



PROJECT MUSE®

*After the Massacre: The Violent Legacy of the San Sabá
Mission* (review)

Juliana Barr

Southwestern Historical Quarterly, Volume 111, Number 4, April 2008, pp.
445-446 (Review)

Published by Texas State Historical Association

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/swh.2008.0011>



➔ *For additional information about this article*

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/408435/summary>

Laboratory near Fort Wingate where Morgan worked examining wool fibers. Willie taught Young the Navajo language in the evenings and this partnership became a lifelong collaboration, which included working on the small book *The Trouble at Round Rock* that Brill de Ramírez speculates about. The other William Morgan wrote the 1931 *American Anthropologist* article “Navaho Treatment of Sickness: Diagnosticians,” about which the author also conjectures.

The author’s claims, such as that Navajo control of research “insures the reliability and accuracy of current work,” while politically correct are somewhat optimistic (p. 62). Brill de Ramírez supports uncritically Taiiaki Alfred’s assertion that “with very few exceptions, universities are sites of production of imperial values and ethics,” which makes one wonder where rightwing critics such as David Horowitz get all their ammunition to accuse universities of being bastions of uncritical liberalism (p. 211).

The central message of this book is that the “ethnographic record presents far greater degrees of complexity and obfuscation than has even been realized to date. Well over a century of textualized stories produced via ethnographic scholarship lies in need of conversive clarity” (p. 211). However, this jargon- and speculation-filled book is a very questionable example of clarity, and while the author writes about the past naivety of readers of “as told to” autobiographies, she does not help her case by admiringly quoting Wilson Follett’s 1938 *New York Times* review of *Son of Old Man Hat* to the effect “that men of ostensible science . . . can so readily detect all manner of profound, subtle significance in so problematic a document is to the layman a matter of chronic amazement. . . . For the veritable scientist of race, culture, mind—the scientist who derives his generalizations from fixed data through a funnel of generalization—the pertinent attitude would seem to be that of the dying Goethe’s unfulfillable demand, ‘More light!’” (p. 133). I want to make the same demand for more light after reading all the “profound, subtle significance” that Brill de Ramírez’s literary criticism has attempted to bring to Left Handed’s life story as recorded by Walter Dyk in *Son of Old Man Hat*.

Northern Arizona University

JON REYHNER

After the Massacre: The Violent Legacy of the San Sabá Mission. By Robert S. Weddle, trans. by Carol Lipscomb. (Lubbock: Texas Tech University Press, 2007. Pp. 216. Illustrations, map, appendices, notes, bibliography, index. ISBN 0-89672-596-0. \$32.95, cloth.)

With *After the Massacre*, Robert S. Weddle offers a valuable follow-up not only to his own 1964 work, *The San Sabá Mission: Spanish Pivot in Texas*, but also to the documentary collection, *The San Sabá Papers*, edited by Leslie Byrd Simpson and Paul D. Nathan. In this new study, he makes available a translation of a recently discovered diary of the 1759 military campaign sent to avenge the 1758 destruction of Mission Santa Cruz de San Sabá by a force of allied Indian nations from across northern Texas and the southern Plains. The diary, written by Capt. Juan Ángel de Oyarzún who led a company of fifty men from San Luis Potosí to participate in

the campaign, came to light in 1979 while Weddle was completing research at the Biblioteca de la Real Academia de la Historia in Madrid, Spain. Beyond the text of the diary which, with two reports written by Diego Ortiz Parrilla at the conclusion of the campaign, constitutes a third of the text, the book puts the events detailed in the diary in perspective with other interpretations from documentary, historical, and archaeological sources.

In a series of nine narrative chapters, Weddle carefully highlights the wide-ranging information made available by the diary itself as well as contextualizing the decisions and actions of Spanish participants as events unfolded in 1758, 1759, and the years that followed this critical pivot in Texas history. For instance, individual chapters explain the state of Spanish knowledge, manpower, and preparation, chart the route of the expedition, mine the diary for the natural history of the region, and tell the story of twentieth-century archaeological searches for the sites of San Sabá mission and presidio as well as the site of battle at a Taovaya settlement on the present-day Texas-Oklahoma border.

In his narrative coverage of the campaign's military endeavors, Weddle first tackles the expedition's sole claim to "victory," in its attack on a Yojuane village, but agrees with recent arguments that the Yojuanes were most likely innocent of any participation in the destruction of Mission San Sabá. His discussion of the main battle at the fortified Taovaya settlement on the Red River explores how the campaign came to be interpreted and judged by Spanish contemporaries as well as by historians from the late eighteenth century through the present day. He is particularly concerned with addressing whether Spanish authorities and later scholars were too harsh in their critiques of the expedition's failures; was it indeed the "disgraceful rout" described by so many for so long? Though Weddle concludes that the evidence of the diary is not sufficient to provide clear rebuttal to claims of the expedition's hasty retreat in the face of dominant Indian opponents, he also outlines a fascinating tale of intermilitary intrigue and rivalry. As it turns out, a "malicious slander campaign" by Felipe de Rábago y Terán, who bitterly resented Ortiz Parrilla when he was given command of Rábago's former garrison in the wake of Rábago's criminal misdoings on the Texas frontier, may have undermined the firsthand accounts of Ortiz Parrilla and Oyarzún in favor of agitated rhetoric bemoaning the "disgrace to the king's arms" suffered at the hands of Taovayas and Comanches. Weddle concludes his investigation with evaluations of the impact the battle campaign had on the fortunes of Spanish and Wichita participants and Spanish-Wichita relations.

The accompanying appendices present Oyarzún's diary and Ortiz Parrilla's accompanying *Consulta* and *Carta Consultiva* in clear and readable English as translated by Carol Lipscomb. It is unfortunate that rising publishing costs seem to prohibit the inclusion of the original Spanish text alongside the translation, but accompanying illustrations and photographs do make a valuable addition to this work. Altogether, Weddle has made yet another welcome and important contribution to our expanding understanding of Texas's Spanish past.