PROJECT MUSE®

Halle Pietism, Colonial North America, and the Young United States (review)

Marie Basile McDaniel

Journal of the Early Republic, Volume 30, Number 1, Spring 2010, pp. 142-145 (Review)

Published by University of Pennsylvania Press

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/jer.0.0129>

➔ *For additional information about this article*

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/371956>

tive in judicial impeachments seemingly akin to the British model under which the Crown could remove a judge on receiving an address or petition from Parliament. Though it emerged from the research project that produced *Thomas Jefferson and Executive Power*, Bailey seems to have deemed this study not to fit within his book's borders and decided instead to publish it as a separate article. His reasoning as an author makes good sense, but I urge readers to obtain a copy of this excellent article so that they may read it alongside his equally valuable book.

Both the book and the article exemplify Bailey's historically sensitive and rigorous examination of a major constitutional thinker as he strives to preserve the integrity of his ideas while at the same time grappling with the real demands of political office. Writing with a clarity and vigor rare in academia, Bailey has given us work that is essential reading for anyone concerned with Thomas Jefferson as political or constitutional theorist, as working politician, or as president, and also for anyone concerned with the relationship between past and present in the often-vexed field of constitutional interpretation. Bailey's achievement is as great as that of David N. Mayer's fine monograph *The Constitutional Thought of Thomas Jefferson* (Charlottesville, VA, 2004), to which Bailey generously acknowledges his indebtedness.

R. B. BERNSTEIN, distinguished adjunct professor of law at New York Law School, is the author of *The Founding Fathers Reconsidered* (Oxford, UK, 2009) and *Thomas Jefferson* (Oxford, UK, 2003); he is now writing *The Education of John Adams*.

Halle Pietism, Colonial North America, and the Young United States.

Edited by Hans-Jürgen Grabbe. (Stuttgart, Germany: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2008. Pp. 321. Cloth, \$88.12.)

Reviewed by Marie Basile McDaniel

The collected articles in *Halle Pietism, Colonial North America, and the Young United States* detail the multifarious legacy of Halle's brand of pietism in North America, and to a lesser extent in England and India, from the late seventeenth to early nineteenth centuries. The theology, adherents, institutions, and networks of Halle's pietism profoundly affected the German-speaking peoples and their adaptation to the New

World, especially in Pennsylvania. The authors in this collection of articles draw on a variety of methods and sources to illustrate the “full panoply of Halle-inspired activities” (9), and the resulting articles, which were first presented at a conference in 2002, build and expand upon on another, sometimes disagreeing in interpretation but, like any really good conference, inspiring avenues for further investigation.

Each of the fourteen individual articles presents a different line of inquiry roughly fitting into one of five subthemes: theology, pastors, politics, science, and identity. Brought together, they clearly show that Halle’s pietism influenced more people than its pastors did, that those people influenced culture in more arenas than religion, and that religion was therefore important to colonial and early republic Americans. Some articles present a counterargument: instances in which Halle pietism failed to influence its students. Each article addresses the question of how much Halle could influence German speakers in America. Surprisingly, the answer is simultaneously a great deal and not at all.

Peter Vogt, Theodore Runyon, and A. G. Roeber set the groundwork for exploring the theological influences of Halle pietism. Vogt argues that German-speaking migrants to eighteenth-century Pennsylvania held theologically determined ideas about church, which influenced their capacity for adaptation and contributed to the rise of American religious pluralism. Runyon traces the innovative influence of pietistic theology—especially the experience of conversion, heart religion, mutual support institutions, public outreach, and lay leadership—on John Wesley and the rise of Methodism. Roeber, in turn, proceeds to the early nineteenth century, when Lutherans struggled over church order, yet stubbornly misinterpreted Martin Luther’s “Orders of Creation,” relegating marriage to a legal contract, rather than accepting the doctrinal influence that Luther intended.

Wolfgang Splitter, Norman Threinen, Mark Haberlein, and Marianne Wockeck move to the practitioners of Halle pietism and their influence over congregations. Splitter examines the near failure of Halle to procure adequate ministers for the congregations in Pennsylvania, with the subsequent establishment of an independent Lutheran ministerium in the state. Threinen builds on Splitter’s work by exploring the declining role of the aging Ziegenhagen, the man in charge of Halle’s pietistic missionary activities, in maintaining links with North America. Haberlein explores the consequences of the dearth of Halle-trained ministers in the Lancaster congregation that led to tensions between its laypeople and

pastors. And Wokeck challenges this decline by emphasizing the success of the pioneer pastors of the 1740s and 1750s who used the *Pfarrhaus* or parsonage as model of “exemplary Christian life” and thereby retained a visual link to Old World traditions (224).

Donald Durnbaugh, Paul Baglyos, and David Ellis explore politics, both within and without the church institutions upon which the pastors relied. Durnbaugh focuses on the acrimonious exchanges between two German-speaking leaders in Pennsylvania, Christopher Sauer and Henry Melchior Muhlenberg, over Bible printing, the distribution of medicines, and the Charity School movement, which was really a debate over theological and political influence. Baglyos examines the influence of Halle pietism on Muhlenberg’s middle son, Frederick, who became a politician in Pennsylvania, but whose studies at Halle solidified both his identity as an American and his disdain for material greed. Ellis explains how the political debates in Halle at the beginning of the nineteenth century over liberal or rational interpretations of the Bible encouraged Old Lutherans to migrate to the United States.

Carola Wessel and Renate Wilson have the tricky task of linking science and pietism in the age of Enlightenment. Wessel examines the few German-language broadsides in North America advertising books and medicines, illustrating the trade link between Halle and North America. Meanwhile Wilson uncovers the contribution of two German-speaking scientists and clergy, Gotthilf Heinrich Ernst Muhlenberg and Johann Chrisopher Kunze, who resurrected a “German-American network in the natural sciences” (236). Both Wessel and Wilson link the two continents, and the devotion of German-speaking leaders, to both pietism and academic study.

Last, Carla Mulford and Steven Nolt tackle the formation of German identity and ethnicity in America. Mulford reexamines Benjamin Franklin’s famous pronouncements on German inferiority within the context of an emergent British nationalistic discourse; these fears of national identity loss created new “ethnizing” divisions. Nolt explains why these ethnic divisions were so important to German speakers who resisted Charles Grandison Finney’s revivalist message, fearing that the broadly Protestant movement would intrude on their long-held attachment to personal freedom.

Fourteen articles, each individually stimulating, are brought together in a book that reads like a great conference with well-written, precirculated papers. I want to go to that conference and listen to the panelists

discuss their interpretations. How much do German speakers in America need Halle's interest? Which is more influential: the theological or non-theological aspects of Halle? Despite some inconsistency between the authors on the level of jargon, the book is accessible to a broadly academic audience, and of special interest to those studying Germans in America, Lutheran theology, the role of pastors, identity, ethnicity, use of print, and migration. Overall, it is the intellectual satisfaction of a conference without the headache of asking for travel funding.

MARIE BASILE MCDANIEL is a PhD candidate at the University of California, Davis. She is currently working on her dissertation, "'We Shall Not Differ in Heaven': Marriage, Revival and War in Philadelphia, 1710–1775."

The Making of a Southerner: William Barclay Napton's Private Civil War. By Christopher Phillips. (Columbia, MO: University of Missouri Press, 2008. Pp. vii, 162. Illustrations. Paper, \$19.95.)

Reviewed by Lillian Marrujo-Duck

Christopher Phillips's *The Making of a Southerner: William Barclay Napton's Private Civil War* narrates the experiences of a Jersey-born northerner, William Napton, whose desire for political, economic, and social status led him to the slave South, where he fully adopted an elitist, paternalistic ideology and lifestyle. In the process, Napton committed himself to the protection of slavery as a morally superior way of life and, after the Civil War and the end of slavery, he became a staunch advocate of Lost Cause mythology.

Phillips organizes Napton's life into well-researched chapters that begin with his early alienation from his father, representing his rejection of northern ethics, and end with the loss of his wife, representing Napton's sharing in the sacrifices made by the South during the Civil War. Phillips relies on an immense collection of primary sources, including Napton's detailed journals, numerous legal decisions, and family papers, all fleshed out by the latest scholarship on issues relating to the church, slavery, and politics. Phillips begins each new era of Napton's conversion with a set of lengthy entries from Napton's journal, most of which nicely illustrate the evolution of an adopted southerner's social and political views.