Following Tradition

Bronner, Simon

Published by Utah State University Press

Bronner, Simon.
Following Tradition.
Project MUSE. muse.jhu.edu/book/9348.

For additional information about this book
https://muse.jhu.edu/book/9348

For content related to this chapter
https://muse.jhu.edu/related_content?type=book&id=253788
CHAPTER 1. THE PROBLEM OF TRADITION

1. The definition and uses are taken from The American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language (1976). The Latin root of tradition is tradere, to hand over or deliver. There is also a legalistic definition listed of the transfer of property to another.

2. The International Dictionary of Regional European Ethnology and Folklore (Hultkrantz 1960) lists “Folk Tradition Research” as a title occasionally used in Scandinavian countries (144). “Tradition sciences” and “tradition research” as cognates of social sciences and social research were used as a theme for the 22nd Nordic Congress of Ethnology and Folkloristics at Liperi, Finland, on June 9–11, 1981, and published as Trends in Nordic Tradition Research, ed. Lauri Honko and Pekka Laaksonen (1983). Although tradition science or research is not a label for a university department in the Nordic countries either, the organizers used it as a key concept to bind existing disciplines of ethnology and folkloristics, primarily, and secondarily of anthropology and comparative religion (see Honko 1983). In England, prominent Victorian folklorist Edwin Sidney Hartland defined folklore as “the science of tradition,” but academic titles did not pick up the reference to tradition science (Hartland 1899; see also Sanderson and Evans 1970; Fenton 1993).

3. The MLA database in 1994 showed that “folkloristics” appeared 113 times in titles. This figure compares with 5,051 hits of “folklore” and 275 for “folklife,” but these appearances include uses of folklore and folklife as the materials of tradition as well as their study. “Folklore studies” or “folklore research” appeared 1,830 times, while “folklife studies” or “folklife research” came up 33 times. “Folk studies” showed up 164 times. “Folklore science” or “science of folklore” shows up primarily to describe early approaches, especially evolutionary ones, such as Alexander Haggerty Krappe’s 1930 classic The Science of Folklore (see Burson 1982).

4. Three volumes covered evening concerts (VRS-9184, 9185, 9186), two volumes, entitled “Traditional Music at Newport, 1964” covered the workshops (WRS-9182, 9183), and two were devoted to blues (VRS-9180, 9181).

5. Previous to the publication of the first Foxfire volume by Doubleday, Wigginton organized distribution of six hundred copies of an offset magazine called Foxfire in 1967 (see Wigginton 1989).

6. This message was carried on a large poster in Spanish and English encouraging participation in the census. Other posters specifically appealed to African and Asian Americans. For the social implications of the ways that the census is taken, see Anderson 1988.
7. The Traditional Values Coalition has a website with the heading “Standing Firm ... Taking Action” (Standing Firm is also the title of Dan Quayle’s book of 1994). The issues of concern listed in the mission statement of the Coalition as of May 1997 are: “Religious Liberties” (freedom of worship and expression in church, outside clinics, at work, school and on the public airwaves), “The Family” (teen pregnancy, the re-definition of the family and domestic partnerships), “Sanctity of Human Life” (abortion ... assisted suicide, baby harvesting, RU-486, euthanasia), “Homosexuality” (politicization of the gay lifestyle and demands for special recognition ... preserving the heterosexual ethic), and “Pornography” (taxpayer funded ‘art,’ pornography addiction and the sexual victimization of women and children). Its newsletter for spring 1997 voiced outrage that the lead character of the popular television show Ellen came out as a lesbian. The group called for combating what it called “homosexual advocacy” in public schools and urged readers to fight pornography in print and on television. A search with the Yahoo! index for sites using “traditional values” produced thirty-one hits, mostly for American organizations identifying themselves as religious or conservative. Examples are “Citizens for Excellence in Education” (helps Christians and conservatives restore academic excellence and traditional moral values to the public schools), “The Citizen’s News” (reflecting traditional American values and conservative viewpoints), “Federalist Society of Mississippi” (reordering priorities within the legal system to place a premium on individual liberty, traditional values and the rule of law), “American Family Association” (devoted to the preservation of traditional family values), “Pathlight Productions” (producing entertainment focused on traditional family values, strong Christian morals, and God-given direction), and “Piaonline” (dedicated to the simple fact that traditional American values are values to be proud of).

8. “The Religious Left” is described in a website for Truland Web Journal, established in March 1995 in New York. It lists constituent groups of the Interfaith Alliance, Interfaith Working Group, Religious Coalition for Reproductive Choice, Unitarian Universalism, Christian Socialist Movement, Religious Society of Friends, and Office for Social Justice. The Interfaith Working Group is more vocal than the others on its stands for policies of supporting “gay rights, reproductive freedom, and the separation of church and state.” There is also a link at the site to the webpage for Religious Socialism prepared by the Democratic Socialists of America. While the religious left appears less united, publicized, or powerful than the religious right, it represents part of the wide-ranging “progressive” and “activist” coalition.

Chapter 2. Folklore and Ideology During the Gilded Age

1. Letter from Stewart Culin to William Henry Holmes, November 30, 1906 (Smithsonian Institution Archives).
4. Review from the Indianapolis Journal and letter come from “Twins of Genius” website documenting the Mark Twain-George Washington Cable tour of 1884–1885 (checked May 1997). The site is part of electronic text sources made available by the University of Virginia.
5. Texts from Harris’s works and reviews of his books are taken from the Joel Chandler Harris website called “Project Navigation,” edited by Melissa Murray and Dominic Perella (checked May 1997), made available by the University of Virginia.
CHAPTER 3. THE ENGLISH CONNECTION, FROM CULTURAL SURVIVALS TO CULTURAL STUDIES


2. The multicultural heritage in games tended to be studied much later. For the influence of African-American heritage, for example, see Jones and Hawes 1987. For Asian-American games, see Scherbatskoy 1976, and for regional games, see Abernethy 1989; Page and Smith 1993.

3. The Opies in the *Oxford Dictionary of Nursery Rhymes* (1952) trace the first line of “This Little Pig” to an English song composed in 1728, and find a reference to the rest of the text in 1760, but cannot account for its popular origin or spread (348–50). The first line of “This Little Pig” did not necessarily evolve into the rest of the text. Halliwell-Phillipps (1849), for example, recorded “This pig went to market/Squeak, mouse, mouse, mousey/Shoe, shoe, shoe the wild colt/And here’s my own doll dowsy” as a rhyme told to children who would not try on shoes (102). The Opies additionally do not consider the implications of the text’s rhythm, performance, or repetition. Other textual references are found in Brewster et al., 1958, 185; Welsch 1966, 187; and Ford 1968, 11.

4. The Opies (1959) offer the “Dark, Dark” material as a narrative under the heading of “Spookies,” but Tucker (1977) found that Girl Scouts from Ellettsville, Indiana, referred to the material as a “poem” (see 209–10). Well aware of textual variation, they used the structure as a guiding principle to organize the words. Shelley, for example, says, “Okay, it’s sorta like those two but it’s a little different” (497), and Beth offers, “Well, you know how you did, ‘There’s a dark dark road,’ except I said it’s black black” (502). A literary rendition of the narrative is Leach 1959, 51.

5. The narrative of the origins of cultural studies usually is drawn to English scholarship in communication and culture such as Hoggart 1957 and Thompson 1955. For surveys of cultural studies, see Grossberg, Nelson, Treichler 1992; Inglis 1993; During 1993; Davies 1995.

CHAPTER 4. THE AMERICANIZATION OF THE BROTHERS GRIMM

1. The manuscript was found in the 1920s, edited and published by Franz Schultz (1924). For a discussion of editions of the manuscript and scholarship related to it, see McGlathery 1993, 41–44. Dating to 1810, the collection is often referred to as the Olenberg manuscript because it was found among Brentano’s posthumous papers in the library of the Trappist monastery in Olenberg.
2. For varying defenses of the genuineness of the Grimms' representation of Viehmann's German tales, see Ward 1988 and Rolleke 1988. A similar controversy surrounds the identity of the storyteller "Old Marie," who may indeed have been young and of "French origin" (see McGlathery 1993, 40–41).

3. Cinderella was followed by an even more expensive and elaborate animated feature, Sleeping Beauty, in 1959 designed for a wide-screen process. The Disney studios continued producing animated adaptations of fairy tales even after Disney's death. Recent productions include Beauty and the Beast (1991) and Aladdin (1992). The Detroit News estimated that in the six times that Cinderella has been released to theaters, 75 million people have seen it, and it grossed 315 million dollars (October 6, 1997). When the film was first issued on video in 1988, it sold eight million copies before April 1989, when it was withdrawn. It was rereleased in 1997 as the second most requested title in the Disney library, behind only The Little Mermaid (see Detroit News site: http://dettnews.com/menu/stories/1908.htm). Disney produced a made-for-television movie of Cinderella with a multiracial cast for airing on November 2, 1997. It featured Brady (African American) as Cinderella, Paolo Montalban (Asian American) as the prince, Whitney Houston (African American) as the fairy godmother, and Whoopie Goldberg (African American) as the queen (see publicity for the show at the creative Hollywood site: http://www.creativehollywood.com/newton/Cinderella.html). For reviews of Disney's special attraction to fairy tales, see Zipes 1994; Schickel 1968; Stone 1988.


5. The conference was Dauphin County Library System's 28th Annual Conference held at the Pennsylvania State University at Harrisburg on May 23, 1996. The buy-or-burn metaphor juxtaposes American consumerism with the specter of book burnings of objectionable material in Nazi Germany with favor given for the American trend. Indeed, the deck was stacked in favor of multicultural literature. Faith Ringgold spoke on African-American storytelling, Gary Soto on stories from Spanish-speaking American neighborhoods, and Jewel Grutman and Gay Matthaei on Native-American tales.

6. This idea is associated with Herder in the German context but is not uniquely his. That societies follow a pattern of natural development, and possess a "poetical," then "heroic," age early in their history, owes much to Giambattista Vico (1688–1744). That human history moves in cycles was an old and widely discussed idea in Vico's day. The distinctive reference given by the Romanticists was to an "ideal, eternal history traversed in time by every nation in its rise, growth, decline and fall" (Berlin 1976, 64). History takes precedence over other kinds of knowledge because it represents the development of human nature itself. Human nature appears to be an activity, and necessarily a social one. For a discussion of these ideas of history, and the relation of Vico and Herder, see Berlin 1976.

7. To be sure, there was American folkloristic concern for Märchen, but it was often presented as a literary or European problem, and many of the folklorists working with the genre were from Europe. Once the major source of folkloristic interest, Märchen during the 1980s were viewed as an understudied genre in America, according to folklorists such as Linda Dégh, W. F. H. Nicolaisen, Wolfgang Mieder, Steven Swann Jones, and Kay Stone. Dégh blamed the lack of attention on "context-centrism" of American folklorists that ignored "accumulated disciplinary knowledge" gained from Europe (Dégh 1995, 28–29). She presented her Narratives in Society: A Performer-Centered Study of Narration (1995) as an attempt to show the continuity of European narrative scholarship with present ethnographic trends, and she demonstrated the oral vitality of Märchen by writing on living storytellers in their...
European communities. As editor of a book series entitled *Folklore Studies in Translation*, Dan Ben-Amos introduced, during the 1980s, two classics of European *Märchen* scholarship by Max Lüthi to American audiences (1982, 1984). Yet he noted that the genre attracted studies that ran counter to "the ethnographic research of narrative performance in particular cultures and specific situations." His hope was that the work "has provided us with an analytical base that can be extended to other genres and other cultures" (Ben-Amos 1982, xii). Alan Dundes during the 1980s drew attention to interpretative consideration of individual tales in the Grimm canon; he edited "casebooks" on *Cinderella* (1988) and *Little Red Riding Hood* (1989) that included reprints of interpretations from folklore studies and other fields.

**CHAPTER 5. MARTHA WARREN BECKWITH AND THE RISE OF ACADEMIC AUTHORITY**

1. Martha Warren Beckwith served on the National Committee of the National Folk Festival in 1938 and was a consultant to the United States Section, International Commission on Folk Arts, in 1935 (see Beckwith 1933, 416; 1938, 442–44). Among her proudest moments were in the folk arts in education field, she wrote, "when the Hawaiian Board in Honolulu decided to use our publications as a text-book in Hawaiian" (see Beckwith 1928a, 281).

2. Of the group, Dorothy Demetracopoulou Lee (Vassar class of 1927), who taught at Vassar and Harvard, and Katharine Luomala, who served as editor of the *Journal of American Folklore* from 1952 to 1953, are probably best known. Lee’s books include *Valuing the Self* (1976) and *Freedom and Culture* (1959). Among her folklore contributions are *Wintu Myths* with Cora Du Bois (1931); "A Study of Wintu Mythology" (1932); "The Loon Woman Myth" (1933); "Greek Accounts of the Vrykolakas" (1942); "Greek Tales of Nastradi Hodjas" (1946); "Greek Tales of Priest and Priestwife" (1947); and "Greek Personal Anecdotes of the Supernatural" (1951). Although not one of Beckwith's students, Katharine Luomala was by her own account deeply influenced by Beckwith’s guidance (see Luomala 1962, 1970). Some representative works by other associates and students of Beckwith include Greenleaf 1933; Green 1923, 1926, 1929; Lewis 1946; Ring 1953; Treadwell 1930; Pukui 1933; and Roberts 1925, 1928.


4. See Lawrence 1911, 1928. Beckwith took some of Lawrence’s approach in "A Note on Punjab Legend in Relation to Arthurian Romance" (1927) and “Pushkin’s Relation to Folklore” (1937) and quoted him extensively in *Folklore in America* (1931b, 63–64).

5. Boas’s *The Mind of Primitive Man* (1911), *Tsimshian Mythology* (1916), and *Primitive Art* ([1927] 1955) were frequently used by Beckwith in courses and articles. Annotating the first and third titles for her folklore course, she wrote, "The first is the classic of the modern American school of social anthropology. The second applies his theories to an objective field. It is 'an attempt to give an analytical description of the fundamental traits of primitive art' as based on two principles: 'the fundamental sameness of mental processes in all cultural forms of the present day' and ‘consideration of every cultural phenomenon as the result of historical happenings.’" (Letter and reading lists from H. N. MacCracken to Martha Beckwith, December 30, 1929, Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

6. "Vassar Trustees Make Changes in College Faculty, Associate Professor M. W. Beckwith Becomes Professor on New Folk Lore Foundation." *Poughkeepsie Eagle News*, February 17, 1920; Letter from Martha Beckwith to President MacCracken, February 14, 1938 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).
7. Letter from Martha Beckwith to President Henry N. MacCracken, December 29, 1919, and to President MacCracken, February 14, 1938 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library). According to a letter specifying the terms of the donation from Alexander & Baldwin, Ltd., to President MacCracken, January 6, 1920, the amount of the gift was twenty-five hundred dollars annually (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

8. Letter from C. B. Bourland to President H. MacCracken, November 26, 1919 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

9. Letter from Elizabeth Deering Hanscom to President MacCracken, November 26, 1919 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

10. Letter from Gertrude Schoepperle Loomis to Martha Beckwith, May 11, 1920 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library). Gertrude Schoepperle Loomis (1882-1921), who like Beckwith had written a dissertation on the folkloric sources of the romance, died prematurely at the age of thirty-nine, a year after Beckwith arrived at Vassar. Her unexpected passing probably dashed Beckwith's hopes for a folklore department at Vassar (see Schoepperle 1960, 1920; Loomis 1927).

11. Letter from Franz Boas to H. N. MacCracken, December 2, 1919 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

12. Letter from William W. Lawrence to Henry Noble MacCracken, December 19, 1919 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

13. Letter from A. Thorndike to Henry Noble MacCracken, December 4, 1919 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

14. Letter from Alexander & Baldwin, Ltd., to President MacCracken, January 6, 1920 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).


16. Letter from Charles Peabody to Martha Beckwith, February 21, 1920 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).


18. Undated letter from Martha Beckwith to Miss Conrow (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

19. Alumnae were also involved in collecting in Dutchess County (see Ring et al. 1953). In addition, a collecting expedition by Elisabeth Greenleaf and Grace Yarrow was sponsored by the Folk-Lore Foundation and the results published as Ballads and Sea Songs of Newfoundland (Greenleaf 1933).

Notes 509

1928 (including nos. 1, 2, 6, 8); see also Mandan-Hidatsa Myths and Ceremonies, 1937 (nos. 10, 12, 14).

21. According to records at Vassar College, the speakers included Franz Boas, W. W. Lawrence, Ella Young (who held the James Phelan lectureship in Celtic mythology at the University of California), Mary A. Jordan, and Ruth Benedict.


23. Letter from Martha Beckwith to President MacCracken, February 14, 1938 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

24. Letter from Martha Beckwith to Rockefeller Foundation, March 28, 1931 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library). For calls for and progress reports of the folk atlasing movement, see Nicolaisen 1973, 1975; Taylor 1965; Erixon 1953; Wildhaber 1972.

25. Letter from Martha Beckwith to American Council of Learned Societies, December 13, 1930 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

26. Beckwith 1922. Letter from Archer Taylor to Martha Beckwith, November 7, 1924 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

27. Letter from Martha Beckwith to President H. N. MacCracken, May 5, 1931 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

28. At the time Beckwith went to study the Oglala Dakota Sioux, the tribe’s traditions had already garnered scholarly attention. See Walker 1905, 1917; Boas 1925b; Meeker 1901; Bushotter 1888; Densmore 1918; Dorsey 1893, 1889; Wissler 1907. For Boas’s ideas that informed Beckwith’s collection of Native-American narrative, see Boas, “Mythology and Folk-Tales of the North American Indians” (1914), and “Stylistic Aspects of Primitive Literature” (1925).

29. For other collections of the Mandan-Hidatsa used by Beckwith, see Matthews 1877; Lowie 1913; and Will 1912. Although Beckwith’s collections among Native Americans are not usually cited as praiseworthy among her works, in a review of Native American collections, William N. Fenton in 1947 offered Beckwith as among the few “notable exceptions” who had applied a rigorous method of analysis and taken stories directly from the native language. He noted that “Beckwith makes a pretty good case of taking materials in Indian English, allowing for lapses of Indian memory and not retouching the material to enhance its attractiveness.” See his “Iroquois Indian Folklore” (1947), particularly 388–94.

30. Alumni Activity Form, February 1932 (Archives, Mt. Holyoke College Library).

31. Letter from Martha Beckwith to President MacCracken, February 14, 1938 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

32. Letter from Martha Beckwith to President MacCracken, May 21, 1932 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

33. Letter to Theresa (no surname given), March 30, 1950; Mary Elspeth Fleming, “I Remember” (Archives, Mt. Holyoke College Library).


35. Letter from Martha Beckwith to Dr. MacCracken, December 29, 1949 (Special Collections, Vassar College Library).

CHAPTER 6. ALFRED SHOEMAKER AND THE DISCOVERY OF AMERICAN FOLKLIFE

1. The emphasis on British American folklore and balladry during the 1940s is evident in a guide to American folklore scholarship written by Levette Davidson (1951). In a chapter entitled “American Folklore Specialists, 1950” Davidson puts a heading “Other Non-English Folklore” last and lists Alfred Shoemaker, Wayland Hand, Roman Jakobson, Jonas Balys, R. D. Jameson, Charles Speroni, and Ruth Rubin (see Davidson 1951, 125).

2. The first chair of folklore in the United States was Martha Warren Beckwith, who held the post of research professor on the Folk-Lore Foundation at Vassar College beginning in 1920. She also had a Pennsylvania-German connection as an honorary vice president of the Pennsylvania-German Folklore Society. (See the chapter on Beckwith elsewhere in this volume and Luomala 1962; Bronner 1992e; Glazier 1996.) Stith Thompson claimed to be the first American professor of English and folklore in 1939 (Thompson 1996, 160). Shoemaker’s title of assistant professor of American folklore was the first post to use “American folklore,” as far as searches have revealed thus far.

3. Interview with Martha Best, July 8, 1991.


8. The “Seminars on American Culture” run by the New York State Historical Association at Cooperstown, New York, beginning in 1948 offered intensive summer seminars for two weeks that qualified for credit through two State Teachers’ Colleges (later State University of New York) and Colgate University. Under the direction of Louis C. Jones, the courses included American Folklore, American Folk Art, and Folklore Collecting (see Dorson 1950a, 346; Davidson 1951, 111). Shoemaker’s course, however, appears to be the first regular college offering in American folk art (cf. Boggs 1940; Dorson 1950b).


10. Interview, June 20, 1991.

11. According to a letter dated June 22, 1970, from the dean’s office at Franklin and Marshall to Ronald Baker, Shoemaker “retired” from the department, although he stayed on with the college’s Pennsylvania Dutch Folklore Center. With Shoemaker’s retirement, the department was discontinued and a folklore teaching line was not transferred elsewhere.


15. William Woys Weaver in “The Pennsylvania German House: European Antecedents and New World Forms” (1986) credits Shoemaker with introducing the “Continental type house” as a folk form (see Shoemaker 1954, 12). Shoemaker promoted the form as evidence of the profound German influence on American culture through Pennsylvania-German adaptation; for later statements on the form, see Bucher 1962 and Glassie 1968.

Shoemaker is still invoked when searches for folk cultural antecedents occur. Commenting, for example, on the Winter 1980–1981 issue of Pennsylvania Folklife, editor William Parsons wrote: “The articles by Ensminger, Jordan and Stevens, which constitute the bulk of this WINTER issue of PENNSYLVANIA FOLKLIFE, stand, in the opinion of the
Editor, in the best of the tradition established by Professor Alfred L. Shoemaker. His specialty articles on Pennsylvania Barns, both the Forebay Barn types and Bottom Barns, elicited further items by an entire group of authoritative contributors (94).

16. As part of the society's recovery, Shoemaker's detractors permanently severed his ties with the society. While the Pennsylvania Folklife Society was reorganized and prospered under new direction, many workers for Shoemaker at Kutztown remained loyal to him. Many quit working for the new festival, complaining of increased pandering of Pennsylvania Dutch stereotypes (which Shoemaker abhored) and the festival's commercial departure from Shoemaker's scholarly premises. One result of the split was the founding in 1965 of the Pennsylvania Dutch Folk Culture Society in Lenhartsville, Pennsylvania. Smaller than the Pennsylvania Folklife Society, it continues to maintain archives, library, outdoor museum, public activities, and publications under the direction of Florence Baver, a Shoemaker associate. One bridge between Shoemaker's heyday and the period that followed was Don Yoder's work for the Pennsylvania Folklife Society. Yoder helped the Folk Culture Society in its early years as well as editing Pennsylvania Folklife for the reorganized Pennsylvania Folklife Society.

17. According to Martha Best, a friend of Shoemaker since they attended high school together, attempts at locating him through the Red Cross, Salvation Army, and Social Security Administration have all been futile. Family members could not help. Shoemaker was unmarried and his sisters lost touch with him. The last time Best saw Shoemaker was in 1967 when he came to Pennsylvania from New York to attend her mother's funeral. According to Best, he was in good spirits and talked, probably quixotically, of planning another folklife project or center out of New York (interview with Martha Best, July 8, 1991). He checked on the progress of the Pennsylvania Dutch Folk Culture Society in Lenhartsville during the late 1960s, but never returned to any posts after 1963 (interview with Florence Baver, July 9, 1991). According to recollections I gathered, Shoemaker was last heard from during the late 1970s. Herbert Miller, who worked for Shoemaker at Kutztown, remembers Shoemaker visiting at Miller's home near Lenhartsville (interview, July 9, 1991).

The mystery of Shoemaker's whereabouts, the saga of his dramatic rise and fall, the reputation of an enigmatic man with ideas well ahead of his time, inspired legend, as narrative accounts of "sightings" and anecdotes mentioned in my essay indicate.

18. Statistical evidence for the changes in folklore offerings within academe is provided by Ronald Baker's surveys published in 1971, 1978, and 1986. Whereas Baker's early survey showed that Anglo-American ballad and folk song (thirty-three percent) still dominated folklore offerings, it also showed the rise of the introductory folklore course (fifty-five percent) since the 1940 and 1950 survey by Boggs and Dorson, respectively. By 1986, ballad and folk song dramatically dropped to seven percent, while American folklore with twenty-six percent moved behind introductory folklore courses. In keeping with Shoemaker's interests, it is noteworthy that after American folklore the categories of highest frequency are "regional American folklore" and "ethnic American folklore." By 1986 a new category championed by Shoemaker among folklore offerings appeared of "material culture," accounting for seven percent of all offerings (equal to percentages for balladry and mythology courses).

As Shoemaker anticipated, folklore courses between 1971 and 1986 increasingly took up ethnological methods. In 1971, seventy percent of folklore courses were taught in English with only nine percent in anthropology and eight percent in a combination of English and anthropology. By 1986, the percentage for English dropped to fifty-eight and rose for anthropology to thirty-two. Most dramatic was the rise in American studies from almost nothing to thirteen percent in 1986. Shoemaker moved from foreign language study to folklore and American studies; overall, folklore courses in foreign languages dropped from five
to 1.5 percent. Meanwhile, courses carrying folklore prefixes rose from two to six percent of all offerings.

Shoemaker differed from these trends at least in the kind of institution for which he worked. Baker's surveys show that folklore courses increasingly were offered by public universities (forty-six percent of the publics offer folklore as opposed to thirty-three percent of the privates; F&M is a small private college) and at large institutions (eighty percent of institutions with over twenty thousand students have folklore courses; thirty-five percent of schools with one to five thousand students have folklore courses). For example, today in central Pennsylvania around Franklin and Marshall, Penn State University campuses at University Park and Harrisburg carry the lion's share of folklore courses in the region.

By 1986 the B.A. with a major, minor, or concentration in folklore was available from about sixty colleges, up from less than ten in 1971, and graduate curricula also rose in number. Shoemaker argued for folklore as a basic collegiate offering, one that explored cultural values basic to students' understanding of their lives and those around them. Appropriately, the total amount of folklore courses has risen from 60 around the time that Shoemaker taught (about ten percent of the total was taught by Shoemaker alone!) at Franklin and Marshall (see Dorson 1950b) to 170 in 1971 (Baker 1971) to 509 in 1986 (Baker 1986a).

19. Much of this discourse was carried on over the Internet. The text of the bill appeared on the Folklore discussion list and other traditional culture lists on May 21, 1996, and the Committee on House Oversight approved the bill on May 23. Alan Jabbour circulated a statement of support for H.R. 3491 on May 24 and the Librarian of Congress's statement appeared on May 28. Numerous criticisms of the measure and the center's response appeared through June, including strong statements from Joe Wilson of the National Council for the Traditional Arts and Steve Goldfield of the University of California at Berkeley. On June 20, 1996, a statement from the president of the American Folklife Center, the chair of the American Folklife Center board of trustees, and director of the National Council for the Traditional Arts addressed to “Folk Arts Advocates” urged a letter-writing campaign in opposition to the repeal to senators and representatives. On June 26, Representative David Obey (Democrat-Wisconsin) introduced his amendment to transfer the American Folklife Center to the Smithsonian, and it was reported over the Internet to many lists through the National Coordinating Committee for the Promotion of History (NCC) Washington Update (vol. 2, no. 21 June 27, 1996). The final outcome of the president signing a bill for reauthorization of the center in the Library Congress for 1997–1998 was reported in the Folklife Center News for 1996 (vol. 18, nos. 3–4).

CHAPTER 7. HENRY W. SHOEMAKER AND THE FABLE OF PUBLIC FOLKLORE

3. Ibid.
7. "The Value of Folklore and Witchcraft Beliefs in Pennsylvania History" (Typescript, Lycoming County Historical Society).
17. Minutes of Pennsylvania Folklore Society meeting, 1951 (Lycoming County Historical Society).

Chapter 8. Richard Dorson and the Great Debates

1. Letter from Daniel Boorstin to Richard Dorson, February 4, 1959; Richard Dorson to Daniel Boorstin, August 15, 1958 (Dorson Mss., Lilly Library, Indiana University). Boorstin was two years older than Dorson, and graduated from Harvard in 1934. While Dorson was at Michigan State University and Indiana University, Boorstin was in the history department at the University of Chicago.
Following Tradition

2. Letter from Richard M. Dorson to Daniel Boorstin, April 10, 1959 (Dorson Mss., Lilly Library, Indiana University).


4. Dorson was clearly uncomfortable with what little Jewish identity he experienced in his childhood. Proud of his participation in elite American institutions such as Exeter and Harvard, he nonetheless mentioned to me anti-Semitism he faced at Exeter. I thought about his comment when I noticed that in his reading of the Brothers Grimm he singled out derision of Jews and the middle class in their fairy-tale corpus as evidence of problems of creating a liberal, inclusive nationalism (Dorson 1966a, xviii–xix). Although Dorson occasionally attended a meeting of the Jewish section of the American Folklore Society, he never considered an extended study of Jewish culture apart from American culture. Dorson's scholarship on Jewish folklore consisted of two essays on Jewish-American dialect humor. His interpretation stressed the force of assimilation in the American scene and the penetration of Jewish lore ultimately into the American tradition: "These contemporary, urban, dialect folktales about Jewish acculturation form a fresh and lively addition to the varied strands of American humorous lore" (Dorson 1960a, 117; see also Dorson 1960b). He stressed similar patterns in the stories he collected to non-Jewish lore to point out their Americanness as a response of children of American immigrants and an example of living lore among modern, urban educated folk. He avoided any reference to his ethnicity in these essays, and in his many reminiscences late in his life, he hardly referred to any Jewish identity. He made one passing reference to himself as a mensch, a Yiddish word for a decent human being (Dorson 1971b, 41). In unpublished transcripts of fieldwork in multiethnic Gary, Indiana, an informant responding to questions about ethnicity asked Dorson about his. After a long pause, his answer was "I was originally Jewish," referring therefore to his ethnicity as a past identity (for his comments on the persistent ethnic identity of Gary, Indiana, see Dorson 1981, 109–64).

5. Letter from Richard M. Dorson to Mr. Brooks, February 24, 1938 (Dorson Mss., Lilly Library, Indiana University).


7. For commentaries on the Bunyan issue during the 1940s and 1950s, see Haney 1942, Charters 1944, Gartenberg 1950, Loehr 1951, Hoffman 1952, Dorson 1956b. A recent summary of the rage for Bunyan is Walls 1996.

8. Dorson announced tennis as a basic influence on his life alongside his attendance at Phillips Exeter and Harvard in his essay "History of the Elite and History of the Folk" published in Folklore: Selected Essays (1972, 249, 256–57). Another example of his referencing of tennis in scholarship was his challenge to Lauri Honko, prominent in Finnish folkloristics, to a tennis match when he visited Indiana University in 1978. Dorson was victorious and he announced to his students that the match pitted two great powers in folklore studies—the old represented by Finland and the new signified by the United States—with the upstart Americans ultimately triumphing. Alan Dundes recalled Dorson's fighting spirit in recounting that he made much of his appointment to distinguished professor, a notable achievement for an underdog folklorist Dorson thought, on the same day he scored
an upset to enter the finals of a local tennis tournament (Dundes 1982, xv). Brunvand recalls the connection of Dorson's sports drive to his academic work this way: "Considering Dick Dorson's lifestyle—lived with great enthusiasm—it was highly likely that it would end either during scholarly labors or on the tennis court. Fittingly, then, while playing tennis, on June 28, 1981, Richard M. Dorson collapsed and went into a coma from which he never recovered" (Brunvand 1982, 352).


10. Letter from Richard Dorson to Ben Botkin, 21 January 1940 (Botkin Mss., Special Collections, University of Nebraska).

11. Dorson later acknowledged that another folklorist, Stanley Edgar Hyman, had also criticized at length Botkin's treasuries around the same time (Dorson 1971a, 8; see Hyman 1948).

12. Dorson's last review of Botkin's books was of *A Treasury of Mississippi River Folklore* in *Minnesota History* (1956). Dorson claimed that his "quarrel is less with Botkin than with folklorists who praise his patchworks as models of research" (Dorson 1971a, 27). Dorson contributed in 1966 to a volume of essays honoring Ben Botkin (see Dorson 1966b and Jackson 1966). If the two men seemed to have made a truce during the 1960s, supporters of Botkin nonetheless kept up criticism of Dorson's tactics and ideas. See Dorson 1971a, 12–13; Halpert 1957; Jones 1959; Jackson 1984a, 1986; and Stekert 1987.

13. The treasury approach to presenting American folklore was still evident in commercial publishing through the 1980s and 1990s, although no single prominent figure carries the association with the style that Botkin had in the 1950s (see Battle 1989; Cohn 1993).

14. Fifteen years later Dorson invoked the authority and prestige of the *Wall Street Journal* in boasting of the "folklore boom" during the bicentennial years. He credited the newspaper with recognizing folklore-folklife and tennis (another Dorson obsession) as "hot" growth industries (Dorson 1978d).


16. Parrington's biography carries much of the outline of New Class heroism: charting intellectual territory alone and gaining fame on the basis of the merit of his argument. A stranger from the hinterland to the exclusive world of Harvard, he was "exhilarated by the freer intellectual atmosphere of the East, yet naive and hence vulnerable there to its cosmopolitanism and its social elitism," so Gene Wise has pointed out. In fact, Wise in his survey of American studies claims that from 1927 to 1965, the American studies project was largely inspired by Parrington. He was "a single mind grappling with materials of American experience, and driven by concentrated fury to create order from them" (Wise 1979, 298–301). Dorson saw a line from Parrington to his comrade-in-arms Daniel Boorstin; he wrote Boorstin before publication of *The Americans*: "I prophesy you will dethrone Parrington, and shave Beard to a whisker" (August 18, 1958; Dorson Mss., Lilly Library, Indiana University).

Chapter 9. Displaying American Tradition in Folk Arts

1. For the connection of simultaneity with a multicultural view of modernity born in a twentieth-century era of communication, see Lowe 1982; Bronner 1986a, 94–129.

2. This information comes from the Abby Aldrich Rockefeller Personal Papers, Rockefeller University Archives. See "Biographical Sketch," at the website for the Papers (http://www.rockefeller.edu/archive.ctr/aar_biog.html ).
3. For elaboration on Boas's ideas of perfecting form in folk art, see Jones 1987, 119–31; Herskovits 1953, especially chap. four, "Man, The Creator"; Beckwith 1929, especially chapter XIII, "Folk Art"; Beckwith 1931a. Not insignificant to Boas's contributions to cultural relativity and related ideas of "creativity" are the ways that his views, influenced by his Jewish roots, countered German stereotypes of Jewish and immigrant folk creativity as a sign of disease (see Gilman 1991; Stocking 1982, 149–50).

4. The United States Section of the International Commission under the leadership of Elizabeth Burchenal unsuccessfully tried during the 1930s to establish "a central authority for the whole field of folk arts of the United States." Among its "expert consultants" were representatives of conflicting views including Holger Cahill and Edith Halpert from the art world and Franz Boas and Martha Beckwith taking an ethnological perspective.

5. The exhibition An Image of Peace: The Penn Treaty Collection of Mr. and Mrs. Meyer P. Potamkin was mounted at the State Museum of Pennsylvania from April 14 to October 20, 1996. See Cullen 1996 and Pennsylvania Historical and Museum Commission 1996.

6. For tributes to collectors, see National Gallery of Art 1987; Hartigan 1990. For examples of thematic folk art books, heavily image-laden and short on text, see Barber 1993; Lipman, Warren, and Bishop 1986; Jones 1975; Bishop 1977.

7. For a critique of the art world's handling of black folk art, see Metcalf 1983.

BIBLIOGRAPHIC ESSAY

1. For retrospective essays on Richard Dorson's roles as Americanist and folklorist, see Georges 1989a, and particularly the contributions of Jay Mechling (1989d), "Richard M. Dorson and the Emergence of the New Class in American Folk Studies" (11–26); Roger D. Abrahams (1989), "Representative Man: Richard Dorson, Americanist" (27–34); William A. Wilson (1989), "Richard M. Dorson as Romantic-Nationalist" (35–42); Stephen Stern (1989), "Dorson’s Use and Adaptation of Prevailing Historical Models of American Folklore" (43–50). Historical background for the relationship of folklore to American studies can be found in Dorson's memoirs of his experience in the American civilization program at Harvard in The Birth of American Studies (Bloomington: Indiana University Publications, 1976). For Dorson's last survey of folklore studies before his death in 1981, see his essay "The State of Folkloristics from an American Perspective" (1982).

2. The book also included essays that should be known by American studies professionals: "Folklore in Relation to American Studies" (78–93), "The Question of Folklore in a New Nation" (94–107), and "Folklore Research Opportunities in American Cultural History" (108–28). For precedents for Dorson's call in "A Theory for American Folklore," see Jordan 1946, 1953; McDowell 1948b; and L. Jones 1956.

3. For criticisms of and alternatives to the American folklore versus folklore in America debate, see Bronner and Stern 1980; Bronner 1982; and L. Jones 1982.

4. Some writings that discuss the rise of ethnographic approaches among folklorists from the 1970s to the 1990s are: Bauman and Sherzer 1974; Toelken 1979; Dorson 1982b; Abrahams 1983; Limon and Young 1986; Bronner 1988b; Bauman 1989; Schoemaker 1990.

5. It could be argued that judging from the use of keywords to describe American life in American studies, during the 1970s the anthropological "culture" replaced the humanistic "civilization." The increasing use of folkloristic terms such as "tradition," "process," "memory," "narrative," and "folkways" in American studies suggests a more behavioral understanding of American experiences. See Jones 1982, Bronner 1982, 1986, 1988; Perin 1988; Bellah et al. 1985; and Varenne 1986. Indeed, the argument in folklore studies over Dorson's "Theory for American Folklore" during the 1950s and 1960s and the consequent
movement toward new questions of process and emergence anticipates the raging debate today in American studies over whether America is a unified or multicultural country. In this regard, Alice Kessler-Harris's presidential address to the American Studies Association of 1991, published in *American Quarterly*, on the multicultural debate called for a "proces­sual notion of America" (Kessler-Harris 1992).

It is also worth pointing out that the relationship between the behavioral study of folk­lore and American studies has been institutionalized at schools such as Indiana University (Bloomington, Indiana), which allows for a joint Ph.D. degree in folklore and American studies. George Washington University offers a folklife program within the American studies Ph.D. Other American studies Ph.D.-granting institutions such as the University of Pennsylvania, University of New Mexico, Bowling Green State University, and Michigan State University have strong folkloristic components, and thus contribute to the influence of folkloristic keywords in American studies scholarship.

6. The use of contextualism in folklore and folklife research may indeed well inform American studies. Robert F. Berghofer, Jr., states that "if the disparate interests that com­prise American studies are united about anything, it is the necessity of contextual knowl­edge" (1989, 589). Two such examples of the possibilities of applying folkloristic ideas of context and tradition in American studies are Glassie 1978 and Mechling 1979; see also the seminal statements of Ben-Amos 1972, 1977, and 1984.