



PROJECT MUSE®

Pelerinage et societe dans le Japon des Tokugawa: Le
pelerinage de Shikoku entre 1598 et 1868 (review)

Constantine Nomikos Vaporis

The Journal of Japanese Studies, Volume 30, Number 1, Winter 2004,
pp. 155-159 (Review)

Published by Society for Japanese Studies

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1353/jjs.2004.0039>



➔ *For additional information about this article*

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/55128>

but it does not exist. Nonetheless, with this book we have gained a distinct picture of the moneylenders and their place in Japan's late medieval capital.

A final note: Gay follows two common practices (both mistaken) in the romanization of certain medieval and early-modern diary names; the issues should be more generally understood. One example is seen in renderings such as *Tokitsugu kyōki*, another in *Sanetaka kōki*. The first is the diary of Yamashina Tokitsugu, the second of Sanjōnishi Sanetaka. The *kyō* of the first and the *kō* of the second come from the status they held as upper noble (third rank and above) and minister, respectively. Thus, the diary name of the first is, in translation, *Record of Lord Tokitsugu—Tokitsugukyō ki* or perhaps *Tokitsugukyō-ki*, or even *Tokitsugukyōki*, but not *Tokitsugu kyōki*.

Pèlerinage et société dans le Japon des Tokugawa: Le pèlerinage de Shikoku entre 1598 et 1868. By Nathalie Kouamé. Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient, Paris, 2001. 317 pages. €38.00.

Reviewed by

CONSTANTINE N. VAPORIS

University of Maryland, Baltimore County

In this, the first book-length study of the Shikoku pilgrimage during the early modern period to appear in a Western language, Nathalie Kouamé presents a well-researched monograph, a revision of her Shibusawa-Claudel (1999) prize-winning doctoral thesis at l'Institut National des Langues et des Civilisations Orientales, in Paris. In making use of a wide range of sources—not only published, government, and temple-issued documents, but also an admirably large number of manuscript records still in private hands, stone road markers, travel diaries, and talismans (*fuda*), among others—the author adopts what she refers to as a sociological, rather than a religious, perspective to study pilgrimage as a social reality and not as an individualistic spiritual quest (p. 18). The main focus of the work is to examine relations between the pilgrims who undertook the route of 88 religious sites and the inhabitants of the island of Shikoku who came into contact with them. Here, in examining the relationship from both sides, two main questions emerge: how were pilgrims received by the locals, and what impact—social, cultural, and economic—did pilgrims have on the local communities through which they passed? In examining the social history of the Shikoku pilgrimage (*henro*), the author is also interested in larger questions such as the “rights” of travelers, the degree of openness of the local communities to outsiders, the development of a regional identity in Shikoku, as well as the basic economic aspects of pilgrimage itself.

The book is divided into three main sections. Part one, an introduction to pilgrims and local society, presents an overview of the history of the Shikoku pilgrimage route that may be familiar, at least in outline form, to many—a history that begins with a formative period from the end of the seventeenth century to the end of the eighteenth century, followed by a middle period of “exceptional development,” a “golden age,” in the early nineteenth century, and then a “late period” of relative decline beginning during the Tempō era (1830–44). Building upon the research of Maeda Takashi and Shinjō Tsunezō, two major figures in the history of Japanese pilgrimage, she offers interesting data on the character and regional origins of pilgrims, as well as the cyclical nature of the act. This research is based on the collections of a number of family records, such as those of the Naoshima and the Ochi, the latter from Agata village in Iyo, who offered pilgrims free lodging over an extended period, at least from 1799 to 1862. While this makes for interesting reading and provides additional quantitative evidence to previous research completed by Maeda and Shinjō, no new major findings or conclusions seem to emerge from the data. Part one concludes with an overview of the historical, demographic, and relatively economically backward position of Shikoku in Japan, which the author aptly notes influenced the character of the pilgrimage; the *henro* was often carried out alone or in very small groups, unlike the confraternity (*kō*) experience, which characterized pilgrimage to other major sites and circuits.

The core of the study begins with part two, on the reception of Shikoku pilgrims by local authorities. A discussion of pilgrims’ passports and official regulations governing the length of time pilgrims were allowed in a particular domain is followed by some interesting material on the “rights” of pilgrims—i.e., mainly how travelers taken ill, or those who had the misfortune of dying while on the road, were handled by local authorities. Even of greater interest is the chapter devoted here to a study of the practice of *settai*, or alms-giving, which Kouamé defines as a “charitable act by which an individual or a collective body offered a gift or a service to a traveler, particularly a pilgrim, without having been solicited” (p. 143). *Settai*, along with the costume Shikoku pilgrims wore, gave this pilgrimage a unique character. The practice of *settai*, which most commonly consisted of rice and other foodstuffs, or money, but also included free baths, lodging, etc., supported a population of pilgrims who might not otherwise have been able to travel. (Interested readers not able to read French are directed to the author’s 1997 English-language article on the subject, which offers a more abbreviated account of this portion of her research.¹) The author rightly notes that the Shikoku pilgrimage is of particular importance because it was the

1. Nathalie Kouamé, “Shikoku’s Local Authorities and *Henro* during the Golden Age of the Pilgrimage,” *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies*, Vol. 24, No. 3–5 (1997), pp. 413–25.

least touristic of the major pilgrimage circuits; with the spectacular development of recreational travel in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, it is too easy to overlook the important religious dimension of travel. However, at the same time she also highlights the transformation of *settai*, which is commonly perceived as an expression of religious sentiments or compassion toward pilgrims on the part of local inhabitants, into a highly formalized social institution—in short, a “form of compulsory civic duty” (p. 164). This would certainly seem to have diluted the religious character of this particular aspect of the Shikoku pilgrimage.

The relationship between local authorities and the pilgrims, Kouamé concludes, was, generally speaking, good. These authorities were tolerant of the mobility of ordinary pilgrims as long as they obeyed regulations such as those concerned with the number of days permitted on the route passing through a particular domain. There was a fringe element that took advantage of the system of alms-giving that officials tried to suppress—beggar pilgrims (*kojiki henro*) and professional pilgrims (*shokugyō henro*) in particular—but their existence did not influence greatly the general attitudes of the officials toward ordinary pilgrims. Kouamé also wisely offers the caveat that one cannot infer, as some Japanese historians have, that this “anti-social” element was large and dangerous to the social order simply from the mere existence of official records on the subject. Instead, she sees such documentation as a reflection of the effectiveness and vigilance of local authorities. In fact, as noted above, the Shikoku pilgrimage was often undertaken alone or in small groups, and thus never exhibited the socially disruptive aspects evidenced by the large-scale *okagemairi* to Ise of the late Tokugawa period.

Part three, on the pilgrims’ impact, adopts the perspective of the local community in exploring relations between it and pilgrims. While finding no evidence that pilgrims disturbed or altered the existing social hierarchy, Kouamé argues that pilgrimage did reinforce horizontal ties between villages through the principle of collective or shared responsibility. However, while it is true that villages often worked together with regard to sick travelers, the issue of who would bear the costs of the travel services incurred in transporting them home, or who would bear the costs of burying a dead person, did also, in at least some places, become a source of contention and conflict as well. Arguing against Shinjō, who sees the *henro* as posing a burden on local communities, Kouamé stresses the positive economic benefits of the pilgrimage. Pilgrims spent money in local shops and inns (those who could not find free lodging offered by alms-givers), on local entertainment, tourist attractions, transportation services, and gave generously to temples, thereby supporting local businesses and by-employments. Beyond its role in generating economic gain, the pilgrimage itself, she asserts, and the cult that developed around it, gave the island of Shikoku a distinct cultural identity,

as evidenced most clearly perhaps by the imitation mini-Shikoku pilgrimage circuits developed in other parts of Japan.

This monograph's strength is the dense nature of the archival research upon which it is based. On the other hand, one notable weakness is the author's apparent unfamiliarity with work on pilgrimage and religious and other forms of travel already published by other non-Japanese scholars such as Winston Davis, Carmen Blacker, James Foard, and myself. Scholarship should be an accumulative process, building upon, and ideally connecting with, the work of our predecessors and contemporaries. (A number of English-language works are cited in the select bibliography, so apparently it is not an issue of foreign-language ability.) For example, the author's major conclusion that in regards to Shikoku *henro* there was a degree of tolerance found among the local authorities, who were otherwise renowned for their severity, and a degree of flexibility in the social system known for its rigidity, resonates with the work of several of the scholars named above. Also, comparisons might be made between the practice of alms-giving on the Shikoku circuit and that carried out on Ise pilgrimage routes. Similarly, when discussing Shikoku history, there is no mention of the important work of Marius Jansen, Luke Roberts, or Mark Ravina.

Also problematic is that on a number of occasions the author uses Shinjō and Maeda, the two Japanese scholars cited above, as foils to emphasize the originality of her work on relatively minor points, as when for example she expresses surprise that the literature on the Shikoku pilgrimage says scant little about the issue of travelers struck ill on the road having certain "rights" to be assisted with repatriation (or in the event of illness, or to be given a burial), overseen by local officials (p. 115). This phenomenon has been researched by others and appears to have been common elsewhere, as the author herself details. The practice of structuring arguments around the refutation or clarification of these two established authorities in the field often gives this reader the feeling that this monograph falls very much within a Japanese historiographical tradition.

The volume concludes with a series of appendices, all of which are quite useful, and includes a glossary (with Japanese characters), a list of Japanese words cited in the text, again with characters, nine pages of transcriptions, in Japanese, of important documents cited in the text, and an English-language summary. The editors are to be thanked especially for allowing the documents to be included here, which give the informed reader the opportunity to read the entire document rather than just the shorter segment quoted in the text. (It would be wonderful if American publishers would do the same!) Given the attention bestowed on these appendices, it is regrettable, however, that a comprehensive bibliography was not provided.

The criticisms made above aside, this work makes an important contribution to the literature, as it is the only work in a Western language, that I

am aware of, devoted to a single pilgrimage circuit and is based on considerable archival skill. As such, it should be read by scholars or advanced graduate students with an interest in Tokugawa social history or religion, or anyone with an interest in religious pilgrimage. The fact that it is written in French will, unfortunately, limit its audience. I would encourage the author to publish additional articles in English so that her research gains the greater exposure it deserves.

Prisoners from Nambu: Reality and Make-Believe in 17th-Century Japanese Diplomacy. By Reinier H. Hesselink. University of Hawai'i Press, Honolulu, 2002. xii, 215 pages. \$47.00, cloth; \$25.95, paper.

Reviewed by
GREGORY SMITS
Pennsylvania State University

Prisoners from Nambu is mainly a detailed narrative of the July 29, 1643, capture of ten Dutch crew members of the yacht *Breskens*, their lengthy period of house arrest in Edo, and the diplomatic maneuvering connected with this incident. Arrested in the northern domain of Nambu and quickly brought to Edo, the ten Dutchmen spent four uneasy months at the Nagasakiya (the Dutch residence) before being released on December 8. Using Japanese and Dutch primary sources, Reinier H. Hesselink has crafted a narrative that is a pleasure to read and sheds some useful light on the inner workings of Tokugawa Iemitsu's administration, certain details of Iemitsu's eradication campaign against Roman Catholicism, Iemitsu's xenophobia, and some of the practical details of interstate diplomacy in early Tokugawa Japan.

Hesselink succeeds masterfully in his main task of telling the story of the ten captured Dutchmen in a manner that "can evoke in the reader a feeling for the reality of the past" (p. 1). Drawing a distinction between "narrative history" and "analytical history," Hesselink seeks to uphold the value of the former, arguing that a narrow focus can convey to the reader an especially vivid sense of past reality. *Prisoners from Nambu* is not lacking in analysis, however, for crafting his narrative required Hesselink to engage in a comparative analysis of sources whose authors often had something to hide or obfuscate. For the most part, I found Hesselink's analysis of the *Breskens* affair and related matters to be reasonable and insightful. In some contexts, however, a rigid adherence to a narrow distinction between reality and make-believe limit the book's potential for shedding light on larger issues and for building constructively on the existing body of literature in