



PROJECT MUSE®

Moving By the Spirit: Pentecostal Social Life on the Zambian Copperbelt by Naomi Haynes (review)

Myung Sahm Suh

Nova Religio, Volume 22, Number 1, August 2018, pp. 145-146 (Review)

Published by University of Pennsylvania Press



➔ For additional information about this article

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/737572>

Moving By the Spirit: Pentecostal Social Life on the Zambian Copperbelt. By Naomi Haynes. University of California Press, 2017. 224 pages. \$85.00 cloth; \$34.95 paper; ebook available.

A prolific scholar in the field of the anthropology of Christianity, Naomi Haynes has published her first book based on fieldwork in the Zambian Copperbelt. Her key theoretical concept is noted in the monograph's title, *Moving by the Spirit*. As an overarching social value of the people of the Copperbelt, "moving" refers to a kind of upward social mobility, which is often calibrated within a matrix of exhibitionist consumerism and commodity fetishism. However, this mundane concept takes on a more complex and complicated meaning among local Pentecostal communities. The value of "moving by the Spirit," Haynes writes, comes from the tension that exists between the benefits of prosperity and charisma, inasmuch as the former represents believers' everyday concerns and the latter their religious aspirations. According to Haynes, much of Pentecostal social life in the Copperbelt hinges upon the dialectical interaction between these two gifts: believers generally subscribe to the prosperity gospel yet still prioritize charisma in acknowledgment of the superior authority of religious leaders. From Haynes' perspective, this ambivalent tension between prosperity and charisma is one of the qualities that makes Pentecostalism so popular in Zambia and many parts of the world.

Within such a theoretical framework, Haynes does an admirable job in parsing the logic of political economy in the Copperbelt Pentecostal world. Her detailed and nuanced analysis in chapters four through eight convincingly demonstrates how familiar religious practices—like preaching, collective prayer, offering, and communal celebration—are actually fraught with micropolitics and economic maneuverings that modulate according to class difference, gender division, and religious hierarchy. Also commendable is the way in which Haynes engages with various theoretical discussions about value, gift economy, language register, and neoliberal sociality. These theories are aptly evoked throughout the work and incorporated into her ethnographic analysis, corroborating her arguments with interpretive depths and informative perspectives.

Yet, there are some places where Haynes' claims sound hollow. In her refutation of James Ferguson's well-known "ethnography of despair" in *Expectations of Modernity* (1999), Haynes tries to present what may be called ethnography of faith-based optimism among Copperbelt Pentecostal communities. However, the social world depicted in *Moving by the Spirit* seems more filled with stories of "corruption and jealous[y]" than that of hopefulness and confidence for the future (149). More concrete evidence would have helped demonstrate that Copperbelt Pentecostals maintain religiously inspired optimism even in times of economic hardship, such as during the 2008 global financial crisis. On a somewhat different note, it is curious that Haynes mentions

a handful of serious cases of social breakdown in Pentecostal churches—e.g., sexual and monetary scandals involving religious leaders (31, 68 and 117)—but never provides additional details. While gender differences in religious leadership is one of her main areas of interest, Haynes treats an incident of clergy misconduct that occurred during her fieldwork as trivial (31). Such gaps and omissions may suggest that Haynes would like to affirm Pentecostalism's social productivity and gloss over its socially corrosive aspects.

Nevertheless, Haynes offers keen analysis of ethnographic data as well as insightful engagement with theory. In this regard, anyone who is interested in studies of religion, Pentecostalism, and Global Christianity would greatly benefit from reading *Moving by the Spirit*.

Myung Sahm Suh, University of California, Irvine

Zar: Spirit Possession, Music, and Healing Rituals in Egypt. By Hager El Hadidi. Oxford University Press, 2016. \$34.95 cloth.

Hager El Hadidi is a researcher as well as initiate in *zar*, and this book explores the *zar* culture as it is experienced in the greater Cairo area of Egypt. *Zar*, in its most basic meaning, is a spirit—*djinn* in Arabic. It is also the name of a ritual that provides a space for one possessed by a *djinn* (99 percent of whom are women) to create a relationship with her spirit. Possession can cause illness, depression and a need to withdraw from the regular world. These places are provided by a *zar* leader known often as 'sheikh' or 'sheikha' (honorific), while in some places where there is the *zar al-sitt* (*zar* of the Grand Lady), the leader is known as *kodya*. They are assisted by a band, as music is very important to the spirits. All leaders go through many initiations. They guide the clients to reconciliation with their *zar*, who then becomes their protector since the *zar* is not exorcised. In Cairo, this creates a community whose participants will try to attend the weekly rituals.

In exploring Egyptian *zar*, El Hadidi covers some of the same ground that other writers have addressed, but then takes the reader into the culture of *zar* as experienced in Cairo. While she describes some of the *zar* spirits that are found in other literature in the field, she introduces new spirits and their different roles as well. Her emphasis is on the communities that *zar* culture creates. These communities are women-led and provide a spiritual oasis that works with not only Muslim entities, but also Christian. She explains the connections and loyalties to different *zar* leaders and the familial relationships that develop. She discusses the material culture that is involved, particularly *zaramulets*. When a woman is first affected by a *zar* she goes to the jewelry shops and views or handles jewelry until the *zar* spirits evoke a reaction in her to indicate a preference.