



PROJECT MUSE®

Freedom and Necessity: St. Augustine's Teaching on Divine Power and Human Freedom (review)

Donato Ogliari O.S.B.

The Catholic Historical Review, Volume 96, Number 1, January 2010,
pp. 92-93 (Review)

Published by The Catholic University of America Press
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/cat.0.0629>



➔ For additional information about this article
<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/369560>

cantly from other scholars such as André Grabar and Neil Moran. As he does elsewhere throughout the history, he provides texts—often in the original as well as translation—and clear, concise summaries of his arguments and conclusions. The general conclusion is a splendid example of theological reflection together with a truly moving coda on his life's work.

The most fascinating and valuable part of the book is Taft's excursus on the frequency of Eucharistic celebration and on the frequency of Holy Communion. As he ably demonstrates, these are distinct questions. His attention to detail makes it very difficult for the reader to hold onto what might have been cherished shibboleths—such as the opinion that solitary celebration of the Mass is an invention of the medieval West or that there ever was a golden age when everyone received Holy Communion regularly. As always, good historical research makes popular and easy generalizations difficult if not impossible.

This volume will serve as a gold standard not only for students of the Byzantine liturgy or liturgical historians in general but also for any scholar or student eager to understand how such a complex phenomenon as Christian ritual works and is understood. The introduction and conclusion should be required reading for any serious student of the liturgy—East and/or West.

School of Theology and Ministry, Boston College

JOHN F. BALDOVIN, S.J.

Freedom and Necessity: St. Augustine's Teaching on Divine Power and Human Freedom. By Gerald Bonner. (Washington, DC: The Catholic University of America Press. 2007. Pp. xii, 142. \$24.95 paperback. ISBN 978-0-813-21474-0)

Apart from the role played by "personal emotion" (p. 17), St. Augustine's unwavering fight against the Pelagians was ultimately due to his conviction that his doctrine of grace, and the consequent theory of predestination, was the expression of true orthodoxy. This was no novelty. The Pelagians, too, were convinced that their doctrinal position was consistent with Holy Scripture and the Church's tradition. In point of fact, at the origin of their controversy there was a different attitude as to the interpretation of Adam's Fall and its effects on his descendants. Augustine was adamant in asserting universal sinfulness: all human beings, as a result of the Fall, make up the *massa damnata* in that they inherit Adam's guilt—in the sense that they actually share his responsibility. In fact, even when baptized, their nature remains "corrupted" and cannot achieve good without the help of grace, which is ultimately responsible for perseverance and salvation. In his predestination, God mysteriously delivers from the *massa damnata* only those he wishes to save and leaves those who are not reached by his unfathomable mercy to be doomed eternally.

In opposition to Augustine, the Pelagians were at pains to stress that in spite of Adam's Fall, free will had not lost entirely the power of acting and pursuing good, and the ability to refrain from sinning. Therefore they rightly empha-

sized—although overoptimistically—man's responsibility. Moreover, they would contend that it would be impossible to maintain the agency of free will in the light of Augustine's somber doctrine of predestination whereby the election of the few and the consequent damnation of the many lay utterly in God's inscrutable designs. With regard to this, Gerald Bonner's conviction that, according to Augustine, "predestination whether to salvation or reprobation, is absolute" (p. 100) should be nuanced. It is certainly "absolute"—and positively so—with regard to salvation, but it could only be "relative" (in the sense that it can be inferred) with regard to reprobation. To maintain the contrary would mean to attribute to God the positive will to consign lots of people to perpetual damnation. Although we might indeed be left with the impression that "having proclaimed the mystery, Augustine then sought to defend it by argument" (p. 116), nevertheless it should be clear that predestination is a category that, set against the background of the *massa damnata*, must be applied *only* to salvation. In fact, however incomprehensible it may be, reprobation is merely a "consequence" of not being elected. In this light, the radicalization of Calvin's supralapsarian approach to predestination and its openness to a double predestination (see p. 46) does not translate Augustine's intention, although one may say that finally the result is the same.

Bonner masterfully synthesizes in a few chapters the difficult topic of the relationship between grace and free will and its extreme outcome, *viz.*, predestination. Although at times it lacks systematization, the presentation is on the whole quite balanced and often supported by primary sources. Finally, even the fact that the problems considered are set in a wider context and are interconnected with the different aspects of Augustine's theology and that of his opponents, it is not only a sign of a necessary, comprehensive approach but also a proof of Bonner's extensive knowledge of both Augustinism and Pelagianism. This is a sufficient guarantee for the book itself.

Abbazia Madonna della Scala
Noci, Italy

DONATO OGLIARI, O.S.B.

Empire Chrétien et Église aux IV^e et V^e Siècles: Intégration ou « Concordat »?: Le Témoignage du Code Théodosien: Actes du Colloque International (Lyon, 6, 7, et 8 octobre 2005). Edited by Jean-Noël Guinot and François Richard. (Paris: Institut des Sources Chrétiennes. Les éditions du Cerf. 2008. Pp. 485. €70,00. ISBN 978-2-204-08661-5.)

This book collects and publishes the papers delivered at an international conference held at Lyon in October 2005 in association with the publication of an edition of book XVI of the Theodosian Code in the series Sources Chrétiennes. Contributions in other languages have been translated into French. A useful composite bibliography has been compiled, but no index is provided, which would have facilitated the use of the book, since several laws are discussed, or at least cited, by several different contributors.