



PROJECT MUSE®

*Wires that Bind: Nation, Region, and Technology in the
Southwestern United States, 1854–1920* by Torsten Kathke
(review)

Sukkoo Kim

Journal of Arizona History, Volume 59, Number 4, Winter 2018, pp. 378-380
(Review)



Published by Arizona Historical Society

➔ For additional information about this article

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/737868>

the section provides clarity to the murky world of myth and speculation surrounding their demise. Unfortunately, Lago denies agency to the individuals responsible for the men's demise by presenting them as either Mormons or Shivwits. In both cases, it implies an organized attack instead of it being the more likely impulsive unsanctioned actions of a few individuals.

The primary critiques likely to be leveled against the book are his choice to present information from the first-person perspective and his use of speculation. Lago recognized these risks and addressed them in the book's introduction (p. xix). While not the standard historical approach, his use of the first-person works, as it allowed him to explain his research process and how his new information impacted the existing understanding of the expedition. Although I do not always personally agree with the conclusions in his speculative chapters, Lago always presents a detailed explanation of the evidence behind his speculation and makes it abundantly clear when he is offering his opinion about historical events.

In the end, Lago's work is an outstanding addition to Powell historiography. He proves that there are still many unanswered questions that need and can be explored by broadening research beyond the "great man" and "great event." By doing so, as Lago argues, Powell's status as a critical historical figure will continue well into the next century.

RAYMOND V. SUMNER, a retired U.S. Army lieutenant colonel, is now a PhD student at Colorado State University and is the second great grandson of Powell guide and lead boatman John Colton "Captain Jack" Sumner.

Wires that Bind: Nation, Region, and Technology in the Southwestern United States, 1854–1920. By Torsten Kathke. (New York: Columbia University Press. Pp. 312. \$45.00 paper)

A problem confronting historians of the U.S. West is that the history of the United States, as typically told, begins in the East. After all, the seminal events and developments—British colonial foundings, the Declaration of Independence, the writing of the Constitution, plantation slavery, and early and late industrial revolutions—all happened in the East. Not surprisingly, many early historians viewed the West as a conquered Spanish territory, a new frontier to be settled, mined, and absorbed by the peoples of the East.

In the 1980s, Patricia Limerick, Richard White and other founders of the New History of the West advocated for a re-interpretation, one

that highlighted the West's social and political distinctiveness as well as its unique contributions to the national dialogue. Yet, while this development was useful, Torsten Kathke argues that a new New Western History, rooted in American studies, with an emphasis on race, class, and gender, and woven with personal stories, is needed.

Kathke's main thesis is that the southern Arizona region, and to a lesser extent, the New Mexico portion of the Gadsden Purchase, developed differently from other places in the West such as Texas, Colorado, Utah and, even California. The Mesilla borderland was historically isolated and remote; it was a Mesoamerican periphery, a Spanish periphery, and then a U.S. periphery. In this peripheral region, the local Hispano-Anglo elites who displaced Native Americans were generally racially and culturally tolerant and lived as one coherent community.

By "wires that bind," Kathke means the copper telegraph wires that, together with the iron horse, destroyed the peripheral status of the southwestern region. The telegraph and the railroad enabled the eastern men and capital to exploit the region's agricultural and mining industries using unskilled Hispanic laborers recruited from central and southern Mexico. The influx of working-class Mexican migrants fostered racism according to Kathke, as all Hispanics were automatically categorized as inferior "Mexicans."

Starting in the 1880s, the new Anglo elites used their political and legal powers to displace local elites. First, the Anglo judges, by creating and upholding a "fiction" of a Hispanic prior appropriation law, were able to expropriate the traditional legal system in service of new industrial developments. Second, the new Anglo elites reduced the geographic importance of traditional localities in favor of new Anglo-dominated communities. By removing the capital to Phoenix, they reduced the role of Tucson, the focus of traditional Hispano-Anglo elites. Unlike the older Anglos, the new Anglo elites created new segregated communities by displacing "Mexicans" to undesirable locations. Third, the new Anglos used associations, political parties, and the military to share insider information on new economic opportunities. By the 1920s, the "Anglo invasion" or "eastern colonization" was complete.

To this overall narrative history of the Southwest, Kathke weaves the "history of the very small—the local, the personal—in accordance with the history of larger constructs, such as a transnationally imagined region, or political entities like state or territory" (p. 23).

The lives of Hispano-Anglo elites are illustrated by short biographies. Jose Redondo, for instance, made his fortune in a variety of activities—as a miner, a merchant, a farmer. By contrast, Anglo newcomer James Barney Jr., a New York merchant, made his money in the

California Gold Rush. As for the lives of new Anglo elites, Kathke focuses on the secondary elites, such as George H. Smalley, Charles M. Clark and Joseph L. Wiley, rather than the primary elites composed of high-level politicians and elite businessmen. Unlike the Anglo elites of the earlier era, the new elites arrived in the Southwest because of the coming of the telegraph and the railroads. Smalley represents a newspaper worker, Clark a telegraph operator, and Wiley a gambler and railroad worker.

To illustrate the changing racial attitudes of the Southwest, Kathke introduces African Americans Wiley and Hannah Box and Carley Williams and a white female lawyer, Sarah Sorin. The main message seems to be that race mattered more than sex in the West. For Wiley and Hannah Box, their fair skin allowed them to “pass” as whites; but, for Carley Williams, with a darker complexion, the only choice was to leave the region. For Sarah Sorin, she was able to practice as the sole female lawyer because she came from an elite white family and had the support of her father and husband.

In *Wires that Bind*, Kathke argues that the New History of the West is deficient because it ignores issues related to race, class, and gender. In particular, for the Southwest, it fails to identify the Hispano-Anglo elite culture that existed before the arrival of the telegraph and the railroad. In the early years, the individuals who came to the Mesilla region of Arizona and New Mexico adapted to its local Hispanic culture and its way of life. Because these local elites were displaced by national ones with little regard for local culture and practices, Kathke sees southwestern history not as a closing of the frontier but as one of “colonization” by the industrial east.

SUKKOO KIM is an associate professor in international and area studies and economics at Washington University in St. Louis.

Arizona Oddities: Land of Anomalies and Tamales. By Marshall Trimble. (Charleston, S.C.: The History Press, 2018. Pp. 144. \$23.99 paper)

Arizona Oddities: Land of Anomalies and Tamales by Marshall Trimble is the latest publication of many books on Arizona history by this author. The book’s well-written introduction provides background information and explains the book’s title. Arizona has confusing town and county name such as the town of Gila Bend in Maricopa County, the town of Maricopa in Pinal County, and the town of Santa Cruz in Pima County. Some town names are more obscure than their names indicate such as Snowflake,