PROJECT MUSE®

Migranten und Internierte: Deutsche in Glasgow, 1864-1918
(review)

Panikos Panayi

The Scottish Historical Review, Volume 85, Number 1: No. 219, April
2006, pp. 167-169 (Review)

Published by Edinburgh University Press

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/shr.2006.0024>

➔ *For additional information about this article*

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/199874>

described, as are the disadvantages in personnel terms of a closed community in the early twentieth century. What is missing, however, is anything substantive from a pupil's point of view. The characteristics of authoritarian regimes are, for instance, only briefly mentioned and the uniform hardly at all. In terms of the wider impact of Heriot's, there is valuable discussion of the connection with the Heriot-Watt College, but the role of Heriot's in nineteenth- and twentieth-century Edinburgh landholding is not conclusively dealt with.

Jinglin' Geordie's Legacy is at its best for all its audiences in the discussions of the internal tensions during William Dewar's time as headmaster and in its treatment of the attempt by Lothian Regional Council to take the School into the state system in the 1970s. Here Brian Lockhart brilliantly blends written evidence, contributions from those involved, and his own experience to produce a chapter which makes clear that Heriot's was still particularly significant in the history of Scottish education at this time. He draws a fascinating parallel between these conflicts and those of a century before. As with his treatment of the 1870s and 1880s, however, Lockhart reaches no explicit judgement on the outcome of the 1970s struggle. He identifies the consequences of the School being forced into independent status by the 1980s, including the waning significance of the Foundation for single-parent and less affluent families. However, he does not close the circle with Heriot's bequest and answer the parallel question to that posed in the nineteenth century, namely whether independence in this case was in conformity with George Heriot's intention. The inclusion in an appendix of the full text of William Dewar's 1979 letter to *The Scotsman* on the issue, and its clear statement of where responsibility lay for the loss of the benefits of grant-in-aid, may, however, be a diplomatic way of dealing with a still highly political issue.

Examination of the book as a whole suggests that the publisher should have taken steps to ensure that illustrations were better placed. This particularly applies to sections dealing with Hospital architecture, in which more detailed illustration is also necessary. Criticism of this nature should not, however, detract from Brian Lockhart's solid achievement in this book, which proves that a history of a single institution can make a significant contribution to the historical debate across a range of issues, while at the same time appealing to a more general readership.

Fachhochschule of Central Switzerland

GORDON MILLAR

Migranten und Internierte: Deutsche in Glasgow, 1864-1918.

By Stefan Manz. Pp. 317.

ISBN 3 515 08427 4.

Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag. EUR 63.80.

In recent decades, as the history of immigration has begun to receive serious attention from some British historians, if not the mainstream establishment, much of which has a blind spot when it comes to such issues, a series of groups has begun to receive considerable attention. Jewish and Irish migrants, with a serious historiography dating back to the nineteenth century, lead the way. Similarly, 'Black' people have also received attention for decades from a variety of scholars. More recently, a series of other, perhaps less obvious, minorities have also come to attract serious study from historians.

One of these is the Germans, which should not actually surprise because they have had a significant presence in Britain for hundreds of years. In fact, this group has reached its numerical peak in recent decades. Over the past two

centuries this minority has consisted of variety of ethnic, social and religious components. Historians have increasingly turned their minds to them. While much of this has focused upon refugees from Nazism, since the early 1990s the migrants who moved to Britain during the nineteenth century have received increasing attention. Indeed, my own general studies on the nineteenth century and the First World War have been followed by more specialist studies.

Stefan Manz's volume might be said to fall into the latter category, except for the fact that it covers the fairly lengthy time period of 1864-1918. But it certainly offers new departures in at least two ways. First of all, it is the only substantial work on the history of Germans in Scotland. In fact, it is one of relatively few books to look at any individual minority in Scotland, other than the Irish and Jews, although most general works on Britain have tackled immigrants in the country as part of the broader picture. More importantly, from the point of view of the historiography of Germans in Britain, Manz's book is a focused city case study of the type that has characterized the historiography of immigrants in the USA during the nineteenth century.

Manz has actually produced an outstanding piece of scholarship, whose strengths lie in all its facets. In fact, there are no obvious weaknesses. The book describes the development of the German community during the nineteenth century, beginning with the reasons for migration to the town and the growth of the local community, moving on to its social and economic structure and then describing the way in which it developed as an ethnic community. Manz stresses the diversity of the community throughout his narrative. The story of the Germans who moved to Britain during the nineteenth century does not have a happy ending and Manz concludes his work by describing the consequences of the xenophobic hostility that destroyed German communities throughout the country. Without wishing to stretch the point too far, it is fair to draw parallels between the history of German Jewry and the evolution of the German minority in Britain during the nineteenth century. Both emerged as successful groups and both faced destruction as a result of extreme wartime intolerance.

Before describing the course of events, Manz begins with a methodological introduction in which he tells us that he is taking a micro-historical and prosopographical approach. While he may not be the first person to have done the latter in the historiography of immigrants in Britain, he is probably the first to have constructed the history of a community by examining individual experiences, which he then brings together under the various themes which take his narrative forward. Manz is completely familiar with the small historiography of Germans in Britain and, more importantly, contextualizes his story within the extant literature on the history of immigration into the country.

The book is extremely thoroughly researched. Apart from a full acquaintance with the secondary literature, Manz travelled widely both in Scotland and beyond for the purposes of examining all of the relevant archival sources, which he cited. He also made much use of newspaper sources, especially the *Glasgow Herald*. Manz further travelled to German archives including various branches of the Bundesarchiv and the Evangelisches Zentralarchiv in Berlin containing information about German communities throughout the world.

One of the most original aspects of this work is the prosopographical approach taken. This is not one that has been used in any studies of immigrant communities in Britain before 1945. It allows detailed insights into how an ethnic community evolves through the experiences of individuals. The urban-based micro-historical approach also deserves mention. Certainly, this does not represent a new departure to the study of immigrants groups in Britain, as several studies of pre-First World War Jewry, especially in the East End

of London, exist. Nevertheless, it is the first study of the German community in an urban location in Scotland.

Unfortunately, most of those who read this review will not have the linguistic ability to read the book it describes. This is a great pity because of the thoroughness of the research, the command of ideas and the richness of the narrative. It traces the rise and fall of an immigrant minority in Britain, describing the way in which the country both accepted and then rejected one particular immigrant group: Glasgow could be any other location which had a similar-sized German community, whether Bradford, Leeds, Liverpool or Manchester. The book really does represent a case study of a national picture. For non-German speakers, let us hope that it appears as an English translation for it is a very rich work of scholarship that deserves a very wide readership.

De Montfort University

PANIKOS PANAYI

McCrae's Battalion: the Story of the 16th Royal Scots.

By Jack Alexander. Pp. 320.

ISBN 1 84018 707 7.

Edinburgh: Mainstream Publishing. 2003. £15.99.

The First World War continues to fascinate. Debates rage in scholarly circles about the nature of the Schlieffen Plan, the operational 'learning curve' on the western front, and the representations of the war in popular culture. These are important historiographical questions. But from our ivory towers we are sometimes guilty of overlooking the impact of the war on local communities and their patriotic citizens who flocked to the colours in the heady days of 1914. Yet it is through such local studies that we might find the true essence of the war. In 1992 Geoffrey Moorhouse published a memorable book on Bury and the Lancashire Fusiliers that hauntingly traced the scars left on the town as a result of that regiment's grievous losses at Gallipoli. In similar vein, Jack Alexander has produced a fine study of Edinburgh and the 16th Royal Scots—McCrae's battalion—that was decimated during the Battle of the Somme. Although more of a regimental history than Moorhouse's work, it evocatively captures the tender interface between home front and battlefield. One cannot fail to be profoundly moved by the fate of Private George Peters—a thirty-five-year-old letterpress printer from Buccleuch Place with a wife and two children who was killed by shellfire in the trenches near Armentieres—when one sits in a comfortable university office in the same street in which he once lived.

The 16th Royal Scots were raised in the autumn of 1914 by Sir George McCrae, a self-made Edinburgh businessman and Liberal MP who had played a prominent role in the city's pre-war territorial force. This New Army battalion was built around the Heart of Midlothian football team and their supporters. The maroons were in dazzling form that season and leading the League. Eleven players immediately volunteered to 'march wi Geordie' and this initiated a wave of enlistments from among the Tynecastle faithful eager to serve alongside their Saturday-afternoon heroes. Soon the battalion was 1,000 strong. In December it was drawn up along George Street before proceeding to its first home: George Heriot's school. Over the winter the recruits were put through an intensive programme of basic training, but the route marches in the snowy Pentland hills took their toll on the Hearts footballers who continued to turn out for their club. Agonisingly, they were pipped to the title by Celtic in the final weeks of the season. In the spring of 1915 McCrae's left Edinburgh to undergo manoeuvres south of the border with other battalions which were to form the 101st Brigade.