Mainland Passage: The Cultural Anomaly of Puerto Rico
(review)

Jorge Duany

The Americas, Volume 66, Number 3, January 2010, pp. 421-423 (Review)

Published by Cambridge University Press

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/tam.0.0223>

➔ For additional information about this article

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/368748>

to trace the Latin American roots and genealogies of autonomous criticism to the colonial condition as well as articles defining concepts and relating their main critiques. As a result, the volume does a commendable job in introducing and problematizing the main concepts associated with considering Latin America beyond Eurocentric perspectives.

The volume's editors emphasize the interdisciplinary character of postcolonial analysis and the necessity of breaking with binary approaches as part of the postcolonial endeavor in the Latin American field. Nevertheless, there is a paucity of historians participating in this debate in which sociologists, philosophers, and literary critics draw heavily on historical arguments. This constitutes the main pitfall of the volume, occasioning an oversimplification of historical arguments about the Latin American past, which at times undermines subsequent arguments and concepts. In overlooking current historical research on ethnohistory, agrarian history, slavery, the Atlantic world, and colonial identity, binary categories and dual approaches can reappear. Some contributors, for example, Elzbieta Sklodowska, José Antonio Mazzotti, Gordon Brotherston, José Rabasa, Santiago Castro-Klaren, and Fernando Coronil, are keenly aware of this problem and the challenges involved in overcoming "binary options," especially in dealing with Latin American creoles. The critique of the self-referentiality of some postcolonial authors is also present. Furthermore, it is noteworthy that although Brazilian intellectuals are often cited, Lusophone America is the focal point of just one article, by Russell G. Hamilton. These exclusions demonstrate the need for scholars to keep striving to overcome academic divisions and linguistic barriers.

In spite of neglecting historical works, the book is one of the first projects to bring together scholars from different regions and academic systems of the Atlantic. As a result, this compilation offers wide-ranging perspectives and critiques associated with the challenge of discussing Latin America with critical viewpoints in language that is not overly cryptic. This volume is bound to become a referential work for scholars in the field of Latin American Studies and a useful teaching tool for graduate-level courses.

Roosevelt University
Chicago, Illinois

FABRÍCIO PRADO

Mainland Passage: The Cultural Anomaly of Puerto Rico. By Ramón E. Soto-Crespo. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2009. Pp. xxiv, 171. Illustrations. Notes. Works Cited. Index. \$22.50 paper.

Puerto Rico is "anomalous" within Latin America and the Caribbean because it remains an "unincorporated territory" of the United States. In 1952, the island became a U.S. Commonwealth (or *Estado Libre Asociado*, in Spanish), with some political and cultural autonomy. In this book, Ramón E. Soto-Crespo argues that Commonwealth status created a "borderland state," whose influence extends to the continental United States through the "mainland passage," the massive Puerto Rican exodus after World War II. The author rejects standard nationalist views of the island's current political status and proposes that it represents a viable alternative to independence or annexation to the American union.

The centerpiece of Soto-Crespo's case is his reinterpretation of Luis Muñoz Marín as a "radical theorist of the borderland" (p. xix). First as Senate President (1941-1948) and then as Governor of Puerto Rico (1949-1964), Muñoz Marín led a populist movement that promoted economic development through industrialization and political autonomy through "free association" with the United States. For its supporters, the Commonwealth government allowed Puerto Ricans to resist assimilation by U.S. culture while preserving their attachment to a federated state. According to Soto-Crespo, Muñoz Marín displayed a "border logic" to decolonize the island without creating a nation-state.

The book is based on close readings of literary and political classics, including Muñoz Marín's 1959 Godkin Lectures at Harvard University; René Marqués's controversial analysis of Puerto Rican "docility"; Edgardo Rodríguez Juliá's contemporary novels and chronicles; Esmeralda Santiago's memoir, *When I Was Puerto Rican* (1994); Arcadio Díaz-Quiñones' collection of essays, *El arte de bregar* (2000); and several exemplars of Nuyorican poetry, such as Pedro Pietri, Miguel Algarín, and Tato Laviera. Even more intriguing is Soto-Crespo's opening commentary on Puerto Rican painters José Campeche and Francisco Oller. The author's deconstruction of these texts and images is insightful, but often tangential to his main thesis about the cultural anomaly of Puerto Rico as a borderland state or the diaspora as a mainland passage. I sensed an underlying disjuncture between Soto-Crespo's ambitious theoretical framework and his criticism of specific works.

Nonetheless, the book poses key questions about Puerto Rican cultural politics. To begin, how unusual is the distinction between cultural and political nationalism? I would argue that it is widespread in Quebec, Catalonia, Galicia, Gibraltar, Scotland, Corsica, the French and Dutch Antilles, and other dependent territories. Second, how has the "mainland passage" reconfigured territorially and linguistically grounded definitions of national identity? Although the diaspora has undermined the traditional premises of the dominant nationalist discourse, crossing the border between the island and the mainland has not erased it altogether. Third, should U.S.-Puerto Rican relations be characterized as colonial, post-colonial, or even postnational? Many will raise their eyebrows when reading that Commonwealth and migration have established "a postnational Puerto Ricanhood as a new form of cultural, political, and geographic association" (p. 76). Finally, should Puerto Ricans in the United States be understood as an ethnic and racialized group or as colonial immigrants? Soto-Crespo's answer is that diasporic "Puerto Ricans have started to conceive of themselves as an ethnic minority" (p. 130). But that statement begs the question of sorting out the differences among ethnic, racial, colonial, and national forms of identification.

In sum, *Mainland Passage* is a provocative intervention into some of the most intractable problems in Puerto Rican studies. It productively elaborates ideas from cultural and post-colonial theorists, especially Gloria Anzaldúa and Walter Dignolo. It pushes the limits of recent debates about Puerto Rico as a colonial nation and the diaspora as an exceptional case within Latinos in the United States. It applies the term "borderland state" to Commonwealth as a nonnational form of government that "has transformed a colonial relationship into an anomalous federalist relationship" (p. xx). Even if one does not sympa-

thize with its fierce apology of *estadolibrista* ideology, the book is worth reading for its fresh approach to old buzzwords such as colonialism, nationalism, decolonization, sovereignty, autonomy, assimilation, and identity.

University of Puerto Rico
Río Piedras, Puerto Rico

JORGE DUANY

Packaged Vacations: Tourism Development in the Spanish Caribbean. By Evan R. Ward. Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2008. Pp. xxvi, 236. Figures. Notes. Bibliography. Index. \$69.95 cloth.

The history of tourism in Latin America is a growing field to which Evan R. Ward has made an invaluable contribution with *Packaged Vacations*, a study that should appeal to a wide readership in a variety of academic disciplines. Ward's monograph is both ambitious and unique, for it compares the development of decentralized tourist hotspots in the Caribbean since 1945, namely, Dorado Beach (Puerto Rico), Cancún (Mexico), Varadero (Cuba), and Punta Cana (Dominican Republic). Remote, coastal, and, literally, steeped in nature, these peripheral destinations comprise some of the world's most pristine beaches and luxurious resorts as well as some of the most compelling problems inherent in tourism development, which affect the environment, local communities, and national well-being.

Through a comparative framework, Ward takes the reader on a backstage tour of these sand, sea, and sun destinations to show us the ideas and people behind hotel conglomerates like RockResorts, Hilton International, Sol Meliá, and Grupo Puntacana, and as well as state development agencies like PRIDCO in Puerto Rico and FONATUR in Mexico, whose efforts have made the Caribbean a veritable playground in the post-World War II era. Part history and part reportage, Ward masterfully interweaves archival research with contemporary interviews and observation to illustrate the varied models of development and the local as well as global conditions that shaped their trajectory. Among the many important conclusions one can draw from this study is Ward's argument that, with the successful development of peripheral zones and the successful mass marketing of packaged resort vacations, these early "poles" are now "cores"—unsustainable, dense, and urban—particularly in Punta Cana and Cancún.

Packaged Vacations is organized into three chronologically informed parts based on models of tourism development: American private investment (1945-1959), Latin American state-driven investment (1960s-1980s), and a combination of American and European investment (since the 1980s). Ward aptly begins with a fascinating examination of the life and work of Laurance Rockefeller, who, through RockResorts, invented the remote, nature-driven beach resort, first in the U.S. Virgin Islands and then in Dorado Beach, Puerto Rico. More than just an interest in profit, Rockefeller's goal was to contribute to Latin America's economic growth through tourism, particularly in out-of-the-way beachfront areas in need of conservation. Similarly, Ward examines Conrad Hilton's urban development model in the 1950s with the construction of the Continental Hilton (Mexico City), the Hotel Caribe