PROJECT MUSE®

Patriotism by Proxy: The Civil War Draft and the Cultural Formation of Citizen-Soldiers, 1863–1865 by Colleen Glenney Boggs (review)

Brian Matthew Jordan

Home Front Studies, Volume 1, 2021, pp. 111–113 (Review)

Published by University of Nebraska Press

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/hfs.2021.0005>

➔ For additional information about this article

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/805718>

only compounded by the war that began in 2003. At that point Alani returns to Fallujah as a journalist, and he later begins working to uncover and make the world aware of the wave of birth defects and their probable cause. Like Alani, the other authors have a personal stake in the story—Hil is an activist who has previously written about Iraq, Mulhearn is a journalist who documented the first siege and the health crisis, and Caputi, notably, is an American veteran of the second siege. Ultimately, this book's multivocal approach to its subject is both its primary strength and a demonstration of Alani's point that "these histories within History should not be forgotten" (p. 176), particularly given the all-too-common gloss of Fallujah as a bad place in a messy but righteously waged war.

Stacey Peebles,
Centre College

***Patriotism by Proxy: The Civil War Draft and the Cultural Formation of Citizen-Soldiers, 1863–1865.* By Colleen Glenney Boggs. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020. 192 pp.**

As the US Civil War staggered into its third bloody year, expiring enlistments and mounting casualty counts combined to leave Lincoln's armies in need of fresh volunteers. In March 1863, the Union's manpower problem yielded to the Enrollment Act, which required all males between the ages of twenty and forty-five to register for the draft. The first lottery was held a few months later. The deadly riots that romped through the streets of New York and Boston that summer evidenced the shrill debate that conscription invited among a Northern populace divided about the wisdom of the war and the necessity of emancipation.

While historians Fred Shannon, Eugene C. Murdock, James W. Geary, and Iver Bernstein have documented the draft (and especially the draft riots) in important books, literary scholars have paid conscription—to say nothing of the citizen-soldier—remarkably little attention. With this slender volume, the latest entry in the Oxford Studies in American Literary History series, Colleen Glenney Boggs attempts to fill the gap. She argues that the

Civil War draft transformed “the way in which American biopower operated,” prompting Americans to rethink not only the content of citizenship and patriotism but also the nature and power of the state (p. 3). Contending that the draft supplies essential “theoretical paradigms for reading the Civil War’s cultural texts,” *Patriotism by Proxy* recounts the draft’s “lasting effects on American culture and literature” (pp. 9, 14–15). Tracing “connections between the national symbolic and its body politics” through her deft readings of newspapers, political cartoons, poetry, and print culture, Boggs lends her voice to a growing chorus of recent scholars—among them Christopher Hager, Kathleen Diffley, Cody Marrs, Alice Fahs, and Elizabeth Duquette—who have retrieved the Civil War as a worthy subject in American literary history (p. 3).

Boggs unwinds her argument in four chapters. The first analyzes the draft lottery as “a site of public reading that linked American lives to national ideology” (p. 12). With the reading aloud of individual names, draft lotteries “gave specificity to each citizen in the act of turning him into a soldier” (p. 30). Via the draft, the state “exercised its individuating and collectivizing function” (p. 30). The ways in which ordinary Americans “negotiated the new material and symbolic demands of the draft” and worked out their implications constitute the subject of the second chapter (p. 12). Commutation and substitution, two methods of draft evasion afforded by the Enrollment Act, naturally posed urgent questions about patriotism and the “representational logic” of citizenship (p. 31). What did patriotism mean if one could purchase a proxy? What did the augmented authority of the nation mean, and how did consolidation of federal power revise notions of identity and belonging? Boggs contends that a “vast cultural archive of poems, songs, stories, images, and ephemera” supplies a portal into the lives and dilemmas of Civil War substitutes, a cohort of soldiers silenced in both historical archives and historiography (p. 44). Through a fascinating rereading of Emily Dickinson’s poetry, the author recovers contemporary disquiet about the “burgeoning draft economy” and the “monetization of soldiers’ lives”—the latter a curious irony in a crusade to end slavery (pp. 12–13).

While conscription posed a dilemma for poor White and immigrant men, it nonetheless blazed (as Frederick Douglass

immediately intuited) a path to citizenship for Black soldiers and their families. “In military service,” Boggs writes, “African American writers saw an opportunity for transforming the very grounds by which biopower operated” (p. 81). Arguing that the kin of Black soldiers also served the Union cause, African American writers relied on “the logics of substitution” to advance claims to citizenship (p. 106). Those claims, of course, would be contested after the war, just as questions about duty, loyalty, and patriotism persisted beyond the cessation of hostilities.

Routinized by the war (and especially the draft), the state’s scrutiny of male bodies also continued, as injured veterans appealed for and secured disability pensions (p. 116). Boggs, in her conclusion, remarks upon the “cultural work” performed by “injured veteran[s],” whose bodies “came to stand in for the state of the nation” (pp. 109, 116). Empty sleeves supplied a keen metaphor for both national and individual reconstruction. Yet many amputees appointed themselves custodians of the war’s “unfinished work” and fanned the conflict’s smoldering embers. Injuries, it should be pointed out, did not reliably yield to “narratives of national reconstruction.” And while African Americans did face some unique obstacles in suing for pension claims, White veterans also invited the skeptical gaze of pension bureaucrats and struggled to satisfy daunting evidentiary burdens (p. 109).

The author’s clever analysis and daring questions are evident in each chapter of this wide-ranging and thought-provoking book. It is not jargon-free, however, and as such will appeal to literary scholars more than historians.

Brian Matthew Jordan,
Sam Houston State University

***The Vietnam Veterans Memorial at Angel Fire: War, Remembrance, and an American Tragedy.* By Steven Trout. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2020. xiv, 239 pp.**

Steven Trout has written extensively on American memory of World War I, but in this monograph, he turns his attention to the building