



PROJECT MUSE®

Eve's Enlightenment: Women's Experience in Spain and Spanish America, 1726-1839 (review)

Heather Hennes

The Americas, Volume 66, Number 3, January 2010, pp. 399-401 (Review)

Published by Cambridge University Press

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/tam.0.0217>



➔ For additional information about this article

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/368734>

ing many to (pluralistically) self-medicate with unsterilized injections of ethnovitamins and antibiotics. Gutmann argues that in being the site of migration, infection, and sometimes medical care, and in influencing Mexico's refusal to challenge U.S. corporations, the United States acts as a "shadow state" for HIV/AIDS in Mexico. Yet he is sometimes harsh on the Oaxaca-based health workers who engage in conscious discouragement and triage for AIDS treatment, but who are themselves subject to neoliberal pressures.

Gutmann is at his most nuanced when discussing vasectomy, perhaps because his participant observation is total; he himself has had the procedure. The "emotional anesthesia" he offers to allay the concerns of men about to undergo vasectomy, and the practical assistance he provides to the surgeons, leads them all to open up to his probing questions. Sadly, we never hear about the history of vasectomy in Mexico: where are the fathers, mothers, uncles, aunts, and cousins that historians and anthropologists of women's reproductive experience have turned to so effectively?

While an eminently contemporary gaze at men, sex, and reproductive health, *Fixing Men* does engage with history on several fronts. The book (too) quickly traces the recent history of Mexican health services policy through expansion, decentralization, and contraction. Unfortunately it leaves out Oaxaca's protests against health reforms in the 1980s, which served as an important precursor to more recent municipal and regional protest. Gutmann does better with his fine summary of family planning since the 1970s, the process of "planning men out of family planning" (p. 100). His discussion of medical profiling—the uses of cultural stereotypes to (erroneously) diagnose and treat—also resonates with historical concerns around blaming and its consequences.

A chapter on traditional sexual healing of men offers a discerning analysis of the uselessness of binary and essentialized male/female categories, even as cultural stereotypes retain a powerful hold on popular and medical perceptions of gendered sexual and reproductive health. We hear, too, of the limits to Oaxaca's recognition of *medicina tradicional* and tidbits of Gutmann's learnings from his predominantly female healer informants. Yet there is surprisingly little discussion of the traditional *boticario* (and its part in Oaxaca's evolving medical pluralism), which dispenses, variously, contraceptives, remedies for sexual and reproductive ailments, and stimulants, such as the colorful octopus and shrimp-laced "Cocos a la Viagra." For the social and cultural historian, Gutmann's book is a good reminder that reproductive health macro- and micro-histories deserve masculinization.

University of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario, Canada

ANNE-EMANUELLE BIRN

Eve's Enlightenment: Women's Experience in Spain and Spanish America, 1726-1839.
Edited by Catherine M. Jaffe and Elizabeth Franklin Lewis. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2009. Pp. 253. Illustrations. Index. \$28.50 cloth.

Responding to a gap in the literature at the junction of Enlightenment studies, Hispanic studies, and women's studies, Catherine Jaffe and Elizabeth Franklin Lewis have compiled an interdisciplinary anthology on women's experiences of the Enlightenment in Spain

and—to a much lesser extent—Spanish America. This volume highlights the ambivalence that characterized women's experience of the Enlightenment in the face of lingering stereotypes about their inherent inferiority, embodied in the image of Eve. The 13 essays examine how women negotiated this ambivalence through writing, material culture, and changing social behavior, often subverting negative gender stereotypes. They also ask how others represented women during this transitional time and what gaps existed between women's lived experiences of the Enlightenment and representations of them. These essays represent diverse approaches and an international assembly of contributors. That said, the reader interested specifically in Spanish America would be disillusioned to find that only three of the 13 essays deal with the region.

In the introduction, the editors situate the volume squarely within Enlightenment and women's studies, reflect on the centrality of experience as an analytical category, and introduce a number of central themes. The essays are organized into three parts. Part 1 focuses on women's writing and education. Four essays ask how women writers navigated the liminal space between tradition and Enlightenment. Mónica Bolufer Peruga provides a sort of theoretical prologue by pointing to the dynamic space between tradition and modernity in which women's experience and writing took shape. Frédérique Morand, María A. Salgado, and Elisa Sampson Vera Tudela focus on women writers who exemplified this literary maneuvering, the latter in Mexican conventual writing. Isabel Morant Deusa points to the tension between tradition and Enlightenment present in Josefa Amar y Borbón's 1790 treatise on women's education, which is referenced by several other authors in this volume.

Part 2 seeks to understand the impact of Enlightenment values and new social practices on women's daily lives. The authors examine nonliterary sites—the home, the street, textiles, and the female body—in which women experienced the shift from traditional values and customs to enlightened ones. María López-Cordón Cortezo shows that the increased presence of royal women in the public eye modeled new social customs for other women. Rebecca Haidt argues that women's activity through a secondhand textile economy made a real impact on the local economy, although it went unnoted in the official records. They share with Sampson Vera Tudela a view of the home and the cloister, respectively, as permeable spaces where women's daily practices came into contact with the male-oriented world outside. María José de la Pascua Sánchez studies female agency, examining how women living independently of men employed tactics for pursuing "new life projects" (p. 140). Finally, Beatriz Quintanilla-Madero focuses on theories of female hysteria in eighteenth-century Mexico, showing how enlightened perspectives confronted traditional gender stereotypes in the space of the female mind and body. These essays offer a fresh look at sources available for the study of women's history, particularly of those women who did not participate in the republic of letters and therefore did not leave documentary evidence of their experiences.

Part 3 examines the representation of women in literature and visual art. Lucy Harney's comparative study of Cirilo Villaverde's mulata protagonist, Cecilia, underscores changes in stereotypes about race and gender in response to shifting ideologies in Cuba. Catherine Jaffe finds that a letter describing a woman's library reveals ambivalence toward women

readers based on concerns about their supposed inability to reason. Looking at the Spanish sentimental novel, Ana Rueda traces a shift in the concept of sensibility toward a gendered notion of sentimentalism, which was politicized as the antithesis to reason and an inappropriate response to Spain's problems. Finally, Janis Tomlinson analyzes the representation of various women in the artistic works of Francisco Goya y Lucientes. She concludes that the Enlightenment provided many of the ideals and stereotypes embodied by Goya's female figures, including *majas*, enlightened mothers, and women of "heroic stature" (p. 234).

Though diverse in their approaches, the essays in this volume converge around common themes and often enter into dialogue with one another. Several essays rethink methodologies for studying women's history and seek to shed light on women's daily experience, recognizing the gaps that lie between those experiences and documentary evidence representing them. The majority draws from extensive bibliographies and makes explicit references to other scholarship in the respective fields. The work is successful in its attempt to better understand women's history and "[the] Enlightenment's contribution to modern gender ideology" (p. 6). It is also accessible enough to the non-Hispanist so as to be useful for a comparative study of women in the Enlightenment in different national contexts.

Saint Joseph's University
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

HEATHER HENNES

Gender and the Mexican Revolution: Yucatán Women and the Realities of Patriarchy. By Stephanie J. Smith. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2009. Pp. xi, 272. Map. Notes. Bibliography. Index. \$27.50 paper.

Yucatán, with its vibrant history of separatist movements, indigenous struggles, and machine politics, has long captured the imagination of Mexicanist historians. In part because Mérida hosted the First Feminist Congress in 1916, feminist historians of twentieth-century Mexico (myself included) have been especially drawn to Yucatecan history. Feminist historians also have a particular advantage because the Yucatán state archive remains under the talented direction of Piedad Peniche Rivero, who shares our intellectual passions. Control over the archive, as any Foucaultian knows, structures knowledge production and, in this case, feminist history is richer for it. Stephanie Smith offers an excellent example of the scholarship we generate with the benefit of such resources.

Smith draws largely on legal records from both civil and military courts to demonstrate the ways that the revolutionary governments of Salvador Alvarado (1915-1918) and Felipe Carrillo Puerto (1922-1924) retained many of the patriarchal assumptions of the *ancien régime* and the Catholic Church. As a result, despite the radical reforms that took place in Yucatán, particularly under the leadership of Elvia Carrillo Puerto—Felipe's sister and the feminist-in-chief during his administration—gains such as women's political rights, easy divorce laws, and a sympathetic judiciary were quickly reversed after Felipe Carrillo Puerto's assassination and Elvia's daring escape.