Thirty-five years later it was still vigorous and its influence had spread beyond the Western Apaches to the Yavapais of central Arizona and the Mohaves and some other Yumans. The Holy Ground religion had a series of predecessors which had some of the characteristics of cults described above. Thus, in 1880 an Apache medicine man, Nocadelklinny, became the prophet of a short-lived movement which seems to have been inspired in part by the Ghost Dance. Nocadelklinny lived at Cibecue where he was widely known as a man with considerable supernatural power. In 1881 he announced that he would bring back to life not all the ancestral dead, but two formerly important war leaders — Diablo and Eskiole — of the Coyotero or White Mountain Band. Dances and rituals such as he prescribed were performed with no results. The chiefs did not come back to life. Nocadelklinny then said that his supernatural power had given him to understand that all Whites would have to be exterminated before the transformation of the dead leaders could be brought about and that this should begin with certain dances. Hundreds of Apaches in the vicinity of Cibecue and Fort Apache became interested and began to listen to Nocadelklinny and to dance. This was a period of tension and trouble on the Apache reservations. Miners and Mormon settlers had been encroaching on the reservations. Indian agents, in a succession following Clum, had been corrupt. Army officers at Fort Apache feared that Nocadelklinny's activities presaged a general uprising. They attempted to arrest him at Cibecue, precipitating a battle with his followers. Nocadelklinny was killed. Nantiatish, another Cibecue medicine man, then assumed leadership and tried to organize an uprising, which however failed to gain a general following after attacks on the San Carlos agency and the mining town of McMillenville were put down in 1882. The Nocadelklinny movement died out.

Subsequently, before 1910, another general movement led by several medicine men gained influence in the Fort Apache area, but little is known about this. It no doubt provided some foundations for the third movement which began just before 1920 and persisted down through 1960. This movement had a leader from near Fort Apache who was known as Silas John. He had gained supernatural power in the usual Apache manner; it took the form of special power with snakes. He held ceremonies in which many snakes were used and which were rendered powerless in Silas John's hands. The ceremonies were designed to cure illness and many miraculous cures were believed to have come about. Silas John's reputation increased and his ceremonies were widely attended. He is said to have been a member of a Catholic congregation and introduced some features of Catholic ritual into his ceremonies. By 1921 his influence had spread throughout both the Fort Apache and the San Carlos reservations. The period was one of hard times for Apaches: influenza epidemics in 1918 killed many Indians; in the depression of 1920-21 mines where Apaches worked were shut down; agriculture was curtailed when settlers upstream from the San Carlos agency diverted water; food was scarce; and Mormon settlers were encroaching on the northwestern part of the Fort Apache reservation near Show Low. Under these circumstances the Silas John movement gained many adherents.
Some of the viewpoint of his followers is indicated in the following letter sent to the superintendent at the San Carlos agency and signed by twenty-five San Carlos Apaches and Yavapais in August, 1921:

We the undersigned hereby request that we be permitted to hold Indian Prayer Service every Sunday on our Prayer Grounds. One year ago we began trying to do away with all evil habits, such as drinking, stealing, and finally to influence them to live a clean life, a Godly life; so far, we have, by talking to all the Indians, induced them to do away with drinking, gambling; we have about three hundred or more who come to our meetings and seem anxious to hear, and take home each Sunday what we try to have them do.

The purpose of this meeting is to teach every one of our Creator and the life of Jesus Christ, and that each one must worship only two highest beings.

As heretofore we have been worshipping things such as the sun, the different movements of clouds, winds, stars and many other things which God created, the same as we are; at the same time we are rapidly doing away with the medicine men, who in years past have been among us, and from practicing medicine have taken from us the best we had in horses, cattle, saddles and money.

This we are dealing with. We have been all our lives and have accomplished nothing in the way of advancement; the Missionaries have been among us, a failure it seems. They tend more to learn our language and tend more to introduce our singing.

So in the year 1920, we... called together a few of our leading Indians and decided to take this step, to hold a Prayer Meeting every Sunday which is open to all our Indians who desire to come here.

The Indians (Apache) of this Reservation are now coming to our meeting from Peridot, and few from Bylas. All of the Indians of San Carlos attend. Seeing that we have been able to induce many of our Indians, we desire to continue our service as we see the Indians have and are listening. They go about now different what it used to be one year ago, no tulapai, stealing not fighting and less trouble.

We are pleased with the advance movement, and we are pleased to learn that many Indians are in hearty accord with continuing our Prayer Meeting. It means an aid to our Indian Bureau and to our Government, and the coworkers of the Government in the field.

We, the Undersigned, also are putting forth every effort to safeguard every man, woman, boy and girl, and have on the ground men and women, known by all who help along with our work not only there but at the camps, and away from home wherever they may be. The Service is conducted in the Indian tongue, as the leaders are non-English speaking.

Believing that it will not be well to force civilized church work on our people, who have for past unknown ages, been untouched by such proceedings; we desire to take step by step, and if fate does not interfere hope to induce our Apache Indians to live a pure Christian life, such as they never dreamed of. Those who come and help along with our work are all expressing a feeling of Brotherly Love and cooperation, we are,

Very respectfully...
This letter was followed by another five months later, addressed likewise to the superintendent and signed by twenty-four Apaches from the settlement north of the San Carlos agency at the boarding school of Rice. It requested the same privileges as those the San Carlos agency people had asked for, namely, "to have our Religious Sermonies and without being molested by Agitators."

Permission to maintain the "Prayer Grounds" and to hold regular Sunday meetings was granted. The new movement was challenged by the minister of the Lutheran mission as a return to paganism, but when he refused to debate with Silas John publicly his opposition was ignored by Apaches. Hundreds of Apaches continued to attend the Sunday services and an annual ceremony attended by all adherents from both reservations was instituted. The strength of the movement was established, so well in fact that various missionaries began to regard it as a threat to their work. Their antagonism to Silas John became definite and open. In 1933 he was accused of murdering his wife and was convicted. His followers remained convinced that he was innocent. During the twenty years that he spent in jail from 1934 to 1954 they maintained communication with him. He continued to think about and develop the ritual, and followers who come to visit him went back to the reservations with diagrams and instructions for carrying on the various ceremonies. He remained a vigorous source of inspiration throughout his years in jail, and many leading Apaches became adherents. On his return to the San Carlos Reservation in 1954 he was enthusiastically welcomed and began immediately to lead and take part in the annual round of ceremonies on the reservations.

The Holy Ground religion was a combination of concepts, rituals, and moral rules from Protestant and Catholic Christianity and the old Apache religious system, with the latter predominating. Although it centered in the leadership of Silas John, it was carried out by Apache men and women, called "disciples," who constituted an organized group. They permitted medicine men, whose power was derived from the old Apache sources of animals and features of the natural world, to practice their curing ritual as a part of ceremonies; but the medicine men had to conform to certain requirements of the new religion, the most important of which was the performance of their ritual within the space ceremonially defined as "The Holy Ground," which was the scene of all the ceremonies. The fundamental beliefs consisted in the belief in God, spoken of as a supreme power, and in Naiyenesgani. The latter was the name for one of the Twin War God Monster Slayers of old Apache mythology, who were sons of the sun, as the result of a virgin birth. Naiyenesgani was associated in the new religion with goshlatagoletn, "sitting above the clouds," who was identified by some as Silas John who was also, therefore, the Son of God. Silas John had the power of this Son of God or Monster Slayer, rather than being the Son of God himself. This power could be used for curing either directly by Silas John himself or by other men with supernatural power who derived it through the Son of God. The power could be used also for a variety of other purposes, such as bringing rain and eliminating evil feelings.

In each community the ceremonies centered about a specially designated area which was rectangular, the four sides of which were marked by crosses colored according to the old Apache four directional associations — black for east, green
RELIGIOUS DIVERSIFICATION

for south, yellow for west, and white for north. The four-directional arrangement and the color associations in a ceremonial circuit in the order given above ran through most ceremony. A sign of the cross similar to a Catholic hand movement and the raising of the right hand with palm forward were prescribed individual actions punctuating ceremony. Circular ground paintings with different colored earth and sand were employed as an important part of many ceremonies. Processions with a variety of standards, singing of songs in Apache to the accompaniment of the Apache water drum, and the use of colored hoops were all features of ritual. Also the use of pollen as a sacred substance characterized the ceremonies.

By 1955 the ceremonies had come to be guarded from Anglo interference with a good deal of care, although it was not unknown for Anglos resident on the reservation to participate in the Sunday meetings, joining in the religious processions and the social dancing in the Apache style, which punctuated the ceremonies. Apache leaders of the movement maintained that the religion was a universal one, not only for Apaches. Nevertheless, Apaches were aware of the disapproval of missionaries and other Anglos and there had been occasional attempts to interfere in the services after Silas John had been sent to jail. The general summer ceremony was held as far as possible from the agency town and although Whites were not forcibly kept away, they were discouraged from coming. The annual ceremony drew five to six hundred people and continued for four days and nights.

The Holy Ground movement was the only vigorous and persisting new religion devised by the Indians of the region, unless we classify the Yaqui variation of Catholicism as a new religion. The blend of Christianity and old religion which the Apaches achieved, however, was very different from the Yaqui. In the first place it was a much simpler system of belief and practice, lacking the elaborate organization, very great degree of specialization of ritual, and large number of complexly interrelated concepts which characterized Yaqui religion. Moreover, Christian concepts penetrated only to the extent of accepting nominally the supreme position of God (and even this was not clear), the likewise not too clear identification of Jesus and Naeyenesgani, and the acceptance of a Protestant-like moral system and behavior taboos; Christian ritual was manifest only in the use of a modified hand sign of the cross and the prominence of the cross as a symbol which also had a native precedent in four-directional symbolism. Beliefs were explained by Apaches primarily with reference to the old mythology dealing with the sun, his monster-slaying twin sons, and other Apache myths. Parallels were certainly drawn between Jesus and other Christian figures, but this was merely auxiliary. The story of Jesus, the role of Mary, and Old Testament world-beginning stories were not accepted. The old basis of belief had been only slightly modified. The new religion was a new one primarily in its organization into a church form of congregation with a regular ceremonial calendar centering in the week and the efforts of its leaders constantly to relate its teachings to the moral problems of its adherents. In these respects it was very different from the old unrelated curing ceremonies which had constituted the elements of Apache religion. In these respects also it certainly showed the influence of the church organizations which had become established on the Apache reservations. Perhaps also in its
universal character, it revealed some influence from Christian teaching, but it did not require a personal experience of conversion for participation in its activities.

The other new religion which was active in the region in the 1950's was the Native American Church. This was not an invention of any of the tribes in the region but had diffused to them from Indians in Oklahoma who had organized the church in the 1890's. The Native American Church was a religious group which employed as its central rite the eating of the cactus button, peyote. The system of beliefs and rituals combined some Christian-derived elements, such as the belief in Jesus as a source of spiritual inspiration, and other elements derived from the old ceremonial systems of the Delaware and other Indian tribes who had been sent to Oklahoma by the United States government. The moon as a female deity and ground altars were examples of such elements. The religion centered around the practice of group eating of the peyote buttons. Such a group gathered in a house or other structure, sat in a circle, and consumed the buttons. The effect of the peyote consisted in the inducement of visions of various kinds and, when eaten in the group, feelings of well-being and group identification. A usual accompaniment of peyote-eating was the passing of a drum to each participant successively, who then accompanied himself while singing songs known as the peyote songs. A session was ordinarily an all-night affair and was terminated with forced vomiting about dawn by each member of the group. The Native American Church existed as early as 1900 as an organized institution with a national head and staff of officers. It carried on missionary work among many Indian groups, proselytization which steadily increased through the 1950's.

The first New Mexican tribe to show interest in the Native American Church was Taos village among the eastern Pueblos. Peyote buttons had been used there traditionally as a specific cure against illnesses caused by witchcraft, but the use of peyote had never developed into a cult. In the 1890's a young Taos man who had been educated in Pennsylvania at Carlisle took an interest in the peyote ceremony and introduced it to other young men in the village. Soon a group was established which regularly carried out the peyote-eating ceremonies. Their activities were opposed by the village leaders, especially as the "peyote boys," as they were called, began to curtail their participation in the traditional village ceremonial life.

Attempts were made by the village hierarchy to forcibly suppress the new rites and oust the peyote-eaters from the village. These were unsuccessful and a feud developed between the families of the "peyote boys" and other families. The peyote cult became more entrenched in the lives of the group that had adopted it, but it did not spread as the opposition to it by the ceremonial leaders crystallized. It continued to exist, and its practitioners increasingly withdrew from other religious activities, constituting a source of conflict for fifty years at Taos. Its attempted introduction was resisted at San Juan village, and it spread nowhere else among the Eastern Pueblos, except for its adoption by a lone practitioner in Santa Clara village.

Although Native American Church missionaries worked as far west and south as the Papagos, nowhere else in the Southwest was the religion adopted for the forty years following its introduction at Taos. But during World War II in the
early 1940's, it began to be taken up by Navajos, chiefly in the extreme north-eastern part of the reservation where many different religious sects had concentrated their activities and where the Indian Bureau had instituted a resettlement project on newly irrigated land. Here, in the vicinity of Fruitland, New Mexico, peyote-eating groups of Navajos were formed. Gradually the religion spread westward until by 1955 there were some two thousand members of the Native American Church. Its spread was opposed by the Navajo Tribal Council, on the ground that peyote was a habit-forming drug, until it was pointed out that medical opinion in the United States was not in agreement on the matter. The Tribal Council then on the principle of religious freedom ceased to oppose it. Nevertheless, the fact that the use of a drug was a necessary feature of the religious ritual constantly brought the practitioners of the religion into conflict with Anglo-Americans. Navajo groups who carried on their ceremonies off the reservation were raided by police, and newspapers took up campaigns against the religion. Nevertheless, by 1960 the influence of the Native American Church was rapidly growing among Navajos. As a religion which combined some elements of Christian belief with generalized Indian traits it fitted well into the mixed culture patterns of many Navajos who had worked extensively off the reservation, and appealed as well to many Navajos who felt antagonistic towards Anglos and saw in the Native American Church an institution which they themselves could control locally. It also fit into the growing awareness on the part of Navajos of many other Indians in the United States with similar reservation background and relations with Anglos. Its spread was related to a pan-Indian type of feeling which had grown up widely over the Southwest as a result primarily of large public performances such as the Gallup Ceremonials participated in by Indian dancers and musicians from many reservations. Yet by 1960 the Native American Church had spread nowhere else among Southwestern Indians. It was confined to a declining cult in Taos and a rapidly growing movement among the Navajos.

The new religions which took hold in the Southwest affected with greatest intensity the Mayos, the Navajos, and the Apaches. The Mayo new religion was very short-lived once forcible suppression of its leaders had been applied. The other groups, with the exception of Walapais, Havasupais, some Papagos, and Tarahumaras who embraced cults very briefly, did not develop intense interest in new religions. By the middle of the 1900's the Apache Holy Ground religion seemed the strongest rooted and most influential. Yet it, too, seemed to be giving way in the late 1950's to a new type of evangelistic Protestant movement, a few years after the return from jail of Silas John.

THE PERSISTENCE OF INDIAN RELIGIONS

The great variety in Indian religious belief and practice which was characteristic of the states of New Mexico, Arizona, Chihuahua, and Sonora by the middle of the twentieth century was partly a result of the persistence of the native religions as whole systems or surviving parts. Religious diversity was greater in this region
than in any other part of the United States or Mexico because of the special geographical, political, and economic factors which had operated to permit or to foster the survival of the native cultures in the face of both Catholic and Protestant invasion. Elsewhere in North America there were not so many culturally distinct peoples at the time of Spanish entrance, and conquest and post-conquest conditions had forced a far greater leveling of cultural differences.

The survival of Indian religion in the face of the systematic missionary efforts of Christians was by no means a matter only of the persistence of odds and ends of belief. There were among all the groups such piece-meal survivals, sometimes compartmentalized in the minds of converted Christian Indians and tagged by them as superstitions, sometimes held as respectable beliefs the inconsistency of which with new ideas had somehow not become apparent to the holders. There were also Indians who had not become members of Christian congregations who lived by a medley of beliefs which derived mostly from the old religions but which were no longer held together by a clear sense of the values which they had expressed. There were in other words survivals of the old which Indians had not been able to adjust to the new conditions of life and which accordingly existed in their minds as unrelated ideas and customs. Every Christian congregation on the reservations was, as it were, surrounded by and partly interpenetrated with such no-longer-functional remnants.

But there were also Indian religions which functioned as systems of belief and daily practice which ordered the universe and gave meaning to life for their participants. The Seris on the margins of the civilizational advance on their desert coast believed in spirits and maintained a view of the universe which could in no sense be said to have been inspired by the Jesuit missionaries and which contained, even after a few years of Protestant evangelization in the 1950’s, only superficial Christian influence. A considerable number, although perhaps a minority by 1960, of Navajos, shielded from the ever-intensifying and multi-form missionary attack in the isolated parts of their large reservation, saw the world still as bounded by four sacred mountains and their place in it as influenced by spirits who had come up from an underworld. In the Hopi Mesa villages a round of dramatic ceremonies continued year after year, the meaning of which was well preserved in old beliefs that held deep significance for many people. Among Zunis and the Eastern Pueblos there were likewise, even though Catholic churches existed in all the villages, a round of ceremony and a system of belief that constituted vital religions, quite distinct from and in some ways wholly incompatible with the beliefs which the visiting priests expounded to them at periodic intervals.