PROJECT MUSE®

Fort Bowie, Arizona: Combat Post of the Southwest, 1858-1894
(review)

Robert P. Wettemann

Southwestern Historical Quarterly, Volume 110, Number 1, July 2006,
pp. 150-151 (Review)

Published by Texas State Historical Association

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/swh.2006.0034>

➔ *For additional information about this article*

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/203066>

near-frontier conditions. She also brings the story of Good Will to the end of its line in 1978, when it finally retired after thirty-five years of service beyond Texas.

Although their styles are distinctly different, each author brings enthusiasm and competence to the story she tells. Texas religious history is better for these two works.

Houston

JOHN H. BARNHILL

Fort Bowie, Arizona: Combat Post of the Southwest, 1858–1894. By Douglas C. McChristian. (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2005. Pp. 368. Acknowledgments, photographs, illustrations, maps, epilogue, appendices, notes, bibliography, index. ISBN 0806136480. \$32.95, cloth.)

In a study that spans more than five decades of southwestern military history, retired National Park Service research and field historian Douglas C. McChristian offers a sweeping examination of Fort Bowie, located in the Apache Pass of southwestern Arizona. Although the author's title is somewhat misleading, as he suggests that Fort Bowie was operational by 1858, troops stationed at the post, which was established in 1862 and remained in operation for thirty-two years, played a significant role in bringing peace to the region. That criticism notwithstanding, the book as a whole serves as a good example of how the history of a military post should be written.

McChristian's study offers a good balance of military operations coupled with a discussion of the post and its garrison, integrating this information into the larger history of the region. With the opening of the Butterfield Overland Mail route in 1858, it soon became apparent that a strong military presence would be needed in southwestern Arizona, as the failed attempt to capture Cochise allowed him to lead the Chiracahua Apache in raids against travelers and settlers. It was, however, the Civil War that would lead to the establishment of Fort Bowie, as the "California Column" was ordered into Apache territory in efforts to counter a Confederate thrust coming from Texas. Initially engaging Cochise at the battle of Apache Pass, the failed Confederate offensive relegated the Californians to protective duty, as they remained in the region and established Fort Bowie in 1862.

Reduced to a temporary "camp" status in 1866 in the wake of a post-Civil War military reorganization, McChristian explains that the fort was soon revitalized to protect immigrants and guard both the overland mail route and transcontinental railroad. It is in this role that the post was at its largest, serving as the base of operations for campaigns against Geronimo between 1881 and 1886. In the ensuing years, the end of the Indian threat led to Fort Bowie's declining importance, factors leading to its closure in 1894.

As an expanded version of a Fort Bowie Historic Research Study prepared for the National Park Service, McChristian is at his best when he describes some of the more colorful episodes that took place at and around Fort Bowie. In his description of the 1862 battle of Apache Springs, he illustrates how artillery was used with telling effect upon the Apache for the first time (although a map may have helped explain the course of the battle). His chapter on garrison life is also

informative, as he describes the role of the army laundress, the place of families on an isolated post, and how the peace of the garrison was disrupted in 1877 by a scandalous extramarital affair that took place between a cavalry lieutenant and the wife of the post surgeon. The author's extensive research, coupled with use of previously unpublished photos of Fort Bowie, provides an insightful glimpse into life at a combat post on the Arizona frontier.

McMurry University

ROBERT P. WETTEMANN JR.

White Justice in Arizona: Apache Murder Trials in the Nineteenth Century. By Clare V. McKanna Jr. (Lubbock: Texas Tech University Press, 2005. Pp. 240. Preface, acknowledgments, illustrations, maps, notes, selected bibliography, index. ISBN 0896725545. \$27.95, cloth.)

Lopsided justice was meted out to offending Apaches in nineteenth-century Arizona Territory according to McKanna, who presents the trials of four San Carlos men to prove his point. Within that framework the author selects rich details acquired by examining trial transcripts to make his case. Overall, however, generalizations abound, assumptions are plentiful, and certain conclusions are one dimensional. For example, in describing the Carlisle School's influence on Indian students, he complains that Superintendent Richard Pratt publicly reported only the good results of the school's outing program. "You do not, however, see or hear the negative side. . . . Indian students sometimes refused to work or were lazy and uncooperative" (p. 99), he writes. Here McKanna omitted an important fact: some farm families took advantage of, or abused the students assigned to them (Adams, *Education for Extinction*, University Press of Kansas, 1995, pp. 161–162). But did schooling in the white man's way cause some returned students to commit violence because they didn't fit in either world? The author devotes several pages to the possibility of identity confusion as an agent affecting the felons on trial. He also cites former Carlisle students, Asa Daklugie and Jason Betzinez, whom he alleges had difficulty adjusting to life "betwixt and between" (pp. 94–123), but neither of these Chiricahua Apaches ever committed offenses against the legal system.

McKanna's writing skill is sometimes ponderous, redundancies occur, and certain information seems misplaced, but in the epilogue the author nicely reinforces his thesis that white justice in the old Arizona Territory was strongly biased against Apaches. He is correctly critical of many, if not most, judicial authorities and of the system that made no effort to understand the behavior of members of a different culture. And, he points out, but only in passing, the hysteria created among white citizens years earlier by the actions of Geronimo and his band as one possible cause for the belief that Apaches were responsible for continuing depredations. More substantive discussion of that conclusion would be helpful. To his credit, McKanna never uses the word "hate" as a diagnosis of society's desire to punish Indians through its territorial judicial system, but those familiar with certain of the dominant culture's behavior at the time will be able to read between the lines.