NOTES

Introduction


25. Obstacles to Excellence, 6.


29. See Rosenblatt, Lost History of Liberalism, 164.


35. Rosalie Silberman Abella and Matthew Diller, “A Conversation with the Honorable Rosalie Silberman Abella and Dean Matthew Diller,” Fordham Law


54. Absalom Peters, A Discourse Delivered in the Park Presbyterian Church before the Society for the Promotion of Collegiate and Theological Education at the West (New York: John F. Trow, 1851).


56. One study of dozens of democracies from 1960 to 2000 found that a 1 percent increase in a nation’s university enrollment is associated with nearly a full


ONE: American Dreams


4. Adams had even hoped to title his book The American Dream but was told by his publisher that “no red-blooded American would pay $3.50 for a dream.” See Allan Nevins, ed., James Truslow Adams: Select Correspondence (London: Routledge, 2017), 296.


10. Tocqueville, Democracy in America, 50.


24. Five percent of adult children without a college degree from the bottom quartile of parental income reach the top income quintile. Nineteen percent of children with a college degree from the bottom quintile reach the top. That’s a fourteen-point difference, or a 280 percent increase. Put differently, people who earn college degrees from the lowest quintile are 3.8 times more likely to reach the highest income quintile than those without college degrees. Ron Haskins, “Education and Economic Mobility,” in *Getting Ahead or Losing Ground: Economic Mobility in America* (Washington, DC: Brookings Institution, 2008), 95.


42. Absalom Peters, A Discourse Delivered in the Park Presbyterian Church (New York: John F. Trow, 1851).

43. See Potts, “‘College Enthusiasm!’”

44. Burke, American Collegiate Populations, 138.

49. Lyman Beecher, *An Address Delivered at the Tenth Anniversary Celebration of the Union Literary Society of Miami University, September 29, 1835* (Cincinnati: Cincinnati Journal Office, 1835), 5.
51. *Addresses Delivered at the Opening of the Iowa State Agricultural College, March 17, 1869* (Davenport, IA: Gazette, 1869), 11.
54. An Act Donating Public Lands to the Several States and Territories Which May Provide Colleges for the Benefit of Agriculture and the Mechanic Arts, 7 U.S.C. § 301 (1862).
59. See Sorber, “Early Land-Grant Colleges,” 108–112. According to Sorber, the “median wealth of the graduating classes ($2,350)” at Maine State College was nearly double the average for the state as a whole (107).


68. Snyder, *120 Years of American Education*, 76.


84. Karabel, *The Chosen*, 44.


89. Servicemen’s Readjustment Act of 1944, S. 1767 (1944), secs. 700, 500, 400.


95. See Wilkinson, *Aiding Students, Buying Students*, 115. The G.I. Bill was renewed and reimagined after nearly every subsequent American conflict and has continued to be a vital source of opportunity for veterans.


118. In 2018, 64 percent of students enrolled at for-profit colleges were federal grant recipients, compared to 36 percent of the student body at public four-year institutions. *Indicators*, 84.


125. Leonard Buder, “Colleges Pick Freshmen; Method Is Vexing to Both,” *New York Times*, May 18, 1958, 1, 80; Marcia Winn, “Colleges Face a Big Application


143. This calculation relies on College Board figures for the 2007–2008 and 2009–2010 school years in constant 2020 dollars. Trends in College Pricing and Student Aid 2020 (New York: College Board, 2020), 19. Some point to a number of US Department of Justice investigations in the late 1980s that ended a practice of many universities of discussing financial aid packages with one another as also playing a role in the unleashing of competition in financial aid packages in the 2000s. Jaschik, “New Tactic in Aid Arms Race.”


149. Indicators of Higher Education Equity in the United States, 145.


165. For a forceful call for such a matching program on behalf of the American Association of State Colleges and Universities, and the need for greater co-investment and maintenance of effort requirements in federal grants, see Daniel J. Hurley, Thomas L. Harnisch, and Barmak Nassirian, A Proposed Federal Matching Program to Stop the Privatization of Public Higher Education (Washington, DC: American Association of State Colleges and Universities, January 2014).

166. See Sandy Baum and Sarah Turner, “Pricing ‘Free College,’” Urban Wire: Education and Training [blog], May 3, 2019, https://www.urban.org/urban-wire/pricing-free-college. This is also why I favor income-contingent loans over a universal loan forgiveness program. The Becker Friedman Institute found that full loan forgiveness in the United States would give $192.5 billion to those in the top 20 percent of earners, but only $29.5 billion to the bottom 20 percent. See Sylvain Catherine and Constantine Yannelis, The Distributional Effects of Student Loan Forgiveness, Working Paper 2020-169 (Cambridge, MA: National Bureau of Economic Research, December 2020).


172. See Chad Coffman, Tara O’Neil, and Brian Starr, “An Empirical Analysis of the Impact of Legacy Preferences on Alumni Giving at Top Universities,” in Affirmative Action for the Rich, 119–121. A 2018 survey by Inside Higher Ed of nearly five hundred of the senior-most admissions and enrollment officers at US colleges and universities found that 42 percent of private institutions (although only 6 percent of


179. Arcidiacono et al., *Legacy and Athlete Preferences*, 17.


**Two: Free Minds**

1. This education was limited to male citizens, which speaks to Athens’s constrained vision of citizenship. See Derek Heater, *A History of Education for Citizenship* (New York: Routledge, 2004), 1–25.


51. William James, “The Teaching of Philosophy in Our Colleges,” The Nation, September 21, 1876, 178.


56. Charles A. Ellwood, “How Should Sociology Be Taught as a College or University Subject?,” American Journal of Sociology 12, no. 5 (March 1907): 592.


60. Proceedings of the American Political Science Association at Its Tenth Annual Meeting Held at Washington, D.C., December 30, 1913–January 1, 1914 (Baltimore: Waverly Press, 1914), 264. The other two duties were “to prepare for professions, such as law, journalism, teaching and public service” and “to train experts for government positions.”


71. Cross, *Oasis of Order*.


117. National Task Force on Civic Learning and Democratic Engagement, *Crucible Moment*.


123. Harriger et al., “Long-Term Impact of Learning to Deliberate.”


THREE: Hard Truths


8. Association of American Universities (AAU) survey conducted in April 2020 on file with AAU.


21. See, e.g., Tim Wu, *The Attention Merchants: The Epic Scramble to Get inside Our Heads* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2016). Studies have shown that fake news travels across social media at six times the speed of real news and that the most popular false news stories normally find their way to anywhere between 1,000 and 100,000 people online, while real news almost always fails to reach more than 1,000 recipients. Soroush Vosoughi, Deb Roy, and Sinan Aral, “The Spread of True and False News Online,” *Science* 359, no. 6380 (March 2018): 1146–1151.


32. Daniel Coit Gilman, “Inaugural Address at Johns Hopkins University,” Johns Hopkins University, February 22, 1876, https://www.jhu.edu/about/history/gilman-address/.


38. Gilman, “Plan for JHU.”


81. See Aby, “Discretion over Valor,” 122; Schrecker, “Subversives, Squeaky Wheels, and ‘Special Obligations,’” 516.
90. American Academy of Arts and Sciences, “Bachelor’s Degrees in the Humanities,” Humanities Indicators, accessed March 22, 2021, https://www.amacad.org/humanities-indicators/higher-education/bachelors-degrees-humanities. For the purposes of counting, the “humanities” in this case include English language and literature, history, philosophy, classics, linguistics, and languages and literatures other than English.


110. Weiss and Nelson, “Penn Settles Gene Therapy Suit.”
111. Headlines like “Flawed Study Helps Doctors Profit on Drug” and “How a Drug Firm Paid for a University Study—Then Undermined It” became increasingly common during this period.

112. Wilson, “Death of Jesse Gelsinger.”


132. Lee Kennedy-Schaffer, “Before p < 0.05 to Beyond p < 0.05: Using History to Contextualize p-Values and Significance Testing,” *American Statistician* 73, no. 1 (2019): 84.


168. Kupferschmidt, “‘Completely New Culture of Doing Research.’”


174. The effect of open peer review on disadvantaged groups is still unclear, with studies showing contrasting results. Charles W. Fox and C. E. Timothy Paine, “Gender Differences in Peer Review Outcomes and Manuscript Impact at Six Journals of Ecology and Evolution,” *Ecology and Evolution* 9, no. 6 (2019): 3599–3619, showed that “papers with female first authors obtained, on average, slightly worse peer review scores and were more likely to be rejected after peer review” than those with male first authors. Amelia R. Cox and Robert Montgomery, “The Case for and against Double-Blind Reviews,” *PeerJ* 7 (2019): e6702, found no gender bias in peer review of ornithology journals, but discussed papers showing double-blind reviewing may reduce institutional and geographic biases as well as the incidence of nepotism.

**FOUR: Purposeful Pluralism**


32. *Yale Literary Magazine* 17, no. 1 (October 1851): 36. The magazine promised a statement explaining the dissolution; it appears to have never been published.


49. In 1910, W. E. B. Du Bois surveyed 107 colleges (excluding historically Black colleges and universities) to assess how many Black students attended and graduated. He found that from 1880 to 1884, these schools collectively graduated 36 Black
students; from 1905 to 1909, that number had risen to 149. See W. E. B. Du Bois, 
The College-Bred Negro American (Atlanta: Atlanta University Press, 1910).
53. “Lionel Trilling to Elliot Cohen, December 2, 1929,” in Life in Culture: 
Selected Letters of Lionel Trilling, ed. Adam Kirsch (New York: Farrar, Straus and 
Giroux, 2018), 32.
54. See Deborah E. Whaley, “Links, Legacies, and Letters: A Cultural History of 
Black Greek-Letter Organizations,” in Brothers and Sisters: Diversity in College 
Fraternities and Sororities, ed. Craig L. Torbenson and Gregory S. Parks (Cranbury, 
55. Carol Kammen, Part and Apart: The Black Experience at Cornell, 1865–1945 
(Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Library, 2009), 47.
56. Felix L. Armfield, Stefan M. Bradley, Kenneth I. Clarke Sr., Gregory S. 
Parks, and Jeremy M. Harp, “Defining the ‘Alpha’ Identity,” in Alpha Phi Alpha: 
A Legacy of Greatness, the Demands of Transcendence, ed. Gregory S. Parks and 
57. See Christine G. O’Malley, “‘First of All’: The Founding of Alpha Phi 
Alpha and the Search for Fraternal Space at Cornell University, 1905–1920,” 
Building and Landscapes: journal of the Vernacular Architecture Forum 26, no. 1 
(2019): 48–72; Andre McKenzie, “In the Beginning: The Early History of the 
Divine Nine,” in African American Fraternities and Sororities: The Legacy and the 
Vision, ed. Tamara L. Brown, Gregory S. Parks, and Clarena M. Phillips 
(Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 2005), 181–210; Whaley, “Links, 
Legacies, and Letters.”
58. See Sarah Turner and John Bound, Closing the Gap or Widening the Divide: 
The Effects of the G.I. Bill and World War II on the Educational Outcomes of Black 
Research, 2002); Suzanne Mettler, “‘The Only Good Thing Was the G.I. Bill’: 
Effects of the Education and Training Provisions on African-American Veterans’ 
60. Calvin H. Plimpton quoted in Anthony S. Chen and Lisa M. Stulberg, 
“Before Bakke: The Hidden History of the Diversity Rationale,” University of 
edu/2020/10/30/aa-chen-stulberg/.


74. Quoted in Fowler, “Six Days in College Hall.”


76. The US Supreme Court did not issue a decision regarding the constitutionality of race-conscious admissions in *DeFunis v. Odegard*, 416 U.S. 312 (1974), as it determined that the case was moot.
78. Bakke, at 312.
80. Bok and Bowen, Shape of the River, 231.
89. Between 1950 and 1990, the number of international students at US colleges and universities grew by a factor of nearly fifteen, from 26,000 to more than 380,000. As of 2019, more than one million international students were enrolled in colleges and universities in the United States. See Emma Israel and Jeanne Batalova, “International Students in the United States,” Migration Policy Institute, January 14, 2021, https://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/international-students-united-states-2020.
92. See Yanni, Living on Campus; William Archibald Irwin, “A Study of the Historical Development of On-Campus Housing at the Ohio State University” (PhD diss., Ohio State University, 1977), 40.
93. Yanni, Living on Campus, 105–106, 197; Valerie Michelman, Joseph Price, and Seth D. Zimmerman, Old Boys’ Clubs and Upward Mobility among the


102. Burns, “Luxury Private Student Housing.”


138. Quoted in McMurtrie, “These Professors Help Students.”


**Conclusion**

2. In this respect, I believe that the university serves in stark contrast to private sector corporations, where the impediments to change are much weaker up front. In this setting, chief executives have much greater latitude in proclaiming new strategies and priorities without having to conduct extensive ex ante consultation that is the hallmark of the university. Having avoided these consultation costs up front, however, they then have to confront and surmount organizational resistance after their strategy or priority has been declared.