Finding Voice
Berman, Kim Shelley

Published by University of Michigan Press


For additional information about this book
https://muse.jhu.edu/book/57361
Notes

Introduction


Chapter 1

12. While Caroline Wang’s website (www.photovoice.com) is no longer available, more information on the history, theory, and applications of PhotoVoice can be found at http://www.photovoice worldwide.com/what_is_photovoice.htm
18. These points are adapted from “Summary of The Moral Imagination: The Art and Soul of Building Peace” (Lederach 2005), by Michelle Maiese, available at http://www.beyondintractability.org/bksum/lederach-imagination
20. Through her International Centre of Art for Social Change (ICASC), Judith Marcuse connects arts-based social change organizations and leading practitioners in the field in Canada and abroad, creating a global hub for collaboration, research, teaching, and knowledge exchange. Her center and its website provide a resource and network for this fast-evolving field. She presents a compelling case for the arts as effective vehicles for communities to explore and solve complex problems. Marcuse commissioned a valuable study by Yael Harlap (2006) on understanding the domain of arts and social change. In-depth interviews were conducted with individuals from 46 Canadian, North American, and international arts organizations. This study has been updated by State of the Art: A Report on Art for Social Change (ASC) in Canada, ICASC, April 2016, available at https://www.icasc.ca/post/state-art-report-art-social-change-asc-canada
21. “Breathing Life into the Ashes: Resilience, Arts, and Social Transformation,” Peter Wall Institute of Advanced Studies (PWIAS) Inaugural Roundtable, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada, 2012, convened by Professor Michelle LeBaron (UBC Law) and Dr. Cynthia Cohen (Brandeis University International Center for Ethics, Justice, and Public Life).
22. LeBaron 2012.
23. In Bridging Troubled Waters (2002) and Bridging Cultural Conflict (2003), Michelle LeBaron writes about intuitive sensing and connected ways of knowing.

Chapter 2

1. Nelson Mandela was sentenced to life imprisonment by the Apartheid government in 1964 and spent 18 of his 27 years on Robben Island.
2. Mbeki turned his back on scientific consensus that AIDS was caused by a viral infection that could be fought by sophisticated medical drugs. The AIDS policy adopted by the government of his day was believed to result in over 330,000 deaths that could have been prevented (according to Harvard researchers quoted in the Guardian in 2008: “Mbeki Aids Denial Caused 300,000 Deaths,” https://www.theguardian.com/world/2008/nov/26/aids-south-africa).
3. Two states of emergency imposed in the 1980s as a result of the mounting opposition to the South African Apartheid state resulted in violent repression, including mass arrests and detention without trial.

4. I left South Africa in 1983 and lived in Boston for seven years, volunteering for an African National Congress development organization in exile and working as a printing assistant while studying for my master’s degree at Tufts University and the School of the Museum of Fine Arts in Boston.

5. The history of South African community art centers has been extensively documented (Hobbs and Rankin 2003; Sack 1988; Hagg 2004; van Robbroeck 2004; Minty 2004; Gaylard 2004), in publications that collectively chart the indispensable role that centers like Polly Street (established in 1949) and Rorke’s Drift Arts and Craft Centre (founded in 1962) played in the development of contemporary black South African art. Arguably, it was the center at Rorke’s Drift that determined the subsequent development of a number of other art centers, including APS, as many of the founding members of APS had graduated from that center in the 1980s.

6. Founded in 1984, Funda is one of the oldest independent training institutions in the visual arts in South Africa, established in response to the inaccessibility of specialized training in the visual arts for black South Africans under apartheid.

7. The Katlehong Art Centre provided art facilities to artists living in East Rand townships of Johannesburg from the mid-1970s, while the Johannesburg Art Foundation, founded in 1982 by the late humanitarian and painter Bill Ainslie, provided an open, multiracial art school in Johannesburg.

8. Graduates who taught in various community art centers include Mbon- geni Buthelezi, Ezekiel Budeli and Simon Mthimkhulu (Funda), Percy Madia (Johannesburg Art Gallery), the late Osiah Masekameng (FUBA), Obed Mbele (Katlehong), Brenda Ramadia (Curriculum Development Project), Chris Molefe (Mofolo Art Centre), and others.

9. Hayley Berman, my sister who runs Lefika La Phodiso Art Therapy Centre in Johannesburg, brought her team to work with us.

10. All these dreams became reality, including the minibus that we acquired in 2015 through a government grant for a mobile print unit.

11. The APS management at the time consisted of a board of directors chaired by Charles Nkosi (head of Funda), other founding members, and some personal and professional friends and colleagues. The board subsequently evolved into a more formally constituted team after the fire.


14. Interview by Darnisa Armante, intern from Brandeis University assisting with data collection, August 2004 (available in Kim Berman’s personal archive housed in the Visual Art Department at UJ).


19. Men as Partners, a subsidiary of the United Nations agency Engen-
der Health, established itself as a Johannesburg-based organization dedicated to changing patriarchal culture and the harm it causes. APS collaborated with this organization for five years until it merged activities with Sonke Gender Justice Network, an NGO that addresses the HIV and AIDS epidemic from a gender-focused perspective. The partnership agreement with Engender Health / Men as Partners allowed for an exchange of skills without financial payment. In exchange for the training received from the facilitators, the Men as Partners organization acquired visual aids useful in their ongoing advocacy work.

The APS participants apply their skills and talents to envision a society free of prejudice, one that fosters equality between men and women. They create drawings and images that reverse stereotypes—such as men carrying babies on their backs, men hanging and ironing washing, and men nursing the sick. These murals can be seen in public spaces in and around Johannesburg (e.g., outside Baragwanath Hospital in Soweto). In addition, some of the narrative pictures are painted on mobile screens and panels used for teaching aids, as well as reproduced on the brochures and website images of Men as Partners.

20. 16 Days of Activism is a worldwide campaign to generate an increased awareness on the negative impact of violence and abuse. It takes place from 25 November to 10 December (International Human Rights Day).

21. Mandela's birthday, 18 July, is observed as an annual international day, declared by the United Nations in 2009. Inspired by Nelson Mandela's call, on his 90th birthday, for all to make a better world, the observation promotes an action of 67 minutes (one minute for each year of Mandela's public service) in the service for good.


25. Sam Nhlengethwa, an established South African artist represented by the Goodman Gallery, is a role model to many emerging black artists.

26. After the fire, in 2004, Brandeis University intern Darnisa Amante conducted an interview with Thabang in which he describes, in his own words, the sense of loss that he felt at the time. This interview and 30 others by Brandeis University interns are available in the Kim Berman personal archive housed in the Visual Art Department at UJ.


28. Nathan 2009. “Habits of mind” is a unifying framework. The term was first coined by John Dewey (1859–1952) in the early 20th century, and the concept was subsequently popularized in progressive American schools.


30. This is Margaret Mead’s most cited quotation in varied ways. According to her biographer, when and where she said those words is unknown (Bowman-Kruhm 2003: 142).

34. According to the national statistics service of South Africa, Statistics South Africa, rape victims in the country were more likely to be young women aged between 16 and 25 (http://www.statssa.gov.za/).
36. The Names Project was established in 1987 and displayed the AIDS Memorial Quilt on the National Mall in Washington. The quilt had 40,000 panels containing 70,000 names memorializing people who died from AIDS. The quilt is exhibited annually on World AIDS Day (December 1) and remains a poignant memorial and symbol around the world. This annual event inspired the model adopted by Paper Prayers (see http://AIDSquilt.org).
38. South African resistance art, or protest art, spans the period of the liberation struggle from the 1960s to the 1990s and refers to works by artists resisting the repressive Apartheid government.
39. For some works whose authors address the issue of arts and AIDS in South Africa, see Allara and Martin 2003; Schmahmann 2007; Arnold and Schmahmann 2005.
40. See, e.g., http://www.avert.org/hiv-AIDS-south-africa.htm
41. Avert—the HIV and AIDS Information and Resources website—documents 316,559 HIV- and AIDS-related deaths in South Africa in 1997 and 607,184 in 2006. Increasing mortality rates were recorded in young adults, and almost one in three women between the ages of 25 and 29 and one-quarter of men between the ages of 30 and 34 were living with HIV. These statistics reflect the period of Thabo Mbeki’s AIDS policies (1999–2008) that did not support access to antiretroviral treatments.
42. DACST separated into two distinct ministries in 2001: the Department of Science and Technology (DST) and the Department of Arts and Culture (DAC). Steven Sack instigated this project in his capacity as curator at JAG and then was appointed as a director in the DACST in 1998.
43. See the APS website (http://www.artistproofstudio.co.za/ikageng).
44. Lorde 1984: 38.
45. Four of the original five groups that were set up (in Winterveld, Tandanani, Bosele, and Kopenang) were involved in their subsequent establishment as Phumani Paper groups, and some were still functional 15 years after their establishment. This is discussed in chapter 3.
46. During the apartheid era, many victims of forced removals were dumped in Winterveld. Poverty remains an ongoing problem in this area, where initiating development projects has been complex. There is no history of cooperative working and no cohesion in the community, as people are from a variety of ethnic origins. The Sisters of Mercy set up an Adult Education Center in the late 1980s. The former Technikon Witwatersrand initiated an outreach project with
the Sisters of Mercy in 1996, through an existing contact, Sister Sheila Flynn, who was a fourth-year fine arts student at the time. Teacher training and art and craft workshops for adult learners were initiated. A grant was then awarded from Metropolitan Life to set up a papermaking project to create income opportunities for 15 women in the center. Paper Prayers used the opportunity to work with the Mapula embroidery group, based in the same region, to participate in the Paper Prayers campaign.

47. Carol Hofmeyr was the coordinator of the Paper Prayers campaign in 1998–99; see the Keiskamma Trust website (http://www.keiskamma.org).
48. Ikageng is an outreach project of APS. Visit http://www.artistproofstudio.co.za/ikageng for more information.
49. This is a common practice of migrant workers from the villages in South Africa that results from past apartheid policies.
50. Interview with an anonymous stakeholder, 2008. This stakeholder is one of the art teachers who participated in a Paper Prayers workshop. All stakeholder questionnaires are filed in the Cultural Action for Change section, Kim Berman personal archive housed in in the Visual Art Department at UJ.
51. The Siyazama Project, “striving to make a positive difference,” is a collaborative intervention using communication and design education to transfer HIV and AIDS awareness to rural women through workshops (see http://www.siyazama.maproject.dut.ac.za).
54. See https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/10894677
56. Cameron, an internationally respected human rights lawyer and judge who was actively involved in AIDS policy issues in the 1990s, was diagnosed as HIV positive in 1986. It took him almost 12 years to publicly disclose his status. His courageous account of the agony of living in silence and shame provides a cautionary note to those who glibly claim that it is the responsibility of everyone to test for HIV and disclose their status.
59. Van der Vliet 2004: 68.
60. Senzo Shabangu, third-year APS intern, interview by Shannah Antonopoulo in 2008. Stakeholder interviews are filed in the Reclaiming Lives section, Kim Berman personal archive housed in in the Visual Art Department at UJ.
61. Sasol was the company that was awarding one of the biggest art prizes in South Africa at the time.
62. Reclaiming Lives manifested in a portfolio of 100 etchings by 97 artists in two editions. Printed by Molefe Thwala, Legohlonolo Mashaba, and Motsamai Thabane, the interviews and photographs of the artists were compiled and transcribed, respectively, by UJ students Johannes Nyokong and Kgomotso Maloka. The
binding, design, and layout were by Bronwyn Marshall. The portfolio was printed in 2006 at Artist Proof Studio, on handmade sisal and cotton paper from the Phumani Paper Archive Mill, University of Johannesburg.

63. This popular practice of creating a drumming circle for team building is adapted from a West African tradition, in which players of talking drums sent messages by drumming the recipient’s name followed by the sender’s name and the message.

64. The statistics have changed from 10 percent in 2006 to 80 percent in 2013, since the global response and political commitment to HIV testing and treatment from the government and UNAIDS.

65. Interview of an anonymous artist by Nchabaleng 2006.


67. The texts from the artists’ handmade book are also filed in the Reclaiming Lives section, Kim Berman personal archive housed in in the Visual Art Department at UJ.

68. Sidibé 2015.

69. For Mark Heywood’s full address, see http://podcasts.ox.ac.uk/hiv-and-aids-special-lecture-oxford-aids-research-day-2012. See also Heywood quoted in Cullinan 2013 (http://www.health-e.org.za/2013/12/10/far-end-aids).

70. Another area of danger that Heywood highlights is a violation of human rights in KwaZulu-Natal, where traditional leaders are conducting the campaign for medical male circumcision because it has been sanctioned and ordered by the community’s king, yet there is no notion of proper consent. There are reports that young men and boys are being herded into circumcision camps and that individuals are not given a choice regarding this. He also warns us about dangerous regression in AIDS activism as donors are turning their backs on HIV and funding of activist organizations, “thereby strangling the civil society response.” He calls for citizen mobilization: “If expanded access to ARVs is not accompanied by an improved quality of care, ultimately the object of access, life and dignity, will be defeated” (ibid.).


Chapter 3

1. The MAPPP-SETA final draft document The Arts and Culture Sub-sector Skills Update (2005/2006) provides an overview of the arts and culture sector, and describes it as having “chronic skills shortages” and “low annual turnover” and as characterized by “a growth trap and struggle for survival” (2005: 6, 7), and reports on the scarce skills in the industry. See also Gerard Hagg’s 2004 research report. In a paper entitled “Ends of the Rainbow,” David Bunn (2008: 7) describes the “sorry state of funding affairs.”


3. Complexity concepts that are used throughout the book include nonlinearity, emergence, dynamic systems, adaption, uncertainty, and coevolutionary processes (see Patton 2011: 7).
4. The unemployment rate in South Africa has been estimated as 36 to 42 percent since the year 2000, using the broad definition of some global poverty research (http://www.gprg.org/themes/t2-inc-ineq-poor/unem/unem-pov.htm). However, according to the narrow definition of Statistics South Africa, which applies a job-search test, approximately 22–25 percent of adults in 2014 who wanted work and actively looked for it were unemployed, and the expanded rate is 35 percent and up to 40 percent among black South Africans (http://www.statssa.gov.za/presentation/Stats%20SA%20presentation%20on%20skills%20and%20unemployment_16%20September.pdf).

5. A “shoot to kill” injunction was issued by Deputy Security Minister Susan Shabangu in 2008 in response to police crime statistics of more than 20,000 people who are murdered each year. The term *shoot to kill* has been used to refer to the brutal police massacre, against regulations, of 34 striking Lonmin mine workers at Marikana in 2012.


7. The Technikon Witwatersrand merged with the former conservative Rand Afrikaans University in 2005, as part of the Mbeki government’s transformation efforts to establish broader-based comprehensive and accessible universities.


10. In August 2002, DACST split into two separate ministries, the Department of Science and Technology (DST, under which Phumani Paper was situated) and the Department of Arts and Culture (DAC).

11. Before allocating funds for a large national program, the government required a “pilot project” to demonstrate the viability of poverty alleviation through papermaking.

12. This number was reduced to 15 producer units by January 2008, due to the closure of 5 groups between 2005 and 2009.

13. The findings were reported at a two-day conference held at UJ. Subsequently, the Ford Foundation funded a two-year grant for a targeted intervention for HIV/AIDS support and product development from 2006 to 2008. A further extensive impact assessment was completed in May 2008, for the AIDS Action program funded by the Ford Foundation. This multiyear PAR program (Cultural Action for Change) is discussed in detail in chapter 5.

14. MAPPP-SETA (the Media Advertising Print and Paper Sectorial Education and Training Authority) administered and accredited the arts and culture learnerships. It was split in 2011, and the arts and crafts subsector was moved to the Culture, Sports, Tourism, and Hospitality Sector Education and Training Authority (CsthSETA).

15. The NQF is the South African National Qualification Framework. NQF2 is equivalent to the 10th-grade level and could be offered to members without matriculation, while NQF4 designates further education and training equivalent to a trade certificate at the 12th-grade level.


17. The arts minister at the time, Pallo Jordan, announced in his budget speech
for 2006–7, on 2 June 2006, “Millions of rands are to be allocated for job creation in arts and culture sectors such as visual arts (R4-million) [and] crafts (R10-million). However, a total of R9-million will be invested in creating jobs in archival paper-making” (van Bosch 2006: 2).


19. Flower Valley Trust set up a papermaking project on an indigenous flower farm in 2001. Working for Water had an invasive vegetation clearing program and contracted Phumani Paper to assist the group in making paper from the invasive Port Jackson willow plant.

20. The group’s numbers dropped to nine members in 2006.

21. The Siyazama papermaking project in Khayelitsha comprised eight disabled members who received a monthly government grant and was therefore more sustainable.


24. Helmore and Singh 2001: 89.


30. Managed by Nkosinathi Ndladla and Dumisani Dlamini, the mill produces specialist archival production papers for printmaking and offers unique collaboration opportunities to artists in paper-based artworks.

31. The African Renaissance project, established by former president Thabo Mbeki, formed a partnership with the South African National Archives to train Malians in the painstaking art of restoring old manuscripts, with the vision that South African archival paper could be used. When Zuma took office, the project was dumped.


33. DAC website: http://www.dac.gov.za/speeches/minister/Speech2June06.htm

34. A number of officials were suspended when some 25 million rand went missing from the coffers of the DAC during the following year.

35. The new DAC Investing in Culture and Heritage Division had a mandate to promote heritage preservation and conservation projects, and archival paper-making was a good fit.


37. The DAC stated on its website, “The projects will be located in all nine provinces with an even geographical spread across the municipal districts in each province” (http://www.dac.gov.za/projects/investing_culture.htm).


41. Hammond 1996–98. The concept of appreciative inquiry was developed by
David Cooperrider and Suresh Srivastva in the 1980s. The approach is based on the premises that “organizations change in the direction in which they inquire” and that inquiry “enhances a system’s capacity for collaboration and change” (http://www.new-paradigm.co.uk/Appreciative.htm).

44. Quoted in du Toit 2007.
45. The series of interviews exploring aspects of resilience and leadership among the women of Phumani Paper groups was conducted as a joint project of the University of Michigan and the University of Johannesburg in July 2008. It has since been developed into a book, Women on Purpose: The Resilience and Creativity of the Founding Women of Phumani Paper (Berman et al. 2012).

46. The documentary film A Ripple in the Water: Healing through Art (2007), directed by Eileen Foti and Patty Piroh and narrated by Charlene Hunter Gault, was dedicated to the Amogalang group because of the inspiration its members had on the US film crew (see http://www.rippleinthewater.com/about/index.html).
47. The grant was awarded by Eileen Foti, the director of the documentary film A Ripple in the Water.

49. Twenty-six of the founding women of Phumani Paper share their stories of determination and resilience in Women on Purpose.
51. LeBaron and Cohen 2013.

Chapter 4

1. Harry Boyte talks about civic agency, which adds a collective dimension that is linked to the well-being of a place and the civic life of a community. According to Boyte, civic agency efforts develop pedagogies and practices that are about empowerment of young people as an end in itself (Boyte 2013: 4–8).

2. South Africa’s Centre for Higher Education Transformation revealed in a 2009 publication that 2.7 million local young people aged 18 to 24 were not in employment, education, or training in 2007. By 2011, this figure had grown to 3.2 million (about 40 percent of the cohort), more than three times the number of young people in South African public and private universities (about 950,000 students). The numbers of unemployed youth not in education or training continue to grow, and there is nothing available to address the present problem, according to John Butler Adams (http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/sajs.2013/a0021).
3. At the time of this chapter’s writing, the battles with students in some universities threatened to close down the completion of the academic program for 2016.

4. Imagining America (IA) is a presidents’ consortium of 70 colleges and universities, based at the University of Michigan. Its mission is to strengthen the public role and democratic purposes of the humanities, arts, and design. IA supports publicly engaged academic and creative work in the cultural disciplines. It works to advance the structural changes in higher education that such work requires. IA’s major task is to constitute public scholarship as an important and legitimate enterprise.

5. Boyte coordinated a coalition of several hundred colleges and universities, called the American Commonwealth Partnership, with the aim of strengthening higher education as a public good.

6. Visiting papermaking collaborators over the period of approximately 18 years included Robbin Silverberg (Dobbin Mill), Eileen Foti, Gail Deery, Anne McKeown (Rutgers University), Susan Gosin (Dieu Donné), and Michelle Samour (Boston School of the Museum of Fine Arts).

7. The self-taught engineer and designer was Antonio Moreno. The patent was registered and awarded.

8. Durant Sihlali died in 2006, and the UJ Papermaking Research and Development Unit purchased his papermaking equipment to prevent it from being sold for scrap metal.

9. The intended proposal for 10,000 dolls was not realized because of unrealistic time frames and an excessively rainy season that slowed the drying time.

10. The case study of David Tshabalala is written up in K. Berman 2008.

11. This case study is written up in Berman and Allen 2012.

12. The Mutale municipality, in the Vhembe district of Limpopo Province, has a total population of about 100,000 people and comprises 13 wards. HaMakuya is a small area in the Mutale municipality, comprising less than 6,000 people. See http://www.mutale.gov.za

13. The trust was originally established in 2007, with the support of Dr. David Bunn (former head of Wits School for the Arts) and Dr. Lara Allen, as a research facility for Wits University, through a grant from the National Lottery Distribution Fund.

14. In their article “Democratic Renovations and Affective Political Imaginaries,” Rike Sitas and Edgar Pieterse offer additional examples of how affective practices and processes in public space create platforms for “democratic enrolment” (Sitas and Pieterse 2013: 331).

15. About 7 or 8 out of 10 fourth-year students chose the elective community field trip to HaMakuya over the four years of the program, while other students chose an art industry elective, such as gallery administration.

Chapter 5

9. References to statistics can be found on the websites of the AIDS Law Project (http://www.aidslawproject.org) and the Treatment Action Campaign (http://www.tac.org.za). These statistics have been significantly reduced since 2011, when a subsequent minister of health, Aaron Motsoaledi, facilitated wide access to testing and antiretroviral treatment in South Africa.
17. The scholars participating were Prof. Julie Ellison, director of Imagining America, who inspired me with her writings on public scholarship and community engagement; Dr. Mark Creekmore, a social scientist and social worker, who contributed his expertise in assessing the impact of community development programs; Dr. Jane Hassinger (University of Michigan), a clinical psychologist and feminist scholar; and Prof. Pamela Allara, my PhD co-advisor from Brandeis University.
18. More detailed information on the arts-based interventions can be found in Berman et al. 2012: 40–60.
23. See also Mitchell et al.’s Putting People into the Picture (2007).
27. Visual artists and cultural activists Stephen Hobbs and Marcus Neustetter,
from the Trinity Session (see http://www.onair.co.za/), influenced this visual approach through their innovative applications and workshops for the trainers.

30. Interview by research assistant, 2006, available in Kim Berman personal archive in the Visual Art Department, UJ.
31. The team consisted of an HIV trainer, two students from the University of Michigan, one UJ student, two artist facilitators from Artist Proof Studio, an academic from Brandeis University, the intervention coordinator, and a Phumani Paper manager.
32. Dr. Mark Creekmore, a visiting researcher from the University of Michigan, analyzed the themes using a coding tool and compiled a report that is available in Kim Berman personal archive housed in the Visual Art Department at UJ.
38. Bart Cox, the HIV trainer, left training materials on-site at the request of the group (Kim Berman personal archives, Visual Art Department, UJ).
41. Marcus Neustetter, a South African artist from the Trinity Session, uses mapping as part of his interactive visual practice (see http://www.onair.co.za/). Neustetter was invited to train the intervention team on the practice of using mapping to organize groups and projects.
42. The term *tsbupatsela* (navigator), used by Mamoeti Mano in her description of the experience of mapping, was adopted by the research team for the subsequent visual mapping interventions.
43. Interview of Mano, April 2008. More information and examples of visual maps made by project members can be found in Berman et al. 2012: 56–59.
44. Berman et al. 2012.
45. Interviews were conducted by me, Hassinger, and her PhD student Leah James, from the University of Michigan. Portraits of the women were taken by New York–based photographer Debbie Rasiel, and the translation and transcription was done by my UJ research assistants Keboni Ramasimong and Shonisani Maphangwa. The interviews were transcribed and are housed in the Kim Berman personal archives in the Visual Art Department at UJ. They all have in common the women’s belief in independence and the value and pride of work as an overriding reason for their resilience. Extracts are included in Berman et al. 2012.
47. While several male group members in some of the sites were also included in the training, women were numerically dominant.

50. Extracts from narratives of 2007 participants. The narratives are filed in the Cultural Action for Change section of the Kim Berman personal archive housed in the Visual Art Department at UJ.


52. These two groups (along with KZN Papermaking & Craft Packaging and Imboni Paper Craft) participated in the pilot phase of PhotoVoice, done before the baseline survey was conducted, which accounts for why they are the only two groups that had engaged with the subject of HIV/AIDS.


54. Thirty-four stakeholder interviews were conducted, and the texts of the interviews are included in the Kim Berman personal archives in the Visual Art Department at UJ. The summary recording extracts are cited in the midterm and final reports (du Toit 2007, 2008c) as follows: “student/graduate beneficiaries” are those stakeholders who benefited from the programs in terms of receiving employment or a chance to complete a qualification (17 interviews); “managers/coordinators” are those involved with the programs in a managerial capacity (8 interviews); “other institutions” include both partners who are from other organizations/institutions involved with implementation at the program level, such as Men as Partners and independent consultants (5 interviews), and partners involved at an academic level, via an academic institution (4 interviews).


56. The 2007 paper was written by Helen Gould based on research prepared by Marsh and Judy El Bushra for the international research project HIV/AIDS: The Creative Challenge (http/ www.healthlink.org.uk).


61. L. du Toit, e-mail interview with the author, 25 January 2008 (du Toit’s emphasis).


Conclusion
