American Catholics in the Protestant Imagination

Carroll, Michael P.

Published by Johns Hopkins University Press

Carroll, Michael P.
American Catholics in the Protestant Imagination: Rethinking the Academic Study of Religion.

For additional information about this book
https://muse.jhu.edu/book/3479
Abenaki Indians, 100
Abeyta, Bernardo, 114, 120, 121, 128
Acadia, 97, 190. See also Acadian Catholicism; Acadians
Acadian Catholicism, xvi; historiography of, 97–103; holy water in, 106; and lay baptism, 104–105; and popular Catholicism generally, 107–108; and priestly influence, 103–104; shortage of priests, 108–109
Acadians: dispersal of, 97, 190; as good Catholics, 97–101. See also Acadian Catholicism affinity arguments: and Cajun Catholicism, 110; and devotional revolution in Ireland, 43–45; and Hispanic Pentecostalism, 147–148; and Methodist and Baptist success, 45; and Protestant individualism, 45–46
Ahlstrom, Sydney, 152, 154
Akenson, Donald, 1, 6, 7, 18–19, 27, 37–38; on “national stock” estimates, 14; on nativist hostility, 41
Albanese, Catherine, 152, 154, 191
Allport, Gordon, 157–158
altars, home, 108, 134
America (magazine), 87–89
American Council of Learned Societies (ACLS), 14–15
American-Italian Historical Association, 62
American Revolution, 3, 83, 178–179; and Irish Americans, 20–21, 26
analogical thinking, 163–166
apparitions, 107
Applegate, Frank, 126
Aragón, José Rafael, 114
Austin, Mary, 126–127
Babcock, Barbara, 145
Bacon, Leonard, 152, 153
Baird, Robert, 152
Bataan survivors, and Chimayó, 124–125
Batson, C. Daniel, 159–161
Baudier, Roger, 102–103
benevolent societies, 7–9
Bodin, Ron, 108–109
Brasseaux, Carl, 98, 105
Briggs, John, 70
Browne, Henry, 89–90
Brown Scapular, xii, 42
Buddhism, 94
Burke, Edmund, 160–161
Cajun, meaning of term, 190–191
Cajun Catholicism, xvi, 96, 101–102; historiography of, 102–104; and lay baptism, 103, 104, 106; and popular Catholicism generally, 107; role of priests, 105–106; and rosary, 108; women central to, 108–112
campanilismo, 64, 66, 68–71, 74, 85
Cash, W. F., 24
Catholic imagination, 163–166
Catholics, as threat to American democracy, 152–153, 155, 164–165. See also individual ethnic groups
Celtic religion, xiii
Center for Migration Studies, 62
Chimayó (shrine), xviii; ex votos at, 116–120; and Hispanic Catholic identity, 113, 115; models of Hispanic spirituality, 125–126; and Nuestro Señor de Esquipulas cult, 114, 120, 121;
Chimayó (continued)
pilgrimage to, during Holy Week, 115, 118–120, 122, 123–126; popularity of, 122–126; and Pueblo Spanish style, 127–128; santero art at, 114–115; and Santo Niño cult, 115, 120, 121; and visited by María Martínez, 121–122
Civil War (U.S.), 178
Collins, Randall, 172
colonization, and study of religion, 150
confessionalization, 57–58
Connell, Robert, 150, 168–169
consensus model, 152–153, 191
conversion experience: and evangelical Christianity, 161; as transition to mature religiosity, 151
corpses, connection between infants and, 106
Crusades, 138
Cuban Catholicism, 132–134
Cullen, Paul Cardinal, 33, 43, 177
Cusack, Margaret Ann, 55–56, 189
Daoism, 94
Deck, Allan Figueroa, 134, 139, 146, 147
degradation narrative, 93–95, 150–151
Delumeau, Jean, 67
democracy, American, 152–153, 155–156, 164–165
de Re Rosa, Gabriele, xiii, 67
devotional revolution in Ireland, 10, 32–33, 43–45, 144, 176–177
dialectical thinking, 164, 174
Díaz-Stevens, Ana María, 130, 139, 141, 146, 191; and matriarchal core hypothesis, 134–136
di Leonardo, Micaela, 62–63
dillingham Commission, 80–81, 82
Diner, Hasia, 54
“doing gender,” 111–112, 191
Dolan, Jay, 8, 96, 134, 139, 155–156; on devotional revolution in Ireland, 33
domestic service, social disciplining and, 53–58
Doyle, David, 7, 13–14, 21
Dunne, Edward M., 89
Durango (Mexico), 121
Durkheim, Emile, 150, 168–170, 172
Eid, Leroy, 7
evangelical Christianity, 2; and American Revolution, 21–22; and conversion experience, 161; and Irish Americans, 17–19; rational choice theory on, 178–180; and Scotch-Irish, 16
Evangeline, 98–101
ex voto, 116–120
Faith Maturity Scale, xviii, 161–163, 167
Famine, Irish, xv, 1–2, 27
Felician, Father, 99–100
feminization of religion, 50–53, 109–112, 131; and female sociability, 51–52; and masculinity, 175–176
Fichera, Sebastian, 70
Finke, Roger, 16, 171–172, 173, 174–175, 176–180, 192
Fischer, David Hackett, 8
Flores, Richard, 132
France: and Acadian Catholics, 97–98; feminization of religion in, 52
free rider problem, 181–184
Galgani, Gemma, 165
Gallo, Patrick, 65
Gambino, Richard, 64
Geertz, Clifford, 154
gender: and Cajun Catholicism, 109–112; and Hispanic Catholicism, 130–138; and Irish immigrants, 50–58
Gilligan, Carol, 166–167
Girardot, Norman, 94
Goizueta, Roberto, 136–137, 139
Great Awakening, 10, 12–13
Greek Orthodox church, female religiosity in, 111–112
Greeley, Andrew, xviii, 1, 23, 146, 174; on the Catholic imagination, 164–167
Griffin, Patrick, 12–13
Griffiths, Naomi, 97
Grosse Île (Quebec), 27
Guatemala, 114
Gumina, Deana, 74–75
Gutiérrez, Ramón, 113, 118, 120–121, 126, 128
Hackett, David, 154–155
Hadley, Herbert, 87–88
Hall, G. Stanley, 151
Hatch, Nathan, 22
Hawthorne, Nathaniel, 98
Hispanic Catholicism: alleged distinctiveness
of, 129–131; confessional bias in the study of, 138–143; and matriarchal core hypothesis, 130–138. See also Chimayó
Hispanics, 129
holy dirt, 113–114, 116, 122
holy fairs, 19–20
Holy Thursday, 123–124
holy water, 106, 113, 121
Holy Week, 118–126, 136
holy wells (Ireland), 35
Hopcroft, Rosemary, 45–46
Hotten-Somers, Diane, 54–55
Hout, Michael, 23
Hynes, Eugene, 43–45
Iannaccone, Laurence, 181–183
image cults, 107, 150
immanence, 163–166
immigration, 29, 82–83, 189
Infant of Prague, 121
Intrinsic/Extrinsic orientation, xviii, 157–159, 167
Irish American Catholics, 16–19; becoming Catholic, 35–39; demographic distinctiveness of, 48–50; disproportionate representation of, among Catholic hierarchy, 29–30; as gold standard for American Catholicism, 29–30; retention of Irish identity by, 23; in San Francisco, 39–41; as sect movement, 176–177; stereotypes about, 30–32; in Toronto, 41–42; as under the control of priests, 32; women in domestic service, 53–58
Irish American Protestants, 1–26; compared to Irish American Catholics, 5–19; as majority of Irish Americans, 1–2; and being American, 20–22; retention of Irish identity by, 23–26; and Scotch-Irish, 2–19
Irish Americans: and evangelical Christianity, 16; in pre-Famine period, 9–10; similarities among, 4–9. See also Irish American Catholics; Irish American Protestants
Irish identity, 5–6, 23–26, 59
Irish nationalism, 5–6, 50
Italian American Catholicism: attitude of American prelates toward, 93–96; compared to Irish American Catholicism, 30, 65; as cultural response to nativist hostility, 80–86; and degradation narrative, 93–95; festivals of, 65, 68–69, 76–80, 84–86; immigration and, 82–83, 189; Prohibition and, 83–84; and rise of localized cults, 77–80; in San Francisco, 71–77; Standard Story about, 63–80, 94; supposed pagan origins of, 64–65, 92–93
Italian Catholicism in Italy, xii–xiii, 138–139
“Italian problem, the,” 38, 87–93, 153
Jones, Maldwyn, 11
Kelley, Dean, 181–182
Lamy, Jean Baptiste, 122
Larkin, Emmet, 10; on the devotional revolution, 32–35, 43, 177
lay baptism, 104–105, 106, 108–109
Longfellow, Henry Wadsworth, 98–99
Los Pastores, 132–133
Louisiana, and Cajun Catholicism, 96
Lourdes, 113, 117, 120
Lubbock, John, 150
Madonna dei Miracoli di Cicagna, 73, 76, 77, 78
Madonna della Guardia, x, 73, 74–75, 76, 77, 78, 189
Madonna del Lume, 73, 74–75, 76, 77
madonnas, localized, 71–77
Mafia, 81
male flight and feminization of religion, 51–52
Martínez, María, 121–122
Mary cult, xii, 44
masculinity, in U.S. South, 175–176
Massa, Mark, 164–165
Matovina, Timothy, 129, 137
matriarchal core hypothesis, 130–138, 186; functions of, 142–143, 145–146
McAvoy, Thomas, 31
McCaffrey, Lawrence, 34, 103
McDonald, Forrest, 14
McWhinney, Grady, 175
Meem, John Gaw, 126, 127, 128
Merton, Robert, 168
Mexican American Catholicism, 129, 136–137, 140–141
Miami, 133–134
Mikmaq Indians, 100
Miller, Kerby, 36–39, 54, 58
Index

Mills, C. Wright, 16
Molleno, Antonio, 114
monotheism, 184–185
Mormonism, 144
multiple narratives approach, xviii, 153–157
nativist hostility: toward Irish, 32, 36–39, 58; toward Italian Americans, 80–86
New Mexico. See Chimayó
New York City, 141
Nuestro Señor de Esquípulas, 114, 120, 121
O’Brien, Michael, 4–7
O’Connell, Daniel, 6
O’Donovan, John, 36
O’Keefe, Georgia, 127
Olson, Daniel, 180–181, 182
Ordnance Survey (Ireland), 6, 36
orientalism, 145
Orsi, Robert, 52, 96, 143–144, 152, 155; and Catholic imagination, 165–167
Our Lady of Charity shrine (Miami), 132–134
Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, 72
Our Lady of Mt. Carmel: chapel in San Francisco, x; church in New York, 66, 68–69; popular cult of, 69–70
Ownsby, Ted, 175–176
pagan Catholicism, 64
Parsons, Talcott, 168–169
patterns (socioreligious events) (Ireland), 35
Peña, Milagros, 134–135
Penal Laws, 8
Penitentes, xiii–xiv, 114, 118, 123, 131
Pentecostalism, 144, 146–148
pilgrimage, 107, 111–112, 113–126, 132, 150
Pío, Padre, 165
Pius IV, 47–48
Polla (Italy), 69
pope, obedience to, 47–48
prejudice and religion, 158
Presbyterians, in early Republic, 9–16
Profession of Faith, 47–48
Prohibition, 83–84, 190
Protestant imagination, ix, 93–96, 186; contrasted with Catholic imagination, 163–166; and degradation narrative, 93–95, 150–151; and dialectical thinking, 164; and Durkheim and Weber, 169–170; and free rider problem, 181–184; and masculinized Western culture, 145; and psychology of religion, 157–163; and rational choice theory, 170–184; and social evolutionary perspective, 149–152; and study of American religion, 149–150. See also matriarchal core hypothesis
Protestantism, 143; and degradation narrative, 93–95, 150–151; fit with American democracy, 152–153; and psychology of religion, 151–152
psychology of religion, 151; and measures of religion, 157–163
Pueblos, 114, 121–122, 145
Pueblo Spanish style, 127–128, 191
Puerto Rican Catholicism, 135–136, 141
Purgatory, 165
Purvis, Thomas, 14–15
Quest Scale, xviii, 159–161, 167, 187
rational choice theory: emphasis on creed, 173–174; on importance of strictness, 174–176; and theory of religious economies, 171–172
Reformation, Protestant, 45–46, 93
Reinhard, Wolfgang, 57
relic cults, 150
RELTRAD, 17–18
remittances sent by Irish from America, 49
Romanized Catholicism, 46–48, 50, 57–58
rosary, xii, 42, 108
rounding rituals, 35
sacramentals, 165–166
Said, Edward, 145
St. Brendan, 3
St. Emydius, xi
St. Patrick benevolent societies, 7–9
St. Patrick’s Church (San Francisco), 40–41
St. Paulinus festa, 78–79
St. Rocco, x, 69
Saints Peter and Paul Church (San Francisco), ix–xi, 72–77, 190
Salpointe, John B., 122
San Antonio, 132, 137, 140
San Francisco: Irish American Catholics in, 39–41; Italian American Catholics in, 71–77
San Francisco de Asís Church (Taos), 127
Index 219

San Gennaro festa, 78
Santa Maria Maddalena de Pazzi Church (Philadelphia), 90–92
Sante Fe, 113, 126–127, 128
santero art, 114
Santiago (St. James) festival, 123
Santo Niño (Holy Child) shrine (Chimayó), 115, 120, 121
Scotch-Irish, xv, 2–16; and evangelical Christianity, 16; history of the term, 6–7; and Presbyterian Church, 11–16; sacramental traditions of, 19–20; and U.S. South, 24
secularization theory, 171
Smith, Jonathan, 94
social disciplining, domestic service and, 53–58
social evolutionary perspective, 149–152
sociology of religion, 168–184
South (U.S.), 1; and evangelical Christianity, 175–176; and Irish Americans, 17–18, 22
Spanish Colonial Arts Society, 126
Spencer, Herbert, 150
SSPP. See Saints Peter and Paul Church
Standard Story (of Italian American Catholicism), xvi, 186; components of, 63–68; origins of, 86–93; and Protestant imagination, 94–96
Starbuck, Edwin, 151
Stark, Rodney, 15; emphasis on creed, 173–174; on importance of strictness, 174–176; on Irish Catholics, 176–177; on powerful gods, 184–185; on rise of Methodists and Baptists, 178–180; and theory of religious economies, 171–172
Stations of the Cross, xii, 140
Steinberg, Stephen, 63
stem family, 44–45
Stevens-Arroyo, Anthony M., 139, 142, 146, 191
strictness: and free rider problem, 181–184; importance of, in rational choice theory, 174–176
Swanson, Guy, 163
Sweet, William, 11
Tamney, Joseph, 181, 182
Taos, 127, 128
Tarango, Yolanda, 136
Tewa Indians, 114
Third Plenary Council (Baltimore), 31
Thurston, Herbert, xii
tongue-dragging, 92
Toronto, Irish Catholics in, 41–42
Tracy, David, xviii, 163–166, 174
Trent, Council of, xiii, 47–48
Treviño, Roberto, 134
Trinterud, Leonard, 10–11
Tweed, Thomas, 96, 130, 133, 154, 155, 191
Tylor, Edward, 150
Ulster Presbyterians. See Scotch-Irish
ultramontanism, 46–48
Vecoli, Rudolph, 63, 65, 85, 87
Via Crucis, 140
Virgen de Guadalupe, 137, 140
Weber, Max, 45, 55, 168–170, 172
white ethnics, 62
white masses, 108
William of Orange, 103
Wilson, John, 154–155, 191
Wittke, Carl, 31
Wuthnow, Robert, 170–171, 182–183
Young, John Howard, 104–106
Zubaría, Antonio de, 122