PROJECT MUSE®

Jinglin' Geordie's Legacy: A History of George Heriot's
School and Hospital (review)

Gordon Millar

The Scottish Historical Review, Volume 85, Number 1: No. 219, April
2006, pp. 166-167 (Review)

Published by Edinburgh University Press

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/shr.2006.0022>

➔ *For additional information about this article*

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/199872>

Jinglin' Geordie's Legacy: A History of George Heriot's School and Hospital.

By Brian R.W. Lockhart. Pp. viii, 440.

ISBN 1 86232 257 0.

East Linton: Tuckwell Press. 2003. £20.00.

Brian Lockhart is to be congratulated for writing a history of George Heriot's, of which he is a former pupil and teacher, an institution that at significant points in the development of education in Scotland has played a prominent role. This book is thoroughly researched and offers something to a variety of audiences, from former pupils to the academic market. Its core contributions are, firstly, to explain to a modern audience the model nature of Heriot's bequest in the seventeenth century, and the expansion of the benefits of this through the Heriot outdoor schools across Edinburgh from the 1830s. These subjects were last discussed at length in the mid-nineteenth century by previous historians of Heriot's Hospital, William Steven and Frederick Bedford. Secondly, Lockhart breaks new ground on the controversy over the future of the Hospital from 1863, and the history of the Heriot day school from 1886.

Early chapters incorporate discussion of well-selected issues, such as the source of Heriot's wealth, drawing on Bruce Lenman's work on Jacobean goldsmith-jewellers' creation of credit facilities for their royal and aristocratic customers. The long-running controversy, still being vigorously conducted in the 1850s, over who was architect of the Edinburgh landmark 'Wark' building is analysed, as are the equally persistent problems caused by the dominance of Edinburgh town councillors on the governing body, and their putting of their own and the town's financial interests before those of the Hospital. Given the broad target audience, however, more explanatory material would have been helpful. The highly worthwhile discussion of Heriot land purchases in Edinburgh would have benefited from an explanation of land-holding practices, and feuing in particular. Again, the recurrent and interesting material on the connections between Heriot's and the Edinburgh High School and University as destinations for more scholarly Hospital inmates, especially in the eighteenth century, would have been made more accessible by notes explaining these institutions. Pruning of long sections on the completion of the Hospital chapel and on the clashes between governors and former pupils' organisations would have enabled excellent material in the notes, which generally reward careful reading, to be moved into the body of the text and, in turn, left room for such explanations.

Heriot's played a key role in mid-nineteenth century Edinburgh, both educationally and politically. Brian Lockhart makes this abundantly clear in discussions of internal reforms started by headmasters Steven and Bedford, in his detailing of Duncan McLaren's role in initiating the Heriot outdoor school scheme and in defending the Hospital as the inheritance of Edinburgh's poor, and in his chapter on the struggle over the Hospital's continued existence, which resulted in its becoming a day school. The wealth of evidence Lockhart has gathered, particularly on the various inquiries held in the 1870s, is impressive, but the battle lines remain confusing and a conclusion on the outcome is missing. Aspects such as the impact of Heriot's on Edinburgh's town council elections, the changes in McLaren's position, and the meaning of the abolition of the outdoor schools for educational provision in the city, can also only find a mention in a work this wide in scope.

The later chapters on the Heriot day school are a sure-footed guide to developments. An invaluable contribution is the evidence Lockhart has gathered which would otherwise have been lost with the passing on of those involved. This compensates for a rather top-down approach. Curricular developments and accompanying expansion of the School's accommodation are excellently

described, as are the disadvantages in personnel terms of a closed community in the early twentieth century. What is missing, however, is anything substantive from a pupil's point of view. The characteristics of authoritarian regimes are, for instance, only briefly mentioned and the uniform hardly at all. In terms of the wider impact of Heriot's, there is valuable discussion of the connection with the Heriot-Watt College, but the role of Heriot's in nineteenth- and twentieth-century Edinburgh landholding is not conclusively dealt with.

Jinglin' Geordie's Legacy is at its best for all its audiences in the discussions of the internal tensions during William Dewar's time as headmaster and in its treatment of the attempt by Lothian Regional Council to take the School into the state system in the 1970s. Here Brian Lockhart brilliantly blends written evidence, contributions from those involved, and his own experience to produce a chapter which makes clear that Heriot's was still particularly significant in the history of Scottish education at this time. He draws a fascinating parallel between these conflicts and those of a century before. As with his treatment of the 1870s and 1880s, however, Lockhart reaches no explicit judgement on the outcome of the 1970s struggle. He identifies the consequences of the School being forced into independent status by the 1980s, including the waning significance of the Foundation for single-parent and less affluent families. However, he does not close the circle with Heriot's bequest and answer the parallel question to that posed in the nineteenth century, namely whether independence in this case was in conformity with George Heriot's intention. The inclusion in an appendix of the full text of William Dewar's 1979 letter to *The Scotsman* on the issue, and its clear statement of where responsibility lay for the loss of the benefits of grant-in-aid, may, however, be a diplomatic way of dealing with a still highly political issue.

Examination of the book as a whole suggests that the publisher should have taken steps to ensure that illustrations were better placed. This particularly applies to sections dealing with Hospital architecture, in which more detailed illustration is also necessary. Criticism of this nature should not, however, detract from Brian Lockhart's solid achievement in this book, which proves that a history of a single institution can make a significant contribution to the historical debate across a range of issues, while at the same time appealing to a more general readership.

Fachhochschule of Central Switzerland

GORDON MILLAR

Migranten und Internierte: Deutsche in Glasgow, 1864-1918.

By Stefan Manz. Pp. 317.

ISBN 3 515 08427 4.

Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag. EUR 63.80.

In recent decades, as the history of immigration has begun to receive serious attention from some British historians, if not the mainstream establishment, much of which has a blind spot when it comes to such issues, a series of groups has begun to receive considerable attention. Jewish and Irish migrants, with a serious historiography dating back to the nineteenth century, lead the way. Similarly, 'Black' people have also received attention for decades from a variety of scholars. More recently, a series of other, perhaps less obvious, minorities have also come to attract serious study from historians.

One of these is the Germans, which should not actually surprise because they have had a significant presence in Britain for hundreds of years. In fact, this group has reached its numerical peak in recent decades. Over the past two