



PROJECT MUSE®

Montreal-Glasgow (review)

Michael Cardy

French Studies: A Quarterly Review, Volume 60, Number 3, July 2006, pp.
419-420 (Review)

Published by Oxford University Press



➔ For additional information about this article

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/208179>

most resonant question of the book is a measure of its significance, and also of its intellectual strength and honesty.

doi:10.1093/fs/knl067

MICHAEL SYROTINSKI
UNIVERSITY OF ABERDEEN

Reframing Difference: 'Beur' and 'banlieue' Film-Making in France. By CARRIE TARR. Manchester – New York, Manchester University Press, 2005. ix + 230 pp. Pb £15.99.

Films made by second-generation immigrants of Maghrebi descent — 'beurs' — and about the problems endemic to the *banlieue* have been the focus of much interest over the past twenty or so years, and the recent outbreaks of rioting have shown that a decade after Kassovitz's *La Haine* their relevance is as great as ever. Tarr presents the first book-length survey of this important corpus in either English or French, and her volume is an admirably thorough and well-researched overview, demonstrating a good grasp of film theory, French social and political history, and gender issues that will make it of interest to those working in a variety of fields. 'The fault lines in the universalist discourses of French Republicanism' (p. 1) become plain in a variety of ways, through the films' diverse ways of negotiating space as well as through their articulation of memory, gender and history. The unavailability of many of the films in English-speaking countries, frustrating though it inevitably is, is to some extent palliated by lucid plot-summaries and analyses along with a judicious choice of illustrations. From time to time there may be a sense that the author is 'ticking boxes' or awarding marks to films on the basis of their ideological acceptability. Thus, while Chibane's *Hexagone* does much to 'engage pleasurably with a *beur* audience' (p. 60), it also receives a mild rap over the knuckles for failing to 'problematisé the dominant culture's construction of French national identity' (p. 61). This is perhaps an inevitable consequence of, on the one hand, the fact that the essays that go to make up the volume were written, and sometimes previously published, separately, thereby requiring separate individual conclusions, and on the other, the problems inevitably associated with so ideologically fraught an area as Tarr is tackling. It is unfortunate that the lay-out of the filmography is periodically marred by glitches, but this is a minor criticism of a book that will certainly become a standard resource in its field and could indeed profitably find a French publisher.

KEITH READER
GLASGOW UNIVERSITY

doi:10.1093/fs/knl103

Montreal-Glasgow. Edited by BILL MARSHALL. University of Glasgow French and German Publications, 2005. xiv + 262 pp. Pb £15.00.

This well-edited volume deals with the culture (in the broadest sense) of two great cities and is divided into several sections: Architecture, History, Literature, Theatre, Film and Television, and Exchanges. The approach is largely but not exclusively comparative. Holly Kinnear shows how personalities involved with both cities were responsible for the impact made on their urban landscapes by the

Beaux-Arts movement, and François Dufaux underlines the high proportion of rental accommodation in the shape of multi-family tenement-type buildings to be found in both cities, but notes a number of differences in their architectural conceptions. Alena Prochazka discusses the extent to which major new buildings in Montreal conform to the established character of the city's built environment. Iain Stevenson studies the Canadian Pacific service of passenger liners that linked the two cities for much of the twentieth century, illustrating the chapter with several stunning poster images. The Scottish presence in Montreal is explored in two chapters by Gillian Leitch and Paul-André Linteau, and Harold Bérubé compares major commemorations of their history, during the crises of depression or war, by the two cities as well as by Toronto. The fine arts are represented by Alexandria Pierce's study of Lord Strathcona's art collection in nineteenth-century Montreal. Sébastien Socqué highlights the importance of the writer and politician, André Laurendeau, in integrating Montreal's cosmopolitan and exceptional character into a coherent notion of French Canada. As for literature, Maureen E. Waters explores the Gothic in the urban landscape of the two cities, although her text reads like the synopsis of a much longer work. Jacques Cardinal provides a dense interpretation of Jacques Ferron's novel, *Les Confitures de coings*, highlighting the political dimension of the work. Jean-François Chassay compares Gaétan Soucy's *L'Immaculée Conception* (1994) and Andrew O'Hagan's *Our Fathers* (1999), but the two novels seem too distant, in every sense, to lead to significant insights. Bill Findlay demonstrates how Glasgow audiences were particularly receptive to translations into vernacular Scots, by Martin Bowman and Findlay himself, of plays by Michel Tremblay, because of the continuing tradition of variety theatre in the city. David Hutchison studies the manner in which television drama with a Glasgow context portrays working-class, but rarely middle-class, experience and hence in some sense betrays the complexity of modern Scottish, especially Glaswegian, life. Pierre Véronneau, in a notably well-written text, contrasts the approaches to Montreal of two of French Canada's most significant film directors, Denys Arcand and Charles Binamé, and Bill Marshall's contribution is a well-realized comparison of the work for the cinema of Marc-André Forcier and Peter Mullan. The book concludes with Mark Rowbotham's study of Prestwick's Freeport and Montreal-Mirabel's foreign trade zone, a feature of the two cities likely to be little known outside business circles, and Michel Sarra-Bournet's overview of Montreal's cultural institutions, their history and probable future directions. This is, all in all, a varied and stimulating volume.

MICHAEL CARDY

UNIVERSITY OF WALES SWANSEA

doi:10.1093/fs/ksn1094

Littératures mineures en langue majeure: Québec/Wallonie-Bruxelles. Textes réunis par JEAN-PIERRE BERTRAND et LISE GAUVIN. (Documents pour l'histoire des francophonies/Théorie, 1) Brussels, P.I.E. — Oxford, Peter Lang — Montreal, Presses de l'Université de Montréal, 2003. 320 pp. Pb £19.00.

The concept of 'littérature mineure' elaborated by Deleuze and Guattari in their 1975 text on Kafka has proved a far less productive notion for the theorization of instances of postcoloniality than might have been expected, even with the gift of hindsight, given the omnipresence of the 'rhizomatic' and the 'nomadic' as key