



PROJECT MUSE®

Fitzgerald and Hemingway

Albert J. DeFazio

American Literary Scholarship, 1998, pp. 179-194 (Article)

Published by Duke University Press



➔ For additional information about this article
<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/38033>

10 Fitzgerald and Hemingway

Albert J. DeFazio III

Place and genre join the perennial issues of gender, race, and class this year. And on the eve of centennial celebrations for Hemingway, debates about authenticity abound. Abroad, *The Times of London* (25 Sept.) reports that a 275-lot auction of Hemingway memorabilia was halted when the items were discovered to be bogus; at home, Joan Didion cries foul at the impending publication of *True at First Light* (NY 9 Nov.: 74–80), while others welcome the prospect of a fifth posthumous work from Hemingway, who has offered readers something “new” for eight consecutive decades. Scholars continue to be well served by editor Susan F. Beegel’s *Hemingway Review*, an annual source of a dozen solid articles and half as many more notes and reviews. Making a rare editorial intrusion, Beegel brings to bear her experience as editor, explaining how and why the journal selects articles for publication (“The Journal in the Jungle: *The Hemingway Review* and the Contemporary Academy,” *HN* 17, ii: 5–17). What is more, in as lucid and succinct a fashion as we have seen, Beegel charts Hemingway’s posthumous reputation and demonstrates that interest in him—measurable in terms of entries in the *MLA Bibliography*—has increased by 125 percent since 1961, typically placing him ahead of all 20th-century writers and behind only Henry James and Herman Melville from the 19th. Publication on Fitzgerald wanes this year, which finds biographers silent and the Cambridge edition between volumes. But even during this hiatus following the great surge generated by the centenary in 1996, Fitzgerald still garners scholarship in every area of this survey, and nearly every piece is important. Both authors share the careful attention of editors J. Gerald Kennedy and Jackson R. Bryer, whose *French Connections: Hemingway and Fitzgerald Abroad* gathers the best papers from the Hemingway/Fitzgerald Conference held in Paris in 1994 and supplements them with commissioned essays by veteran

scholars. The result is a balanced anthology addressing the role of France in the lives and works of both men.

i Letters, the Archives, Texts, and Bibliography

Alan Margolies's edition of *The Beautiful and Damned* (Oxford) emends 15 accidentals from the first edition, includes a selected bibliography, a chronology, and an appendix of thorough explanatory notes. Margolies's introduction describes the evolution of the manuscript and the attendant struggles with composition, the influences (including Frank Norris and H. L. Mencken), the critical response, particularly to Fitzgerald's illustration of the prejudices of his characters, and the biographical parallels of alcoholic decline. Last year I noted that the 1996 printing of *The Great Gatsby* reflected emendations that Matthew J. Bruccoli favored but was prevented from incorporating in earlier printings (*retinas* to *irises* and *Astoria* to *Long Island City*); Cambridge University Press announced, then, that the unannounced changes were made in error and will reverse them in the next printing. Unscathed, however, is Bruccoli's rejection of *running board* in favor of *dashboard*, which is Fitzgerald's word in the manuscript and the revised proofs. Acknowledging that Fitzgerald occasionally had difficulties with details, he contends that *dashboard* is the correct and accurate term because cars of the '20s had nearly vertical windshields, and provided that the top were down one could easily strike that jaunty pose, resting one's posterior against the dashboard.

Bruccoli's *F. Scott Fitzgerald Collection Notes, No. 5*, published at the Thomas Cooper Library (University of South Carolina), records new additions, among them a glass color slide used as a preview for the 1926 movie version of *Gatsby*. Curator of the Hemingway Room at the John F. Kennedy Library, Stephen Plotkin supplies "News from the Hemingway Collection" (*HN* 17, ii: 143–44). With the generous help of many colleagues, particularly Jackson R. Bryer, I continue to compile bibliographies for the *Hemingway Review* (*HN* 17, ii: 132–42; 18, i: 114–29) and the *Fitzgerald Society Newsletter* (8: 28–34).

ii Biography

Editors Ruth Prigozy, Jackson R. Bryer, and Alan Margolies have nurtured the *The F. Scott Fitzgerald Society Newsletter* (No. 8) through its

growth in girth and significance. The best source for information on news, notes, current bibliography, and conferences, this annual also includes timely book reviews, even for hard-to-find foreign texts—Horst H. Kruse reports on German publications (p. 26), Bryer on Indian (p. 27). Linda Patterson Miller notes the passing of Honoria Murphy Donnelly (pp. 18–21); and Prigozy does the same for the distinguished Fitzgerald scholar John Kuehl. Seymour I. Toll contributes “Biggs and Fitzgerald: An Untold Story” (pp. 10–15), which sketches the relationship between the Princeton classmates, fellow writers, and friends, including Biggs’s tenure as Fitzgerald’s executor (he was left “the estate of a pauper and the will of a millionaire . . .”).

Charles Oliver glides through his 18th year as editor of the *Hemingway Newsletter* (No. 36), keeping readers abreast of centennial happenings, WWW resources, books recent and forthcoming, and news, including a note on Martha Gellhorn who died this year, as did Antonio Ordóñez. David Sandison’s *Ernest Hemingway: An Illustrated Biography* (Chicago Review) marshals the facts of its subject’s life, wedging familiar text between mostly familiar photographs; devoid of both index and bibliography, this volume will probably find a home in the high school library. John Raeburn examines “Hemingway on Stage: *The Fifth Column*, Politics, and Biography” (*HN* 18, i: 5–16), concluding that biographers have overlooked the author’s political interest in the Spanish Civil War and therefore have left uncharted the process by which “he transformed himself from a propagandist with Stalinist inclinations into a political novelist of the first magnitude.”

iii Sources, Influences, Parallels

Source studies flourish, particularly for Hemingway, whose enormous reading and, as we are discovering, his substantial debt to that reading long remained shrouded by the erroneous characterization of him as a “dumb ox.” Gautam Kundu’s “Inadvertent Echoes or ‘An Instance of Apparent Plagiarism’? Cather’s *My Ántonia*, *A Lost Lady*, and Fitzgerald’s *The Great Gatsby*” (*EA* 51: 325–37) focuses on Fitzgerald’s indebtedness to Cather regarding point of view, characterization, imagery, and phrasing. The novels are “umbilically connected,” the result of Fitzgerald’s new-found interest in matters of form and his appreciation for Cather’s aesthetic principles. Roger L. Tarr’s “Marjorie Kinnan Rawlings Meets F. Scott Fitzgerald: The Unpublished Accounts” (*JML* 22: 165–74)

mines unpublished and partially published letters and a sketch by Rawlings to detail their meeting in the fall of 1936, when Fitzgerald was suffering from writer's block, alcoholism, poor press, and a broken shoulder. Prompted by Maxwell Perkins, whose "genius rested as much on his compassion as on his editorial skills," Rawlings persevered in initiating a meeting with Fitzgerald, which she recounts in vivid detail in her sketch, "Scott," here printed in full. Exploring the impact of photography on the work of both Hemingway and Fitzgerald is Constance Pierce's "Fear of Photography" (*LIT* 8: 295–304). Reflecting on the photographic images in *The Garden of Eden*, "In Another Country," and "The Snows of Kilimanjaro," Pierce concludes that Hemingway is the "ethicist," concerned with the camera's propensity to deceive; *The Great Gatsby* prompts her to call Fitzgerald the "esthete" who uses the buffoon Chester McKee to represent debased art, which hangs on the wall like ectoplasm.

Another study focusing on visual metaphors is William E. H. Meyer Jr.'s "Faulkner, Hemingway, *et al.*: The Emersonian Test of American Authorship" (*MissQ* 51: 557–71), which contrasts Faulkner's "Old World aristocratic lyricism" with Hemingway's "hypervisuality." "Faulkner may be a greater writer or word-smith than Hemingway; but Hemingway will forever remind us of Faulkner's failure to transcend Southern lyricism and an aristocratic, Old World diction for the democratic prose-imagism of New World aesthetics and perception." For Americans, it is the seeing that is important; the sound and the fury are apparently the purview of mere regionalists. Expanding the discussion of Hemingway and the visual arts is Theodore L. Galliard Jr.'s "Hemingway's Debt to Cézanne: New Perspectives" (*TCL* 45: 65–78), which uses passages from the short stories and the novels to "show how representative paintings by Cézanne embody a range of methods that Hemingway incorporated into his writings, significantly strengthening the symbolic impact of his narrative point of view, setting, and character focus." Galliard focuses on various forms of omission, including "effective shifts in perspective and narrative point of view," "the blank-canvas power of the implied but unspoken," "the telling detail of clothing or expression in a 'portrait,'" and "the repetition of symbolic vertical and horizontal planes in indoor and outdoor settings." By applying such visual techniques to verbal settings, Hemingway invites from his readers comparisons that focus their attention on the symbolic meaning of details and imagery. Alistair Highet contemplates cinematic versions of masculinity in "*Casablanca*, Hum-

phrey Bogart, the Oedipus Complex, and the American Male" (*Psychoanalytic Review* 85: 761–74), which calls the film "a prototype for the screen heroics that have followed it" and notes that it "throws light on a particular style of assumed masculinity—the stoical, American strain that gets its finest, broad articulation in the stories of Ernest Hemingway, and which predominates in film narratives today."

Frederic J. Svoboda's gem, "Who Was That Black Man?: A Note on Eugene [Jacques] Bullard and *The Sun Also Rises*" (*HN* 17, ii: 105–10), identifies the drummer at Zelli's Jazz Club and observes his parallels with Jake: he is an American from Georgia, fluent in French, in love with a member of the nobility, a wounded veteran of the Great War who fought in the trenches before earning his aviator's wings, a boxer, and owner of *Le Grand Duc*, a nightclub where he employed the young Langston Hughes and entertained Hemingway. The "nigger drummer," like the "nigger" Bugs in "The Battler," is more than he seems to Jake: the reality behind the name, the unexposed portion of the iceberg, is "a warning to Jake and Brett" of the delta between perception and reality.

Nancy Bredendick's source study, "*Toros célebres*: Its Meaning in *Death in the Afternoon*" (*HN* 17, ii: 64–77), explains how Hemingway uses a little book about famous bulls to illustrate essential concepts from the bullfight as he urges the casual spectator to become the knowledgeable aficionado. Typically, he selects freakish accidents or grotesque spectacles by way of helping his readers distinguish between art and mere action and evoking from them the emotions proper to the art. Susan M. Catalano's note, "Henpecked to Heroism: Placing Rip Van Winkle and Francis Macomber in the American Renegade Tradition" (*HN* 17, ii: 111–17), explains how these reluctant renegades confront spousal tyranny, compel sympathy, and become antiheroes.

Peter L. Hays challenges the presumption that Hemingway's writing is exclusively autobiographical and champions the author's ability to invent in "Hemingway Raids the Library for *For Whom the Bell Tolls*" (*HN* 18, i: 98–102). Hays discovers sources in H. R. Knickerbocker's *The Siege of Alcazar: A Warlog of the Spanish Revolution* and Thomas Carlyle's *The French Revolution* and provides some convincing parallel texts to prove his point. Sherry Lutz Zivley suggests a source for various plot elements in the novel's final chapter in "The Conclusions of Azuela's *The Underdogs* and Hemingway's *For Whom the Bell Tolls*" (*HN* 17, ii: 118–23), but she concludes that Hemingway elaborates his borrowed elements "with a modernist consciousness that includes concern and grief for the death of

one's comrades, an awareness of nature and a yearning for its solace, reluctance to kill even an enemy soldier, and the admission of fear."

iv Criticism

a. Full-Length Studies: Fitzgerald Robert L. Gale's *An F. Scott Fitzgerald Encyclopedia* (Greenwood) provides a very brief chronology before plunging into the alphabetized entries, which present the essential action in Fitzgerald's novels, short stories, and plays, names the characters and suggests their significance, includes helpful individual end-of-entry bibliographies, and graciously acknowledges his debt to a host of veteran scholars. A typical entry for a story identifies the characters and plot, eschewing evaluative commentary. There are biographical entries as well (regarding Hemingway, Gale grows caustic: "Ultimately, Fitzgerald proved more courageous than Hemingway in confronting agonies: Fitzgerald died while supporting his family and trying to finish *The Last Tycoon*; Hemingway blew his head off.") and a thorough index. Were it the only encyclopedia of Fitzgerald's work available, we would be thankful and content with Gale's 500 pages of solid information; but Mary Jo Tate's *F. Scott Fitzgerald A to Z* (1998), which arrived in time to be covered last year (see *AmLS* 1997, p. 189), is a more appealing reference work on several counts: direct quotations enliven the biographical entries; black-and-white photographs, illustrations, and maps supplement the narrative; and five important bibliographies appear in the appendix.

b. Full-Length Studies: Hemingway Jopi Nyman's *Hard-Boiled Fiction and Dark Romanticism* (Peter Lang) focuses on the relationship between tough masculinist narratives and romance, especially as they relate to the theme of the wasteland and to Gothic conventions. Nyman reads the death of Harry Morgan as "the end of the American dream" and argues that hard-boiled fiction is antimodern because its pathos and romanticism represent a nostalgia for the past, for tradition and traditional gender codes. An indulgent review of criticism and plot summaries of doubtful necessity make this a slow read.

c. Collections Katie De Koster provides a fine starting point for readers new to *Gatsby* with her anthology, *Readings on The Great Gatsby* (Greenhaven). She reprints excerpts of criticism suitable for "young adults," dividing 19 selections with their brief headnotes into three categories:

“Who Is Jay Gatsby?” (character); “Reflections of America in *The Great Gatsby*” (the American Dream, immigration, and social issues); and “The Art of *The Great Gatsby*” (emphasizing point of view). A very brief biography leads the volume, and an even briefer list of further readings (and Web sites) concludes it. Dalton and Maryjean Gross have written and compiled *Understanding The Great Gatsby: A Student Casebook to Issues, Sources, and Historical Documents* (Greenwood). This text, best-suited for secondary students, opens with a dozen-page literary analysis and proceeds with very brief essays on Fitzgerald’s life and work, scandals of the ’20s, and “the woman question,” followed by a gathering of newspaper articles and first-person narratives. Although *F. Scott Fitzgerald: Centenary Essays from India*, ed. Mohan Ramanan (Prestige), escaped me, Jackson R. Bryer’s review (*Fitzgerald Society Newsletter* 8: 27) indicates that it contains unrevised conference papers from the Fitzgerald Centenary Seminar at the American Research Centre in Hyderabad in 1996. Many of these papers are brief, and some tread well-worn paths; nonetheless, a few of the comparative analyses (they include Nathanael West, Theodore Dreiser, Henry James, Richard Wright, Joseph Conrad, and Anita Desai, author of *Cry, the Peacock*) suggest provocative avenues of study.

Having graced us with *Five Decades . . .* in the 1970s and *Six Decades . . .* in the 1980s, editor Linda Wagner-Martin reprints 23 articles, most of them written in the past decade and not available in readily accessible books, together with Gertrude Stein’s review (1923) of *Three Stories and Ten Poems* and D. H. Lawrence’s review (1927) of *In Our Time*, in *Ernest Hemingway: Seven Decades of Criticism* (Mich. State). Wagner-Martin’s well-chosen selections and her arrangement announce some of the most salient changes in Hemingway studies: a half-dozen works treat *The Garden of Eden*; at least as many more address gender issues; and only seven are dedicated to either style or biography. The diverse methodologies at work here include psychoanalytic, linguistic, feminist, gender, and multiculturalist. Whereas the selections from the two earlier volumes were nearly exclusively male, *Seven Decades*, with 11 of its items authored by women, represents another important shift: female scholars are more than ever bringing their varied and informed perspectives to bear on Hemingway’s canon.

Dovetailing neatly with J. Gerald Kennedy’s *Imagining Paris* (see *AmLS* 1993, pp. 124, 135–36) is *French Connections: Hemingway and Fitzgerald Abroad* (St. Martin’s), ed. Kennedy and Jackson R. Bryer. They

preface the anthology with "Recovering the French Connections of Hemingway and Fitzgerald" (pp. vii–xv), reminding readers of the whens and wheres of an important literary and personal relationship that began in Paris and endured until Fitzgerald's death in Hollywood 15 years later. The 13 revised conference papers and 4 commissioned essays are evenhanded, valuable, and sensibly arranged. The opening section, "Overviews: Two American Writers in Paris," supplies a context. George Wickes's "The Right Place at the Right Time" (pp. 3–14) explains the allure of Paris to the two authors, their sundry responses to the city, and their literary associations. Scott Donaldson's "Fitzgerald's Blue Pencil" (pp. 15–29) documents Fitzgerald's generous assistance in directing Hemingway toward Scribner, the sound editorial advice dispensed regarding both "Fifty Grand" and *The Sun Also Rises*, and Hemingway's attempt to minimize the significance of this help in *A Moveable Feast*.

The volume's second section, "Hemingway in France," opens with H. R. Stoneback's "'Very Cheerful and Clean and Sane and Lovely': Hemingway's 'Very Pleasant Land of France'" (pp. 33–59), a well-documented tour of the land and the literature (*The Garden of Eden*, *A Moveable Feast*, *The Sun Also Rises*) that takes readers beyond Paris and into the French countryside, arguing that "the most neglected geography" of Hemingway's life represents not a "wasteland" but a "good country," an Eden. Robert A. Martin's "The Expatriate Predicament in *The Sun Also Rises*" (pp. 61–73) asks how the novel can be read as "American" and answers by explaining how Cohn, Gorton, and Barnes both internalize and reject American values, representing "the best and worst qualities of Americans abroad" and providing a "historical view of the expatriates with permanent value for those of us in the contemporary world." In "The City of Brothel Love" (pp. 75–100) Claude Caswell discusses the "prostitution motif pervading Hemingway's first major novel," focusing on Georgette's foreshadowing of Brett Ashley and identifying the "prostitute as an essential trope in his art." Welford Dunaway Taylor's "A Shelter from *The Torrents of Spring*" (pp. 101–19) proposes that, more than a mere contract-breaker with Boni & Liveright or a satire of his one-time mentor and friend Sherwood Anderson, the parody was prompted by Hemingway's "anxiety of influence" brought about by his intensive reading, particularly of Turgenev, during his early years in Paris. Another literary relationship, this one with Gertrude Stein, is the subject of Kirk Curnutt's "In the temps de Gertrude" (pp. 121–39);

examining the minor essays and unpublished manuscripts, Curnutt revisits the issue of who instructed whom and reflects on Hemingway's maliciousness in denying Stein's influence. William Braasch Watson's "The Other Paris Years of Ernest Hemingway" (pp. 141–58) explores the eight Spanish Civil War stories that he wrote during his 1937 and 1938 visit to Paris and illustrates their importance as a transition from his less commercially successful writing of the early '30s to his highly successful *For Whom the Bell Tolls* (1940).

Ruth Prigozy's "Fitzgerald, Paris, and the Romantic Imagination" (pp. 161–71) leads the third section of *French Connections*, "Fitzgerald and France," her own essay addressing his method of incorporating the nation into his fiction, the remaining tracts focusing on *Tender is the Night*. Prigozy determines that Fitzgerald's depiction of Paris derives less from the observable, concrete details than from three other sources that he sifted through his complex romantic imagination: tourist brochures and other aspects of pop culture, literary sources, and "an Emersonian extension of the self into . . . 'a world elsewhere.'" John F. Callahan writes elegantly in "'France was a Land': F. Scott Fitzgerald's Expatriate Theme in *Tender is the Night*" (pp. 173–86) of the novel's possessing "a vividness of place that intensifies its American characters' sense of alienation from self and country." In "The Figure on the Bed: Difference and American Destiny in *Tender is the Night*" (pp. 187–213) Felipe Smith uses the correspondence and the manuscripts to support his argument that "Fitzgerald stages the Peterson murder as a quintessentially American sex/race dilemma in Paris first to demonstrate the way that Paris exacerbated disturbing American Jazz Age social trends and second to illustrate that the 'freest' of Americans, having escaped the imaginative limitations of their native institutions by fleeing to this expatriate paradise, thereby only accelerated their decline." Paris was what Fitzgerald feared: "a hedonistic paradise without social boundaries" where microcolonies were "no longer stratified by law, custom, or violence into a manageable social hierarchy." "The Influence of France on Nicole Diver's Recovery in *Tender is the Night*" (pp. 215–32) is Jacqueline Tavernier-Courbin's focus; she argues that the catalyst for Nicole's emancipation is an overheard conversation between two gardeners that reveals the "simple eroticism of the Mediterranean" and verifies the "rightness" of her affair with Tommy Barban.

In the anthology's final section, "Intertextual French Connections,"

Jacqueline Vaught Brogan pursues Hemingway's rivalry with Fitzgerald in "Strange Fruits in the *Garden of Eden*" (pp. 235–56), which details the ways in which *Eden* and *A Moveable Feast* define their author's ethical stance with relation to race, gender, and capitalism. James Plath in "*The Sun Also Rises* as 'A Greater Gatsby': 'Isn't It Pretty to Think So?'" (pp. 257–75) proposes that *The Sun* began as a parody of his rival's successful work but then took on "a life of its own, its theme partially deriving from [Hemingway's] criticism of Fitzgerald's view of the world." In "Madwomen on the Riviera: The Fitzgeralds, Hemingway, and the Matter of Modernism" (pp. 277–96) Nancy R. Comley reflects on the intertextuality of *Tender*, *Eden*, and Zelda's *Save Me the Waltz*, three works which posit the French Riviera of the '20s as the key scene of modernism. Robert E. Gajdusek's "The Metamorphosis of Fitzgerald's Dick Diver and Its Hemingway Analogs" (pp. 297–316) argues that *Tender*'s depiction of the demise of patriarchal authority and rise of a matriarchate influences *Eden*'s sexual and cultural transformations. Closing the volume and challenging the critical commonplace of the expatriate experience as positive and liberating is J. Gerald Kennedy's "Figuring the Damage" (pp. 317–43); the recollections featured in "Snows" and "Babylon Revisited" suggest that the Left Bank was a destructive rather than liberating force.

Although Paul Smith passed away in 1996, the founding president of the Hemingway Society and author of *A Reader's Guide to the Short Fiction of Ernest Hemingway* (1989) still manages to delight and instruct with *New Essays on Hemingway's Short Fiction* (Cambridge). Smith's introduction (pp. 1–18), written with the knowledge that, like Hemingway's old man at the Ebro bridge, he would go no farther, having literally run out of time and space, echoes his "last challenge" to the "practical reader": "to be always open to possibilities, to remain humble enough to trust the story, and to remain skeptical enough to think for yourself." Nancy R. Comley and Robert Scholes turn their gaze to "Up in Michigan" (pp. 19–45) and insist that the story need not be read as about rape or seduction, as has been the recent tendency, but as "a classic confrontation between female tenderness and male sexual drive"; and while Hemingway's sympathies are fully enlisted on the female side of the equation, he has left interpretation open. James Phelan, discussing narrative technique in "Now I Lay Me" (pp. 47–72), finds the story disconcerting because of tensions between the cognitive, emotive, and ethical

components of his reading. Susan F. Beegel gives “Fathers and Sons” an ecological reading that puts dozens of details under the microscope and concludes pensively, contemplating Nick and his son “headed down the American highway toward a diminished future with no known pre-historic analogue” (pp. 75–110). Debra A. Modellmog’s postcolonial reading of “The Snows of Kilimanjaro” (pp. 111–36) considers the story’s critique of wealth and materialism but does not find that imperialism in itself is condemned.

d. General Essays Bert Bender’s “‘His Mind Aglow’: The Biological Undercurrent in Fitzgerald’s *Gatsby* and Other Works” (*JAmS* 32: 399–420) discusses how evolutionary biology (eugenics, accident and heredity, and sexual selection) underlies Fitzgerald’s concern with social hierarchy, his interest in time, money, Spengler and other naturalists, and his negative portrayal of male violence. Bender finds Fitzgerald’s plot in *Gatsby* to be in accord with the fundamental “ontogenetic fact”: that within the egg is “the chain of generation,” and Gatsby could do nothing to compensate for the fact that he and Daisy came from different strata.

Stephen P. Clifford’s engaging *Beyond the Heroic “I”: Reading Lawrence, Hemingway, and “Masculinity”* (Bucknell) gives equal attention to both authors, is indebted to the theories of Teresa de Lauretis, and aims to “recognize the multiple voices and narrative possibilities” in Lawrence’s and Hemingway’s fiction. Clifford, well acquainted with existing scholarship, focuses on “the ways that the narrative of a single work has been influenced by the construction of gender and the expression of narrative desire within that text and by the various critical readers of that text.” His chapter on *In Our Time* considers rape in “Up in Michigan,” race in “The Battler,” and desire in “Cat in the Rain,” concluding that these are polyphonic narratives “in which various diverse voices all share similar expressions in a narrative mapping of differences.” He challenges the myth of Hemingway’s misogyny in “‘We could have had such a damned good time together [if only you had a penis]’: Critical Phallogentrism and *The Sun Also Rises*” by reevaluating the core assumptions of the narrator and concluding that “Brett Ashley is not the formulaic Sleeping Beauty whose desires are limited to her performance as monster or prize in relation with the quest hero, and neither may we presume that Jake Barnes or any of Hemingway’s other protagonists are as fixed as the traditional epic hero.” Frederic Henry’s “conflict with masculinity” and

rejection of the role of hero is Clifford's last subject in a work that offers readings of time-honored cruxes in Hemingway's fiction informed by both relevant Hemingway scholarship and contemporary theory.

Carl P. Eby's "Ernest Hemingway and the Mirror of Manhood: Fetishism, Transvestism, Homeovestism, and Perverse *Méconnaissance*" (*ArQ* 54, iii: 27–68) argues that the Catherines of *Farewell* and *Eden* "represent on some level the split-off feminine half of Hemingway's ego"; Eby uses unpublished letters to support his claim that "Hemingway can serve as a model of manhood precisely because he left us an eloquent, and at times courageous, record of how one man constructed his own masculinity." Ernest Lockridge's "*Othello* as Key to Hemingway" (*HN* 18, i: 68–77) aligns Jake Barnes, Frederic Henry, and Colonel Cantwell with Shakespeare's play: the first is Hemingway's vision of an "honest Iago"; the second a sweet, sleeping, lingering fool who is unaware of his betrayal; and the last a perverse braggart, intent upon cuckoldry.

Jacqueline Vaught Brogan returns us to the question of genre in "*In Our Time: A Cubist Anatomy*" (*HN* 17, ii: 31–46), finding the aesthetic bent to be cubist, the generic type to be anatomy—or Menippean satire, as defined by Northrop Frye in *Anatomy of Criticism*. Hemingway's anatomy of our time studies "domination, violence, indifference (even racism and sexism)" and emerges as a "deeply ethical text, radically concerned with the way we see and will see the world." If he did not fully grasp this in 1923–25, when he was composing the first stories, then surely he understood it by 1930, when he added "On the Quai at Smyrna" as an "Introduction" to his collection of stories and interchapters depicting a violent world.

Gender has long been an issue in Hemingway's writing, and David J. Ferrero cleverly transposes the gender relationships in stories from *In Our Time* ("Nikki Adams and the Limits of Gender Criticism," *HN* 17, ii: 18–30), yoking his invented female, "Nikki," with the trials (the prospect of marriage and paternity) that Hemingway grants to Nick Adams. Ferrero rejects allegations of misogyny that began 60 years ago with Edmund Wilson and continued in Leslie Fiedler, observing that when "a male author interrogates the social institutions that obligate men to women, he is a misogynist. When a woman writes of women imposed upon by men and the same institutions, she is a feminist." Nick's ambition is to "define himself as a man," not to become one of the men without women. Scott Donaldson's "Ernest Hemingway," pp. 169–95 in *American Writers: Retrospective Supplement I* (Scribner), revises and

extends Philip Young's essay, which appeared in 1959 as part of Minnesota's "Pamphlets on American Writers" series.

e. Essays on Specific Works: Fitzgerald The narrator of *Gatsby* continues to attract commentary. Laura Barrett in "'Material Without Being Real': Photography and the End of Reality in *The Great Gatsby*" (*SNNTS* 30: 540–57) suggests that the numerous photographs and advertisements supply "a technological parallel for Nick's solipsizing vision and suggest that all sight in the Jazz Age is askew." Nick filters and shapes his narrative in much the same fashion that the photographer creates his images; however, at the novel's conclusion, "Nick's inability to thrive in a material world permits him to revert to an imaginary construction of the past," and the photographic medium, which is generally associated with clarity and realism, becomes an instrument of instability. George W. Layng's "Fitzgerald's *The Great Gatsby*" (*Expl* 56: 93–95) explores how loss is redeemed through speech with reference to the "elusive rhythm[s]" and "lost words . . . heard somewhere a long time ago." Gatsby, who can vividly recall his past with Daisy, is initially contrasted with Nick, whose past "is at best a vague feeling and for the most part lost"; but their roles reverse as Gatsby loses his sense of the past when his affair with Daisy fails, whereas Nick's "new ability to recall echoes of his life" helps him to mature and endure as Gatsby could not.

Michael E. Nowlin's "'The World's Rarest Work': Modernism and Masculinity in Fitzgerald's *Tender is the Night*" (*CollL* 25, ii: 58–77) considers the novel in light of Fitzgerald's remark, "I would rather be an artist than a careerist," and suggests that Diver's mission is "to redeem the character of paternal authority in the American-fueled consumer paradise that succeeded the Great War." Aligning his own tendencies with Diver and pairing his friend Hemingway with Barban, Fitzgerald is able to explore the "polarities of masculine desire," which switch between the compulsion to be desired by women or the desire to repudiate femininity through some form of violence.

f. Essays on Specific Works: Hemingway Scholars increasingly are treating the range of Hemingway's canon, and while the major novels continue to garner studies, current assessments also treat *Death in the Afternoon*, *To Have and Have Not*, and *Across the River and into the Trees* (with *Garden of Eden* well-covered in collections). George Monteiro brings an unpublished letter to light in "Maxwell Perkins's Plan for *The*

First Forty-Eight" (HN 18, i: 92–97), explaining that Hemingway rejected Perkins's suggestion that the stories be arranged in order of composition, favoring instead "to preserve the progress of the Nick Adams drama" by reprinting the stories as they appeared in the original collections. Hillary K. Justice's "'Well, well, well': Cross-Gendered Autobiography and the Manuscript of 'Hills Like White Elephants'" (HN 18, i: 17–32) brings an array of textual and biographical evidence to bear upon this story, which is often read in terms of Jig's response to her husband's persistent plea that she have an abortion. Justice finds that much of the dialogue "can almost miraculously support two equal and opposite meanings"; that being the case, she concludes that the story is about more than the end of a relationship or contemplation of an abortion.

In Ken Ryan's "The Contentious Emendation of Hemingway's 'A Clean, Well-Lighted Place'" (HN 18, i: 78–91) we return to the debate about antimetronomic dialogue. Ryan's "works cited" is now the best starting point for researching this long-standing controversy. Following a succinct review of an issue that has been considered for 40 years, Ryan concludes emphatically that the error was not typographical, that the variously attributed lines of dialogue were in fact part of Hemingway's ambition, and that the emendation ought to be retracted. For first-year students who suffer from "text reticence, and its evil twin, the dubious deduction," Richard Duguet's "The Trial of Margaret Macomber: A Classroom Exercise in Fact Finding and Literary Analysis" (*Teaching English in the Two-Year College* 25, ii: 159–60) proposes turning the classroom into a courtroom and making the students stick to the text as they pursue the truth.

Two treatments of *The Sun Also Rises* address gender and religion. David Blackmore's "'In New York It'd Mean I Was a . . .': Masculinity Anxiety and Period Discourses of Sexuality in *The Sun Also Rises*" (HN 18, i: 49–67) seeks to locate the novel "in a historical context of early twentieth-century discourses regulating gender and sexuality by enforcing these binarisms" and determines that Hemingway ultimately "retreats from the potentially radical gesture of disconnecting manhood from its arbitrarily determined, contradictory cultural signifiers." Ron Berman's "Protestant, Catholic, Jew: *The Sun Also Rises*" (HN 18, i: 33–48) charts the ideological arguments among the three religions reflected in the narrative. Overlooked last year is Clarence Lindsay's study of psychological "places," "Consequential Identity in Hemingway's *A Farewell*

to *Arms* (*Midamerica* 24 [1997]: 99–114), which identifies the “bewildering system of oppositions” (Austrian/Italian, male/female, romantic/real, among others) that are tropes for some of the novel’s overarching oppositions (war/peace, life/death, chaos/order). These oppositions, Lindsay argues, “structure the novel’s themes and at the same time express Frederic Henry’s apprehensive consciousness.”

Three works of the ’30s receive an essay apiece, focusing on genre, gender, and psychoanalysis. Michael Thurston’s “Genre, Gender, and Truth in *Death in the Afternoon*” (*HN* 17, ii: 47–61) addresses two issues: “the dramatization of authorship through generic conventions and the exploration of gender through a dialectic of nature and performance.” Identifying the genre as anatomy, Thurston finds that Hemingway “struggles for and subverts the notion of a stable and representable truth,” revealing an irresolvable dialectic which on the one hand seeks a static truth but on the other acknowledges truth’s dynamic nature. Toni D. Knott’s “One Man Alone: Dimensions of Individuality and Categorization in *To Have and Have Not*” (*HN* 17, ii: 78–87) seeks to elevate this novel’s status beyond its claim as one of the first gangster stories by examining the importance of connecting to others, specifically through marriage, and “individualizing,” foregoing the tendency to categorize others based on brief and superficial observations. Carl Eby, in “Rabbit Stew and Blowing Dorothy’s Bridges: Love, Aggression, and Fetishism in *For Whom the Bell Tolls*” (*TCL* 44: 204–18), joins a 60-year-old debate begun by Arturo Barera: why would Hemingway select a nickname for Maria that had a vulgar meaning in Spanish slang? With a quick nod to previous scholarship, Eby suggests that a split in Hemingway’s ego leaves him both informed and innocent of the multiple readings of “Rabbit”; likewise Jordan’s love/hate relationship with Maria is revealed by his attaching a vulgar nickname to a woman he clearly loves.

Works of the ’50s are examined for gender or ecological implications. Jopi Nyman’s “The Body Overconsumed: Masculinity and Consumerism in Ernest Hemingway’s *Across the River and into the Trees*” (*AmStScan* 30: 34–46) explores the construction and maintenance of masculinity in the novel, arguing that it “laments the loss of gendered (bodily and social) power” and that Colonel Cantwell’s death “is not tragic but rather a gendered solution to cultural change and the loss of autonomy.” As “the masculinized world of authentic European high culture” is supplanted by postwar American consumption and mass culture, the male body becomes “overconsumed, terminally ill and ready to depart from

the world. The future belongs to objects, not individuals.” Nudging readings of Santiago’s adventure beyond the “Christian parable” and the “fighter code” is Eric Waggoner’s “Inside the Current: A Taoist Reading of *The Old Man and the Sea*” (*HN* 17, ii: 88–104), which provides a new ecological reading; while previous evaluations fault the old fisherman for plundering or misunderstanding his marine environment, Waggoner praises his recognition of the interconnectedness of the spiritual and natural worlds, and holds that the story is not merely about action but constitutes a “rumination on the awareness of essence and precision from which that action arises.”

Finally, Craig Boreth’s culinary biography, *The Hemingway Cookbook* (Chicago Review), presents recipes for the dishes and drinks that Hemingway’s life and work made famous. A thorough bibliography, rare photographs, and a reprint of “The Fable of the Good Lion” complement Boreth’s narrative, which excerpts passages from the works, connects them to the life, and suggests how Hemingway’s art not only describes the emotions evoked by food but also re-creates those emotions in the reader.

George Mason University